

2021 BRICS New Delhi Summit Final Compliance Report

10 September 2021 to 31 May 2022

Prepared by

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Angela Min Yi Hou, Sonja Dobson and Brittaney Warren
and the University of Toronto BRICS Research Group

and

Alexander Ignatov, Irina Popova, Andrey Shelepov and Andrei Sakharov
and the Center for International Institutions Research
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,
Moscow

22 June 2022

Contents

Research Team	3
Toronto BRICS Research Group	3
G20 Research Group Analysts	3
RANEPA Research Group.....	3
Preface	4
Introduction and Summary	5
Methodology and Scoring System.....	5
The Breakdown of Commitments	5
Selection of Commitments.....	5
Compliance Scores	6
Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments Across Issue Areas, 2009–2021.....	7
Table 2: 2021 BRICS New Delhi Summit Priority Commitments	8
Table 3: 2020 BRICS Moscow Summit Interim Compliance Scores	10
1. Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	11
2. International Financial Institutions Reform.....	25
3. Development: Sustainable and Inclusive Recovery	34
4. Development: SDG 12.....	45
5. Trade: Facilitating Value-Added Trade.....	55
6. Macroeconomics: Competition	64
7. Digital Economy: Cooperation	69
8. ICT: Open Environment	80
9. Health: Infectious Diseases.....	91
10. Health: Major Diseases and Tuberculosis	103
11. Health: COVID-19 Pandemic.....	111
12. Terrorism: BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan	120
13. Terrorism: Combatting Terrorism.....	135
14. Regional Security: Afghanistan.....	144
15. Crime and Corruption: International Anti-Corruption.....	152
16. Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework.....	166
17. Climate Change: Holistic Approach.....	178
18. Climate Change: UNFCCC	197
19. Food Security: Intra-BRICS Cooperation.....	205
20. Education: Better Education and TVET.....	221

Research Team

Dr. Marina Larionova, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Professor John Kirton, Co-director, BRICS Research Group
Brittaney Warren, Compliance Specialists, BRICS Research Group

Toronto BRICS Research Group

Alissa Xinhe Wang, Co-Chair of Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group
Angela Min Yi Hou, Co-Chair of Summit Studies, BRICS Research Group
Sonja Dobson, Editor-in-Chief, BRICS Research Group

G20 Research Group Analysts

Jarod Bechard
Yu Bi
Miranda Bocci
Wesley Cheung
Yuet Ottica Chong
Ieuan Edwards
Joy Zhixin Fan
Thomas Houlie
Elisabeth Iannucci
Wenny (Yiyao) Jin
Ashleen Kaur
Leila Koohi
Eva Li
Jathorsan Lingarajan
Fianait Liu
Ashton Mathias
Sarah Nasir
Chun Yin Justin Ng
Alexandra Nicu
Pantea Jamshidi Nouri
Kelley Prendergast
Tianyang Qi
Warisa Rahman
Tanmaya Ramprasad
Chan-Min Roh
Faye Rozario
Amandeep Saini
Yana Sadeghi
Simren Ravina Sharma
Ethan Ullmann
Han Xin
Thomas Yue
Yiran (Katherine) Zhang

RANEPA Research Group

Alexander Ignatov
Irina Popova
Andrei Sakharov
Andrey Shelepov

Preface

The BRICS Research Group has been assessing progress made by the BRICS members in implementing commitments their leaders make at each summit since the 2011 Sanya meeting. These reports monitor each member's efforts to implement a carefully chosen selection of the many commitments produced at each summit. They are offered to the general public and to policy makers, academics, civil society, the media and interested citizens around the world in an effort to make the BRICS's work more transparent, accessible and effective, and to provide scientific data to enable the meaningful analysis of the causes of compliance and the impact of this important informal international institution. Previous reports are available at the BRICS Information Centre at <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/compliance> and at the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration available at <http://www.ranepa.ru/eng/ciir-ranepa/research-areas/brics/analytics>.

This current final report analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 20 priority commitments selected from the 73 commitments made by the leaders at New Delhi on 9 September 2021. The report covers actions taken by the BRICS members to implement those commitments between 10 September 2021 and 31 May 2022. The BRICS Research Group relies on publicly available information, documentation and media reports for its assessments. To ensure accuracy, comprehensiveness and integrity, we encourage comments from stakeholders. Indeed, scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available. All feedback remains anonymous. Responsibility for the contents of this report lies exclusively with the authors and analysts of the BRICS Research Group.

The final report will be released on the eve of the virtual summit hosted by China on 23-24 June 2022.

John Kirton and Marina Larionova
Co-directors, BRICS Research Group

Introduction and Summary

The 2021 BRICS New Delhi Final Compliance Report, prepared by the BRICS Research Group (based at the University of Toronto and the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration [RANEPA]), analyses compliance performance by BRICS countries with 20 priority commitments drawn from the total 73 commitments made by the leaders at the New Delhi Summit, which was held on 9 September 2021.

Methodology and Scoring System

This report draws on the methodology developed by the G7 Research Group, which has been monitoring G7 compliance since 1996 and adapted for monitoring G20 performance since 2008.¹ The use of this time-tested methodology provides for cross-institutional, cross-member and cross-issue consistency and thus allows compatibility and comparability of the compliance performance by different summit institutions and establishes a foundation for evidence-based assessment of the effectiveness of these institutions.²

The methodology uses a scale from -1 (0%) to +1 (100%), where +1 (50%) indicates full compliance with the stated commitment, -1 indicates a failure to comply or action taken that is directly opposite to the stated goal of the commitment, and 0 indicates partial compliance or work in progress, such as initiatives that have been launched but are not yet near completion and whose final results can therefore not be assessed.³ Each member receives a score of -1, 0 or +1 for each commitment.

The Breakdown of Commitments

At the New Delhi Summit in 2021, the BRICS leaders focused on three pillars: policy and security, economy and financial, and culture and people-to-people exchanges. The theme was “BRICS @ 15: Intra-BRICS Cooperation for Continuity, Consolidation and Consensus.” The topics discussed included a brighter shared future for the international community based on mutually beneficial cooperation; the COVID-19 pandemic and the Access to COVID-19 Tools Accelerator initiative; peace, security and counter-terrorism cooperation; sustainable development and innovative means to achieve it. BRICS leaders also acknowledged the need to strengthen and reform the multilateral system.

Selection of Commitments

For each compliance cycle (that is, the period between summits), the research team selects commitments that reflect the breadth of the BRICS agenda and the priorities of the summit’s host, while balancing the selection to allow for comparison with past and future summits.⁴ The selection also takes into account the breakdown of issue areas and the proportion of commitments in each one (see Table 1). The primary criteria for selecting a priority commitment for assessment are the comprehensiveness and relevance to the summit, the BRICS and the world. Selected commitments must meet secondary criteria such as measurability and ability to comply within a year. Tertiary criteria include significance, as identified by relevant stakeholders in the host country and scientific teams. Of the 73 commitments made at the 2021 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS Research Group selected 20 priority commitments for its compliance assessment (see Table 2).

¹ The Compliance Coding Manual is available at <http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/evaluations/index.html#method>.

² Informal summity institutions are defined as international institutions with limited membership, relatively low bureaucracy and reliance on open, flexible and voluntary approaches. Regular meetings of the heads of states and governments who engage on a wide range of international, regional and domestic politics stand at the pinnacle of such international arrangements, which involve many actors operating according to established procedures on two levels: domestic and international. Commitments contained in the collectively agreed documents are not legally-binding but their implementation is stimulated by peer pressure. Among such bodies engaged in global and regional governance are G7, G20, BRICS, the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation forum and others.

³ The formula to convert a score into a percentage is $P=50 \times (S+1)$, where P is the percentage and S is the score.

⁴ Guidelines for choosing priority commitments, as well as other applicable considerations, are available in the Compliance Coding Manual.

Compliance Scores

Compliance for the 2021 New Delhi Summit Final report is +0.59 (80%) (see Table 3).

By country, China earned the highest compliance score at +0.85 (93%). India came in second with a score of +0.60 (80%), closely followed by Russia with a score of +0.65 (83%). Brazil earned a score of +0.50 (75%) and South Africa earned the lowest score of +0.35 (68%) (see Table 3).

By issue, four commitments earned a score of +1 (100%): the macroeconomic commitment on competition, the ICT and digital economy commitment on an open environment, the climate change commitment on a holistic approach, and the science and education commitment on better education and training. Four commitments also earned a score of +0.80 (90%): the development commitment on sustainable and inclusive recovery, the health commitment on COVID-19, the commitment on combatting terrorism and the food security commitment on intra-BRICS cooperation. Four more commitments earned a score of +0.60 (80%) and five commitments earned a score of +0.40 (70%). The three commitments that earned the lowest score, of +0.20 (60%) were on the global financial safety net and the value-added trade and, of -0.20 (40%), on major diseases and tuberculosis.

Table 1: Distribution of BRICS Commitments Across Issue Areas, 2009–2021

Issue Area	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Energy	5	9	1	2					6	2	2	3	
Finance		3	1			6	6	5	9	5	1		
Climate change		1	6	3	1	1	1	1	3		3	1	3
Macroeconomic policy		1	5	1	5	7	6	4	4	3	1	2	2
Trade	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7	21	18	8	2	3
International cooperation	1	2	5	3	6	8	30	7	21	18	8	8	7
Socioeconomic	1	1	3	2		7	5	2		2			
Development	1	5	1	3	10	4	4	2	11	6	2	3	4
Natural disasters	1	1	1										
Food and agriculture	3		1	1		1	17		5	3		2	1
ICT and digital economy			2			1	17	3	12	3	2	3	4
Science and education	1	1	1		2	5							1
Health			1	1		1	6	2	6	1		4	5
Human rights			1		1	2	5		2		1		3
Accountability			1										
Regional security	1		1	4	8	6	6	4	12	7	4	7	1
Terrorism			1	1	2	2	1	4	7	3	1	2	7
Culture		1				3	1	2	3			1	
Sport		1											
IFI reform	1	2	1	2	9	8	3	2	5	2	2	1	1
Non-proliferation					1			1	2		1		2
Crime and corruption						4	10	3	8	6	10	3	7
Environment						1	1	1	3	3	3		2
Tourism							1			1			
International taxation										4	5	1	
Space												1	
Inter-BRICS cooperation												1	
Intergovernmental organization reform													4
Peace and security													1
Total	15	31	38	32	47	68	130	45	125	73	49	45	58

Notes: ICT = information and communication technologies; IFI = international financial institution.

Table 2: 2021 BRICS New Delhi Summit Priority Commitments

	Issue Area	Commitment
1	Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	[We] reiterate our support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO [World Trade Organization] and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs [least-developed countries], recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.
2	International Financial Institutions Reform: Global Financial Safety Net	We reaffirm our commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota- based and adequately resourced IMF [International Monetary Fund] at its center.
3	Development: Sustainable and Inclusive Recovery	[We encourage]...to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises.
4	Development: SDG-12	[Stressing the importance of achieving the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development and its Goals, we reiterate our commitment to the achievement of all SDGs, including] SDG-12 which identifies sustainable consumption and production patterns as a vital element of sustainable development.
5	Trade: Facilitating Value Added Trade	We stress the need to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.
6	Macroeconomics: Competition	[Recognizing the important role of fair competition in supporting business development, protecting consumers' interests, and promoting post-pandemic economic recovery and growth in difficult times,] we will continue to deepen practical cooperation in the field of competition.
7	ICT and Digital Economy: Cooperation	[As we enter the 'Decade of Action' for the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals,] we [believe that BRICS must prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and] encourage further cooperation.
8	ICT and Digital Economy: Open Environment	We reaffirm our commitment to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT [information and communications technologies] environment.
9	Health: Infectious Diseases	We support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the WHO's [World Health Organization] Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.
10	Health: Major Diseases and Tuberculosis	We reiterate our commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, specially Tuberculosis.
11	Health: COVID-19 Pandemic	We reaffirm our strong commitment to continue our ongoing efforts in supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic through financing, donation, local production and facilitating export of vaccines, therapeutics, diagnostics and other life saving equipment.

12	Terrorism: BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan	We endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy which was adopted by our National Security Advisors which is aimed at implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy and defines the approach and actions of the BRICS countries towards counter-terrorism cooperation, including ensuring coordinated efforts to understand, identify and collaboratively respond to persistent and emerging terrorist threats, as well as cooperation within the framework of the UN and other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.
13	Terrorism: Combatting Terrorism	We commit to combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.
14	Regional Security: Intra-Afghan Dialogue	We stress the need to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.
15	Crime and Corruption: International Anti-Corruption	We reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.
16	Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework	We [stress the importance and] support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD [Convention on Biological Diversity] in a balanced way.
17	Climate Change: Holistic Approach	We emphasize the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.
18	Climate Change: UNFCCC	We reaffirm our commitment to the full implementation of the UNFCCC [United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change], its Kyoto Protocol and Paris Agreement, and to the principles of UNFCCC including “Common But Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective Capabilities” in the light of different national circumstances.
19	Food and Agriculture: Intra-BRICS Cooperation	Recognizing the importance of agriculture and rural revitalization for achieving the 2030 Agenda, we reiterate our commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.
20	Science and Education: Better Education and TVET	We commit to strengthening our cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training), through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise

Table 3: 2021 BRICS New Delhi Summit Final Compliance Scores

	Issue Areas	Brazil	Russia	India	China	South Africa	Average	
1	Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform	0	0	+1	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
2	IFI Reform: Global Financial Safety Net	-1	0	+1	0	+1	+0.20	60%
3	Development: Sustainable and Inclusive Recovery	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.80	90%
4	Development: SDG 12	+1	+1	0	+1	0	+0.60	80%
5	Trade: Facilitating Value Added Trade	0	+1	-1	+1	0	+0.20	60%
6	Macroeconomics: Competition	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
7	ICT and Digital Economy: Cooperation	+1	0	+1	0	0	+0.40	70%
8	ICT and Digital Economy: Open Environment	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
9	Health: Infectious Diseases	0	+1	0	+1	0	+0.40	70%
10	Health: Major Diseases and Tuberculosis	0	0	-1	0	0	-0.20	40%
11	Health: COVID-19 Pandemic	+1	0	+1	+1	+1	+0.80	90%
12	Terrorism: BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan	-1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
13	Terrorism: Combatting Terrorism	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.80	90%
14	Regional Security: Intra-Afghan Dialogue	0	+1	+1	+1	-1	+0.40	70%
15	Crime and Corruption: International Anti-Corruption	+1	0	+1	+1	-1	+0.40	70%
16	Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework	0	0	0	+1	+1	+0.40	70%
17	Climate Change: Holistic Approach	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
18	Climate Change: UNFCCC	+1	+1	0	+1	0	+0.60	80%
19	Food and Agriculture: Intra-BRICS Cooperation	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.80	90%
20	Science and Education: Better Education and TVET	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1.00	100%
	Average	+0.50	+0.65	+0.60	+0.85	+0.35	+0.59	80%
		75%	83%	80%	93%	68%		

Note: ICT = information and communications technologies; SDG = Sustainable Development Goal; TVET = training and vocational education and training; UNFCCC = United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change; WTO = World Trade Organization.

1. Intergovernmental Organization Reform: WTO Reform

“[We] reiterate our support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO [World Trade Organization] and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs [least-developed countries], recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average		+0.60 (80%)	

Background

At the 2021 BRICS summit hosted virtually by India on 9 September 2021, the BRICS leaders reiterated their commitment to reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).⁵ The renewal of this commitment reflects a continuation of the pledge to support the multilateral trading system and the central role of the WTO therein.

The WTO was first referenced by BRICS summitry in the context of Russia’s accession to the Organization in 2012.⁶ Adopted at the 4th BRICS leaders’ summit on 29 March 2012, the Delhi Declaration acknowledged Russia’s accession as a step towards a more representative WTO system. Concurrently, BRICS leaders also emphasized the importance of upholding a rule-based multilateral trading system and rolling back protectionism.

Since 2012, BRICS members have repeatedly reaffirmed their support for an “open, inclusive, non-discriminatory, transparent and rule-based multilateral trading system,” including at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit,⁷ the 2015 Ufa Summit,⁸ the 2016 Goa Summit,⁹ and the 2017 Xiamen Summit.¹⁰ At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders called on all WTO Members to avoid unilateral and protectionist measures, and recognized the importance of WTO reform “to ensure the effectiveness and relevance of the organization and its capacity to better address current and future challenges.”¹¹

In the context of WTO reform, BRICS summitry has taken a specific interest in the role and representation of developing economies and least developed countries (LDCs) in the multilateral trading system. BRICS leaders

⁵ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 17 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

⁶ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

⁷ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

⁸ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 15 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁹ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-goa.html>

¹⁰ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

¹¹ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

advocated for the representation of developing economies at the WTO in the 2018 Johannesburg Declaration,¹² the 2019 Brasilia Declaration,¹³ and the 2020 Moscow Declaration.¹⁴

In the 2020 BRICS Moscow Declaration, and in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, the leaders acknowledged the crucial role of international trade in the global economic recovery. They committed to “support the necessary reform of the WTO with a view to making it more resilient and effective in confronting global economic challenges and to improve its key functions in the interest of all WTO Members.” They further recognized that “the reform must, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO, and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs, recognizing that the majority of WTO members are developing countries.”¹⁵ This commitment was reiterated virtually at the 2021 New Delhi leaders’ summit.

Commitment Features

The commitment reads: “[we] reiterate our support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs, recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.”

The word “reiterate” is a low binding commitment verb.¹⁶ It indicates that the present commitment was established at previous BRICS summits, yet not completed. Consequently, the verb also indicates that the BRICS leaders intended for new efforts to be made in this area before the next summit, providing a basis to assess compliance within the current compliance cycle.¹⁷ Given that “reiterate” is a low-ambition term, actions encapsulated by the parameters of this commitment include verbal affirmations, political statements, economic and financial support, and institutional or administrative assistance to the WTO reform process. However, a depth analysis will be applied accordingly.

To define the key concepts in this commitment, “support” is understood to mean acts of “providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity.”¹⁸

“Necessary” is defined as “needed in order to achieve a particular result.”¹⁹ “Urgent” is interpreted as “a short-term initiative that should be put into action in the present and/or very near future. It should not include prolonged and/or delayed efforts and compliance.”²⁰ Both words qualify the core concept of “WTO reform,”

¹² BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

¹³ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

¹⁴ Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

¹⁵ Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

¹⁶ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁷ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁸ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁹ Necessary, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 15 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/us/dictionary/english/necessary>

²⁰ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

which refers to efforts to modernize and improve the WTO and its core functions in order to address challenges that are putting the multilateral trading system and the WTO's role under stress.²¹

The topic of WTO reform covers a broad range of topics that include safeguarding and strengthening the WTO's dispute settlement mechanism, reinvigorating its negotiating function, strengthening its Secretariat and more.²²

This commitment is to be analysed in two components:

1. The BRICS member's support for necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO, and
2. The BRICS member's support for necessary and urgent reform which would consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs.

Part I: WTO Reform

The first part of the commitment espouses the importance of upholding “the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO.” As provided by the phrase “inter alia,” BRICS members do not need to fulfil all three elements in the first part of the commitment; rather, they provide an illustrative account of what constitutes support for WTO reform.

a) Preserving the WTO's Centrality

The WTO embodies the multilateral frameworks and international rules under which cross-border trade unfolds. It is “the only global international organization dealing with the rules of trade between nations” and seeks to “ensure that trade flows as smoothly, predictably and freely as possible.”²³ As recognized by previous BRICS summit documents, the WTO ought to be preserved as the core institution of international trade. To this end, for example, BRICS members can demonstrate compliance with the first part of this commitment by reaffirming the WTO's centrality in global trade relations through political statements.

b) Core values

The core values of the WTO are not officially defined by the Organization itself. As an illustrative list, the G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting on 22 September 2020 agreed to a list of foundational ideas underpinning the WTO. The list of values adopted by G20 consensus included rule of law, transparency, non-discrimination, inclusiveness, fair competition, market openness, resistance to protectionism, and reciprocal and mutually advantageous arrangements.²⁴ Other values include sustainability, market orientation, special and differential treatment, and consensus-based decision-making. To this list, former Deputy Director-General of the WTO Alan Wm. Wolff proposed adding several values for consideration: peace, stability and certainty, well-being, equality, sovereignty, universality, development, transparency, convergence, reciprocity, international cooperation, morality, openness, balance, and trust.²⁵

The aforementioned values can inform the compliance of BRICS members if they demonstrate policy actions that align with the core values of the WTO. For example, a BRICS member could support the revival of

²¹ Reforming the World Trade Organization, Chatham House (London) 11 September 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<https://www.chathamhouse.org/2020/09/reforming-world-trade-organization>

²² Ottawa Group and WTO Reform, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 23 May 2019. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<https://www.canada.ca/en/global-affairs/news/2019/05/ottawa-group-and-wto-reform.html>

²³ The WTO, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 15 November 2021.

https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/thewto_e.htm

²⁴ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting: Communiqué, G20 Information Centre (Toronto) 22 September 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-trade-0922.html>

²⁵ DDG Wolff: Openness, balance and trust are underlying values of the WTO, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 25 June 2020. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news20_e/ddgaw_25jun20_e.htm

negotiations of an Environmental Goods Agreement, which would constitute an action that reaffirms the core value of sustainability in international trade.

c) Fundamental principles of the WTO

The principles underpinning the multilateral trading system are:

- “Trade without discrimination
- “Freer trade: gradually through negotiation
- “Predictability: through binding and transparency
- “Promoting fair competition
- “Encouraging development and economic reform”²⁶

According to the WTO, its “founding and guiding principles remain the pursuit of open borders, the guarantee of most-favoured-nation principle and non-discriminatory treatment by and among members, and a commitment to transparency in the conduct of its activities. The opening of national markets to international trade, with justifiable exceptions or with adequate flexibilities, will encourage and contribute to sustainable development, raise people’s welfare, reduce poverty, and foster peace and stability. At the same time, such market opening must be accompanied by sound domestic and international policies that contribute to economic growth and development according to each member’s needs and aspirations.”²⁷

In sum, the multilateral trading system should be without discrimination, freer, predictable, more competitive, and more beneficial for less developed countries under the multilateral frameworks of the WTO.

Part II: Developing Countries and Least Developed Countries

The latter half of the commitment articulates a specific focus on the involvement of developing countries and LDCs in the WTO, which is encapsulated in the scope of the Organization’s core values and principles.

“Least Developed Countries,” or LDCs, refer to a group of “low-income countries confronting severe structural impediments to sustainable development” that are “highly vulnerable to economic and environmental shocks and have low levels of human assets.”²⁸ This designation of LDCs is carried out by the Committee for Development Policy Secretariat of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs at the United Nations.

In contrast, the term “developing countries” in the context of WTO membership is a self-declared status, rather than a designation made by a third-party such as the United Nations based on socio-economic metrics. WTO Members announce their own “developed” or “developing” status.²⁹ Developing countries are privy to special and differential treatment (S&DT), which can manifest in rights such as longer transition periods to implement WTO agreements, access to technical assistance and capacity-building, and eligibility for unilateral Generalized System of Preferences offered by several developed Members. S&DT provisions can be found across various WTO agreements and frameworks.

To comply with the second part of this commitment, the BRICS member must make explicit reference to the standing of developing countries and LDCs in their engagements in WTO reform. For example, the BRICS

²⁶ Principles of the Trading System, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 15 November 2021.

https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact2_e.htm

²⁷ Overview, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 15 November 2021.

https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/wto_dg_stat_e.htm

²⁸ Least Developed Countries (LDCs), United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs – Economic Analysis (New York) Access Date: 2 November 2021. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/dpad/least-developed-country-category.html>

²⁹ Who are the developing countries in the WTO? World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 15 November 2021.

https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/devel_e/d1who_e.htm

member can put forward proposals on S&DT provisions in ongoing WTO negotiations, engage in the work of the WTO Committee on Trade and Development, or contribute financially to technical assistance programs managed by the WTO Secretariat.³⁰

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must demonstrate strong compliance with both parts of the commitment: reaffirm its support for WTO reform, and in doing so, show consideration for the interests of developing WTO members. Partial compliance, or a score of 0, would be assigned if a member engages in supporting WTO reform writ large, yet without specific regard for developing and least developed countries. A score of partial compliance would also be given to BRICS members that somewhat comply with both aspects of the commitment, or strongly comply with one dimension and somewhat with the other. Non-compliance, or a score of -1, would be attributed to BRICS members that do not take any action to reiterate its support for WTO reform within the compliance cycle.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does NOT reiterate its support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least-developed countries (LDCs), recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.
0	The BRICS member DOES reiterate its support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO but DOES NOT consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs, recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.”
+1	The BRICS member reiterates its support for the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO AND consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs, recognizing that the majority of the WTO members are developing countries.”

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 30 September 2021, Counselor of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Thais Valerio de Mesquita spoke at the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.³¹ She highlighted the importance of the WTO’s fisheries subsidies negotiations and their significance for the fisheries sector, despite not having yet reached a formal agreement. She stated that an agreement would ensure that the rules are set by a consensus through members and solidify evolutions in the sector.

On 5 October 2021, Minister of Foreign Affairs Carlos Alberto Franco França participated in the Ministerial Informal Meeting of the WTO on the sidelines of the Ministerial Meeting of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).³² He noted the importance of advancing rules for industrial and

³⁰ Understanding the WTO: Developing Countries, World Trade Organization (Geneva) Access Date: 15 November 2021. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/dev1_e.htm

³¹ FAO Session Calls for Predictable Rules, Cooperation on Fisheries, International Institute for Sustainable Development (Winnipeg) 5 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://sdg.iisd.org/news/fao-session-calls-for-predictable-rules-cooperation-on-fisheries/>

³² WTO Ministerial Informal Meeting, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 5 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/wto-ministerial-informal-meeting>

agricultural subsidies, promoting an equitable environment for competition, and preventing international trade distortions.

On 6 October 2021, Minister França spoke at the Promoting Trade for All session on the relevance of international trade for economic growth and sustainable development.³³ He highlighted the importance of both OECD and non-OECD members' contributions to a fair and non-discriminatory trading system within the framework of the WTO.

On 12 October 2021, Secretary for Foreign Trade and Economic Affairs Sarquis José Buainain Sarquis and Secretary for Foreign Trade of the Ministry of the Economy Lucas Ferraz attended the G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting.³⁴ The meeting adopted a joint declaration, of which one of the six main themes was WTO reform.

On 25 November 2021, Brazil submitted a revised request to the members of the Agreement on Government Procurement. The action shows Brazil's prioritization of "the process of accession to that instrument, as well as the importance for Brazil of the multilateral trade system."³⁵

On 2 December 2021, the agreement on services domestic regulation was announced, to which Brazil is a signatory.³⁶ The agreement seeks to streamline licensing and qualification procedures, and it will reduce red tape around licensing and qualifications and lower service trade costs by up to seven per cent.

On 26 January 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro addressed a letter to the Secretary-General of the OECD, in light of the OECD's decision on 25 January 2022 to open accession discussions with Brazil. In the letter, President Bolsonaro acknowledged Brazil's role as a founder of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade and WTO and a "staunch defender of the rules-based multilateral trading system with the WTO at its center," reiterating Brazil's commitment to "open, competitive, sustainable and transparent market economies."³⁷

On 31 March 2022, WTO Members – including Brazil – reached an agreement to enable more efficient use of tariff-rate quotas to support market access for agricultural products.³⁸ Brazil played an active role in the construction and negotiation of the agreement.

³³ Part II of the Meeting of the OECD Council at Ministerial Level, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/part-ii-of-the-meeting-of-the-oecd-council-at-ministerial-level>

³⁴ G20 Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/g20-trade-and-investment-ministerial-meeting>

³⁵ Joint Press Release by the Ministry of External Relations and the Ministry of Economy - Brazil presents offer for accession to the Agreement on Government Procurement, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 29 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/joint-press-release-by-the-ministry-of-external-relations-and-the-ministry-of-economy-brazil-presents-offer-for-accession-to-the-agreement-on-government-procurement>

³⁶ UK helps broker groundbreaking WTO agreement set to cut cost of global services trade by £113 billion, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 2 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-helps-broker-groundbreaking-wto-agreement-set-to-cut-cost-of-global-services-trade-by-113-billion>

³⁷ Letter from the President of the Federative Republic of Brazil to the Secretary-General of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Government of Brazil (Brasília) 26 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/content-centers/speeches-articles-and-interviews/president-of-the-federative-republic-of-brazil/documents/letter-from-the-president-of-the-federative-republic-of-brazil-to-the-secretary-general-of-the-organisation-for-economic-co-operation-and-development-oecd>

³⁸ Decision on the mechanism for filling underused tariff quotas in the agricultural sector within the scope of the WTO, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasília) 4 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/decisao-sobre-mecanismo-de-preenchimento-de-quotas-tarifarias-subutilizadas-no-setor-agricola-no-ambito-da-omc

On 26 April 2022, President Bolsonaro met with WTO Director-General Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala.³⁹ President Bolsonaro requested the need for a multilateral negotiation to allow fertilizers to flow freely into food-producing countries.

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support WTO reform that would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the WTO and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs. As an active participant in the multilateral trading system, Brazil has taken action to support WTO reform and preserve and support core WTO values. However, it has failed to take action to consider the interests of all members, especially the developing and least developed countries.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Joy Fan

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to support the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least developed countries.

On 12 October 2021, Russia joined its G20 counterparts at the Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting in adopting a joint declaration, of which one of the six main themes was WTO reform.⁴⁰

On 27-29 October 2021, Russia's second Trade Policy Review took place at the WTO.⁴¹ The review was preceded by a report submitted by Russia on 22 September 2021.

On 12 November 2021, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin spoke at the Meeting of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) Council of Heads of Government.⁴² In his speech, Prime Minister Mishustin stated the importance of continuing to take actions "aimed at maintaining an open and non-discriminatory trade regime, and compliance with the rules of the World Trade Organisation and the principle of voluntariness of climate efforts."⁴³

On 25 November 2021, Prime Minister Mishustin attended a meeting of the Heads of Government Council of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation via videoconference.⁴⁴ Prime Minister Mishustin emphasised that in order to strengthen the global economy, it is important to preserve the foundations of the WTO.

On 26 November 2021, Deputy Prime Minister Alexey Overchuk spoke at the Second Plenary Session of the 13th Asia-Europe Meeting Summit.⁴⁵ In his speech, he mentioned the importance of "restoring the effectiveness of the World Trade Organization" and that this is a Russian priority.

³⁹ President Jair Bolsonaro met with the Director-General of the World Trade Organization, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 26 April 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/en/government-of-brazil/latest-news/2022/president-jair-bolsonaro-met-with-the-director-general-of-the-world-trade-organization>

⁴⁰ G20 Ministerial Statement on Trade and Investment, G20 Information Centre (Sorrento) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 6 February 2022. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2021/211012-trade.html

⁴¹ Trade Policy Review: Russian Federation, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 27 October 2021. Access Date: 9 February 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/tpr_e/tp516_e.htm

⁴² Meeting of the CIS Council of Heads of Government, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43783/>

⁴³ Meeting of the CIS Council of Heads of Government, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43783/>

⁴⁴ Meeting of the SCO Heads of Government Council, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43901/>

⁴⁵ Statement by Alexey Overchuk at the Second Plenary Session of the 13th Asia-Europe Meeting Summit (ASEM13), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43917/>

On 2 December 2021, the agreement on services domestic regulation was announced, to which Russia is a signatory.⁴⁶ The agreement seeks to streamline licensing and qualification procedures, and it will reduce red tape around licensing and qualifications and lower service trade costs by up to seven per cent.

On 4 February 2022, President Vladimir Putin met with President Xi Jinping of China on the margins of the XXIV Olympic Winter Games.⁴⁷ The bilateral meeting produced a joint statement which affirmed the two parties' support for trade facilitation in line with WTO rules. The leaders further expressed support for a multilateral trade system based on the central role of the WTO and pledged to take active part in WTO reform.

Russia has participated in international action to strengthen the WTO and preserve its centrality, core values and fundamental principles. However, Russia has not demonstrated consideration for the interest of developing and least developed countries.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ieuan Edwards

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to support the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 8 October 2021, Ambassador and Permanent Representative to the WTO Brajendra Navnit delivered a statement to the WTO General Council pertaining to agenda item 10: “proposed General Council decision on procedures to enhance transparency and improve compliance with notification requirements under WTO agreements.”⁴⁸ In the statement, Ambassador Navnit stated that the term “transparency” was limited within the discussion of “fulfilling notification obligations of developing countries, including LDCs” rather than encompassing functions and stakeholders across the WTO, which is a concern for all members. To improve transparency, Ambassador Navnit proposed six points: improving agricultural notifications, enhancing developed countries' compliance with their Article 3.3 obligations of the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), encouraging developed members to announce measures that affect GATS mode 4 commitments, improving transparency in Article 66.2 of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), disclosing of reason of genetic resources in patent applications, and improving transparency in tariffs.

On 8 October 2021, Ambassador Navnit delivered a statement at the WTO General Council advocating for the TRIPS waiver proposed jointly with South Africa.⁴⁹ The waiver is intended to exempt patents on COVID-19 vaccines from the TRIPS Agreement and aims to ensure the equitable distribution of vaccines to developing countries. In the statement, Ambassador Navnit noted the discrepancy between high- and low-income countries regarding vaccine access, production, and affordability and the increasing gap in accessibility that will persist without the waiver.

On 8 October 2021, Ambassador Navnit delivered a statement at the WTO General Council pertaining to agenda item 8: “supporting the conclusion of fisheries subsidies negotiations for the sustainability of the ocean

⁴⁶ UK helps broker groundbreaking WTO agreement set to cut cost of global services trade by £113 billion, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 2 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-helps-broker-groundbreaking-wto-agreement-set-to-cut-cost-of-global-services-trade-by-113-billion>

⁴⁷ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Beijing) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 9 February 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770>

⁴⁸ Statement by India — Delivered by Ambassador & PR to the WTO Agenda Item 10, Permanent Mission of India in Geneva (Geneva) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/Agenda_Item_10_14oct-converted.pdf

⁴⁹ Statement by India — Delivered by Ambassador & PR to the WTO Agenda Item 4A, Permanent Mission of India in Geneva (Geneva) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/Agenda_Item_4A_14oct-converted.pdf

and fishing communities.”⁵⁰ In the statement, Ambassador Navnit elaborated upon India’s view regarding the necessity of S&DT in the fisheries subsidies negotiations to ensure proper developmental space and equitable opportunity for countries with negligible industrial fishing fleets and LDCs.

On 8 October 2021, Ambassador Navnit delivered a statement at the WTO General Council reiterating India’s unequivocal support of LDCs’ integration into the multilateral trading system, acknowledging the disproportionate impact of COVID-19 on the economies and developmental, technological and health sectors of LDCs.⁵¹

On 12 October 2021, India joined its G20 counterparts at the Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting in adopting a joint declaration, of which one of the six main themes was WTO reform.⁵²

On 22 October 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with WTO Director-General Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala as part of her three-day visit to India.⁵³ They discussed India’s decision to lift export restrictions on vaccines, multilateralism, and the WTO’s 12th Ministerial Conference. At the meeting, Prime Minister Modi reiterated India’s support for the WTO’s centrality, core values and fundamental principles.

On 8 November 2021, India and South Africa circulated a note to WTO members regarding the moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions.⁵⁴ The two countries sought clarification on the scope of the moratorium and its effects on developing economies.

On 23 November 2021, Ambassador Navnit delivered a statement at the WTO General Council pertaining to agenda item 12: “proposed general council decision on procedures to enhance transparency and improve compliance with notification requirements under WTO agreements.”⁵⁵ Ambassador Navnit rejected a punitive approach to upholding transparency within the WTO, given that it increases the burden on developing countries and LDCs. In its place, India supports a “hand holding” proposal that emphasizes equality between Members.

On 26 November 2021, in the joint communique adopted at the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People’s Republic of China, India reaffirmed its support for a transparent, open, and non-discriminatory multilateral trading system.⁵⁶

On 11 January 2022, India notified the Dispute Settlement Body of its decision to appeal the panel report “India — Measures Concerning Sugar and Sugarcane,” which previously concluded that India had violated its

⁵⁰ Statement by India — Delivered by Ambassador & PR to the WTO Agenda Item 8, Permanent Mission of India in Geneva (Geneva) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/Agenda_No.8_14oct-converted.pdf

⁵¹ Statement by India — Delivered by Ambassador & PR to the WTO Agenda Item 7, Permanent Mission of India in Geneva (Geneva) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/Agenda_Item_7_14oct-converted.pdf

⁵² G20 Ministerial Statement on Trade and Investment, G20 Information Centre (Sorrento) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 6 February 2022. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2021/211012-trade.html

⁵³ DG Okonjo-Iweala welcomes constructive talks during visit to India, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 22 October 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news21_e/dgno_22oct21_e.htm

⁵⁴ Work Programme on Electronic Commerce - The Moratorium on Customs Duties on Electronic Transmissions: Need for Clarity on its Scope and Impact, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 8 November 2021. Access Date: 9 February 2022. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W833.pdf&Open=True>

⁵⁵ Statement by India — Delivered by Ambassador & PR to the WTO Agenda Item 12, Permanent Mission of India in Geneva (Geneva) 23 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. https://www.pmindiaun.gov.in/public_files/assets/pdf/Statement_Agenda_Item%20-12_1dec.pdf

⁵⁶ Joint Communique of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People’s Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs, Government of India (Mumbai) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/joint+communique+of+the+18th+meeting+of+the+foreign+ministers+of+the+russian+federation+the+republic+of+india+and+the+peoples+republic+of+china>

obligation to notify the Committee on Agriculture of its sugar export subsidies.⁵⁷ However, there is currently no Appellate Body to address the appeal.

On 14 January 2022, in tandem with the United Kingdom's Secretary of State for International Trade Anne-Marie Trevelyan, India signed a joint statement at the 15th Meeting of the India-UK Joint Economic and Trade Committee.⁵⁸ The statement reaffirmed India's commitment to free and fair trade, collaboration with all WTO Members to engage in WTO reform, and cooperation at the WTO to pursue shared goals of restoring trust in the multilateral trading system.

On 21 January 2022, at a virtual informal WTO ministerial meeting, India emphasized the inclusion of the TRIPS waiver in the WTO's pandemic response package and cautioned against using the pandemic as a veil to secure market access from developing markets.⁵⁹

On 11 March 2022, Minister of Commerce and Industry, Consumer Affairs and Food, and Public Distribution and Textiles Shri Piyush Goyal and Canada's Minister of International Trade, Export Promotion, Small Business and Economic Development Mary Ng engaged in the fifth India-Canada Ministerial Dialogue on Trade & Investment.⁶⁰ Both parties reaffirmed their commitment to enforcing the principles of the WTO by working together to support "rules-based, transparent, non-discriminatory, open, and inclusive" trading mechanisms.⁶¹

On 2 May 2022, at the sixth India-Germany Inter-Governmental Consultations, Prime Minister Modi and German Chancellor Olaf Scholz reaffirmed their commitment to reforming the WTO as part of their discussions on trade, investment, and digital transformation.⁶² In committing to reform the WTO, both parties asserted the importance of strengthening the principles and functions of the WTO, which includes preserving the Appellate Body and its autonomy.

On 3 May 2022, the Quad—composed of the India, European Union, South Africa, and the United States—submitted to the WTO Director-General a preliminary proposal on ways to streamline and expand the production of COVID-19 vaccines.⁶³ The document emerged as the product of discussions amongst the four WTO Members regarding India and South Africa's TRIPS waiver proposal.

Notwithstanding its appeal of the WTO panel decision on sugar export subsidies, India has made considerable efforts to adhere to the present commitment. India has reiterated its support for the necessary and urgent reform of the WTO in a manner that takes into account the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs.

⁵⁷ India appeals panel reports in disputes targeting Indian sugar subsidies, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 11 January 2022. Access Date: 14 January 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/ds579_580_581apl_11jan22_e.htm

⁵⁸ India-UK Joint Statement on the JETCO, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 14 January 2022. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/india-uk-joint-statement-on-the-jetco>

⁵⁹ TRIPS waiver, developing nations' policy space key, India tells WTO, The Economic Times (Geneva) 22 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/india/trips-waiver-developing-nations-policy-space-key-india-tells-wto/articleshow/89051764.cms>

⁶⁰ Joint Statement issued at conclusion of the 5th India-Canada Ministerial Dialogue on Trade & Investment, Ministry of Commerce and Industry (New Delhi) 11 March 2022. Access Date: 30 April 2022. <https://commerce.gov.in/international-trade/joint-statements-and-minutes-of-the-meetings/joint-statement-issued-at-conclusion-of-the-5th-india-canada-ministerial-dialogue-on-trade-investment/>

⁶¹ Joint Statement issued at conclusion of the 5th India-Canada Ministerial Dialogue on Trade & Investment, Ministry of Commerce and Industry (New Delhi) 11 March 2022. Access Date: 30 April 2022. <https://commerce.gov.in/international-trade/joint-statements-and-minutes-of-the-meetings/joint-statement-issued-at-conclusion-of-the-5th-india-canada-ministerial-dialogue-on-trade-investment/>

⁶² Joint Statement: 6th India-Germany Inter-Governmental Consultation, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 2 May 2022. Access Date: 30 April 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/35251>

⁶³ TRIPS Council hears initial reactions to Quad's outcome document on IP COVID-19 response, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 6 May 2022. Access Date: 30 April 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/trip_06may22_e.htm

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Leila Koobi

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to support the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 21 October 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs published an article with suggestions for WTO reform.⁶⁴ China's WTO reform plan focuses on the unfairness of trade rules in WTO agriculture negotiations. The plan primarily calls for the elimination of the "aggregate measure of support" privilege.

On 12 October 2021, China joined its G20 counterparts at the Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting in adopting a joint declaration, of which one of the six main themes was WTO reform.⁶⁵

On 4 November 2021, at the opening of the fourth China International Import Expo, President Xi Jinping declared that China would continue to follow its trajectory of participation and alignment with the values of the WTO in upholding and contributing to a multilateral trading system, promoting equitable opportunity in trade, and continuing to open up the country for cross-border trade.⁶⁶

On 16 November 2021, Vice Minister of Commerce and Deputy Representative of International Trade Negotiations Shouwen Wang virtually attended the China-Brazil High-Level Coordination and Cooperation Committee Economic and Trade Sub-Committee.⁶⁷ He was joined by Brazil's Deputy Foreign Minister and Deputy Minister of Economy. Both countries agreed to maximize the leadership role of the sub-committee in promoting bilateral trade and economic cooperation and expanding cooperation in WTO frameworks.

On 2 December 2021, 67 WTO members jointly issued the Declaration on Completing the Negotiation on Domestic Regulation of Trade in Services, with China as a signatory.⁶⁸ The declaration proposed changes aimed at improving the transparency, predictability, and efficiency of authorization procedures for service providers hoping to provide services in foreign markets.

On 3 December 2021, Premier Li Keqiang held a video meeting with WTO Director-General Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala.⁶⁹ At their virtual meeting, Premier Li stated that China supports WTO reform and safeguarding the WTO's basic principles and core values. China is further committed to closing the gap between the North and

⁶⁴ 世贸组织改革该何去何从 [Where should the WTO reform go?], Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China - WTO/FTA Consulting Network (Beijing) 21 October 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <http://chinawto.mofcom.gov.cn/article/ap/tansuosikao/202110/20211003210026.shtml>

⁶⁵ G20 Ministerial Statement on Trade and Investment, G20 Information Centre (Sorrento) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 6 February 2022. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2021/211012-trade.html

⁶⁶ 习近平在第四届中国国际进口博览会开幕式上的主旨演讲（全文） [Xi Jinping's keynote speech at the opening ceremony of the 4th China International Import Expo (full text)], Southcn.com (Guangzhou) 4 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 5 May 2022. https://theory.southcn.com/node_a862b6d02b/678ca129d7.shtml

⁶⁷ 中国与巴西召开高层协调与合作委员会经贸分委会第八次会议 双方一致同意深化互利经贸合作 [China and Brazil held the 8th meeting of the Economic and Trade Sub-Committee of the High-level Coordination and Cooperation Committee Both sides agreed to deepen mutually beneficial economic and trade cooperation], Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <http://stpaul.mofcom.gov.cn/article/todayheader/202111/20211103219493.shtml>

⁶⁸ 商务部解读 WTO 服务贸易国内规制联合声明倡议谈判成果 [Ministry of Commerce Interpretation of the Negotiation Results of the WTO Joint Statement on Domestic Regulation of Trade in Services], Government of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 8 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2021-12/08/content_5659345.htm

⁶⁹ 李克强会见世界贸易组织总干事伊维拉 [Li Keqiang Meets with WTO Director-General Iweala], Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 4 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/web/zyxw/202112/t20211204_10462380.shtml

the South. Premier Li reiterated China's commitment to taking on responsibilities that are in line with its level of economic development and is willing to actively participate in relevant WTO negotiations.

On 10 December 2021, Permanent Representative of China to the WTO Ambassador Chenggang Li gave a speech at a high-level forum marking twenty years since China's accession to the WTO. In the speech, Ambassador Li stated that China will remain "a staunch supporter of the multilateral trading system" and expressed hope that the upcoming 12th Ministerial Conference "will deliver meaningful outcomes in some critical areas, such as fisheries subsidies and the response to the COVID-19 pandemic."⁷⁰ Furthermore, the Ambassador reaffirmed that China will be committed to necessary WTO reform and is willing to work with other WTO members to achieve this goal.

On 10 December 2021, China and 112 WTO members signed the Joint Statement on Investment Facilitation, which aims to "establish international rules, improve the transparency of investment policies, simplify and speed up investment approval procedures, and promote international cooperation on a global scale."⁷¹

On 13 December 2021, Vice Premier Hu Chunhua co-chaired the virtual 8th China-France High-Level Summit alongside the French Minister of Economy, Finance and Revitalization.⁷² The summit focused on international macroeconomic policy coordination and bilateral cooperation. The two parties agreed to both play a role in the EU-China Joint Working Group on WTO Reform to advance necessary reforms in the rules and operations of the WTO.

On 15 December 2021, at the virtual launch of the WTO Ministerial Statement on Trade, Environment and Sustainable Development, Vice Minister of Commerce and Deputy Representative of International Trade Negotiations Shouwen Wang delivered a statement on plastic pollution and environmentally sustainable plastics trade.⁷³ Vice Minister Wang reiterated President Xi Jinping's commitment to gradually phasing out the use of single-use plastic products. Vice Minister Wang stated that China encourages the WTO to assist its members in developing a link between trade, environment, and development to address pressing issues when facing the prospect of sustainable development.

On 26 April 2022, China – alongside the European Union, Thailand, and the United Kingdom – reported to a WTO meeting on issues relating to data monitoring and collection on trade in essential goods.⁷⁴ The meeting acknowledged that a lack of accurate statistics contributes to issues of transparency within the Organization, further creating barriers to addressing trade and supply issues during the pandemic.

⁷⁰ High-Level Forum marks 20 years of China's WTO membership, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 10 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news21_e/acc_10dec21_e.htm

⁷¹ 112 个世贸组织成员就投资便利化谈判发布联合声明 [112 WTO members issue joint statement on investment facilitation negotiations], World Trade Organization (Geneva) 10 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news21_e/acc_10dec21_e.htm

⁷² 第八次中法高级别经济财金对话联合情况说明 [Joint Situation Statement on the Eighth China-France High-level Economic and Financial Dialogue], Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 14 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <http://fr.mofcom.gov.cn/article/zxhz/202112/20211203228407.shtml>

⁷³ 王受文:中方愿与其他世贸组织成员就促进环境可持续塑料贸易共同努力 [Wang Shouwen: China is willing to work with other WTO members to promote environmentally sustainable plastic trade], Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <http://www.mofcom.gov.cn/article/xwfb/xwbldhd/202112/20211203229179.shtml>

⁷⁴ 世贸组织成员讨论加强必需货物贸易数据收集, 以应对 COVID-19 [WTO members discuss strengthening data collection on trade in essential goods in response to COVID-19], Government of China (Beijing) 29 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://chinawto.mofcom.gov.cn/article/ap/o/202204/20220403308901.shtml>

On 6 May 2022, at an informal TRIPS Council meeting, Ambassador Li Chenggang expressed China's concerns regarding the text on intellectual property exceptions put forth by India and South Africa.⁷⁵ Ambassador Li shared three technical points regarding the text, reiterating China's support and contributions to closing the vaccination gap between LDCs and developed countries, encouraging the WTO to come to a decision regarding intellectual property exemptions for vaccines, and promoting multilateral cooperation on the import and export of vaccines.⁷⁶

On 11 May 2022, at the WTO-led Aid for Trade initiative's meeting (which seeks to assist developing countries and LDCs in overcoming trade-related barriers), China affirmed the importance of supporting LDCs in their ability to trade as the pandemic continues to affect overall trade capacities. China also highlighted the need to amend the discrepancy in access to vaccines between developed and developing countries.⁷⁷

As an active participant in the multilateral trading system, China has adhered to the present commitment to reiterate its support for the necessary and urgent reform of the WTO and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and LDCs.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Leila Koobi

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to support the necessary and urgent reform which would, inter alia, preserve the centrality, core values and fundamental principles of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and consider the interests of all members, including developing countries and least developed countries (LDCs).

On 23 September 2021, President Cyril Ramaphosa addressed the United Nations General Assembly. He urged "all member states to support the proposal for a temporary waiver of certain provisions of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights to allow more countries, particularly low- and middle-income countries, to produce COVID-19 vaccines."⁷⁸

On 28 September 2021, President Ramaphosa addressed the WTO Public Forum.⁷⁹ In his address, he reiterated the importance of a waiver for TRIPS-related obligations vis-à-vis COVID-19 vaccines and called for the asymmetries in existing WTO agreements to be addressed. He also stated that the WTO "must ensure that developing economies, and especially the least developed among them, secure a share in the growth in international trade commensurate with the needs of their economic development."⁸⁰

⁷⁵ 李成钢大使在 TRIPS 理事会非正式会议上的发言 [Statement by Ambassador Li Chenggang at the Informal Meeting of the TRIPS Council], Government of China (Beijing) 6 May 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://www.mofcom.gov.cn/article/zwjg/zwxw/zwxwoz/202205/20220503310784.shtml>

⁷⁶ 李成钢大使在 TRIPS 理事会非正式会议上的发言 [Statement by Ambassador Li Chenggang at the Informal Meeting of the TRIPS Council], Government of China (Beijing) 6 May 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://www.mofcom.gov.cn/article/zwjg/zwxw/zwxwoz/202205/20220503310784.shtml>

⁷⁷ Members, partner organizations outline priorities for Aid for Trade Global Review, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 11 May 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news22_e/aid_04may22_e.htm

⁷⁸ Statement by HE Mr Cyril Ramaphosa, President of the Republic of South Africa, on the occasion of the General Debate of the 76th session of the United Nations General Assembly, South African Government (Pretoria) 23 September 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/speeches/2021/cram0923.htm>

⁷⁹ President Cyril Ramaphosa: World Trade Organisation Public Forum, Government of South Africa (Cape Town) 28 September 2021. Access Date: 23 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-world-trade-organisation-public-forum-28-sep-2021-0000>

⁸⁰ President Cyril Ramaphosa: World Trade Organisation Public Forum, Government of South Africa (Cape Town) 28 September 2021. Access Date: 23 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-world-trade-organisation-public-forum-28-sep-2021-0000>

On 12 October 2021, South Africa joined its G20 counterparts at the Trade and Investment Ministerial Meeting in adopting a joint declaration, of which one of the six main themes was WTO reform.⁸¹

On 21 October 2021, Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition Ebrahim Patel met with the United States Trade Representative Katherine Tai on the margins of the G20 summit.⁸² They discussed the WTO's pandemic efforts, including the waiver on the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property (TRIPs), and bilateral agricultural market access.

On 8 November 2021, South Africa and India circulated a note to WTO members regarding the moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions.⁸³ The two countries sought clarification on the scope of the moratorium and its effects on developing economies.

On 10 November 2021, on the occasion of the Engagement with the Resident Heads of Mission from Europe and Americas, Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Naledi Pandor emphasized the government's leadership towards the pursuit of a TRIPS waiver at the WTO to enable quicker and more equitable access to vaccines for developing countries.⁸⁴

South Africa has advocated for WTO reform through its leadership of the TRIPS waiver, which considers the interests of developing and least developed countries as well as the principles and rules of the multilateral trading system.

Thus, South African receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Ieuan Edwards

⁸¹ G20 Ministerial Statement on Trade and Investment, G20 Information Centre (Sorrento) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 6 February 2022. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2021/211012-trade.html

⁸² Readout of Ambassador Katherine Tai's Meeting with South Africa Minister for Trade, Industry and Competition Ebrahim Patel, Office of the United States Trade Representatives (Sorrento) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2021/october/readout-ambassador-katherine-tais-meeting-south-africa-minister-trade-industry-and-competition>

⁸³ Work Programme on Electronic Commerce - The Moratorium on Customs Duties on Electronic Transmissions: Need for Clarity on its Scope and Impact, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 8 November 2021. Access Date: 9 February 2022. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W833.pdf&Open=True>

⁸⁴ Remarks by Dr GNM Pandor, Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, on the occasion of Engagement with the Resident Heads of Mission from Europe and Americas, South African Government (Pretoria) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/speeches/2021/pand1110.htm>

2. International Financial Institutions Reform

“We reaffirm our commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia		0	
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.20 (60%)		

Background

BRICS members have consistently addressed the topic of international financial institution (IFI) reform since the inception of the leaders’ summit, especially with regards to the International Monetary Fund (IMF). In addition to the present commitment found in the 2021 New Delhi Declaration, a similar commitment to “a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at the center of the global financial safety net” was adopted at the 2020 Moscow Summit,⁸⁵ the 2019 Brasilia Summit,⁸⁶ the 2018 Johannesburg Summit,⁸⁷ the 2016 Goa Summit,⁸⁸ and the 2015 Ufa Summit.⁸⁹

On 17 November 2021, BRICS leaders adopted the Moscow Declaration.⁹⁰ The leaders welcomed the IMF’s response to the COVID-19 pandemic, acknowledged the need to resource IMF financing, and noted the ongoing 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

Adopted on 14 November 2019, the Brasilia Declaration expressed its disappointment with the 15th GRQ, which failed to increase the quota size of the IMF and realign quota shares to increase the representation of emerging markets and developing countries.⁹¹ Similarly, at the 2018 Johannesburg Summit,⁹² the 2016 Goa Summit,⁹³ and the 2013 Durban Summit,⁹⁴ the BRICS leaders emphasized the importance of increasing the representation of the poorest IMF members in Sub-Saharan Africa and globally.

⁸⁵ Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁸⁶ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁸⁷ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁸⁸ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁸⁹ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁹⁰ Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁹¹ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁹² BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁹³ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 15 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁹⁴ BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Durban) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 15 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html

BRICS summit documents have also called on the IMF to efficiently conclude GRQs. At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the leaders observed a commitment to complete the 15th GRQ by 2019. This commitment mirrors that of the Xiamen Declaration adopted on 4 September 2017, which committed to the same deadline of 2019.⁹⁵

On 15 July 2014, the Fortaleza Declaration adopted by BRICS leaders called for the implementation of the 2010 IMF reforms and outcomes of the 14th GRQ.⁹⁶ The Declaration also stipulated the leaders' hope that IMF reforms would proceed "with a few to ensuring increased voice and representation of emerging markets and developing countries."

On 29 March 2012, at the 4th BRICS Summit in New Delhi, the leaders expressed concern for the pace of the IMF's quota and governance reforms, as well as the Fund's access to sufficient resources.⁹⁷ The Declaration also included a call for the IMF to improve its surveillance framework.

On 14 April 2011, the BRICS leaders adopted the Sanya Declaration, which called for IFIs to "reflect changes in the world economy, increasing the voice and representation of emerging economies and developing countries."⁹⁸ The leaders further called for improvements to the Special Drawing Rights' (SDRs) basket of currencies and reforms to international financial regulatory oversight.

Building on a decade of engagement on IFI reform, BRICS leaders met virtually at the 2021 summit hosted by India and reaffirmed their collective commitment "to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center."⁹⁹

Commitment Features

The commitment reads: "we reaffirm our commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center."¹⁰⁰

To define the key concepts in this commitment, "reaffirm" is understood to mean "affirm again, whereby affirm is to assert strongly, state as fact, confirm or ratify a judgment."¹⁰¹ This term qualifies the communique excerpt as a political binding commitment, and acknowledges that the commitment requires new efforts in an area that has been established in the past.¹⁰² As a low-binding commitment verb, "reaffirm" also encapsulates within the parameters of compliance any verbal statements by BRICS governments in support of the commitment.

According to the IMF, the Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) consists of "international reserves, central bank bilateral swap arrangements (BSAs), regional financing arrangements (RFAs), Fund resources, and market-

⁹⁵ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁹⁶ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 15 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

⁹⁷ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 23 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html

⁹⁸ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 23 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html

⁹⁹ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 17 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

¹⁰⁰ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 17 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

¹⁰¹ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁰² Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 15 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

based instruments.”¹⁰³ The GFSN’s purpose is to “(i) provide insurance for countries against a crisis; (ii) supply financing when crises hit; and (iii) incentivize sound macroeconomic policies.”

The IMF is an international organization that works to “foster global monetary cooperation, secure financial stability, facilitate international trade, promote high employment and sustainable economic growth, and reduce poverty around the world.”¹⁰⁴ The Fund is governed and financed by quotas, which are denominated in SDRs and determined by an IMF Member’s relative economic standing.¹⁰⁵ In other words, quotas are the determinant of an IMF Member’s financial obligations to the organization, voting power, and access to financing.

The IMF Board of Governors conducts GRQs every five years. Over the past decade, under the New Arrangements to Borrow, a group of Members have provided additional lending resources to the IMF, maintaining their relative shares as aggregate IMF quotas doubled. This change was introduced to ensure that the IMF was “adequately resourced,” or to provide the IMF with resources to operate at its optimal capacity.

The present commitment is understood in two parts. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must reaffirm its commitment to both 1) a strong Global Financial Safety Net and 2) a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

To comply with the first part of the commitment, the BRICS member should take actions to support a robust GFSN (see definition and objectives above). The GFSN refers to a wider breadth of international, regional, and domestic financial institutions. Examples of compliant actions include aligning domestic policies with regional financing arrangements or providing support to financial and market instruments that safeguard against financial crises in developing economies.

With regards to the latter half of the commitment, examples of compliance include policy actions taken with a view to increasing the BRICS member’s financial contributions to the Fund or expressing support for a future quota increase during GRQs to ensure the adequate availability of IMF financing.

Falling short of fulfilling both parts of the commitment, a BRICS member would receive a score of 0 for partial compliance if it reaffirmed its commitment to the GFSN without reference to a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF. Partial compliance would also be assigned to a BRICS member that somewhat complies with both aspects of the commitment or lacks strong compliance and concrete actions in one or the other.

Non-compliance, or a score of -1, would be assigned to a BRICS member that does not take any actions within the compliance cycle to reaffirm its pledge to a strong GFSN or reforms to the IMF’s quota system and adequate resourcing.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does NOT reaffirm its commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net with a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.
0	The BRICS member reaffirms its commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net OR a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.
+1	The BRICS member reaffirms its commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net WITH a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou

¹⁰³ Adequacy of the Global Financial Safety Net, International Monetary Fund (Washington DC) 23 March 2016. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.imf.org/external/np/pp/eng/2016/031016.pdf>

¹⁰⁴ About the IMF, International Monetary Fund (Washington DC) Access Date: 15 November 2021. <https://www.imf.org/en/About>

¹⁰⁵ IMF Quotas, International Monetary Fund (Washington DC) 4 March 2021. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/Sheets/2016/07/14/12/21/IMF-Quotas>

Brazil: -1

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to reaffirm a strong Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) as its center.

On 13 October 2021, at a meeting of G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, Brazil signed on to a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net, with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its centre.¹⁰⁶

On 14 October 2021, Brazil signed on to the final communiqué of the International Monetary and Finance Committee.¹⁰⁷ The communiqué called upon IMF members to sign voluntary trading arrangements for Special Drawing Rights (SDRs), supported the establishment of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust within the IMF framework, recommended the scaling up of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust, and reaffirmed a commitment to revisit the adequacy of quotas under the 16th General Review of Quotas by December 2023.

On 4 November 2021, the Central Bank of Brazil (BCB) published the Financial Stability Report, which concluded that systemically important financial market infrastructures (FMIs) ran efficiently and safely throughout the first half of 2021.¹⁰⁸ The BCB will continue working to improve the cybersecurity of FMIs and the management of social and environmental risks.

On 15 December 2021, Minister of the Economy Paulo Guedes declared that Brazil will not recognize the IMF's permanent representative to Brazil starting from June 30, when the current representative is due to be replaced.¹⁰⁹ Minister Guedes also denied the IMF's economic forecasts.

On 28 January 2022, the Ministry of the Economy announced that it will gradually phase out its Tax on Financial Operations levied on foreign exchange transactions by 2029 to accelerate its accession to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.¹¹⁰

On 7 March 2022, the Central Bank published the Minutes of the 48th Meeting of the Financial Stability Committee, whereby the Central Bank pointed out recent developments in the international economy and tightened global financial conditions.¹¹¹ Responding to these developments, the Committee stated that it would minimize any exacerbated spillover on the prices of local assets, in particular through the foreign exchange market.

Although Brazil took stock of progress in its domestic financial systems through BCB's reporting, Brazil did not reaffirm its commitment to a strong GFSN by engaging in regional or international financial alignment. Furthermore, although Brazil participated in G20 and IMF meetings that reaffirmed the importance of a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF, its withdrawal of recognition of the IMF representative demonstrates actions counter to the objective of the present commitment.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

¹⁰⁶ Italian G20 Presidency - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting - Communiqué, G20 Sustainable Finance Working Group (Washington DC) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://g20sfwg.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/G20-FMDBG-Communique%CC%81-Fourth-G20-FMDBG-meeting-13-October-2021.pdf>

¹⁰⁷ Communiqué of the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington, D.C.) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/10/14/communique-of-the-forty-fourth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

¹⁰⁸ Financial Stability Report, Banco Central Do Brasil (Brasília) 4 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.bcb.gov.br/en/publications/financialstabilityreport>

¹⁰⁹ Brazil Sacks IMF Office, Complaining About its Estimates, Bloomberg (New York) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2021-12-15/brazil-dismisses-imf-mission-complaining-about-its-estimates>

¹¹⁰ Brazil Will Phase Out Forex Tax as Part of Effort to Join OECD, Bloomberg Tax (London) 28 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://news.bloombergtax.com/daily-tax-report-international/brazil-will-phase-out-forex-tax-as-part-of-effort-to-join-oecd>

¹¹¹ Minutes of the Meeting of the Financial Stability Committee, Banco Central Do Brasil (Brasilia) 7 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. https://www.bcb.gov.br/en/financialstability/comefminutes/Minutes_48_Comef_en

Analyst: Tianyang Qi

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to reaffirm a strong Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) as its center.

On 13 October 2021, at a meeting of G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, Russia signed on to a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong Global Financial Safety Net, with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its centre.¹¹²

On 14 October 2021, Russia signed on to the final communiqué of the International Monetary and Finance Committee.¹¹³ The communiqué called upon IMF members to sign voluntary trading arrangements for Special Drawing Rights, supported the establishment of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust within the IMF framework, recommended the scaling up of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust, and reaffirmed a commitment to revisit the adequacy of quotas under the 16th General Review of Quotas by December 2023.

On 6 December 2021, the leaders of Russia and India held a working meeting in New Delhi and issued a joint statement. The parties noted progress achieved in many spheres throughout the two decades of strategic cooperation and highlighted prospects for further engagement, including the integration of Russia-promoted MIR payment system within India's national payment system. Also, Russia invited Indian credit institutions to engage with the financial messaging system of the Bank of Russia to facilitate faultless interbank transaction.¹¹⁴

Through its participation in international meetings, Russia has demonstrated reaffirmation of a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF. However, it has not demonstrated concrete policy action to support a strong GFSN within the compliance cycle.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Chun Yin Justin Ng

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm a strong Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) as its center.

On 13 October 2021, at a meeting of G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, India signed on to a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong GFSN, with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its centre.¹¹⁵

On 14 October 2021, India signed on to the final communiqué of the International Monetary and Finance Committee.¹¹⁶ The communiqué called upon IMF members to sign voluntary trading arrangements for Special Drawing Rights, supported the establishment of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust within the IMF

¹¹² Italian G20 Presidency - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting - Communiqué, G20 Sustainable Finance Working Group (Washington DC) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://g20sfwg.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/G20-FMDBG-Communique%CC%81-Fourth-G20-FMDBG-meeting-13-October-2021.pdf>

¹¹³ Communiqué of the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington, D.C.) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/10/14/communique-of-the-forty-fourth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

¹¹⁴ Partnership for Peace, Progress and Prosperity. India-Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, President of Russia (Moscow) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5745>

¹¹⁵ Italian G20 Presidency - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting - Communiqué, G20 Sustainable Finance Working Group (Washington DC) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://g20sfwg.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/G20-FMDBG-Communique%CC%81-Fourth-G20-FMDBG-meeting-13-October-2021.pdf>

¹¹⁶ Communiqué of the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington, D.C.) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/10/14/communique-of-the-forty-fourth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

framework, recommended the scaling up of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust, and reaffirmed a commitment to revisit the adequacy of quotas under the 16th General Review of Quotas by December 2023.

On 5 November 2021, the third India-Senegal Joint Commission meeting was held in Dakar, Senegal.¹¹⁷ India and Senegal agreed to continue bilateral development cooperation in economic sectors such as trade and investment.

On 19 December 2021, India held the third meeting of the India-Central Asia Dialogue, welcoming the Ministers of Foreign Affairs of Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.¹¹⁸ The Minister of External Affairs emphasized the need to establish cooperation between specialized national institutions in the field of finance.

On 29 December 2021, the Reserve Bank released the 24th issue of its financial stability report, which evaluates risks to financial stability and the resilience of the financial system.¹¹⁹ The report acknowledged the impact of the pandemic on domestic and global economic recovery, and signalled confidence in sufficient capital to respond to stress conditions in credit risk.

On 15 January 2022, Minister of External Affairs Dr. S. Jaishankar and the Minister of Finance of Sri Lanka H.E. Basil Rajapaksa agreed to extend USD400 million to Sri Lanka under the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation's currency swap arrangement.¹²⁰ To assist Sri Lanka, the Ministers also agreed to defer its Asian Clearing Union settlement of USD515.2 million by two months.

On 22 February 2022, the Minister of Finance convened a meeting of the Financial Stability and Development Council in Mumbai.¹²¹ The Council deliberated on the major macro-financial challenges arising in view of global and domestic developments and emphasized the need to maintain constant vigilance on financial conditions and the functioning of financial institutions, especially considering financial vulnerabilities in the medium and long-term.

On 2 May 2022, Prime Minister Modi co-chaired the plenary session of the India-Germany Inter-Governmental Consultation with German Chancellor Olaf Scholz.¹²² Both sides agreed to strengthen collaboration on risk finance and insurance solutions against climate and disaster risks as well as capacity-building.

¹¹⁷ Joint Statement on Third India-Senegal Joint Commission Meeting, Ministry of External Affairs Government of India (Dakar) 5 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34483/Joint_Statement_on_Third_IndiaSenegal_Joint_Commission_Meeting_November_05_2021

¹¹⁸ Joint Statement of the 3rd meeting of the India-Central Asia Dialogue, Ministry of External Affairs Government of India (New Delhi) 19 December 2021. Access Date: 17 January 2022. https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34705/Joint_Statement_of_the_3rd_meeting_of_the_IndiaCentral_Asia_Dialogue

¹¹⁹ RBI releases the Financial Stability Report, December 2021, Reserve Bank of India (New Delhi) 29 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. https://rbi.org.in/Scripts/BS_PressReleaseDisplay.aspx?prid=52996

¹²⁰ Virtual Meeting between EAM and Finance Minister of Sri Lanka H.E. Basil Rajapaksa, Ministry of External Affairs Government of India (New Delhi) 15 January 2022. Access Date: 17 January 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34752/Virtual_Meeting_between_EAM_and_Finance_Minister_of_Sri_Lanka_HE_Basil_Rajapaksa

¹²¹ Press Release: 25th meeting of Financial Stability and Development Council held in Mumbai. FSDC notes the need for constant vigil on financial conditions and functioning of financial institutions. Minister of Finance Department of Economic Affairs (Mumbai) 22 February 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. https://dea.gov.in/sites/default/files/Press%20release%20for%20the%2025th%20meeting%20of%20the%20Financial%20Stability%20and%20Development%20Council_0.pdf

¹²² Prime Minister Co-chairs the Plenary Session of the 6th India-Germany Inter-Governmental Consultations, Minister of External Affairs (Berlin) 2 May 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/35254/prime+minister+cochairs+the+plenary+session+of+the+6th+indiagermany+intergovernmental+consultations>

India has taken action to provide support and engage in cooperation vis-à-vis financial and market instruments, especially with developing countries, in support of a robust GFSN. In compliance with the second part of the commitment, India has joined international action in reference to a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Tianyang Qi

China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to reaffirm a strong Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) as its center.

On 13 October 2021, Governor of the People's Bank of China Yi Gang attended the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors.¹²³ At the meeting, the participants agreed to support vulnerable countries in response to COVID-19 and welcomed new IMF allocation of Special Drawing Rights. The ministerial meeting also reiterated the present commitment and agreed to continue advancing the 16th General Review of Quotas (GRQ).

On 14 October 2021, Governor Yi attended the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee.¹²⁴ All meeting participants supported the allocation of SDRs to vulnerable countries. China expressed its support for countries with stronger external financial positions to channel their SDRs to vulnerable countries. China further supported scaling up the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust, establishing a Resilience and Sustainability Trust, and revisiting the adequacy of quotas under the 16th GRQ by December 2023.¹²⁵

On 22 April 2022, Governor Yi attended the 45th Meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee. The meeting welcomed the establishment of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust, which would lay the foundation for the voluntary allocation of SDRs.¹²⁶ The meeting also reaffirmed its support for the completion of the 16th GRQ.

Although China has not demonstrated concrete policy action to support a robust GFSN, China has expressed support for a future increase of quotas during GRQs, thus reaffirming its commitment to a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its center.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Chun Yin Justin Ng

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm a strong Global Financial Safety Net (GFSN) with a quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF) as its center.

¹²³ Governor Yi Gang Attended G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting Virtually, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 15 October 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2022. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4157443/4361722/index.html>

¹²⁴ Governor Yi Gang attended the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 15 October 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2022. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/en/3688110/3688172/4157443/4361725/index.html>

¹²⁵ Communiqué of the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington, D.C.) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/10/14/communique-of-the-forty-fourth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

¹²⁶ Governor Yi Gang Attended the Forty-fifth Meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee Virtually, People's Bank of China (Beijing) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <http://www.pbc.gov.cn/goutongjiaoliu/113456/113469/4535327/index.html>

On 13 October 2021, at a meeting of G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors, South Africa signed on to a communiqué that reaffirmed its commitment to a strong GFSN, with a strong quota-based and adequately resourced IMF at its centre.¹²⁷

On 14 October 2021, Reserve Bank Governor Lesetja Kganyago signed on to the final communiqué of the International Monetary and Finance Committee.¹²⁸ The communiqué called upon IMF members to sign voluntary trading arrangements for Special Drawing Rights (SDRs, supported the establishment of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust (RST) within the IMF framework, recommended the scaling up of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust (PRGT), and reaffirmed a commitment to revisit the adequacy of quotas under the 16th General Review of Quotas by December 2023.

On 15 October 2021, the National Treasury released a revised technical paper entitled “Financing a Sustainable Economy,” which issued recommendations on how best to reflect environmental, social, and governance risks associated with climate-related financial shocks in government practices and regulations.¹²⁹ The recommendations highlighted the need to expand the use of sustainable finance mechanisms and develop a benchmark climate risk scenario for stress tests by financial sector actors and regulators.

On 11 November 2021, as part of the release of the Medium Term Budget Policy Statements for 2021, South Africa committed to “implement the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) and support recapitalisation of the World Bank and the African Development Bank in line with South Africa’s shareholding duties in these institutions”¹³⁰ The IFMS is a Cabinet-mandated modernization program aimed at replacing aging financial and supply chain management systems across the public service, which could help facilitate South Africa’s ability to withstand external financial crises.¹³¹

On 30 November 2021, during the 45th Annual Meeting of G77 Ministers of Foreign Affairs, Deputy Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Alvin Botes welcomed both the new general allocation of SDRs and recent voluntary SDR pledges, calling for an increase in both, given the liquidity crises faced by developing countries.¹³²

On 10 December 2021, the Central Bank’s Prudential Authority published a regulatory framework for financial conglomerates, creating new stipulations surrounding risk management, intragroup transactions, and financial exposures.¹³³ This framework is in line with recommendations contained in the IMF’s 2014 Financial Sector Assessment Program report.

On 20 March 2022, during a meeting of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) Council of Ministers, member states including South Africa urged countries to sign the Agreement on the

¹²⁷ Italian G20 Presidency - Fourth G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors meeting - Communiqué, G20 Sustainable Finance Working Group (Washington DC) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://g20sfwg.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/G20-FMDBG-Communique%CC%81-Fourth-G20-FMDBG-meeting-13-October-2021.pdf>

¹²⁸ Communiqué of the Forty-Fourth Meeting of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington, D.C.) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2021/10/14/communique-of-the-forty-fourth-meeting-of-the-imfc>

¹²⁹ Financing a Sustainable Economy – Technical Paper, 2021, National Treasury of South Africa (Pretoria) 15 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022.

http://www.treasury.gov.za/comm_media/press/2021/2021101501%20Financing%20a%20Sustainable%20Economy.pdf

¹³⁰ Medium Term Budget Policy Statement 2021, National Treasury of South Africa (Pretoria) 11 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/mtbps/2021/mtbps/FullMTBPS.pdf>

¹³¹ About Us, Integrated Financial Management System (Pretoria) 14 January 2022. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <http://www.ifms.gov.za/About.aspx#Background>

¹³² Deputy Minister Alvin Botes: 45th Annual Meeting of Ministers of Foreign Affairs of Member States of the Group of 77, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-alvin-botes-45th-annual-meeting-ministers-foreign-affairs-member-states>

¹³³ Final Prudential Standards for financial conglomerates FC02 to FC05, South African Reserve Bank (Pretoria) 10 December 2021. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.resbank.co.za/en/home/publications/publication-detail-pages/prudential-authority/PA-financial-sector-regulation/Financial-Conglomerates-/Prudential-Standards/2021/Prudential-Standards-for-financial-conglomerates>

Operationalization of the SADC Regional Development Fund (RDF).¹³⁴ The SADC RDF would help to ensure sustainable financing of regional programs.

On 25 April 2022, during the Spring Meetings of the IMF and World Bank, Finance Minister Enoch Godongwana affirmed South Africa's commitment to deepening its relationship with multilateral development banks and enhancing South Africa's Presidential Climate Finance Task Team.¹³⁵

South Africa has reaffirmed its commitment to a quota-based and adequately resourced IMF as its center by welcoming the August 2021 increase in SDR allocations, and by calling for support to the PRGT and the creation of the Resilience and Sustainability Trust. Furthermore, South Africa reaffirmed its commitment to a strong GFSN by aligning domestic regulatory frameworks with recommended best practices from the IMF's international financial arrangements. South Africa has also invested in the modernization of domestic systems that may help facilitate the mitigation of external shocks.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Ashton Mathias

¹³⁴ SADC Council of Ministers deliberates on regional integration, cooperation and economic development, Southern African Development Community (Lilongwe) 20 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.sadc.int/news-events/news/sadc-council-ministers-deliberates-regional-integration-cooperation-and-economic-development/>

¹³⁵ Finance Minister Enoch Godongwana Represented South Africa at the 2022 Spring Meetings of the International Monetary Fund and World Bank Group, Ministry of Finance of the Republic of South Africa (Pretoria) 25 April 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.treasury.gov.za/comm_media/press/2022/2022042501%20Media%20statement%20-%202022%20IMF%20World%20Bank%20Spring%20Meetings.pdf

3. Development: Sustainable and Inclusive Recovery

“[We encourage]...to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.80 (90%)		

Background

As significant emerging economies, the BRICS members have focused on developing countries since they first met as BRIC in 2009. This meeting and the several following meetings were mainly to discuss the global economy, global development and recovery.^{136,137,138}

At the Fourth BRICS Summit in New Delhi, the BRICS leaders began to expand their focus in global development and recovery to encompass both education and jobs, stating: “We believe that it is critical for advanced economies to adopt responsible macroeconomic and financial policies, avoid creating excessive global liquidity and undertake structural reforms to lift growth that create jobs...Creating jobs needed to improve people’s living standards worldwide is critical...We encourage expanding the channels of communication, exchanges and people-to-people contact amongst the BRICS, including in the areas of youth, education, culture, tourism and sports.”¹³⁹

In 2013, at the Durban Summit, the BRICS leaders first acknowledged the fundamental role played by small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) In the communiqué, they said: “SMEs are major creators of jobs and wealth. In this regard, we will explore opportunities for cooperating in the field of SMEs and recognise the need for promoting dialogue among the respective Ministries and Agencies in charge of the theme, particularly with a view to promoting their international exchange and cooperation and fostering innovation, research and development.”¹⁴⁰

At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the BRICS leaders met under the theme “Inclusive Growth: Sustainable Solutions.” They discussed inclusive economic and social policies, sustainable recovery, education, jobs and SMEs.¹⁴¹ The 2015 Ufa Summit discussed the investment in education, inclusive and equitable quality education

¹³⁶ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>

¹³⁷ 2nd BRIC Summit of Heads of State and Government: Joint Statement, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 April 2010. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100415-leaders.html>

¹³⁸ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

¹³⁹ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

¹⁴⁰ BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>

¹⁴¹ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

and the importance of higher education. As well, they committed to supporting “the efforts aimed at establishing and enhancing the cooperation mechanisms in such areas as SMEs support”.¹⁴²

While job creation was only mentioned once at the 2016 Goa Summit, micro, small and medium enterprises were acknowledged as major employment opportunities. The BRICS leaders stated that “We agreed that MSMEs [micro-, small and medium-sized enterprises] provide major employment opportunities, at comparatively lower capital cost, and create self-employment opportunities in rural and underdeveloped areas. MSMEs thus help assure equitable wealth distribution nationally and globally. We commend organisation of BRICS second round-table on MSMEs by India with a focus on technical and business alliances in MSMEs Sector. We agree to work for greater integration of MSMEs in Regional and Global Value Chains.”¹⁴³

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS leaders stated: “We stress the importance of education to promoting sustainable economic and social development, and to strengthening BRICS partnership, and commend the positive progress in our education cooperation. We reiterate our support for BRICS University League and BRICS Network University in conducting education and research cooperation, welcome efforts to promote cooperation among educational think tanks, and exchanges among youth including by organizing youth summer camps and offering more scholarship opportunities to BRICS students. We agree to share experience and practices in realizing education-related sustainable development goals.”¹⁴⁴

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS leaders met under the theme: “BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution.” They discussed inclusive and sustainable growth, economic and social recovery, job creation, education and SMEs.¹⁴⁵

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS leaders did discuss sustainable development in terms of economic and social, as well as environment, but did not discuss education. SMEs and job creation were also discussed, but the main focus was about strengthening and reforming the multilateral system, economic and financial cooperation, and intra-BRICS cooperation.¹⁴⁶

The 2020 Moscow Summit was held under the theme of “BRICS Partnership for Global Stability, Shared Security and Innovative Growth,” in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic. The BRICS leaders stated, “We emphasize the crucial role of education for enhancing human capital, for the re-skilling and up-skilling of people in the post-COVID 19 recovery, achieving sustainable development and allowing for an inclusive economic growth” and “we welcome the adoption of the Guidelines for Promoting Effective Participation of MSMEs in International Trade that promotes MSMEs integration in global value chains and their operation performance.” Quality education, economic growth and sustainable development played key roles at the 2020 Moscow Summit.¹⁴⁷

Commitment Features

The BRICS commitment is “[We encourage]...to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).” The commitment includes two main components: mitigating negative social and economic

¹⁴² VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 9 November 2021. brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

¹⁴³ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

¹⁴⁴ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

¹⁴⁵ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

¹⁴⁶ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasil.html>

¹⁴⁷ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

consequences, within which the educational process for the former and safeguarding jobs for the latter are the most important focuses.

“Encourage” “does not imply strong measurability in the commitment. It should be taken as a soft commitment where no concrete action is to be taken.”¹⁴⁸ “To take necessary measures” refers to undertaking any and all ways of achieving the goal of this commitment: mitigating negative social and economic consequences. “Mitigate” refers “to make something less harmful, unpleasant or bad.”¹⁴⁹ “Negative social and economic consequences” refers to the adverse impacts on society and the economy that occur. In this commitment, social includes and prioritizes education while economic includes and prioritizes safeguarding jobs, particular in the SME sector. “Sustainable and inclusive recovery” refers to the process of growing and healing from negative social and economic consequences in a way that is “able to continue over a period of time”¹⁵⁰ and includes all types of people and society. “Ensure continuity” refers to “the fact of something continuing for a long period of time without being changed or stopped.”¹⁵¹ For this commitment, the reference is to ensuring people’s education is not interrupted from year to year. “Educational process” refers to the years spent in school, from primary to secondary to tertiary education.

“Safeguard jobs” refers to protecting employment and employment opportunities from further damage or harm and to ensure they are not lost.¹⁵² “Especially” refers to “very much; more than usual or more than other people or things.”¹⁵³ MSMEs refer to companies that have fewer than 10, 50 and 250 employees, respectively, according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.¹⁵⁴

For full compliance, a BRICS member does not need to take concrete action but does need to take action on addressing both social and economic consequences, including on education and jobs, particularly in MSMEs. If a BRICS member takes action on address social and economic consequences without addressing education and jobs, particularly in MSMEs, it would be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member addresses social consequences, including education, but not economic consequences, including jobs, it would be considered partial compliance. Actions that would contribute to compliance could including attending or hosting meetings, verbal reaffirmation of the commitment, statements on intentions to address the commitment or making speeches.

¹⁴⁸ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 10 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁴⁹ Mitigate, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 10 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/mitigate>

¹⁵⁰ Sustainable, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/sustainable>

¹⁵¹ Continuity, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/continuity>

¹⁵² Safeguard, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/safeguard>

¹⁵³ Especially, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 10 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/especially>

¹⁵⁴ Enterprises by business size, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (Paris) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://data.oecd.org/entrepreneur/enterprises-by-business-size.htm>

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises.
0	The BRICS member somewhat takes necessary measures to mitigate negative social OR economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process OR to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises.
+1	The BRICS member somewhat takes necessary measures to mitigate negative social AND economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process AND to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Sonja Dobson

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 24 September 2020, Brazil took a USD750 million loan from the Inter-American Development Bank to strengthen lines of credit for 11,000 MSMEs.¹⁵⁵ The loan was used to provide liquidity to Brazil's development bank BNDES to alleviate scarcity caused by the COVID-19 pandemic.

On 18 October 2021, the federal government program "Pronampe" released stimulus for MSMEs reaching USD11.3 billion in 850,000 lines of credit, of which 74 per cent went to small companies and 26 per cent to micro companies.¹⁵⁶ Additionally, the pandemic emergency credit access program "Peac" released USD3.6 billion into an investment guarantee fund to increase liquidity and back more loans for MSMEs.

On 21 October 2021, the federal government, in partnership with the UK government, announced a new digital service called the "Global Trade Hub" to benefit MSMEs to be released in 2022.¹⁵⁷ The service would provide MSMEs an integrated, digitized service to promote exports including a self-diagnosis tool for export maturity, along with business training, market intelligence to facilitate internationalization of firms.

On 21 November 2021, the Associated Press reported that disruptions in schooling caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, along with the politicisation of university entrance exams by President Bolsonaro's administration, caused a decrease in students registered for university entrance exams to decrease forty-four per cent from the previous year.¹⁵⁸

¹⁵⁵ Brazil to uphold MSMEs financial sustainability during the COVID-19 crisis, Inter-American Development Bank (Washington, D.C.) 29 September 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.iadb.org/en/news/brazil-uphold-msmes-financial-sustainability-during-covid-19-crisis>

¹⁵⁶ Measures to stimulate the economy carried out by the government reach R\$ 1.169 trillion, Ministry of Economy (Brasilia) 18 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/outubro/medidas-de-estimulo-a-economia-executadas-pelo-governo-atingem-r-1-169-trilhao>

¹⁵⁷ Brazilian government presents a new platform for the internationalization of small businesses at the WTO, Ministry of Economy (Brasilia) 21 October 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/setembro/governo-brasileiro-apresenta-na-omc-nova-plataforma-de-internacionalizacao-de-pequenos-negocios>

¹⁵⁸ Pandemic dents turnout at Brazil university entrance exams, Marcelo Silva de Sousa (Rio de Janeiro) 21 November 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://apnews.com/article/college-admissions-coronavirus-pandemic-health-caribbean-pandemics-7b4595b7f486404e9ce619622c0891e1>

On 7 January 2022, the Ministry of Economy opened the Special Secretariat for Productivity and Competitiveness to provide products and services to benefit MSMEs, particularly to promote digital sales and e-commerce on Amazon.com.br.¹⁵⁹ This includes providing seminars and training programs for MSMEs, individual microentrepreneurs and artisans, and opening a page on amazon dedicated to Brazilian artisan handicrafts.

On 19 April 2022, Minister of Education Victor Good participated in an online event: High-Level Dialogue on Recovery from the Impact of the Pandemic on Education in LAC - “From Crisis to Action: The Time for Saving Education in Latin America is Now,” with the aim of involving the ministers of finance and education in a discussion about the implications that the education crisis brings for the economic growth of the region and to seek support around an action agenda.¹⁶⁰ The event was attended by the Ministers of Education of Ecuador, Panama and Colombia.

On 26 May 2022, Brazil’s largest state-controlled bank, Banco do Brasil, announced BRL6 billion in credit for SMEs.¹⁶¹ This brings the total loan amount to BR210 billion.

On 24 May 2022, Federal Government of Brazil published Decree 11.079/22 in the Federal Official Gazette, which creates the National Policy for the Recovery of Learning in Basic Education.¹⁶² The government's strategy is to implement programs and actions to recover learning and prevent school dropout and dropout in basic education, which grew during the pandemic. According to the government, the project was developed from the active listening carried out at the Regional Coordination Meetings, from international and national studies and experiences. Brazil has fully complied with its commitment by extending various lines of credit to stimulate MSMEs, as well as to keep continuity in the educational process.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Jarod Bechard

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 27 September 2021, Russia expanded its employment incentive programme, which provided subsidies to employers hiring officially unemployed people, the disabled, single mothers, or parents with disabled children or more than three minor children, to restore employment under the COVID-19 pandemic.¹⁶³

¹⁵⁹ Ministry of Economy and Amazon Brasil promote training for MSEs, MEIs and artisans, Ministry of Economy (Brasilia) 5 January 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/janeiro/ministerio-da-economia-e-amazon-brasil-promovem-capacitacao-para-mpe2019s-mei2019s-e-artesaos>

¹⁶⁰ Ministro da Educação participa de debate sobre crise educacional, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 19 April 2022. Access Date: 16 June 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mec/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ministro-da-educacao-participa-de-debate-sobre-crise-educacional>.

¹⁶¹ State-controlled bank to expand credit for small and medium-sized firms, The Brazilian Report (Brasilia) 26 May 2022. Access Date: 27 May 2022. <https://brazilian.report/liveblog/2022/05/26/state-controlled-bank-to-expand-credit-for-small-and-medium-sized-firms/>

¹⁶² Decreto Nº 11.079, De 23 De Maio De 2022, Diário Oficial Da União (Brasilia) 24 May 2022. Access Date: 16 June 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.in.gov.br/web/dou/-/decreto-n-11.079-de-23-de-maio-de-2022-402040949>.

¹⁶³ Meeting with deputy prime ministers, Government House (Moscow) 27 September 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43351/>

On 25 October 2021, Russia provided approximately RUB38.5 billion of grants to SMEs and businesses which directly interact with people to support about 3 million people.¹⁶⁴

On 28 October 2021, Russia set the export duties on aluminium alloys, which were 15 per cent duty on aluminium alloy with no less than RUB150 per 1 metric tonne, at 0 per cent to maintain employment levels at alloy plants.¹⁶⁵

On 26 November 2021, Russia announced that 19 Russian regions would receive around RUB860 million from the federal budget in 2021 for several purposes, including promoting employment.¹⁶⁶

On 25 January 2022, the Russian government had a meeting on implementing socioeconomic development initiatives to 2030.¹⁶⁷ The discussions were on initiatives to improve living standards and develop the socioeconomic sphere through raising engineering education, developing entrepreneurship in universities and the quality of IT education.

On 27 January 2022, the Russian government had a meeting on implementing socioeconomic development initiatives to 2030.¹⁶⁸ The discussions included measures to create a more convenient business environment for beginner entrepreneurs launching start-ups, create new jobs, and develop industries.

On 1 February 2022, the Russian government had a meeting on implementing socioeconomic development initiatives to 2030.¹⁶⁹ The discussions included launching the Social Treasury initiative which will create a fair, targeted support system for people, moving all types of assistance to be uniform to remove red tape, and improving education standards for college students.

On 4 May 2022, President Vladimir Putin recognized the need of supporting labour market when meeting Labour Minister Anton Kotyakov.¹⁷⁰

Russia has taken actions toward mitigating negative economic consequences through providing subsidies and grants, reducing duties, and allocating the federal budget. Furthermore, it has encouraged lessening negative social consequences and investing in the educational process.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yuet Ottica Chong

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

¹⁶⁴ Meeting with deputy prime ministers on current issues, Government House (Moscow) 25 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43634/>

¹⁶⁵ Government approves zero duties on aluminium alloys, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 28 October 2021. Access Date 13 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43663/>

¹⁶⁶ Government meeting, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43914/>

¹⁶⁷ Meeting on implementing the initiatives of Russia's socioeconomic development through to 2030, Russian Government (Moscow) 25 January 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44398/>

¹⁶⁸ Meeting on implementing socio-economic development initiatives to 2030 and their results, Russian Government (Moscow) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44422/>

¹⁶⁹ Meeting on implementing socioeconomic development initiatives to 2030 and their results, Russian Government (Moscow) 1 February 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44452/>

¹⁷⁰ Putin highlights importance of supporting Russia's labour market, CGTN (Beijing) 4 May 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://news.cgtn.com/news/2022-05-04/Putin-highlights-importance-of-supporting-Russia-s-labor-market-19Lsv7vnXsQ/index.html>

On 10 September 2021, the Employees' State Insurance Corporation announced the extension of the Atal Beemit Vyakti Kalyan Yojana scheme up to 30 June 2022.¹⁷¹ The scheme pays an unemployment allowance at 50 per cent of wages for three months to insured people who lose their jobs without a reason.

On 22 September 2021, Union Education Minister Shri Dharmendra Pradhan held a meeting on the use of digital education to universalize education.¹⁷² Technology would be used to develop an integrated ecosystem that covered education from school to higher education to skill development and teachers training.

On 25 September 2021, Union Labour and Unemployment Minister Shri Bhupender Yadav distributed e-Shram cards to unorganised workers who can use the cards to avail the benefits of government schemes.¹⁷³ COVID-19 Relief Scheme approval letters were also given to the dependents of 11 workers who lost their lives to COVID-19.

On 29 September 2021, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved the continuation of the national scheme for PM POSHAN in Schools for five more years.¹⁷⁴ One cooked meal is provided to government operated and government aided schools through the scheme. The scheme covers about 118 million school children.

On 30 September 2021, Minister Yadav launched DigiSaksham which is a digital skills program.¹⁷⁵ DigiSaksham aims to improve youth employability by providing free training in digital skills. The training can be accessed through the National Career Service Portal.

On 1 October 2021, the Ministry of Labour and Unemployment's revised rate of Minimum Wages – Variable Dearness Allowance (VDA) became effective.¹⁷⁶ The VDA was revised on the basis of average Consumer Price Index for industrial workers and will benefit around 15 million workers.

On 4 October 2021, the government extended the Credit Guarantee Scheme for Subordinate Debt up to 31 March 2022.¹⁷⁷ The scheme provides credit facilities to stressed MSMEs through lending institutions.

On 25 October 2021, Minister Pradhan launched phase two of the Mahatma Gandhi National Fellowship which is a two-year fellowship that enhances skill development.¹⁷⁸ The fellowship combines classroom sessions with field immersion to increase employment and economic output in rural areas.

On 25 October 2021, the Department of School Education and Literacy created the National Steering Committee (NSC) to implement the National Initiative for Proficiency in Reading with Understanding and

¹⁷¹ Key decisions announced at the 185th meeting of ESIC, Ministry of Labour & Employment (Delhi) 10 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1753858>

¹⁷² Union Education Minister holds a meeting on Universalization on Quality Education through Digital Education, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 22 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1757000>

¹⁷³ Labour Minister Shri Bhupender Yadav distributes e-Shram Cards and approval letters for Relief Schemes to unorganized workers in Mumbai, Ministry of Labour & Employment (Delhi) 25 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1758128>

¹⁷⁴ Cabinet approves continuation/revisions/modifications of centrally sponsored national scheme for PM POSHAN in Schools for five more years, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 29 September Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1759256>

¹⁷⁵ Shri Bhupender Yadav launches DigiSaksham- joint initiative of Labour Ministry with Microsoft India to enhance employability of youth, Ministry of Labour & Employment (Delhi) 30 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1759684>

¹⁷⁶ Rate of Minimum Wages (Variable Dearness Allowance) Revised for Central sphere workers, Ministry of Labour & Employment (Delhi) 29 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1767465>

¹⁷⁷ Credit Guarantee Scheme for Subordinate Debt (CGSSD) extended up to 31.03.2022, Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (Delhi) 4 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1760766>

¹⁷⁸ Union Minister for Education and Skill Development inaugurates phase-II of Mahatma Gandhi National Fellowship, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 25 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1766303>

Numeracy (NIPUN).¹⁷⁹ NIPUN aims to make sure every child is proficient in literacy and numeracy by grade three. NSC will disseminate tools to measure yearly progress and develop a methodology to analyse progress.

On 27 October 2021, the Ministry of Education notified the four-year integrated Teacher Education Programme (ITEP).¹⁸⁰ ITEP enables a student-teacher to get a degree in education alongside another specialised discipline. It also allows students to complete their Bachelors in four years instead of five, saving one year.

On 29 November 2021, the Ministry of Education introduced Manodarpan, an initiative that aims to provide psychosocial support to students, teachers and families to improve mental health and emotional wellbeing.¹⁸¹ A working group comprising of experts from education, mental health and psychosocial fields was set up to promote mental wellbeing through counselling, online resources and a helpline.

On 8 December 2021, the All India Council for Technical Education accepted the recommendations of the National Fee Committee that outline the maximum tuition fee for programs. All state governments were asked to comply with the recommendations to make education more affordable.¹⁸²

On 12 January 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi inaugurated a Technology Centre at Puducherry. The centre will support 2,000 MSMEs and incubate 200 startups. The aim of the centre is to encourage entrepreneurial spirit and the development of skills.¹⁸³

On 22 February 2022, the government approved the continuation of the Central Sector National Means-cum-Merit Scholarship for a period of five years. The scheme awards merit-based scholarships to students of economically weaker sections to encourage them to continue their education.¹⁸⁴

On 25 February 2022, Union Minister for MSMEs Nayan Ranjan Khanna launched the Union MSME RuPay Credit Card. The card allows MSMEs to meet their business expenses via a simplified payment mechanism. It offers benefits including digital payments and interest-free period.¹⁸⁵

On 30 March 2022, the Union Cabinet approved a USD808 million for a World Bank assisted scheme called Raising and Accelerating MSME performance (RAMP). RAMP is a scheme that supports COVID recovery interventions of the Ministry of MSMEs. It aims on improving access to market credit and addressing issues such as delayed payments.¹⁸⁶

India took necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for MSMEs.

¹⁷⁹ Government sets up National Steering Committee for implementation of the NIPUN Bharat Mission, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 25 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1766377>

¹⁸⁰ Ministry of Education notifies Four Year Integrated Teacher Education Programme, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 27 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1766921>

¹⁸¹ Initiatives taken by the Government for Mental Health and Emotional Wellbeing of Students, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 29 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1776154>

¹⁸² Initiative for affordability of education, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 8 December 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1779334>

¹⁸³ Prime Minister inaugurates MSME Technology Centre at Puducherry, Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (Delhi) 12 January 2022. Access Date: 11 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1789390>

¹⁸⁴ Government approves the continuation of national Means-cum-Merit Scholarship (NMMSS) for a period of five years, Ministry of Education (Delhi) 22 February 2022. Access Date: 11 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1800307>

¹⁸⁵ Union MSME Minister Nayan Ranjan Khanna launches Union Bank MSME RuPay Credit Card, Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (Delhi) 25 February 2022. Access Date: 11 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1801119>

¹⁸⁶ Cabinet approves USD 808 million for "Raising and Accelerating MSME performance," Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (Delhi) 30 March 2022. Access Date: 11 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1811362>

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sarah Nasir

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

On 12 September 2021, China gathered hiring information and verified the accuracy of the job posting, made use of big data analytics to match the unemployed with suitable job advertisements, intervened businesses with operational difficulties to secure employment, provided occupational training for skills in demand, and included information about odd jobs to the public employment service.¹⁸⁷

On 27 September 2021, China issued and distributed the Outline for the development of Women (2021-2030) and the Outline for the Development of Children (2021-2030), which states that it would take action to solve the problem of girls dropping out from compulsory education, and ban children from leaving school for early marriage.¹⁸⁸

On 2 October 2021, Premier Li Keqiang hosted an executive meeting of the State Council and connected securing employment opportunities with supporting small- and medium-sized enterprises. Therefore, the government encouraged local governments to reduce the rents and utility charges of the enterprises.¹⁸⁹

On 27 October 2021, Premier Li hosted an executive meeting of the State Council and acknowledged the need to strengthen employment, especially in small- and medium-sized enterprises in the manufacturing sector. To support these small- and medium-sized enterprises, the government delayed collecting taxes from them.¹⁹⁰

On 2 November 2021, Premier Li hosted an executive meeting of the State Council and again mentioned the importance of stabilizing employment in responding to the concerns of the public.¹⁹¹

On 22 November 2021, China provided subsidies for SMEs to stabilize employment and create jobs under the COVID-19 pandemic and power restrictions.¹⁹²

¹⁸⁷ Ren li zi yuan she hui bao zhang bu guo jia fa zhan gai ge wei min zheng bu cai zheng bu guan yu shi shi ti sheng jiu ye fu wu zhi liang gong cheng de tong zhi, The State Council, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 12 September 2021. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 13 January 2022. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/zhengceku/2021-10/26/content_5644935.htm

¹⁸⁸ Guo wu yuan guan yu yin fa zhong guo fu nv fa zhan gang yao he zhong guo er tong fa zhan gang yao de tong zhi, The State Council, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 27 September 2021. Translation provided by analyst, Access Date 13 January 2022. http://big5.www.gov.cn/gate/big5/www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2021-09/27/content_5639412.htm

¹⁸⁹ Li Keqiang zhu chi zhao kai guo wu yuan chang wu hui yi bu chu dui zhi zao ye zhong xiao wei qi ye deng shi shi jie duan xing shui shou huan jiao cuo shi jin yi bu jia da qi ye shu kun li du deng, Premier, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/premier/2021-10/20/content_5643918.htm

¹⁹⁰ Li Keqiang zhu chi zhao kai guo wu yuan chang wu hui yi bu chu dui zhi zao ye zhong xiao wei qi ye deng shi shi jie duan xing shui shou huan jiao cuo shi jin yi bu jia da qi ye shu kun li du deng, Premier, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 27 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/premier/2021-10/27/content_5647182.htm

¹⁹¹ Li Keqiang zhu chi zhao kai guo wu yuan chang wu hui yi ting qv guo wu yuan di ba ci da du cha qing kuang hui bao yao qiu wei rao shi chang zhu ti xv qiu min zhong guan qie he yong hao zheng fu zi jin zha shi gong zuo deng, Premier, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 3 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/premier/2021-11/03/content_5648700.htm

¹⁹² Guo wu yuan ban gong ting guan yu jinyi bu jia da dui zhong xiao qi ye shu kun bang fu li du de tong zhi, The State Council, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 22 November 2021. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 13 January 2022. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2021-11/22/content_5652485.htm

On 10 January 2022, Vice Premier Hu Chunhua advocated to maintain employment stability and provide more job opportunities during a meeting of the leading group on employment work under the State Council.¹⁹³

On 29 March 2022, the Ministry of Education of China issued a notice to encourage the local governments to improve the system for preventing school dropouts and increasing the rate of completing compulsory education and securing the enrolment of the school-aged population.¹⁹⁴

On 5 May 2022, Premier Li hosted an executive meeting of the State Council and decided to help SMEs by tax rebate, RMB1.6 trillion of inclusive loans, subsidies for rent, guarantee fees, and interest, and further reduce fees to stabilize the economy and employment with many SMEs.¹⁹⁵

On 5 May 2022, the State Council issued a notice to announce its measures to secure and enhance the employment opportunities of fresh graduates, which included encouraging SMEs to employ fresh graduates, providing more government positions to fresh graduates, supporting fresh graduates with lower-income background, strengthening career guidance, offer vocational training to fresh graduates, and simplifying the process of job searching.¹⁹⁶

On 11 May 2022, Premier Li hosted an executive meeting of the State Council and announced that China should prioritize employment when creating fiscal and monetary policies.¹⁹⁷

China has taken actions towards mitigating negative social consequences by encouraging girls and children not to discontinue education and sending notices to guide the local governments. Additionally, it rolled out measures like subsidisation, tax refund, and inclusive loan, to maintain stable employment to alleviate negative social consequences, demonstrating full compliance with this commitment.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yuet Ottica Chong

South Africa: 0

South has partially complied with its commitment to take necessary measures to mitigate negative social and economic consequences thus allowing sustainable and inclusive recovery, in particular to ensure continuity in the educational process and to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs).

¹⁹³ Vice Premier calls for more efforts to stabilize employment, Xinhua (Beijing) 11 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/20220111/931d911a5dd343a2873bdb1d819c0924/c.html>

¹⁹⁴ Jiao yu bu ban gong ting guan yu jin yi bu zuo hao pu tong zhong xiao xue zhao sheng ru xue gong zuo de dong zhi, The Ministry of Education, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 29 March 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.moe.gov.cn/srcsite/A06/s3321/202204/t20220401_612689.html

¹⁹⁵ Li Keqinag zhu chi zhao kai guo wu yuan chang wu hui yi bu shu jin yi bu wei zhong xiao wei qi ye he ge ti gong shang hu shu kun jv cuo deng, Premier, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 5 May 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/premier/2022-05/05/content_5688727.htm

¹⁹⁶ Guo wu yuan ban gong ting guan yu jin yi bu zuo hao gao xiao bi ye sheng deng qing nian jiu ye chang ye gong zuo de tong zhi, The Ministry of Education, The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 5 May 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 14 May 2022. http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xgk/moe_1777/moe_1778/202205/t20220513_627335.html

¹⁹⁷ China decides to prioritize employment in fiscal and monetary policies, CGTN (Beijing) 12 May 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://news.cgtn.com/news/2022-05-12/China-decides-to-prioritize-employment-in-fiscal-and-monetary-policies-19Y7ds8Zkk0/index.html>

On 28 September 2021, the Department of Small Business Development worked with the United Nations Development Program to launch a study on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on small businesses and determine the necessary types of assistance.¹⁹⁸

South Africa took some measures to safeguard jobs, especially for micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, while failing take any action to ensure continuity in the educational process.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Jarod Bechard

¹⁹⁸ The DSBD in collaboration with the UNDP launches a study on the impact of covid-19, Department of Small Business Development (Pretoria) 28 September 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <http://www.dsbdd.gov.za/media-release/dsbdd-collaboration-undp-launches-study-impact-covid-19>

4. Development: Sustainable Development Goal 12

“[Stressing the importance of achieving the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development and its Goals, we reiterate our commitment to the achievement of all SDGs, including] SDG-12 which identifies sustainable consumption and production patterns as a vital element of sustainable development.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.60 (80%)		

Background

The 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development and its constituent Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were adopted by the United Nations on 25 September 2015.¹⁹⁹ At the 2016 Summit in Goa the BRICS leaders welcomed the document’s adoption and committed to “to lead by example in the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in line with national circumstances and development context respecting the national policy space.”²⁰⁰ The commitment has been reiterated every year, with a particular focus on the Goal 12 (SDG-12) at the 2021 New Delhi Summit.²⁰¹

The SDG-12 “Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns” contains 11 targets:

12.1 Implement the 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production, all countries taking action, with developed countries taking the lead, taking into account the development and capabilities of developing countries;

12.2 By 2030, achieve the sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources;

12.3 By 2030, halve per capita global food waste at the retail and consumer levels and reduce food losses along production and supply chains, including post-harvest losses;

12.4 By 2020, achieve the environmentally sound management of chemicals and all wastes throughout their life cycle, in accordance with agreed international frameworks, and significantly reduce their release to air, water and soil in order to minimize their adverse impacts on human health and the environment;

12.5 By 2030, substantially reduce waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse;

12.6 Encourage companies, especially large and transnational companies, to adopt sustainable practices and to integrate sustainability information into their reporting cycle;

¹⁹⁹ Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015, 70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, United Nations (New York) 25 September 2015. Access Date: 13 December 2021. https://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E.

²⁰⁰ Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>.

²⁰¹XIII BRICS Summit- New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsdatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>.

12.7 Promote public procurement practices that are sustainable, in accordance with national policies and priorities;

12.8 By 2030, ensure that people everywhere have the relevant information and awareness for sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature;

12.A Support developing countries to strengthen their scientific and technological capacity to move towards more sustainable patterns of consumption and production;

12.B Develop and implement tools to monitor sustainable development impacts for sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products;

12.C Rationalize inefficient fossil-fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption by removing market distortions, in accordance with national circumstances, including by restructuring taxation and phasing out those harmful subsidies, where they exist, to reflect their environmental impacts, taking fully into account the specific needs and conditions of developing countries and minimizing the possible adverse impacts on their development in a manner that protects the poor and the affected communities.²⁰²

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the BRICS countries to take action advancing the implementation of the SDG-12 targets. For the purposes of this assessment covering the majority of the targets, i.e., six out of 11, is required for full compliance with the commitment. Single policy action can serve to promote the implementation of several SDG targets. Partial compliance requires taking action covering at least one of the SDG-12 targets.

Policy actions may include adopting SDG-12-related action plans or similar strategic documents, enacting new legislation, implementing new regulatory requirements, funding or otherwise supporting projects aimed at advancing the implementation of one (or several) of the targets, engaging with private sector or civil society (e.g., to raise awareness of the SDG-12 targets), etc.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS country fails to take actions to advance the implementation of any of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 12 targets.
0	The BRICS country takes action to advance at least one of the SDG-12 targets.
+1	The BRICS country takes action to advance the implementation at least six of the SDG-12 targets.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov
Lead Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to achieve the targets in Sustainable Development Goal 12.

On 9 September 2021, the Brazilian Company of Hospital Services (Ebserth), affiliated entity of the Ministry of Education, launched the Conscious Consumption Campaign through one of its hospitals – the Gaffrée and Guinle University Hospital.²⁰³ The goals of the campaign are: to optimize the use of resources and contribute to environmental sustainability, promote public awareness, cut the excessive use of energy, water, and other basic inputs, as well as reduce waste.

²⁰² Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015, 70/1. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, United Nations (New York) 25 September 2015. Access Date: 13 December 2021. https://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E.

²⁰³ HUGG lança campanha de consumo consciente, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 9 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/ebserh/pt-br/hospitais-universitarios/regiao-sudeste/hugg-unirio/comunicacao/noticias/hugg-lanca-campanha-de-consumo-consciente>

On 9 September 2021, the Government of Brazil announced the investment of BRL6 million (USD1.14 million) in the construction of 100 artesian wells in 19 municipalities in the state of Paraíba.²⁰⁴ The project is expected to result in improved access to quality water in 49 settlements.

On 10 September 2021, the Ministry of Tourism and the Economic and Social Development Bank (BNDES) signed a Technical Cooperation Agreement to encourage investment in the tourism sector, considering its potential for the economic and social development of the country.²⁰⁵ According to the Minister of Tourism of Brazil, Gilson Machado Neto, the goal of the partnership is to enable the development of the tourism sector via the attraction of private investments, as well as to articulate the improvement of tourism mobility and connectivity.

On 10 September 2021, the Government of Brazil through the Ministry of Regional Development reported the launch of the sustainable urban drainage system in Sertãozinho, São Paulo.²⁰⁶ The Federal Government invested BRL81.2 million (USD15.42 million) into this project, which is expected to benefit the entire population of the city of about 33,000 families by preventing floods, expanding access to clean and safe water and sanitation services, as well as improving water usage efficiency. Among the objectives of the project is widening the existing canal, creating a retention reservoir, and building 15 reinforced concrete bridges and a linear park on the banks of the stream.

On 31 October 2021, on the first day of the UN Climate Change Conference the Brazilian Government announced that it was committed to reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 50 per cent by 2030 with an ultimate goal of reaching carbon neutrality by 2050. Brazil also shared its plans to eliminate illegal deforestation in the country.²⁰⁷ The explicit actions for the country to reach this goal are contained in the document “Guidelines for a National Strategy for Climate Neutrality,” presented at the event. The publication includes the “National Plan for the Control of Illegal Deforestation and Recovery of Native Vegetation 2020-2023.”²⁰⁸

On 17 January 2021, the Ministry of Mines and Energy of Brazil affirmed the decision of the National Energy Policy Council to maintain the mandatory biodiesel content in diesel fuel at 10 per cent throughout 2022.²⁰⁹ This policy is aimed at reducing carbon dioxide emissions resulting from the use of diesel fuel and promote the clean bioenergy sector. It also acts as one of the staples of the Guidelines for a National Strategy for Climate Neutrality.

²⁰⁴ Investimento de R\$ 6 milhões levará água de qualidade a assentados paraibanos, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 9 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/incra/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/investimento-de-r-6-milhoes-levara-agua-de-qualidade-a-assentados-paraibanos>

²⁰⁵ MTur e BNDES assinam cooperação para incentivar investimentos no setor de turismo, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 10 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/turismo/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mtur-e-bndes-assinam-cooperacao-para-incentivar-investimentos-no-setor-de-turismo>

²⁰⁶ Obra de drenagem urbana sustentável é entregue no estado de São Paulo, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 10 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/casacivil/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/setembro/obra-de-drenagem-urbana-sustentavel-e-entregue-no-estado-de-sao-paulo>

²⁰⁷ Brasil encerra primeira semana de negociações com importantes avanços, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 6 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/brasil-encerra-primeira-semana-de-negociacoes-com-importantes-avancos>

²⁰⁸ Diretrizes para uma Estratégia Nacional para Neutralidade Climática, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 31 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/DiretrizesparaumaEstrategiaNacionalparaNeutralidadeClimtica.pdf>

²⁰⁹ MME reafirma o acerto da decisão do CNPE de manter o teor de biodiesel no diesel em 10% ao longo de 2022, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 17 January 2022. 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mme-reafirma-o-acerto-da-decisao-do-cnpe-de-manter-o-teor-de-biodiesel-no-diesel-em-10-ao-longo-de-2022>

On 18 January 2022, the Ministry of Mines and Energy of Brazil published a report on the importance of the building sector for energy consumption.²¹⁰ The report, titled “Implementing the Paris Agreement and Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions Throughout the Life Cycle of Buildings: European Public Policies, Tools and Market Initiatives,” was prepared by the Buildings Performance Institute Europe in partnership with the ministry. The study presents public policies developed to assist in the adoption of strategies and reduce the environmental impact of the building sector.

On 31 January 2022, the Government of Brazil announced the investment of BRL6 billion (USD1.14 billion) in energy and infrastructure in Rio de Janeiro.²¹¹ The investment includes the construction of the country’s largest natural gas-fired power plant as well as the expansion of road, railroad and port infrastructure. The primary objective of the whole investment project is the construction of the GNA II Thermolectric Plant, which is expected to become be the biggest gas-fired thermal plant in the country and contribute to the Brazilian energy security, supplying energy to 14 million homes.

On 21 March 2022, the Ministry of Mines and Energy and the Minister of Environment launched a set of incentive measures for the production and sustainable use of biomethane.²¹² The initiative contributes to the commitments made by the country during the 26th United Nations Climate Change Conference. The document, signed by Brazil and more than a hundred other countries, provides for a global effort to reduce methane emissions by 30 per cent by 2030 in relation to the 2020 levels. The Ministry of Environment Administrative Rule no. 71, dated 21 March 2022, established the National Program for Methane Emission Reduction and the Special Regime of Incentives for Infrastructure Development.

On 13 April 2022, through the Decree No. 11.044, the Brazilian Government launched the Certificate of Recycling Credit Program.²¹³ The measure aims to provide an injection of estimated BRL14 billion (USD2.96 billion) in private investment in the recycling of products and discarded packaging.

On 13 April 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro, signed a Federal Decree No. 11.043, establishing the National Solid Waste Plan.²¹⁴ The plan includes guidelines, strategies, actions and sets targets to modernize solid waste management in the country, in order to put into practice the objectives set out in the National Policy for Solid Waste - Law No. 12.305 of 2010. Among the objectives set by the plan is the elimination of all landfill sites in the country by 2024.

On 26 April 2022, Brazil published the joint Interministerial Ordinance No. 107, of 25 April 2022, which provides for the controlled elimination of polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), approves the PCB Management

²¹⁰ MME publica relatório sobre importância de edificações no consumo energético, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 19 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mme-publica-relatorio-sobre-importancia-de-edificacoes-no-consumo-energetico>

²¹¹ Governo Federal anuncia investimentos em energia e infraestrutura para o Rio de Janeiro, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 31 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/governo-federal-anuncia-investimentos-em-energia-e-infraestrutura-para-o-rio-de-janeiro>

²¹² Governo Federal lança medidas de incentivo à produção e ao uso sustentável do biometano, +, Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 21 March 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-lanca-medidas-de-incentivo-a-producao-e-ao-uso-sustentavel-do-biometano>

²¹³ Governo Federal lança Certificado de Crédito de Reciclagem – Recicla+, Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 13 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-lanca-certificado-de-credito-de-reciclagem-2013-recicla>

²¹⁴ Governo Federal acaba com espera de mais de 10 anos e publica decreto do Plano Nacional de Resíduos Sólidos Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasilia) 14 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-acaba-com-a-espera-de-mais-de-10-anos-e-publica-decreto-do-plano-nacional-de-residuos-solidos>

Manual for electric equipment and implements the PCB National Inventory system.²¹⁵ PCBs are a class of persistent organic pollutants, banned by the Stockholm Convention in 2001.

Brazil has taken action to enact medium- and long-term plans on sustainable consumption and production, promote sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources, public awareness on sustainable development issues, sustainable tourism, waste management, including in food and agricultural sector.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to the targets in Sustainable Development Goal 12.

On 7 October 2021, the Government of Russia approved a list of socio-economic development initiatives until 2030.²¹⁶ The initiatives on the list are divided into six categories: social sphere, construction, ecology, digital transformation, technological breakthrough and the “state for citizens.” The “Ecology” category contains four initiatives aimed at recycling and careful extraction of mineral resources, reducing greenhouse gas emissions, eliminating hazardous landfills and emergency facilities. The estimated government spending on the initiatives by 2024 amounts to RUB4.6 trillion (USD61 billion).

On 13 October 2021, the Government of Russia signed an agreement with the state “Gazprom” company on cooperation in the field of hydrogen energy.²¹⁷ The agreement is aimed at accelerating the development of natural gas-based technologies in the field of hydrogen energy and establishing pilot projects. “Gazprom” is expected to develop and submit a roadmap with the technological development targets for the Government’s approval.

On 15 October 2021, at the Strategic session on the development of hydrogen energy in Russia the Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin announced, that more than RUB9 billion (USD120 million) would be invested over the three years in the development of competitive domestic technologies for production, transportation, and storage of hydrogen, creation hydrogen energy technologies test sites.²¹⁸

On 29 October 2021, the Government of Russia approved the Strategy of Socio-Economic Development of the Russian Federation with Low Greenhouse Gas Emissions until 2050.²¹⁹ The strategy provides for the establishment of the national system for greenhouse gas emissions reduction and sustainable development support, creating a system of public non-financial reporting by companies, improvement of energy and environmental efficiency in economic sectors, finalization of information and technical manuals on the best available technologies, taking into account energy and resource efficiency practices, incentivizing recycling and reuse of energy resources and goods, promoting the practices of waste reduction and re-utilization, reforestation,

²¹⁵ Governo regulamenta eliminação controlada de substâncias tóxicas, Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasília) 26 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-regulamenta-eliminacao-controlada-de-substancias-toxicas>

²¹⁶ The government approved a list of socio-economic development initiatives until 2030, Russian Government (Moscow) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/43451/>.

²¹⁷ «Gazprom» i Pravitel'stvo RF podpisali soglasenie o namerenijah v oblasti vodorodnoj jenergetiki (Gazprom and the Russian Government Signed an Agreement of Intent in the field of Hydrogen Energy), Gazprom (Moscow) 13 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gazprom.ru/press/news/2021/october/article539806/> (in Russian)

²¹⁸ Strategicheskaja sessija po razvitiju v Rossii vodorodnoj jenergetiki (Strategic session on the development of hydrogen energy in Russia), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 15 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/43558/> (in Russian)

²¹⁹ Strategija social'no-jekonomicheskogo razvitija Rossijskoj Federacii s nizkim urovnem vybrosov parnikovyh gazov do 2050 goda (Strategy of Socio-Economic Development of the Russian Federation with Low Greenhouse Gas Emissions until 2050), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 29 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://static.government.ru/media/files/ADKkCzp3fW032e2yA0BhtlpyzWfHaiUa.pdf> (in Russian)

etc. The ultimate goal of the strategy is to ensure Russia's compliance with its international obligations to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

On 10 December 2021, Minister of Energy Nikolai Shulginov launched the Russko-Polyanskaya solar power plant in Omsk oblast. The plant is expected to provide an annual reduction of harmful emissions by 12,700 tons and improve the environmental situation in the Omsk region.²²⁰ Commissioning of the Russko-Polyanskaya power plant will increase the total installed capacity of solar generation in the region's energy system to 60 MW, according to the minister. Total investment into the solar power plant construction amounted to RUB2.8 billion (USD37 million).

On 16 December 2021, the Government of Russia approved the rules for posting publicly available information on the state of the environment.²²¹ According to the new rules, federal, regional, and local authorities are obligated to publish information on the state of the environment, including the quality of atmospheric air, soil, water, and forest resources, harmful emissions, as well as radiation levels on their official websites or make it available to the public through state and municipal information systems.

On 29 March 2022, the Federal Project "Clean Air" was extended by two years – until 31 December 2026.²²² The project aims to ensure a significant reduction in air pollution in 12 major industrial centers: Bratsk, Krasnoyarsk, Lipetsk, Magnitogorsk, Mednogorsk, Nizhny Tagil, Novokuznetsk, Norilsk, Omsk, Chelyabinsk, Cherepovets and Chita through measures to reduce emissions from industrial enterprises, municipal and transport infrastructure facilities.

On 21 April 2022, the Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment announced that in March-April 2022 four new projects for the reclamation of landfills near Moscow "Safonovo," "Yadrovo," "Zavolenye" and "Taldomsky" were launched in accordance with the federal project "Clean Country" of the national project "Ecology."²²³ Additionally, in December 2021, contracts were signed for the reclamation of the Egorievsky and Volovich landfills.

On 22 April 2022, the Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment reported that it had finished the drafting of the federal law "On Amending the Forest Code of the Russian Federation" and Article 9 of the Federal Law "On Limiting Greenhouse Gas Emissions."²²⁴ The draft law is aimed at the implementation of climate projects in the field of forest relations on the territory of Russia, ensuring the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and increasing the absorption of greenhouse gases.

²²⁰ Nikolaj Shul'ginov Dal Start Rabote Russko-Poljanskoj Solnečnoj Jelektrostantsii V Omskoj Oblasti (Nikolay Shulginov Gave the Go-Ahead For The Operation of the Russko-Polyanskaya Solar Power Plant in the Omsk Region), Ministry of Energy of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 10 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://minenergo.gov.ru/node/22185> (in Russian)

²²¹ Pravitel'stvo utverdilo pravila razmeshhenija obshhedostupnoj informacii o sostojanii okruzhajushhej sredy (The Government of Russia approved the rules for posting publicly available information on the state of the environment), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 December 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/44150/>

²²² A law was passed that expanded the terms of the federal "Clean Air" project, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 29 March 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/prinyat_zakon_kotoryy_rasshiril_sroki_realizatsii_federalnogo_proekta_chistyy_vozdukh/
²²³ "Clean Country": six new projects for the elimination of large landfills in the Moscow region started in 2022, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 21 April 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/chistaya_strana_v_2022_godu_startovali_shest_novykh_proektov_po_likvidatsii_krupnykh_poligonov_tko_v/

²²⁴ Forest climate projects will help reduce greenhouse gas emissions, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/klimaticheskie_proekty_v_oblasti_lesnykh_otnosheniy_pomogut_sokratit_vybrosy_parniko_vykh_gazov/

Russia has taken action to enact medium- and long-term plans on sustainable consumption and production, promote sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources, public awareness on sustainable development issues, waste management, recycling, encourage companies to adopt sustainable practices.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

India: 0

India has partially complied with the commitment to the targets in Sustainable Development Goal 12.

On 2 November 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi addressed the UN Climate Change Conference (COP26), announcing the country's goals of increasing non-fossil energy capacity to 500 gigawatts, while meeting about 50 per cent of its energy requirements from renewables by 2030; reducing carbon intensity of its economy by more than 45 per cent by 2030, and reaching Net Zero by 2070.²²⁵

On 6 November 2021, at COP26, the Indian Delegation stated that while India represented 17 per cent of the global population, its historical cumulative emissions amounted to only 4 per cent, and annual greenhouse gas emissions to about 5 per cent.²²⁶ The achievement of 24 per cent reduction in gross domestic product emission intensity in 2005-2014 was also noted, as well as 17-fold increase in India's solar energy generation capacity.

On 1 February 2022, the Minister of Finance of India presented the Budget 2022-2023, unveiling a set of Government policies on sustainable development promotion.²²⁷ These included: measures to promote a shift to increased use of public transportation in urban areas, as well as supporting technology applications, such as electric vehicles; the allocation of additional funds to facilitate the domestic manufacturing of solar panels; a plan on circular economy transition; the introduction of 5-7 per cent biomass pellets to thermal power plants, which would allegedly result in CO₂ savings of 38 MMT annually.

India has taken action to enact medium- and long-term plans on sustainable consumption and production, tackling waste management issues, and encouraging companies to adopt sustainable practices.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment to achieve the targets in Sustainable Development Goal 12.

On 3 November 2021, the Central Committee of the Communist Party and the State Council revealed an action plan on saving food.²²⁸ The Plan aims to establish a standard and a monitoring system for cutting food loss and waste by 2025, through such means as scientific innovation, raising public awareness, implementing new storage techniques, etc.

²²⁵ National Statement by Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi at COP26 Summit in Glasgow, Ministry of External Affairs of India (New Delhi) 2 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34466/National+Statement+by+Prime+Minister+Shri+Narendra+Modi+at+COP26+Summit+in+Glasgow>

²²⁶ India speaks on climate change from a position of strength and responsibility at the Facilitative Sharing of Views (FSV) of India's Third Biennial Update Report (BUR) at COP26, Indian Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 6 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://moef.gov.in/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/PIB1769796.pdf>

²²⁷ Budget 2022-2023 Speech of Nirmala Sitharaman Minister of Finance, Government of India (Delhi) 1 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/budget_speech.pdf

²²⁸ Action plan outlines measures to reduce waste, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/policywatch/202111/03/content_WS6181c7b1c6d0df57f98e46c9.html

On 30 November 2021, China Petroleum and Chemical Corp launched a project in Kuqa, Xinjiang Uygur autonomous region, building a green hydrogen plant, which would be powered entirely by solar energy.²²⁹ The project is expected to reduce carbon dioxide emissions by 485,000 tons annually after it becomes operational in 2022.

On 7 December 2021, the National Energy Administration announced that it would launch the second phase of the wind and solar power projects focusing on the Gobi Desert and other arid regions by 2022.²³⁰ The new power plants are expected to get connected to the grid by 2023-24, generating clean energy for the region.

On 21 January 2022, the National Development and Reform Commission released a plan on boosting the green transformation of consumption.²³¹ The Plan contains measures to stimulate green consumption through raising public awareness, curbing “extravagance and waste,” and enhancing market share of green and low-carbon products. The government plans to incorporate measures of energy saving and environmental protection in such areas as food, clothing, housing, transport, tourism and electricity consumption.

On 24 January 2022, the State Council released a Comprehensive work plan for energy conservation and emission reduction, detailing the country’s efforts “to build and improve an economic structure conducive to green, low-carbon and circular development in its ongoing anti-pollution fight to achieve its carbon peak and neutrality goals” set to be reached by 2060. The Plan is a part of the 14th five-year plan. It contains 10 measures aimed at energy conservation and emissions reduction, including improvements in building and infrastructure sectors, transport and logistics, curbing energy consumption, promoting green technologies, providing stimuli for industrial enterprises to improve waste pollution management and control, and dealing with waste accumulation. According to the plan, by 2025 China aims to reduce energy consumption per unit of gross domestic product by 13.5 per cent from 2020 while keeping total energy consumption “at reasonable levels.”²³²

On 29 January 2022, the Civil Aviation Administration issued a roadmap for green development during the 14th Five-Year Plan period (2021-2025). The plan set up targets to “make civil aviation smarter, low-carbon and resource-efficient to achieve green transformation,” including by optimizing aircraft fuel consumption and reducing airport CO2 emissions.²³³

On 23 March 2022, the National Development and Reform Commission and the National Energy Administration released a plan on the development of hydrogen energy for the 2021-2035. The plan provides for the creation of a complete cycle hydrogen energy industry development system “with the innovation capability significantly improved and the core technologies and manufacturing processes basically mastered.”²³⁴

On 24 May 2022, the General Office of the State Council issued an action plan on controlling new pollutants, including persistent organic pollutants, endocrine disruptors and antibiotics.²³⁵ The plan sets up a new

²²⁹ Nation moves ahead with ambitious climate goals, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 7 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202201/07/content_WS61d79648c6d09c94e48a34c1.html.

²³⁰ More Gobi green projects in pipeline, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202112/07/content_WS61aeb114c6d09c94e48a1c9b.html.

²³¹ China promotes green consumption amid decarbonization drive, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 21 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202201/21/content_WS61eaae93c6d09c94e48a411b.html.

²³² 5-year plan spotlights green development, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 24 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202201/24/content_WS61ee88b6c6d09c94e48a4301.html.

²³³ China’s civil aviation sets out roadmap for green development, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 29 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202201/29/content_WS61f4ecef6d09c94e48a4879.html

²³⁴ China maps 2021-2035 plan on hydrogen energy development, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 23 March 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202203/23/content_WS623ac568c6d02e53353282a4.html

²³⁵ China outlines plan to control new pollutants, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 24 May 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202205/24/content_WS628cd024c6d02e533532b3e1.html.

management system which subjects chemical plants to rigorous inspections and monitoring to evaluate environmental risks and identify new high-risk pollutants. The plan also provides for the establishment and the improvement of the legal and regulatory framework on chemical-related environmental issues, as well as the upgrade of the technology standards system.

On 30 May 2022, the State Council released a circular on the implementation plan to promote the high-quality development of new energy in the new era, prepared by the National Development and Reform Commission and the National Energy Administration.²³⁶ The plan provides for the acceleration of the construction of a clean, low-carbon, safe and highly efficient energy system with the total installed electricity capacity of wind and solar power of 1.2 billion kilowatts by 2030.

China has taken action to enact medium- and long-term plans on sustainable consumption and production, promote sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources, public awareness on sustainable development issues, waste management, recycling, encourage companies to adopt sustainable practices.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment to achieve the targets in Sustainable Development Goal 12.

On 15 October 2021, Deputy Minister of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment Makhotso Sotyú announced an investment of ZAR29 million (USD1.89 million) into waste management system of Mangaung Metro Municipality in the Free State province. According to the Deputy Minister, the action was taken in response to the official request by the Municipality due to “waste management challenges and financial budget constrain.”²³⁷

On 2 November 2021, at the UN Climate Change Conference (COP26), President Cyril Ramaphosa announced a revised Nationally Determined Contribution with the goals of reducing domestic carbon emissions to between 420 and 350 million tons of carbon dioxide equivalent by 2030. The President also announced a partnership with the governments of France, Germany, the United Kingdom and the United States, as well as the European Union, to support a transition to a low-carbon economy in South Africa. The Partnership pledged to mobilize ZAR131 billion (USD8.5 billion) over the next three years to implement the vision outlined in the Political Declaration on the just energy transition in South Africa, also unveiled at COP26. The Declaration laid out medium and long-term goals for “accelerated decarbonization” of the country’s energy system with particular attention to vulnerable demographics, e.g. coal miners, women and youth.

On 23 February 2022, in his 2022 Budget Speech, Minister of Finance of South Africa Enoch Godongwana announced the government’s plans to reform the electricity sector, including through the amendment of the 2006 Electricity Regulation Act,²³⁸ that allow for private sector renewable energy generation projects of up to 100 megawatts without licensing.²³⁹

²³⁶ China to develop high-quality new energy in new era, State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 30 May 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202205/30/content_WS62946dc4c6d02e533532b7e5.html

²³⁷ Deputy Minister Makhotso Sotyú announces R29 million waste management intervention for Mangaung Metro Municipality, South African Government (Pretoria) 15 October 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-makhotso-sotyú-announces-r29-million-waste-management-intervention-mangaung>

²³⁸ Minister Enoch Godongwana: 2022 Budget Speech, South African Government (Pretoria) 23 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-enchod-godongwana-2022-budget-speech-23-feb-2022-0000>

²³⁹ Electricity Regulation Amendment Bill, South African Government (Pretoria) 10 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://cer.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ELECTRICITY-REGULATION-AMENDMENT-BILL-10.02.2022-DMRE.pdf>

On 23 May 2022, Minister of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries Barbara Creecy announced the launch of the national waste management fleet, with an estimated worth of ZAR44.5 million (USD2.87 million).²⁴⁰ The fleet, according to the Minister, consists of 22 vehicles including skip loader trucks, front end loaders, compactor trucks and other trucks required to transport waste within these areas. The vehicles will be active across 19 municipalities of the country.

South Africa has taken action to enact medium- and long-term plans on sustainable consumption and production and tackle waste management issues.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov

²⁴⁰ Minister Barbara Creecy: Launch of national waste management fleet, South African Government (Pretoria) 23 May 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-barbara-creecy-launch-national-waste-management-fleet-23-may-2022-0000>

5. Trade: Facilitating Value-Added Trade

“We stress the need to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia			+1
India	-1		
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average		0.20 (60%)	

Background

Trade has been an important issue area for the BRICS summit since its first meeting in Yekaterinburg in 2009. In the Yekaterinburg declaration, BRICS leaders called upon all parties to “work together to improve the international trade and investment environment” and urged “the international community to keep the multilateral trading system stable.”²⁴¹ In the 2010 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS emphasized the importance of the multilateral trading system and committed to resist all forms of protectionism and disguised restrictions on trade.²⁴² At the 2011 Sanya Summit, BRICS leaders again encouraged countries to refrain from protectionism and expressed their support of the multilateral trading system.²⁴³

Starting at the 2012 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS moved their discussions on trade beyond their affirmation of support for the multilateral trading system and their commitment to refrain from protectionism. Specifically, at the New Delhi Summit, they agreed to “work together to intensify trade and investment flows,” to take suitable measures to facilitate further consolidation of the BRICS’ trade and economic ties, and to support the development of instruments for enhancing intra-BRICS trade in coming years.²⁴⁴ At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the BRICS again agreed to intensify trade and investment flows amongst BRICS countries.²⁴⁵

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the BRICS adopted the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, which serves as a key guideline for expanding BRICS trade and investment.²⁴⁶ This document was endorsed at the 2016 Goa Summit, where the leaders also emphasized the importance of the “BRICS Roadmap for Trade, Economic and Investment Cooperation.”²⁴⁷ At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the leaders agreed “to improve and broaden trade

²⁴¹ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>

²⁴² 2nd BRIC Summit of Heads of State and Government: Joint Statement, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 15 April 2010. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100415-leaders.html>

²⁴³ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

²⁴⁴ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

²⁴⁵ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

²⁴⁶ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

²⁴⁷ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

and investment cooperation mechanism and scope, with a view to enhancing BRICS economic complementarity and diversification in BRICS countries.”²⁴⁸

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, amidst growing trade conflicts around the world, the BRICS emphasized the importance of a favourable external environment for the sustained growth of global trade. In addition, the BRICS continued to support the operationalization of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership and the progress in implementing the BRICS Action Agenda on Economic and Trade Cooperation.²⁴⁹ The BRICS stressed the importance of value-added trade, which is a central subject of this current commitment. At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders again agreed to promote trade expansion among BRICS members, and welcomed progress under the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership and the BRICS Action Agenda on Economic and Trade Cooperation.²⁵⁰

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, trade was discussed in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic. Acknowledging the need to strengthen cooperation on issues of the BRICS post-pandemic economic agenda, BRICS leaders stated that “policy priorities in our countries go beyond the immediate objectives to minimise the COVID-19 implications and include, inter alia, deepening international cooperation and trade.”²⁵¹ In addition, they called on countries to ensure that “all COVID-19 related measures are targeted, proportionate, transparent and temporary and do not create unnecessary barriers to trade or disruption to global supply chains, and are consistent with WTO [World Trade Organization] rules.”²⁵² At this summit, the BRICS also adopted an updated Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025.²⁵³

Commitment Features

In this commitment, the use of the term “joint efforts” suggests that for an action to count towards compliance, it must be taken collaboratively or cooperatively with another BRICS member. Actions that are taken by one BRICS member alone does not count towards compliance.

This commitment also requires these joint efforts to be aimed at “facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade...among BRICS countries.” This means that BRICS members need to take actions that lead to increased or improved trade relations between BRICS members. Examples of actions that facilitate a conducive environment for enhancing trade include are outlined in the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership.²⁵⁴

In addition, the commitment requires BRICS members to promote a conducive environment specifically for “value-added trade,” which is measured by the value that is added in producing goods and services for export and import. This measurement recognizes that with the growth of global value chains, a country’s exports increasingly rely significantly on intermediate imports, and measurement of value-added trade considers the

²⁴⁸ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

²⁴⁹ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

²⁵⁰ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

²⁵¹ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

²⁵² XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

²⁵³ Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, BRICS Information Center November 2020. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html>

²⁵⁴ The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Center 2025 (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html>

value added by each country in the production of goods and services.²⁵⁵ Specific actions that promote value-added trade are also outlined in the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership.²⁵⁶

Finally, the commitment requires BRICS members to address “the pandemic and its consequences.” Specifically, this refers to the COVID-19 pandemic and its adverse impact on “the international economy, healthcare systems, financial sector and development, [and] well being of the most vulnerable groups in [society].”²⁵⁷

Overall, there are three distinct but inter-related aspects to this commitment.

- 1) At the most general level, the commitment requires BRICS members to continue their joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade. Using the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 as a guideline, actions that count towards compliance can fall under either of the following categories:
 - a. Enhancing market access opportunities and facilitate market linkages;
 - b. Promoting mutual trade and investment and create a business-friendly environment for investors in BRICS countries
 - c. Promoting cooperation on technical regulation, standards, etc.
 - d. Encouraging direct contacts between enterprises, associations and other business entities of BRICS with the use of the BRICS Business Council instruments;
 - e. Enhancing cooperation in competition law enforcement and policies to foster a fair market environment for efficient and sustainable trade development;
 - f. Enhancing supply chain connectivity through identifying bottlenecks in regional supply chains.²⁵⁸
- 2) On a more specific level, the commitment requires BRICS members to take actions that facilitate a conducive environment for value-added trade. Using the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 as a guideline, actions that count towards compliance can fall under either of the following categories:
 - Fostering effective integration of BRICS enterprises into global and regional value chains;
 - Strengthening investment cooperation with the aim to increase the share of value added goods and services in intra-BRICS trade;
 - Fostering the integration of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises in inclusive and diversified regional and global value chains.²⁵⁹
- 3) Finally, the commitment also requires BRICS members to address the pandemic and its consequences. In the context of this commitment, BRICS members, in taking actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade, must ensure that their actions contribute to the post-pandemic economic recovery. In other words, actions to enhance trade need to be taken with a view to contributing to mitigating the current crisis and or ensuring post-crisis economic growth.²⁶⁰

Full compliance requires the BRICS member to comply with all three aspects above. Thus, the BRICS member needs to take actions cooperatively with other BRICS members towards enhancing trade, and specific attention

²⁵⁵ Trade in Value Added, OECD. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.oecd.org/sti/ind/measuring-trade-in-value-added.htm>

²⁵⁶ The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Center 2025 (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html>

²⁵⁷ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

²⁵⁸ This list is adapted from The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Center 2025 (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html>

²⁵⁹ Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, BRICS Information Center November 2020. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html>

²⁶⁰ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html>

needs to be given to value-added trade. In addition, these actions also need to respond to the consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic.

To achieve partial compliance, the BRICS member needs to take actions cooperatively with other BRICS members towards enhancing trade. In addition, these actions need to address either contribute specifically to enhancing value-added trade, or be in response to the consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Lack of compliance refers to the situation when the BRICS member has only taken general actions on enhancing trade, without addressing the need to enhance value-added trade, nor responding to the consequences of the pandemic. Failure to take general actions on enhancing trade is also indicative of lack of compliance.

This report also applies a depth analysis, whereby weaker actions, such as verbal reiterations of support or simply attending meetings, count towards partial compliance only.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not take joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade; OR the BRICS member took joint actions that enhancing intra-BRICS trade, but their actions did not address the need to enhance value-added trade or respond to the consequences of the pandemic.
0	The BRICS member engaged in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade AND these actions EITHER addressed the need to enhance value-added trade OR responded to the consequences of the pandemic.
+1	The BRICS member engaged in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade AND these actions addressed the need to enhance value-added trade AND responded to the consequences of the pandemic.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinbe Wang

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.

On 26 October 2021, the Brazilian Secretary General of Foreign Affairs Ambassador Fernando Simas Magalhães and Russian Deputy Minister of Economic Development Vladimir Ilyichev concluded co-chairing the 11th Brazil-Russia Intergovernmental Commission on Economic, Commercial, Scientific and Technological Cooperation. The meeting assessed existing bilateral cooperation projects and examined future such projects, including in the fields of customs, trade, agricultural, and energy cooperation.²⁶¹ Russian Ambassador to Brazil Alexei Labetsky previously stated in September that the Commission would be a positive forum for bilateral trade diversification, particularly for engineering and high-tech products.²⁶²

On 16 November 2021, China and Brazil virtually held the 8th Meeting of the Economic and Trade Subcommittee of China-Brazil High-level Coordination, emphasizing further investment cooperation in the digital economy and green development realm, encouraging further investment in China's Belt and Road Initiative and Brazil's Investment Partnerships Program, and reaffirming the need for open, fair access in each

²⁶¹ 11th Brazil-Russia Intergovernmental Commission on Economic, Commercial, Scientific and Technological Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia). 26 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/11th-brazil-russia-intergovernmental-commission-on-economic-commercial-scientific-and-technological-cooperation>

²⁶² Russian-Brazilian trading relations need to be actualized — Russian ambassador, TASS (Moscow). 1 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://tass.com/economy/1344563>

other's markets.²⁶³ The Chinese delegation further encouraged Brazil to actively take part in expos such as the China International Import Expo.

On 24 November 2021, during an online forum organized by the Brazil-China Business Council, Chinese Ambassador to Brazil Yang Wanming and Brazilian Secretary of Innovation, Sustainable Development and Irrigation Fernando Camargo indicated the two countries are looking into deepening ties in agricultural biotechnology and sustainable trade development.²⁶⁴

On 30 November 2021, during an official visit by Minister of Foreign Affairs, Ambassador Carlos Alberto Franco França, to Moscow, Russian President Vladimir Putin verbally committed to strengthening trade relations with Brazil, including through the BRICS framework.²⁶⁵

On 14 December 2021, Brazil stated it stood ready to negotiate a prompt resolution to its sugarcane dispute with India, after a World Trade Organization (WTO) panel report ruled India's sugar export subsidies constituted a violation of WTO rules.²⁶⁶

On 27 December 2021, the BRICS Science, Technology, and Innovation (STI) framework released the initial pre-proposal results of the fifth coordinated call for STI multilateral research & development projects, which launched on 30 August 2021.²⁶⁷ Under this new scheme, projects must involve partners in at least two other BRICS nations. The Brazilian National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (CNPq), under the Brazilian Ministry of Science and Technology, received initial approval for multilateral projects on antimicrobial resistance, big data analytics for public health care, and innovation in nanophotonics among others.

On 16 February 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro and Russian President Vladimir Putin met in Moscow to discuss ways to deepen cooperation on value-added trade (particularly for oil, gas, and fertilizers), agriculture, and market access.²⁶⁸ During the Brazil-Russia Business Meeting, President Bolsonaro oversaw discussions between sector representatives from both countries regarding new perspectives for investment flows, infrastructure and concession programs, and increasing fertilizer trade.²⁶⁹

On 22 April 2022, Minister of State for Mines and Energy Bento Albuquerque met his Indian counterpart, accompanied by several high-ranking government and private sector representatives from both countries.²⁷⁰ The two countries jointly agreed to expand bilateral trade in the oil and gas sector, develop the Brazil-India

²⁶³ China and Brazil Held the 8th Meeting of the Economic and Trade Subcommittee of China-Brazil High-level Coordination and Cooperation Committee Both Agreed to Deepen Mutually Beneficial Economic and Trade Cooperation, Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China (Beijing). 19 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022.

<http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/significantnews/202111/20211103220286.shtml>

²⁶⁴ China, Brazil seeking deeper cooperation in agricultural biotech, Xinhua Net (Beijing). 24 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-11/24/c_1310329815.htm

²⁶⁵ Russia praises bilateral cooperation with Brazil; Putin invites Bolsonaro to visit Moscow, The Rio Times (Rio de Janeiro). 2 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.riotimesonline.com/brazil-news/brazil/russia-praises-bilateral-cooperation-with-brazil-invites-bolsonaro-to-visit-moscow/>

²⁶⁶ Final report of the Panel in the disputes "India – Sugar and Sugarcane" (DS579, DS580 and DS581), Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasilia). 14 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/final-report-of-the-panel-in-the-disputes-201cindia-2013-sugar-and-sugarcane201d-ds579-ds580-and-ds581>

²⁶⁷ 5th BRICS STI FP Call - Pre-proposal stage results!, BRICS STI Framework Programme (Moscow). 27 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://brics-sti.org/?p=new/31>

²⁶⁸ President Jair Bolsonaro and President Vladimir Putin meet in Moscow, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 16 February 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/en/government-of-brazil/latest-news/2022/president-jair-bolsonaro-and-president-vladimir-putin-meet-in-moscow>

²⁶⁹ President Jair Bolsonaro participates in a meeting with businessmen from Brazil and Russia, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 17 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/acompanhe-o-planalto/noticias/2022/02/presidente-jair-bolsonaro-participa-de-encontro-com-empresarios-do-brasil-e-da-russia>

²⁷⁰ Brazil and India will forge alliance to promote bioenergy and biofuels, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-e-india-forjarao-alianca-para-a-promocao-da-bioenergia-e-dos-biocombustiveis>

Alliance on Bioenergy and Biofuels, and host a meeting of the Joint Working Group on Cooperation in Bioenergy to further promote research and technical exchanges.

On 28 April 2022, Special Secretary for Foreign Trade and International Affairs of the Ministry of Economy Roberto Fendt (among other Brazilian and Chinese governmental representatives) attended the 9th Meeting of the Economic-Financial Subcommittee of the Sino-Brazilian High Level Commission for Coordination and Cooperation.²⁷¹ The two countries discussed the development of financial tools to deal with global challenges, mutual participation in multilateral development banks, BRICS cooperation, and best practices regarding public-private partnerships.

Brazil partially complied with its commitment by engaging in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade. Brazil's actions addressed the need to enhance value-added trade, but they did not respond specifically to the consequences of the pandemic.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ashton Mathias

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.

On 15 November 2021, the Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin attended a meeting of the Heads of Government Council of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation via videoconference. He stressed that Russia would continue to merge multilateral integration initiatives and boost mutually beneficial cooperation in Eurasia.²⁷² Mishustin also stated that Russia and China will implement joint initiatives in the sphere of transport that are conducive to cooperation ties.

On 29 November 2021, the Deputy Prime Minister Alexander Novak spoke about bilateral cooperation between Russia and China in various segments at the third Russian-Chinese Energy Business Forum. Novak noted that both Russia and China are confidently overcoming the negative economic consequences of the pandemic, and boosting economic and trade cooperation to recover from the pandemic.²⁷³ Russia was also increasing its coal supplies, according to Deputy Prime Minister Novak.

On 4 February 2022, Russia and China signed a joint agreement and announced to strengthen bilateral cooperation.²⁷⁴ Both Russia and China promised to defend the multilateral trade system based on the central role of the WTO and ensure the sustainable and stable operation of global and regional value chains. Specifically, the agreement pointed out that the two members would deepen strategic partnerships among BRICS members and promotes cooperation in economy and finance.

On 16 February 2022, President Vladimir Putin and Brazilian President Jair Bolsonaro met in Moscow to discuss ways to deepen cooperation on value-added trade (particularly for oil, gas, and fertilizers), agriculture,

²⁷¹ Brazil and China discuss opportunities for economic cooperation and investment, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 29 April 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/abril/brasil-e-china-debatem-opportunidades-de-cooperacao-economica-e-investimentos>

²⁷² Meeting of the SCO Heads of Government Council, Government House (Moscow). 15 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43901/>

²⁷³ Alexander Novak: We can see significant potential for expanding Russia-China partnerships in key energy segments, Government House (Moscow). 29 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43942/>

²⁷⁴ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, Presidential Executive Office (Moscow) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770>

and market access.²⁷⁵ During the Brazil-Russia Business Meeting, President Bolsonaro oversaw discussions between sector representatives from both countries regarding new perspectives for investment flows, infrastructure and concession programs, and increasing fertilizer trade.²⁷⁶

On 10 March 2022, Deputy Prime Minister Novak spoke to Minister of Housing and Urban Affairs of India Hardeep Singh Puri regarding bilateral cooperation in fuel, energy, and education. Novak announced that Russia will further attract Indian investment to the Russian oil and gas sector and expand Russian companies' sales networks in India. Novak also stated that Russia's oil and petroleum product exports to India had approached USD1 billion, and that there would be more opportunities to increase this amount.²⁷⁷

Russia has engaged in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade. Its actions address the consequences of the pandemic and specifically address value-added trade.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yu Bi

India: -1

India has not complied with its commitment to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.

On 5 December 2021, President of Russia Vladimir Putin visited Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi. In New Delhi, they were assured by one another to increase their annual trade to USD30 billion by 2025.²⁷⁸ They also signed a memorandum of understanding where Russia will continuously supply India with coal to prevent interruptions in the latter's steel production.²⁷⁹ At the same meeting, both India and Russia planned to expand their trade portfolio towards education, agriculture, pharmaceuticals, and clean energy. The goal is to strengthen their bilateral relations through augmenting the number of sectors within the trade. Furthermore, India will be loaning USD1 billion to Indian businesses to expand their entrepreneurial ventures in eastern Russia, to increase trade.²⁸⁰

In March 2022, India commenced talks with MERCOSUR member countries, particularly Brazil, to amend the pre-existing Preferential Trade Agreement.²⁸¹ The motive behind this is for India to import more crude sunflower oil.

²⁷⁵ President Jair Bolsonaro and President Vladimir Putin meet in Moscow, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 16 February 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/en/government-of-brazil/latest-news/2022/president-jair-bolsonaro-and-president-vladimir-putin-met-in-moscow>

²⁷⁶ President Jair Bolsonaro participates in a meeting with businessmen from Brazil and Russia, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 17 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/acompanhe-o-planalto/noticias/2022/02/presidente-jair-bolsonaro-participa-de-encontro-com-empresarios-do-brasil-e-da-russia>

²⁷⁷ Alexander Novak spoke by telephone with Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas and Minister of Housing and Urban Affairs of India Hardeep Singh Puri, Government House (Moscow) 10 March 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44779/>

²⁷⁸ India, Russia reinvigorate bilateral ties, Observer Research Foundation (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 30 December 2021. <https://www.orfonline.org/research/india-russia-reinvigorate-bilateral-ties/>

²⁷⁹ India signs trade and arms deals with Russia during Putin's visit to New Delhi, CNN News (Atlanta) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 30 December 2021. <https://www.cnn.com/2021/12/06/india/india-russia-arms-deal-putin-modi-intl-hnk/index.html>

²⁸⁰ Vladimir Putin: What Russian president's India visit means for world politics, BCC News (New Delhi). Access Date: 30 December 2021. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-59515741>

²⁸¹ India looks to MERCOSUR countries to meet sunflower oil demand; Amendments to be made in PTA, Financial Express (Noida) 12 April 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2021. <https://www.financialexpress.com/economy/india-looks-to-mercosur-countries-to-meet-sunflower-oil-demand-amendments-to-be-made-in-pta/2489591/>

India took joint actions towards enhancing intra-BRICS trade, but its actions did not address the need to enhance value-added trade or respond to the consequences of the pandemic.

Thus, India receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Jathorsan Lingarajan

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.

On 20 September 2021, Minister of Commerce Wang Wentao attended the 24th Association of Southeast Asian Nations Plus Three (10+3) Trade Ministers' Meeting, where Russia and India were also included as dialogue partners.²⁸² In this meeting, Minister Wang announced to deepen cooperation to combat the COVID-19, implementing President Xi Jinping's commitment to making Chinese vaccines accessible as public goods, and providing assistance to other members to quickly resume economic development. Wang also stated in this context that China will safeguard the multilateral trade system by promoting the high-quality development of the Belt and Road Initiative.

On 30 September 2021, the Deputy Director of the Finance Department of the Ministry of Commerce Shu Jueting said that China and Russia will continue to smooth port transportation and customs clearance and ensure the stability of industrial and supply chains.²⁸³ China and Russia agreed to support the establishment of electromechanical industry demonstration parks in each other's localities, and discuss the cooperation on "two countries, dual parks." The two sides will steadily expand two-way market access for agricultural products and deepen agricultural cooperation.

On 16 November 2021, China and Brazil co-hosted the 8th meeting of the Economic and Trade Subcommittee of China-Brazil High-level Coordination and Cooperation Committee.²⁸⁴ Vice Minister Wang Shouwen emphasized that the two sides will continue to expand practical cooperation and improve bilateral economic and trade relations. According to Vice Minister Wang, the two countries boost cooperation under plurilateral and multilateral frameworks such as the World Trade Organization, the G20, BRICS, Forum for Economic and Trade Co-operation between China and Portuguese-speaking Countries (MACAO Forum), etc.

On 4 February 2022, China and Russia signed a joint agreement and announced to strengthen bilateral cooperation.²⁸⁵ Both Russia and China promised to defend the multilateral trade system based on the central role of the World Trade Organization (WTO) and ensure the sustainable and stable operation of global and regional value chains. Specifically, the agreement pointed out that the two members would deepen strategic partnerships among BRICS members and promote cooperation in economy and finance.

On 1 March 2022, Vice Minister and Deputy China International Trade Representative Wang Shouwen attended and spoke at opening of the first meeting of BRICS Contact Group on Economic and Trade Issues

²⁸² Head of the Department of Asian Affairs of the Ministry of Commerce briefed the press on outcomes of the Trade Ministers' Meetings on East Asia Cooperation, Ministry of Commerce, People's Republic of China (Beijing). 20 September 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2021. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/policyreleasing/202109/20210903202334.shtml>

²⁸³ MOFCOM Regular Press Conference, Ministry of Commerce, People's Republic of China (Beijing). 1 October 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/press/202110/20211003208877.shtml>

²⁸⁴ China and Brazil Held the 8th Meeting of the Economic and Trade Subcommittee of China-Brazil High-level Coordination and Cooperation Committee Both Agreed to Deepen Mutually Beneficial Economic and Trade Cooperation, People's Republic of China (Beijing). 19 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/significantnews/202111/2021110320286.shtml>

²⁸⁵ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development (Translation provided by Google), Ministry of Commerce, People's Republic of China (Beijing) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <http://www.crc.mofcom.gov.cn/article/qyxx/202202/424206.html>

for 2022.²⁸⁶ Vice Minister Wang stated that China aimed to deepen trade and economic cooperation and create an open and inclusive trading environment with other BRICS members, acknowledging the profound influences that were brought by the pandemic.

On 28 April 2022, Special Secretary for Foreign Trade and International Affairs of the Ministry of Economy Roberto Fendt (among other Brazilian and Chinese governmental representatives) attended the 9th Meeting of the Economic-Financial Subcommittee of the Sino-Brazilian High Level Commission for Coordination and Cooperation.²⁸⁷ The two countries discussed the development of financial tools to deal with global challenges, mutual participation in multilateral development banks, BRICS cooperation, and best practices regarding public-private partnerships.

China has engaged in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade, specifically including value-added trade and addressing the consequences of the epidemic.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yu Bi

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to continue our joint efforts on facilitating a conducive environment for enhancing trade, specifically value-added trade, among BRICS countries while striving to address the pandemic and its consequences.

On December 4, 2021, President Cyril Ramaphosa had conversations with Russian President Vladimir Putin, discussing amalgamating efforts to address the effects of the pandemic.²⁸⁸ In this context, the two leaders also conversed about their upcoming Russian-South African summit, which focuses on the economic and trade relations between the two countries.

South Africa has engaged in joint actions that enhance intra-BRICS trade. Its actions address the consequences of the pandemic, but do not specifically address value-added trade.

Therefore, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Jathorsan Lingarajan

²⁸⁶ Vice Minister and Deputy China International Trade Representative Wang Shouwen Attends and Speaks at Opening of First Meeting of BRICS Contact Group on Economic and Trade Issues for 2022, Ministry of Commerce, People's Republic of China (Beijing) 1 March 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022.

<http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/newsrelease/significantnews/202203/20220303284705.shtml>

²⁸⁷ Brazil and China discuss opportunities for economic cooperation and investment, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 29 April 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/abril/brasil-e-china-debatem-opportunidades-de-cooperacao-economica-e-investimentos>

²⁸⁸ Russian, South African leaders to pool efforts in tackling coronavirus amid new strain, TASS Russian News Agency (Moscow) 4 December 2021. Access Date: 30 December 2021. <https://tass.com/world/1370797>

6. Macroeconomics: Competition

“[Recognizing the important role of fair competition in supporting business development, protecting consumers’ interests, and promoting post-pandemic economic recovery and growth in difficult times,] we will continue to deepen practical cooperation in the field of competition.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

Background

Relevant BRICS authorities have cooperated on competition and antimonopoly issues since the launch of the forum. The first meeting of BRIC competition authorities was held in the framework of the International Competition Conference (ICC) in Kazan, Russia on 1 September 2009. The second meeting was hosted by China in Beijing on 20-22 September 2011. On 21 -22 November 2013, the third conference was held in New Delhi, India. On 11-13 November 2015, South Africa hosted the fourth meeting of the BRICS Heads of competition authorities. The next meeting of BRICS competition authorities was held on the margins of International Legal Forum on 19 May 2016 in St. Petersburg, Russia. It was held again in 2017, along with the BRICS ICC on the margins of the Annual Conference of the International Competition Network and the meeting of the BRICS Heads of competition authorities. In 2018, the meeting of the BRICS Heads of competition authorities was hosted by South Africa in Durban. The Sixth BRICS Competition Conference was held on 16-19 September 2019 in Moscow. Besides, the Brasilia Declaration mentioned the meeting of the Working Group on Studying Competition on Digital Markets on the margins of the International Conference “Designing Anti-Trust for the Digital Era.” The Heads of the BRICS competition authorities met again on 19 May and 23 July 2020 (in a virtual format). Moreover, the Russian BRICS Presidency hosted the meeting of BRICS Working Group on the Research of Competition Issues of Pharmaceutical Markets on 13 March 2020 in Moscow, the extraordinary meeting of heads of international units of BRICS competition authorities on 27 May 2020 and the meeting of the Working Group for Research of Competition Issues in the Automotive Markets on 5-6 November 2020. Thus, competition authorities of the BRICS countries usually meet at least once a year, while the ICC is held biannually.

BRICS leaders for the first time addressed competition issues at the Fortaleza Summit with a commitment “to improve competition policy and enforcement, undertake actions to address challenges that BRICS Competition Authorities face and further enable competitive environments in order to enhance contributions to economic growth.”²⁸⁹ The leaders reiterated this commitment in Ufa, and also welcomed cooperation on competition-related policies in pharmaceutical and other socially important economic sectors.²⁹⁰ In Xiamen, the leaders noted the significance of the interaction between relevant authorities, “in particular, in identifying and suppressing restrictive business practices that are of a transboundary nature.”²⁹¹ In the Moscow 2020 Declaration, the BRICS leaders acknowledged the progress in cooperation among the countries’ competition

²⁸⁹ Fortaleza Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

²⁹⁰ Ufa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

²⁹¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

authorities and the BRICS International Competition Law and Policy Center activities.²⁹² In 2021, given the challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic, the leaders stressed the importance of practical cooperation in the field of competition.

Commitment Features

The commitment requires BRICS members to deepen practical cooperation in the field of competition, recognized by the BRICS leaders as playing “the important role ... in supporting business development, protecting consumers’ interests, and promoting post-pandemic economic recovery and growth in difficult times.”²⁹³

Full compliance is registered for BRICS countries that manage to deepen cooperation in the area of competition bilaterally or multilaterally in partnership with other BRICS members, for instance through the exchange of experience and relevant information or carrying out joint investigations. Domestic actions to improve competition policy and enforcement not explicitly providing for intra-BRICS cooperation are considered as partial compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	BRICS member has not taken any steps to improve competition policy and enforcement
0	BRICS member has taken steps to improve competition policy and enforcement that has not led to deepening intra-BRICS cooperation
+1	BRICS member has taken steps to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov
Lead Analyst: Andrey Shelepov*

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to improve competition policy and enforcement.

On 14 September 2021, the 7th meeting of the Lusophone Competition Network took place bringing together representatives from eight Member States of the Community of Portuguese Speaking Countries, including Brazil. The meeting addressed the key sectors that deserve greater attention from competition in order to ensure the efficient functioning of markets and consumer protection.²⁹⁴

On 15 September 2021, Special Secretariat for Productivity and Competitiveness of the Ministry of Economy launched the Municipalities Competition Index, the first wide-ranging index for competitive assessment. The initiative allows the Public Power to evaluate the business environment of Brazilian municipalities in a systematic, continuous and structured way, and to develop studies, programs and public policies related to the dissemination of good practices and regulatory and competition improvement. In addition, it is a tool to attract foreign investment to Brazilian cities.²⁹⁵

²⁹² XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

²⁹³ XIII BRICS Summit- New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

²⁹⁴ Rede Lusófona da Concorrência abordou desafios na recuperação económica, Comunidade dos Países de Língua Portuguesa (Lisbon) 14 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.cplp.org/id-4447.aspx?Action=1&NewsId=9293&M=NewsV2&PID=10872>

²⁹⁵ Índice de Concorrência dos Municípios é lançado no gov.br, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 15 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/setembro/indice-de-concorrenca-dos-municipios-e-lancado-no-gov.br>

On 20 September 2021, the Administrative Council for Economic Defence (CADE) released a guide on evidence examination in the context of CADE's leniency programme. The guide provides the government with guidance on the parameters for what constitutes – and how to assess – evidence in the scope of the authority's leniency programme. Moreover, it gives reference points to companies conducting internal investigations and resources for building effective compliance programs.²⁹⁶

On 14 October 2021, Administrative Council for Economic Defense and the Comisión Federal de Competencia Económica (Cofece), Mexico's antitrust authority, renewed a Memorandum of Understanding signed in 2016 to maintain an agenda of cooperation between countries in competition matters. The purpose of the MOU is to contribute to the effective enforcement of competition legislation in each country, through cooperation and assistance between the two agencies.²⁹⁷

On 16-17 November 2021, the 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was successfully held in China, representatives of all BRICS members took participated in the event. Promoting post-pandemic economic growth, combating cross-border cartels, responding to new challenges of the digital economy, advancing market-oriented reforms, and implementing competition policies within economic globalization are the common tasks faced by competition agencies in all countries. Participants had in-depths discussions of the above five topics, shared experiences and practices from the perspectives of competition law enforcement agencies, academia, enterprises, and law firms and exchanged views.²⁹⁸

On 26 May 2022, the General Superintendent of the Administrative Council for Economic Defense created a specialized unit in its structure to analyze cases related to unilateral conduct that restricts competition.²⁹⁹ The measure is in line with a broad investment strategy, in recent years, in initiatives aimed at strengthening the agency's role in conducting investigations of abuses of dominant position.

Brazil has taken steps to improve competition policy and enforcement inside the country and internationally and to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to improve competition policy and enforcement.

On 16-17 November 2021, the 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was successfully held in China, representatives of all BRICS members took participated in the event. Promoting post-pandemic economic growth, combating cross-border cartels, responding to new challenges of the digital economy, advancing market-oriented reforms, and implementing competition policies within economic globalization are the common tasks faced by competition agencies in all countries. Participants had in-depths discussions of the

²⁹⁶ CADE launches guide with evidential recommendations for antitrust leniency, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 20 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/cade/en/matters/news/cade-launches-guide-with-evidential-recommendations-for-antitrust-leniency>

²⁹⁷ Cade e autoridade antitruste do México renovam memorando de entendimentos, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 14 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/cade/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/cade-e-autoridade-antitruste-do-mexico-renovam-memorando-de-entendimentos>

²⁹⁸ The 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was Successfully Held in China, Competition Policy International (Beijing) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/the-7th-brics-international-competition-conference-was-successfully-held-in-china/>

²⁹⁹ Superintendência-Geral do Cade institui unidade especializada em investigar condutas unilaterais, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 26 May 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/cade/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/superintendencia-geral-do-cade-institui-unidade-especializada-em-investigar-condutas-unilaterais>

above five topics, shared experiences and practices from the perspectives of competition law enforcement agencies, academia, enterprises, and law firms and exchanged views.³⁰⁰

On 16 December 2021, the government adopted amendments to the Federal law “O zakupkah tovarov, rabot, uslug ot del'nymi vidami juridicheskikh lic” (“On Purchase of Goods, Services by Selected Legal Entities”). The law is applied to state-owned corporations, natural monopolies’ subjects, selected companies in electricity, water supplies, waste disposal industries. Amendments are designed to promote competition in the sphere.³⁰¹

On 19 May 2022, the Federal Anti-Monopoly Service announced that a new expert council would be established to promote competition in the country’s regions.³⁰² The Council would deliver non-binding recommendations regarding implementation of competition policy built on available expertise of the Council’s members that would include the FAS staff, representatives of civil society organizations, academic community, etc.

Russia has taken steps to improve competition policy and enforcement inside the country and to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on competition.

On 16-17 November 2021, the 7th BRICS International Competition Conference (ICC) was held in China. Chairperson of the Competition Commission of India Ashok Kumar Gupta participated in the ICC and presented the Study on Competition Issues in the Automotive Sector prepared in the framework of its work as co-chair of the Working Group for Research on the Competition Issues in the Automobile Markets. The Working Group was established in 2016 to elaborate specific proposals for the formation of a competition environment in the automobile markets and facilitate exchange of experience and approaches to the application of antimonopoly laws in the automobile markets between the BRICS countries.³⁰³

India has taken steps to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on competition.

On 16-17 November 2021, the 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was successfully held in China, representatives of all BRICS members took participated in the event. Promoting post-pandemic economic growth, combating cross-border cartels, responding to new challenges of the digital economy, advancing market-oriented reforms, and implementing competition policies within economic globalization are

³⁰⁰ The 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was Successfully Held in China, Competition Policy International (Beijing) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/the-7th-brics-international-competition-conference-was-successfully-held-in-china/>

³⁰¹ Reshenija, prinjatye na zasedanii Pravitel'stva 16 dekabrja 2021 goda (Decisions Approved on 16 December 2021 Meeting), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 27 January 2022. <http://government.ru/news/44148/>

³⁰² Federal Anti-Monopoly Service Order 392/22, Federal Anti-Monopoly Service (Moscow) 19 May 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://fas.gov.ru/documents/688425>

³⁰³ The 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was Successfully Held in China, Competition Policy International (Beijing) 30 January 2022. Access date: 1 February 2022. <https://www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/the-7th-brics-international-competition-conference-was-successfully-held-in-china/>

the common tasks faced by competition agencies in all countries. Participants had in-depths discussions of the above five topics, shared experiences and practices from the perspectives of competition law enforcement agencies, academia, enterprises, and law firms and exchanged views.³⁰⁴

On 16 November 2021, China's State Administration for Market Regulation (SAMR) and the Eurasian Economic Commission (EEC) signed a Memorandum of Understanding aimed at strengthening interaction between the EEC and SAMR in the field of competition policy and antimonopoly regulation, including the improvement of the legal framework, methodological assistance in investigating law violation cases and countering anticompetitive practices.³⁰⁵

China has taken steps to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment on competition.

On 16-17 November 2021, the 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was successfully held in China, representatives of all BRICS members took participated in the event. Promoting post-pandemic economic growth, combating cross-border cartels, responding to new challenges of the digital economy, advancing market-oriented reforms, and implementing competition policies within economic globalization are the common tasks faced by competition agencies in all countries. Participants had in-depths discussions of the above five topics, shared experiences and practices from the perspectives of competition law enforcement agencies, academia, enterprises, and law firms and exchanged views.³⁰⁶

On 18 February 2022, South Africa, Egypt, Kenya, Mauritius and Nigeria held a multilateral meeting on digital competition policy.³⁰⁷ The parties signed a joint declaration to collaborate in the regulation of digital markets to remove barriers for expansion of African digital platforms, share information regarding existing regulations and laws, etc.

South Africa has taken steps to deepen practical intra-BRICS cooperation in the field of competition.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

³⁰⁴ The 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was Successfully Held in China, Competition Policy International (Beijing) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/the-7th-brics-international-competition-conference-was-successfully-held-in-china/>

³⁰⁵ The EEC and the PRC signed a Memorandum of Understanding in the field of competition policy and antimonopoly regulation, Eurasian Economic Commission (Moscow) 18 November 2021. Access Date: 1 February 2022. <https://eec.eaeunion.org/en/news/eek-i-knr-podpisali-memorandum-o-vzaimoponimani-i-v-oblasti-konkurentnoy-politiki-i-antimonopolnogo-regulirovaniya/>

³⁰⁶ The 7th BRICS International Competition Conference was Successfully Held in China, Competition Policy International 17 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/the-7th-brics-international-competition-conference-was-successfully-held-in-china/>

³⁰⁷ Collaboration by African competition regulators with respect to the regulation of digital markets in Africa, Cliffe Dekker Hofmeyr (Johannesburg) 9 March 2022. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://www.cliffedekkerhofmeyr.com/en/news/publications/2022/Practice/Competition/competition-law-alert-Collaboration-by-African-competition-regulators-with-respect-to-the-regulation-of-digital-markets-in-Africa.html>

7. ICT and Digital Economy: Cooperation

“[As we enter the ‘Decade of Action’ for the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs),] we [believe that BRICS must prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and] encourage further cooperation.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia		0	
India			+1
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.40 (70%)		

Background

In 2014, the BRICS Ministers of Science, Technology and Innovation met for the first time where they concluded with the Cape Town Declaration, welcomed by BRICS leaders at the Fortaleza Summit. The Cape Town Declaration was aimed at: “(i) strengthening cooperation in science, technology and innovation; (ii) addressing common global and regional socio-economic challenges utilizing shared experiences and complementarities; (iii) co-generating new knowledge and innovative products, services and processes utilizing appropriate funding and investment instruments; and (iv) promoting, where appropriate, joint BRICS partnerships with other strategic actors in the developing world.”³⁰⁸ A peaceful, secure and open digital and Internet space was also mentioned, as well as a reiteration of the BRICS commitment to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

In 2015, the BRICS Ministers of Science, Technology and Innovation met again and the BRICS leaders reiterated their calls for a peaceful, secure and open digital and Internet space and their commitment to the SDGs.³⁰⁹ In 2016, the BRICS leaders recognized the importance of incorporating technology for the implementation of the SDGs and committed “to bridging digital and technological divides, in particular between developed and developing countries.”³¹⁰

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS leaders first mentioned the digital economy, stating “Living in the era of digital economy, we are ready to use opportunities it provides and address challenges it poses for global growth. We will act on the basis of principles of innovation, partnership, synergy, flexibility, open and favorable business environment, trust and security, protection of consumer rights in order to ensure the conditions for a thriving and dynamic digital economy, that will foster global economic development and benefit everyone.”³¹¹

In 2018, the BRICS Business Council established a Digital Economy Working Group. At the 2018, Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS leaders stated: “We are convinced that trade and technology are vital sources of inclusive growth, including through economic integration and consolidation of global value chains in sustainable and equitable ways. Technological progress will have wide ranging implications for production of goods and services as well as incomes of people. Appropriate policies and measures need to be taken to ensure

³⁰⁸ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

³⁰⁹ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

³¹⁰ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

³¹¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

that the developing countries benefit from the advantages of technological progress and do not suffer from lack of its early adoption. It is essential to develop effective policies to bridge the digital divides, including through supporting people to learn and by adopting new technologies and ensure effective mechanisms for transfer of relevant technologies.”³¹² While the BRICS leaders addressed some aspects of the digital economy and the SDGs at the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the main focus was on economic growth and innovation.³¹³

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS leaders acknowledged the importance of the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership for 2021-2025 to enhance BRICS cooperation in trade, investment and finance, digital economy and sustainable development. Furthermore, the leaders stated, “We recognize the role of the digital economy as an important tool for modernization and transformation of the industry, promotion of inclusive economic growth, support of seamless global trade and business conduct, and thus helping BRICS national economies to meet the Sustainable Development Goals.”³¹⁴

Commitment Features

The BRICS commitment is “[As we enter the ‘Decade of Action’ for the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs),] we [believe that BRICS must prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and] encourage further cooperation.” This commitment includes two components: prioritizing the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development and encouraging further cooperation on the matter.

“The Decade of Action” was announced in September 2019 by the United Nations to ensure the co-operation are met by 2030. The Decade of Action calls for action on three levels: “global action to secure greater leadership, more resources and smarter solutions for the Sustainable Development Goals; local action embedding the needed transitions in the policies, budgets, institutions and regulatory frameworks of governments, cities and local authorities; and people action, including by youth, civil society, the media, the private sector, unions, academia and other stakeholders, to generate an unstoppable movement pushing for the required transformations.”³¹⁵ “Implementation” refers to “the process of making something active or effective.”³¹⁶

The “Sustainable Development Goals” refer to the 17 goals and 169 targets agreed to by all UN member states in 2015, “which are an urgent call for action by all countries - developed and developing - in a global partnership. They recognize that ending poverty and other deprivations must go hand-in-hand with strategies that improve health and education, reduce inequality, and spur economic growth – all while tackling climate change and working to preserve our oceans and forests.”³¹⁷

“Prioritize” is “to decide which of a group of things are the most important so you can deal with them first.”³¹⁸ In this case, the priority is utilizing technology and data for development. “Effective and efficient use of technology and data” refers to successfully and quickly using “(the study and knowledge of) the practice, especially industrial, use of scientific discoveries”³¹⁹ and “information, especially facts or numbers, collected to

³¹² BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

³¹³ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilgia.html>

³¹⁴ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

³¹⁵ Decade of Action, United Nations (New York) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/decade-of-action/>

³¹⁶ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

³¹⁷ The 17 Goals, United Nations (New York) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://sdgs.un.org/goals>

³¹⁸ Prioritize, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/prioritize>

³¹⁹ Technology, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/technology>

be examined and considered and used to help decision-making, or information in an electronic form that can be stored and used by a computer.”³²⁰ “Development” refers to “the process in which someone or something grows or changes and becomes more advanced.”³²¹

“Various tracks of work” refers to the 17 different SDGs and the ability of technology and data to advance those. The 17 goals being: 1) no poverty; 2) zero hunger; 3) good health and well-being; 4) quality education; 5) gender equality; 6) clean water and sanitation; 7) affordable and clean energy; 8) decent work and economic growth; 9) industry, innovation and infrastructure; 10) reduced inequalities; 11) sustainable cities and communities; 12) responsible consumption and production; 13) climate action; 14) life below water; 15) life on land; 16) peace, justice and strong institutions; and 17) partnerships for the goals.³²² “Encourage” “does not imply strong measurability in the commitment. It should be taken as a soft commitment where no concrete action is to be taken” “co-operation rather cooperation” refers to building on partnerships and working together in more aspects to achieve the goal of this commitment.

For full compliance, a BRICS member must take strong action on prioritizing the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in more than one area of the SDGs, as well as encouraging further cooperation. This means that a BRICS member must take concrete action on the first component, such as contributing to existing initiatives, launching or initiating new projects or programs, drafting or passing new laws or policies or investing in improving technology and data for development. For the second component on encouraging further cooperation, the BRICS member need only take soft actions, such as making speeches, reaffirming their commitment to this commitment, or attending meetings on the matter. This would include BRICS meetings that discuss this issue. If a BRICS member only addresses the first component, it would be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member only addresses one area of the SDGs through the first component, but also addresses the second component, it would still be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member engages in soft actions on both components, it would also be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member fails to engage with international or multilateral initiatives that prioritize effective and efficient use of technology and data for development, that would be considered an act of non-compliance. Furthermore, if a BRICS member takes action that contradicts this commitment, it would be considered an act of non-compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work and encourage further cooperation.
0	The BRICS member somewhat prioritized the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work OR encouraged further cooperation.
+1	The BRICS member strongly prioritized the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work AND encouraged further cooperation.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Sonja Dobson

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and encourage further cooperation.

³²⁰ Data, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/data>

³²¹ Development, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/development>

³²² The 17 Goals, United Nations (New York) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://sdgs.un.org/goals>

On 24 November 2021, Minister of State for Education Milton Ribeiro participated in the Conference on Israeli Innovations in Agriculture and Water.³²³ The event was promoted by the Israeli Embassy in Brazil and brought together Israeli agritechs in the water sector, agribusiness entrepreneurs and state governments. The conference aimed to bring innovation companies and state governments closer to new technologies aimed at improving water use and productivity in the countryside.

On 11 February 2022, the Brazilian Agency for Industrial Development, in partnership with the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply, launched the second Public Notice for Agro 4.0.³²⁴ The initiative will select eight pilot projects to disseminate the adoption of 4.0 technology for the Brazilian productive sector. The projects will receive a total of BRL1.5 million and aim to identify viable models for the application of solutions, focusing on increasing efficiency and productivity and reducing costs.

On 4 March 2022, a memorandum of understanding between the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation and the World Health Organization (WHO) was signed in Geneva to promote the development of technologies linked to the health sector such as diagnostic tests, new medicines, new vaccines, animal and sewage testing protocols, monitoring, preparation and response to other pandemics and epidemics.³²⁵ The decision to sign the document was based on the interest shown by the WHO in the research and development activities (R&D) promoted by the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation to face the Covid-19 pandemic in the fields of science, technology and innovation in health, such as the creation of RedeVirus MCTI, development of national vaccines, monitoring and sequencing of the virus and several other measures of the folder during this period. The memorandum of understanding paves the way for Brazilian researchers to cooperate with other countries not only to combat COVID-19, but other diseases that impact humanity.

On 24 May 2022, Brazil hosted the event “Agro: Technology and Space Applications” in Cuiabá.³²⁶ With the objective of demonstrating the use of technology related to the space sector, covering the academy, the State and society, and the agricultural sector, together, lectures were given throughout the day, aiming at show options to expand agriculture in a sustainable and modern way, through the use of spatial artifacts.

Brazil has taken action to prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data in the agriculture and health sectors. Furthermore, Brazil has taken these actions alongside other countries and in partnership with other organizations, encouraging further cooperation.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Ashleen Kaur

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and encourage further cooperation.

³²³ Ministro da Educação participou da Conferência de Inovações Israelenses em Agricultura e Água, Brazilian Government (Brasília) 24 November 2021. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 16 June 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mec/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ministro-da-educacao-participou-da-conferencia-de-inovacoes-israelenses-em-agricultura-e-agua>

³²⁴ Edital é lançado e vai selecionar projetos-piloto para adoção de tecnologias 4.0 no agro, Brazilian Government (Brasília) 11 February 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 16 June 2022. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/agricultura-e-pecuaria/2022/02/edital-e-lancado-e-vai-selecionar-projetos-piloto-para-adoacao-de-tecnologias-4-0-no-agro>

³²⁵ MCTI e OMS assinam acordo para cooperação mútua em temas relevantes para a ciência, tecnologia e inovação em saúde, Brazilian Government (Brasília) 4 March 2022. Access Date: 16 June 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/mcti/pt-br/acompanhe-o-mcti/noticias/2022/03/mcti-e-oms-assinam-acordo-para-cooperacao-mutua-em-temas-relevantes-para-a-ciencia-tecnologia-e-inovacao-em-saude>

³²⁶ AEB realiza evento mostrando que o espaço pode revolucionar o agronegócio, Brazilian Government (Brasília) 24 May 2022. Access Date: 16 June 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/aeb/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/aeb-realiza-evento-mostrando-como-as-tecnologias-espaciais-podem-revolucionar-o-agronegocio>

On 13 September 2021, the Ministry of Finance announced the digital ruble will become a key digitization project before 2030 and the third form of money issued by the Bank of Russia.³²⁷ This will contribute to further development of the payment infrastructure, increase competition and the spread of new innovative financial instruments, as well as increase the cost of services for people and businesses.

On 8 October 2021, Russia and the United States jointly submitted a draft resolution on international information security to the United Nations General Assembly with 53 other countries co-sponsoring the draft.³²⁸ The resolution invited all member states to take into account “the assessments and recommendations contained in the report of the Open-ended Working Group and the reports of the Group of Governmental Experts” and to “continue to inform the Secretary - General of their views and assessments” on a set of questions, including efforts taken at the national level to strengthen information security, and continue cooperation in this field. Also, the resolution expresses support for the Open-Ended Working Group on security established in 2018 following Russia’s proposal.

On 23 November 2021, Russia requested that 13 foreign technology companies, including Facebook, Twitter and TikTok, be officially represented on Russian soil by the end of 2021 or face outright bans.³²⁹ The purpose of this campaign is to protect data privacy and support the domestic technology sector over Silicon Valley alternatives.

On 29 November 2021, Russia took steps to regulate technology giants more closely by imposing small fines for content violations, while also seeking to force foreign companies to have official representation in Russia and store Russians’ personal data on its territory.³³⁰ Thus far, Twitter has been fined a total of RUB38.4 million (USD511,900) in 2021, and the regulator has said it will seek fines on the annual turnover of Google and Facebook.

On 6 December 2021, President Vladimir Putin paid a visit to India for the 21st India – Russia Annual summit with Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi.³³¹ During the bilateral talks, several Government-to-Government Agreements and memorandums of understanding were signed in different sectors including developing the science and technology industries.

On 8 December 2021, Russia blocked Tor, an encrypted browser typically used to circumvent internet censorship or to surf the internet anonymously.³³² The government is using its growing technological capacity to increase regulatory oversight and censorship of internet activity.

³²⁷ Digital ruble will become third form of money in Russia before 2030 — strategy, Russian News Agency (Moscow) 13 September 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. <https://tass.com/economy/1336999>

³²⁸ Developments in the field of information and telecommunications in the context of international security, and advancing responsible State behaviour in the use of information and communications technologies, United Nations (New York) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/LTD/N21/281/02/PDF/N2128102.pdf?OpenElement>

³²⁹ Moscow tells 13 mostly U.S. tech firms they must set up in Russia by 2022, Reuters (Moscow) 23 November 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. <https://www.reuters.com/markets/europe/moscow-says-13-foreign-tech-firms-must-be-represented-russian-soil-by-2022-2021-11-23/>

³³⁰ Russia says Twitter mobile slowdown to remain until all banned content is removed, Reuters (Moscow) 29 November 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. <https://www.reuters.com/world/europe/russia-says-twitter-mobile-slowdown-remain-until-all-banned-content-is-removed-2021-11-29/>

³³¹ 21st India – Russia Annual Summit, Government of India Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34608/21st_India__Russia_Annual_Summit

³³² Russia blocks privacy service Tor ratcheting up internet control, Reuters (Moscow) 8 December 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. <https://www.reuters.com/technology/russia-ratchets-up-internet-crackdown-with-block-privacy-service-tor-2021-12-08/>

On 4 March 2022, the Government of Russia blocked Meta-owned Facebook and certain Twitter features, signalling further restriction of access to foreign internet platforms.³³³

On 10 March, Russia released a document called the “Priority Action Plan for Ensuring the Development of the Russian Economy in the Conditions of External Sanctions Pressure.”³³⁴ The document outlined a plan to reduce restrictions on the use of intellectual property owned by foreign brands. Given sanctions imposed on Russia, this decree will enable domestic companies that rely on software from foreign brands to continue their operations.

On 14 April, President Putin decreed an interdepartmental commission to pursue technological sovereignty in the area of critical information infrastructure.³³⁵ Specifically, he will be engaged in ensuring the technological independence of CII facilities, equipping them with domestic radio-electronic products, technical equipment, and information support. Given current sanctions imposed on Russia, the commission aims to find substitutes for Western technology suppliers.

Russia has taken some action on prioritizing the effective and efficient use of technology and data, as well as some cooperation, in currency, science, technology and information. However, Russia has also taken action that restricts the effective and efficient use of technology and data by restricting access to the internet and certain platforms.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Eva Li

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work and, encourage further cooperation.

On 16 September 2021, Union Minister of State in the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology (IT) Shri Rajeev Chadrashkekhar inaugurated five National Institute of Electronics and Information Technology Centres in three states.³³⁶ The centres are meant to provide the youth with skills and training. The Centres aim to help make India one of the leading human resource provider for technology requirements.

On 23 September 2021, the Ministry of Electronics and IT invited public and private stakeholders including internet service providers to a workshop called “Connecting all Indians.”³³⁷ Attendees discussed a roadmap to accelerate internet access in rural areas. The goal of the workshop was to develop strategies for universal internet coverage.

³³³ VPN use in Russia is surging as citizens try to bypass government’s tightening internet control, (New Jersey) 10 March 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <https://www.cnn.com/2022/03/11/vpn-use-in-russia-is-surging-as-government-tightens-internet-control.html>

³³⁴ Russia May Legalize Software Piracy As Tech And Game Companies Continue To Pull Out, Yahoo Finance (New York) 10 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://finance.yahoo.com/news/russia-may-legalize-software-piracy-215000363.html>

³³⁵ Putin establishes Security Council’s commission on IT infrastructure sovereignty, Russia News Agency (Moscow) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. https://tass.com/russia/1438013?utm_source=google.com&utm_medium=organic&utm_campaign=google.com&utm_referrer=google.com

³³⁶ Union Minister Rajeev Chandrasekhar inaugurates five National Institute of Electronics and information Technology (NIELIT) Centers in three North Eastern States, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 16 September 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1755655>

³³⁷ Ministry of Electronics and IT organizes strategy workshop on making India one of worlds’ largest connected countries, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 23 September 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1757190>

On 2 October 2021, the Ministry of Electronics and IT announced that the Unique Identification Authority of India plans on opening a total of 166 Aadhaar Enrolment and Update Centres in 122 cities.³³⁸ These centres have the capacity of manage up to a 1,000 enrolments and update requests per day.

On 25 October 2021, the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology organised a training program to strengthen the cybersecurity ecosystem in India.³³⁹ Participants included Chief Information Security Officers (CISOs), IT staff and Bank Organisations. The goal of the workshop was to help participants understand the cyber world in order to provide individual organisations and citizens with better cybersecurity.

On 1 November 2021, Minister Chandrasekhar inaugurated the first Internet Exchange in Uttarakhand.³⁴⁰ The Internet Exchange will improve the quality of Internet and Broadband services in Uttarakhand.

On 10 November 2021, the National Internet Exchange of India (NIXI) enabled digital payments across its business units.³⁴¹ This allows NIXI to provide uninterrupted service and improve all its services. It also helps make the internet accessible to everyone.

On 12 November 2021, the NIXI established a customer care unit to enhance customer support for Dot IN Registry, Internet Exchange and Internet Registry for Internet Names and Numbers.³⁴² The unit was established to service the Indian Internet community more efficiently.

On 21 November 2021, Minister Chandrasekhar inaugurated the fifth Aadhar Seva Kendra (ASK) at Ghaziabad.³⁴³ The ASK can handle up to 1,000 residents per day. This will enhance delivery of social welfare benefits, improving the lives of residents of Ghaziabad.

On 25 November, the National e-Governance Division began a six-day Deep Dive Training Program for CISOs, IT officials and banks.³⁴⁴ The workshop included discussions on topics such as cyber security, mobile security, and cryptography. The workshop aims to equip participants with the necessary information and skills to manage cyber security challenges. It enables better functioning and delivery of e-Governance services and promotes a safe digital space.

On 30 November 2021, the National Association of Software and Services Companies, the Ministry of Electronics and IT, and the Government of Andhra Pradesh inaugurated the Centre of Excellence on IoT and AI at Andhra University.³⁴⁵ The centre aims to promote innovation in emerging technologies such as the Internet of Things (IoT), artificial intelligence (AI) and robotics, entrepreneurship and, develop solutions to real-world challenges.

³³⁸ UIDAI plans to open 166 stand-alone Aadhaar Enrolment and Update Centres in 122 cities across the country, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 21 October 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1760208>

³³⁹ Ministry of Electronics and IT organizes week long CISO Deep Dive Training program from 25th to 30th October, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 28 October 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1767114>

³⁴⁰ MoS IT Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar inaugurated the first Internet Exchange for Uttarakhand in Dehradun, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 1 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1768488>

³⁴¹ National Internet Exchange of India launches 'Digital Payment Gateway,' Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1770652>

³⁴² National Internet Exchange of India establishes dedicated "Customer-Care Unit" (24/7), Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1771185>

³⁴³ Aadhaar Seva Kendra inaugurated by Rajeev Chandrasekhar and General (DR) V.K Singh (Retd) at Ghaziabad, U.P., Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 21 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1773720>

³⁴⁴ MeitY organised 24th CISO Deep Dive Training program under Cyber Surakshit Bharat Initiative, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1774952>

³⁴⁵ Union Ministry of Electronics and IT, Govt of Andhra Pradesh and NASSCOM launch 'Centre of Excellence of IoT and AI' in Visakhapatnam, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 19 December 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1776510>

On 6 December 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi and Russian President Vladimir Putin signed an memorandum of understanding that called for greater bilateral cooperation in the science and technology sector.³⁴⁶

On 15 December 2021, the Union Cabinet approved an incentive scheme to promote RuPayDebit cards.³⁴⁷ The scheme will help banks build a digital payment ecosystem and make digital payments accessible to marginalised populations who are not part of the formal banking system.

On 21 December 2021, Minister Chandrasekhar inaugurated ASK at Gonda, Varanasi, Saharanpur and Moradabad.³⁴⁸ This will improve the delivery of social welfare benefits of residents of the aforementioned cities.

On 23 December 2021, Minister Chandrasekhar inaugurated seven new internet exchange nodes in cities across Uttar Pradesh.³⁴⁹ This will help improve the quality of internet and broadband services in the region.

On 28 December 2021, Minister Chandrasekhar inaugurated the fifth software technology park in Uttar Pradesh.³⁵⁰ The technology park will help empower tech start-ups, increase software exports and provide employment opportunities.

On 17 January 2022, new licenses for UL(M2M) and UL-VNO(M2M) were introduced under the UL and UL-VNO licenses.³⁵¹ The new licenses allow an independent category of service providers to create, operate and provide network for interconnection. The licenses help improve the Internet of Things and machine to machine communication ecosystem.

On 29 January 2022, the India-ASEAN Digital Work Plan 2022 was approved at the ASEAN Digital Ministers meeting.³⁵² The plan involves capacity building and knowledge sharing in several areas including 5G and Internet of Things. It also includes a WiFi Access network interface for public internet. The meeting was attended by ASEAN countries and dialogue partner countries including Australia, Canada, China, EU and Russia.

On 8 February 2022, the government issued guidelines for registration of WPAN/WLAN connectivity providers and M2MSP providers.³⁵³ The guidelines will help address connectivity, traceability and encryption. They help strengthen the Internet of Things and machine to machine communication ecosystem.

On 25 February 2022, the Telecommunication Engineering Centre invited input on the development of a framework for fairness assessment of Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning.³⁵⁴ The goal is to build public

³⁴⁶ 21st India – Russia Annual Summit, Ministry of External Affairs (Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34608/21st_India__Russia_Annual_Summit

³⁴⁷ Cabinet approves an incentive scheme for promotion of RuPay Debit Cards and low value BHIM-UPI transactions, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1781730>

³⁴⁸ Big Push for Digital Uttar Pradesh with launch of 4 more Aadhar Seva Kendra at Gonda, Varanasi, Saharanpur and Moradabad, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 21 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021.

³⁴⁹ 7 new Internet Exchanges launched by MoS (Electronics and IT) Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar and MoS (Law and Justice) in Uttar Pradesh, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi) 23 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1784627>

³⁵⁰ STPI Meerut to give impetus to IT and entrepreneurship in Tier 2 cities, Ministry of Electronics & IT (Delhi). 28 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1785836>

³⁵¹ Government take steps to facilitate wider proliferation and innovation in Machine to Machine communication (M2M) sector, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 10 February 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1797179>

³⁵² India-ASEAN Digital Work Plan 2022 approved at 2nd ASEAN Digital Ministers (ADGMIN) meeting, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 29 January 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1793449>

³⁵³ Government take steps to facilitate wider proliferation and innovation in Machine to Machine communication (M2M) sector, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 10 February 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1797179>

³⁵⁴ Telecommunication Engineering Centre (TEC) initiates fairness assessment of Artificial Intelligence/Machine Learning Systems to build public trust, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 25 February 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1801110>

trust and remove bias from Artificial intelligence systems that are being used in a number of sectors including healthcare, transport and finance.

On 3 March 2022, India signed the Host Country Agreement to establish an Area Office and Innovation Centre of the International Telecommunication Union in New Delhi.³⁵⁵ The office and centre will serve several South Asian countries and will support research and development in telecommunication technologies in South Asia.

On 4 March 2022, the National Informatics Centre organised Tech Conclave 2022 with a focus on e-governance and emerging technologies.³⁵⁶ The event helps IT managers of government ministries stay informed about the latest ICT technologies and best practices. It also provides a platform for IT Secretaries of State Governments to understand new technologies that can be rolled out in their states.

On 23 March 2022, the Telecommunications Secretary K. Rajaraman inaugurated the All India Digital Nation-Wide Pension Adalat.³⁵⁷ The Pension Adalat is conducted regularly by Department of Telecommunication field units on a virtual basis. Grievances of pensioners are mitigated by brining all stakeholders under one single platform.

On 28 March 2022, Secretary Rajaraman released two reports called “Rollout of Small Cells for 5G Networks by leveraging Street Furniture” and “IoT/ICT Standards for Smart Cities.”³⁵⁸ The reports facilitate the proliferation of cell infrastructure to support 5G networks and sets guidelines for the development of smart infrastructure for smart cities.

On 22 April 2022, an additional 10 Gbps International bandwidth was commissioned to improve internet connectivity in the Northeastern States in the country.³⁵⁹ Access to high speed and high-quality internet will help establish software parks, e-education and e-banking.

On 10 May 2022, the Telecommunication Engineering Centre and M’s VVDN Technologies Private Limited signed a Memorandum of Understanding.³⁶⁰ The partnership will facilitate research and innovation in 5G.

India took actions that prioritized the effective and efficient use of technology and development in its various tracks of work and encouraged further cooperation.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sarah Nasir

China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to prioritize the effective and efficient use of technology and data for development in its various tracks of work, and encourage further cooperation.

³⁵⁵ India signs Host Country Agreement with the International Telecommunication Union for establishment of Area Office and Innovation Centre at New Delhi, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 3 March 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1802731>

³⁵⁶ Minister of State for Electronics and IT, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar inaugurates NIC Tech Conclave 2022, Ministry of Electronics and IT (Delhi) 4 March 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1802812>

³⁵⁷ Secretary (T) Shri K. Rajaraman inaugurates All India Digital Nation-Wide Pension Adalat, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 23 March 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1808744>

³⁵⁸ Secretary (Telecom) Shri K. Rajarman releases TEC Report – “Rollout of Small Cells for 5G Networks by leveraging Street Furniture,” Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 28 March 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1810629>

³⁵⁹ Augmentation of one additional 10Gbps international bandwidth at Agartala to strengthen internet services in North Eastern States, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1819074>

³⁶⁰ A historic initiative by Department of Telecommunications – India advances in 5G/ORAN testing eco system through public private partnership, Ministry of Communications (Delhi) 10 May 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1824200>

On 13 September 2021, the Chinese government ordered Alipay, a well-established payments app, to create a separate app for its consumer lending business.³⁶¹ The user data used to make lending decisions will also be replaced with a new credit scoring joint venture, which is partially state-owned. This is part of China's regulatory crackdown on large internet firms regarding a wide range of antitrust, privacy, and user data issues.

On 1 November 2021, China's personal information protection law came into effect.³⁶² The law includes consumer-protection measures that restricts domestic and foreign companies from collecting users' personal information without their consent, and from storing more personal data than necessary. This regulatory uncertainty has caused many foreign technology companies to leave or downsize operations in China.

On 29 November 2021, the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology ordered a temporary suspension of updates to the Tencent app.³⁶³ The app will remain frozen until further technical testing by the Chinese authorities.

On 15 December 2021, President Xi Jinping had a virtual meeting with Russian President Vladimir Putin.³⁶⁴ He specified that China would host the 14th BRICS Summit, reaffirmed strategic coordination with Russia, and encouraged BRICS countries to deepen cooperation across the board.

On 8 January 2022, state media outlet Nanfang Daily announced that the Chinese government invested CNY31.8 billion to build a "free trade port for data" in Nansha, Guangzhou city.³⁶⁵ The project's goal is to build up controllable cross-border information flows, and includes a cross-border data centre, industrial parks for big data, and telecommunication labs.

On 12 January 2022, the State Council issued a plan for the development of the country's digital economy and set several targets for 2025, namely the increase of the digital economy's share of the national GDP from 7.8 per cent in 2020 to 10 per cent in 2025.³⁶⁶ The government also plans to increase support for 6G research and development and be involved in the creation of international standards for 6G.

On 30 January 2022, the Cyberspace Administration announced a blockchain technology play its role in facilitating data sharing, optimizing business procedures, lowering costs, improving synergy and building reliable systems.³⁶⁷ 15 cities and 164 other entities including companies, universities, hospitals and industry groups were chosen to carry out a trial on the application of blockchain technology.

On 16 March 2022, Chinese Vice-Premier Liu He called on regulators to adopt a "standardised, transparent and predictable" approach in overseeing the country's technology giants.³⁶⁸ Vice-Premier Liu also recommended

³⁶¹ Beijing to break up Ant's Alipay and force creation of separate loans app, Financial Times (London) 13 September 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.ft.com/content/01b7c7ca-71ad-4baa-bddf-a4d5e65c5d79>

³⁶² In China, escalating cost of business sends some companies to the exits, Washington Post (Washington) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/china-business-foreign-companies/2021/11/25/f0ff625a-4056-11ec-9404-50a28a88b9cd_story.html

³⁶³ Chinese tech giant Tencent told to suspend new app roll outs, BBC News (London) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.bbc.com/news/business-59426908>

³⁶⁴ President Xi Jinping Had a Virtual Meeting with Russian President Vladimir Putin, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/202112/t20211215_10470186.html

³⁶⁵ China plans its first 'free data port' in Guangzhou as Beijing eyes total control over cross-border information flows, South China Morning Post (Guangzhou) 8 January 2022. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.scmp.com/tech/policy/article/3162601/china-plans-its-first-free-data-port-guangzhou-beijing-eyes-total>

³⁶⁶ China's cabinet says it will promote transformation of digital economy, Reuters (London) 12 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/technology/chinas-cabinet-says-it-will-promote-transformation-digital-economy-2022-01-12/>

³⁶⁷ China Picks Cities, Entities to Take Part in Blockchain Trials, Bloomberg News (New York) 30 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2022-01-30/china-picks-cities-entities-to-take-part-in-blockchain-trials>

³⁶⁸ China's regulatory storm may soon subside for Big Tech firms after Xi Jinping's right-hand man calls for order and transparency, South China Morning Post (Shanghai and Hong Kong) 18 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.scmp.com/tech/policy/article/3171023/chinas-regulatory-storm-may-soon-subside-big-tech-firms-after-xi>

that regulators give a heads-up to financial authorities before publishing new policies. The comments have signalled that the regulatory crackdowns seen this past year may subside in 2022.

By enacting the personal information protection law, China has stifled the free market's development of technology and data. However, the government has taken action to develop the domestic electronic information technology sector, enhancing Sustainable Development Goals 9 Industry, Innovation and Infrastructure. President Xi Jinping has also encouraged further cooperation between BRICS countries on the matter.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Eva Li

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to enhance digital economy cooperation through the BRICS cooperation Working Group.

On 23 September 2021, South Africa held a webinar on the state of innovation in developing a sustainable water ecosystem.³⁶⁹ The webinar reflected on the progress of developing sustainable water ecosystems in South Africa while also the challenges being posed towards this in a scientific knowledge and research on the issue.

On 5 October 2021, the Department of Science and Innovation (DSI) along with its partners launched an innovative science faculty which is highly eco-friendly and sustainable.³⁷⁰ The infrastructure is a hub for scientific awareness activities on multiple themes while it also offers a knowledge programme.

On 20 October 2021, the DSI organised the third among a series of webinar in the South African Women in Science Awards under the theme of "Women Technopreneurs."³⁷¹ The webinar explored issues around the cultivation and nurturing of appropriate ecosystems and value chains in support of women innovators and technopreneurs in South Africa.

On 13 January 2022, three nanosatellites produced in South Africa were launched into space as part of SpaceX's Transporter-3 mission.³⁷² This created a position for South Africa as an African leader in satellite development while also helping the country capture valuable shares a new market in the fast-growing world economy.

Thus, South Africa has taken actions to enhance the BRICS digital economy cooperation as outlined in the framework. However, it hasn't taken any noteworthy actions to enhance cooperation as part of the BRICS group.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ashleen Kaur

³⁶⁹ Webinar on the state of innovation in developing a sustainable water ecosystem in South Africa, Department of Science and Innovation (Brazil). 21 September 2021. Access Date Jan 06 2022. <https://www.dst.gov.za/index.php/media-room/latest-news/3488-webinar-on-the-state-of-innovation-in-developing-a-sustainable-water-ecosystem-in-south-africa>

³⁷⁰ Launch of an innovative science facility in the Eastern Cape, Department of Science and Innovation (Brazil). 30 September 2021. Access Date Jan 06 2022. <https://www.dst.gov.za/index.php/media-room/latest-news/3499-launch-of-an-innovative-science-facility-in-the-eastern-cape>

³⁷¹ Women taking the lead in technopreneurship, Department of Science and Innovation (Brazil). 19 October 2021. Access Date Jan 06 2022. <https://www.dst.gov.za/index.php/media-room/latest-news/3517-women-taking-the-lead-in-technopreneurship>

³⁷² Elon Musk's SpaceX Transporter-3 Mission To Launch South African Nanosatellite Constellation, Department of Science and Innovation (Brazil). 13 January 2022. Access Date Jan 13 2022. <https://www.dst.gov.za/index.php/media-room/latest-news/3559-elon-musk-s-spacex-transporter-3-mission-to-launch-south-african-nanosatellite-constella-on>

8. ICT and Digital Economy: Open Environment

“We reaffirm our commitment to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT [information and communications technologies] environment.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

Background

The BRICS first addressed issues related to information and communication technologies (ICT) during Russia’s BRICS presidency in 2015. In the Ufa Declaration the BRICS leaders highlighted the importance of an “open, non-fragmented and secure Internet.”³⁷³ In 2016, the BRICS noted the need for “enhanced cooperation in ecommerce” and declared support for “efforts aimed at capacity building for effective participation in e-commerce trade.”³⁷⁴

The digital economy itself was discussed during China’s BRICS presidency in 2017. In the Xiamen Declaration, the BRICS leaders committed to “act on the basis of principles of innovation, partnership, synergy, flexibility, open and favorable business environment, trust and security, protection of consumer rights in order to ensure the conditions for a thriving and dynamic digital economy, that will foster global economic development and benefit everyone.”³⁷⁵

In 2019 under the Brazilian BRICS presidency, the BRICS communication ministers held a meeting in Brasilia. The parties committed to work together on connectivity, innovation, security, human development, fostering digital transformation and promoting digital governance.³⁷⁶ The BRICS leaders underscored “the importance of an open, secure, peaceful, stable, accessible and nondiscriminatory environment for information and communications technologies” and committed to “explore in appropriate fora ways to promote and facilitate investments in productive sectors, ecommerce, micro, small and medium sized enterprises, infrastructure and connectivity, which will help to promote economic growth, trade and job creation.”³⁷⁷

In 2020, the BRICS leaders recognized “the role of the digital economy as an important tool for modernization and transformation of the industry, promotion of inclusive economic growth, support of seamless global trade and business conduct” and highlighted the need to focus on “overcoming the digital divide.”³⁷⁸

³⁷³ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

³⁷⁴ Goa Declaration October 16, 2016, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

³⁷⁵ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

³⁷⁶ Declaration of the 5th BRICS Communications Ministers Meeting, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 August 2019. Access Date: 14

December 2021. https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/

³⁷⁷ 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

³⁷⁸ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsdatelstvo2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

BRICS launched cooperation “in order to address common security challenges in the use of ICT in 2015.”³⁷⁹ In Goa the BRICS agreed to strengthen joint efforts to enhance security in the use of ICTs and “to continue to work together for the adoption of the rules, norms and principles of responsible behaviour of States including through the process of UNGGE [United Nations Group of Governmental Experts].”³⁸⁰ In 2017 the BRICS decided to promote cooperation according to the BRICS Roadmap of Practical Cooperation on Ensuring Security in the Use of ICTs and acknowledged the initiative of the Russian Federation on a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation in ensuring security in the use of ICT³⁸¹. The leaders underscored “the UN a central role in developing universally accepted norms of responsible state behavior in the use of ICTs to ensure a peaceful, secure, open, cooperative, stable, orderly, accessible and equitable ICT environment” and reiterated its importance at each subsequent summit. In 2018 the BRICS acknowledged the importance of establishing a framework of cooperation among BRICS member States on ensuring security in the Use of ICTs and, in agreed to work towards consideration and elaboration of a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation on this matter.³⁸² In 2019 and 2020 the BRICS welcomed the establishment and progress of a UN open-ended working group and the UNGGE and reaffirmed the importance of establishing legal frameworks of cooperation among BRICS member States on ensuring security in the use of ICT as a BRICS intergovernmental agreement on cooperation on ensuring security in the use of ICTs or bilateral agreements among BRICS countries on the matter.³⁸³

In 2021, the BRICS nations reaffirmed commitment to the “promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment” and highlighted “the importance of establishing legal frameworks of cooperation among BRICS States on this matter.”³⁸⁴

Commitment Features

In New Delhi the BRICS leaders committed to the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT environment. Also, the BRICS members again highlighted “the role of the United Nations in promoting dialogue, to forge common understandings in the security of and in the use of ICT and development of universally agreed norms, rules and principles for responsible behaviour of States in the realm of ICT, without prejudice to other relevant international fora.”

Finding common ground for understanding the issues relating to ‘open, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment’ remains on the top of the international agenda. The UNGGE has contributed much to bringing the multilateral consensus on the topic into life and its widely acknowledged³⁸⁵ list of 11 voluntary, non-binding norms of responsible State behavior in the cyberspace³⁸⁶ could serve as a basis for further assessment of the BRICS member states actions on fulfilling the commitment under consideration.

³⁷⁹ VII BRICS Summit, RANEP (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 24 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

³⁸⁰ Goa Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 24. December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

³⁸¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 24 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwxo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

³⁸² 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 24 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

³⁸³ 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 14 November 2021. Access Date: 24 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

³⁸⁴ XIII BRICS Summit – New Delhi Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indiyskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

³⁸⁵ Developments in the field of information and telecommunications in the context of international security, United Nations (New York) 30 December 2015. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N15/457/57/PDF/N1545757.pdf?OpenElement>

³⁸⁶ Group of Governmental Experts on Developments in the Field of Information and Telecommunications in the Context of International Security, United Nations (New York) 22 July 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://undocs.org/en/A/70/174>

Following the recommendations given by the UNGGE, we thus have three dimensions for assessing the states behavior in the cyberspace regarding ‘promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment’. These dimensions include: 1) adherence to the voluntary, non-binding norms of responsible behavior in cyberspace; 2) actions referring to capacity building in use of ICT; and 3) confidence-building measures. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member shall take actions aimed at capacity building and confidence building and shall not take steps that could be regarded as breaking the recommended rules of responsible state behavior in the cyberspace.

Rules / Principles of responsible behavior of states

The UNGGE proposes the following norms as a benchmark of responsible state behavior:

- A. Consistent with the purposes of the United Nations, including to maintain international peace and security, States should cooperate in developing and applying measures to increase stability and security in the use of ICT and to prevent ICT practices that are acknowledged to be harmful or that may pose threats to international peace and security;
- B. In case of ICT incidents, States should consider all relevant information, including the larger context of the event, the challenges of attribution in the ICT environment and the nature and extent of the consequences;
- C. States should not knowingly allow their territory to be used for internationally wrongful acts using ICT;
- D. States should consider how best to cooperate to exchange information, assist each other, prosecute terrorist and criminal use of ICT and implement other cooperative measures to address such threats. States may need to consider whether new measures need to be developed in this respect;
- E. States, in ensuring the secure use of ICT, should respect Human Rights Council resolutions 20/8 and 26/13 on the promotion, protection and enjoyment of human rights on the Internet, as well as General Assembly resolutions 68/167 and 69/166 on the right to privacy in the digital age, to guarantee full respect for human rights, including the right to freedom of expression;
- F. A State should not conduct or knowingly support ICT activity contrary to its obligations under international law that intentionally damages critical infrastructure or otherwise impairs the use and operation of critical infrastructure to provide services to the public;
- G. States should take appropriate measures to protect their critical infrastructure from ICT threats, taking into account General Assembly resolution 58/199 on the creation of a global culture of cybersecurity and the protection of critical information infrastructures, and other relevant resolutions;
- H. States should respond to appropriate requests for assistance by another State whose critical infrastructure is subject to malicious ICT acts. States should also respond to appropriate requests to mitigate malicious ICT activity aimed at the critical infrastructure of another State emanating from their territory, taking into account due regard for sovereignty;
- I. States should take reasonable steps to ensure the integrity of the supply chain so that end users can have confidence in the security of ICT products. States should seek to prevent the proliferation of malicious ICT tools and techniques and the use of harmful hidden functions;
- J. States should encourage responsible reporting of ICT vulnerabilities and share associated information on available remedies to such vulnerabilities to limit and possibly eliminate potential threats to ICT and ICT-dependent infrastructure;
- K. States should not conduct or knowingly support activity to harm the information systems of the authorized emergency response teams (sometimes known as computer emergency response teams or cybersecurity incident response teams) of another State. A State should not use authorized emergency response teams to engage in malicious international activity.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member shall not take steps that violate any of the abovementioned recommendations.

Capacity-building measures

The UNGGE noted that the implementation of the recommended measures ‘may not immediately be possible, in particular for developing countries, until they acquire adequate capacity’³⁸⁷. Regarding capacity building, the UNGGE suggests the following:

- A. Assist in strengthening cooperative mechanisms with national computer emergency response teams and other authorized bodies;
- B. Provide assistance and training to developing countries to improve security in the use of ICT, including critical infrastructure, and exchange legal and administrative best practices;
- C. Assist in providing access to technologies deemed essential for ICT security;
- D. Create procedures for mutual assistance in responding to incidents and addressing short-term problems in securing networks, including procedures for expedited assistance;
- E. Facilitate cross-border cooperation to address critical infrastructure vulnerabilities that transcend national borders;
- F. Develop strategies for sustainability in ICT security capacity-building efforts;
- G. Prioritize ICT security awareness and capacity-building in national plans and budgets, and assign it appropriate weight in development and assistance planning. This could include ICT security awareness programmes designed to educate and inform institutions and individual citizens. Such programmes could be carried out in conjunction with efforts by international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations;
- H. Encourage further work in capacity-building, such as on forensics or on cooperative measures to address the criminal or terrorist use of ICT.

States may also consider additional measures taken on a bilateral, subregional, regional and multilateral basis such as:

- A. Strengthen cooperative mechanisms between relevant agencies to address ICT security incidents and develop additional technical, legal and diplomatic mechanisms to address ICT infrastructure-related requests, including the consideration of exchanges of personnel in areas such as incident response and law enforcement, as appropriate, and encouraging exchanges between research and academic institutions;
- B. Enhance cooperation, including the development of focal points for the exchange of information on malicious ICT use and the provision of assistance in investigations;
- C. Establish a national computer emergency response team and/or cybersecurity incident response team or officially designate an organization to fulfil this role. States may wish to consider such bodies within their definition of critical infrastructure. States should support and facilitate the functioning of and cooperation among such national response teams and other authorized bodies;
- D. Expand and support practices in computer emergency response team and cybersecurity incident response team cooperation, as appropriate, such as information exchange about vulnerabilities, attack patterns and best practices for mitigating attacks, including coordinating responses, organizing exercises, supporting the handling of ICT-related incidents and enhancing regional and sector-based cooperation;
- E. Cooperate, in a manner consistent with national and international law, with requests from other States in investigating ICT-related crime or the use of ICT for terrorist purposes or to mitigate malicious ICT activity emanating from their territory.

³⁸⁷ Group of Governmental Experts on Developments in the Field of Information and Telecommunications in the Context of International Security, United Nations (New York) 22 July 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://undocs.org/en/A/70/174>

To meet the capacity-building criterion of the commitment, the BRICS member shall take steps that somewhat match any of the abovementioned areas of action.

Confidence-building measures

As regarding building trust and confidence to ensure peaceful and safe use of ICTs, the UNGGE urges states to do the following:

- A. Assist in strengthening cooperative mechanisms with national computer emergency response teams and other authorized bodies;
- B. Provide assistance and training to developing countries to improve security in the use of ICTs, including critical infrastructure, and exchange legal and administrative best practices;
- C. Assist in providing access to technologies deemed essential for ICT security;
- D. Create procedures for mutual assistance in responding to incidents and addressing short-term problems in securing networks, including procedures for expedited assistance;
- E. Facilitate cross-border cooperation to address critical infrastructure vulnerabilities that transcend national borders;
- F. Develop strategies for sustainability in ICT security capacity-building efforts;
- G. Prioritize ICT security awareness and capacity-building in national plans and budgets, and assign it appropriate weight in development and assistance planning. This could include ICT security awareness programmes designed to educate and inform institutions and individual citizens. Such programmes could be carried out in conjunction with efforts by international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations;
- H. Encourage further work in capacity-building, such as on forensics or on cooperative measures to address the criminal or terrorist use of ICTs.

Also, the UNGGE notes, that in the interest of ICT security capacity-building ‘States may consider forming bilateral and multilateral cooperation initiatives that would build on established partnership relations. Such initiatives would help to improve the environment for effective mutual assistance between States in their response to ICT incidents and could be further developed by competent international organizations, including the United Nations and its agencies, the private sector, academia and civil society organizations.’

To ensure compliance with the confidence-building criterion of the commitment, the BRICS member shall take steps in line with any of the areas of action listed in this section.

A +1 score indicating the full compliance with the commitment on the promotion of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful ICT environment requires the BRICS member to take actions that match both of the key subject areas and thus contributing to capacity-building and confidence building. Also, no action within the monitoring period shall be regarded as inconsistent with the voluntary, non-binding rules of responsible state behavior in the cyberspace. Failing to meet the criterion of adhering to the set of rules will serve as a precondition to grant the BRICS member a 0 score even if the two other criteria are met.

To achieve a partial compliance (a 0 score) the BRICS member shall take action in any of the two key spheres. Also, its steps shall not violate the rules of responsible state behavior.

A -1 score indicating a non-compliance with the commitment shall be given if the BRICS member takes no steps that could be treated as contributing to capacity-building or confidence-building regarding use of ICTs. Also, if the BRICS member takes actions matching at least one of two subject areas but some of its actions violate the rules of responsible states behavior this will be a -1 score case as well.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not contribute to either of the commitment's subject areas, namely capacity building and confidence building OR some of its actions that match ONE out of TWO subject areas could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states
0	The BRICS member takes actions that match at least ONE out of TWO subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states
+1	The BRICS member takes actions that match TWO subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to promote of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies.

On 9 November 2021, Brazil and Finland signed a Memorandum of Understanding on Cooperation in the Area of Cybersecurity, which establishes the basis for different bilateral initiatives, such as the exchange of information on incidents in the virtual environment, exchange of experiences in the formulation of public policies and regulations, in addition to actions to train technicians, exchange knowledge between specialists and raise society's awareness of online risks.³⁸⁸

On 3 December 2021, the Center for Prevention, Treatment and Response to Government Cyber Incidents issued guidelines "Trends in cyber threats to critical infrastructure: Best cyber protection practices to be implemented in critical infrastructures." It is recommended that public managing institutions guide their critical infrastructures to implement the following protective measures:

- a) If it is an institution of the Federal Public Administration, institute and implement the Cyber Incident Prevention, Treatment and Response Team, as provided for in Decree No. 10,748, of 16 July 2021;
- b) Adopt user awareness campaigns in relation to social engineering attacks, with special attention to phishing attempts via email, care with the use of unknown media drives (pen drives, external hard drives, etc.) or untrusted devices for accessing corporate accounts
- c) Implement a policy that promotes the timely and timely update of Operating Systems with the latest security patches, including firmware updates for devices on operating networks;
- d) Promote continuous monitoring of devices connected to both the operational network and the administrative network;
- e) Implement effective segmentation between the administrative network and the operational network;
- f) Implement the principle of least privilege, limiting users to the minimum level of access necessary to fulfill their tasks;
- g) Institute a policy of access credentials to administrative and operational networks, making use of multi-factor authentication, periodic password change, blocking systems due to excessive attempts and other measures contained in good practices and access credentials;

³⁸⁸ Reunião Ministerial Brasil-Finlândia sobre Segurança Cibernética Culmina com Assinatura de Memorando de Cooperação, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 9 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/gsi/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/reuniao-ministerial-brasil-finlandia-sobre-seguranca-cibernetica-culmina-com-assinatura-de-memorando-de-cooperacao>

- h) Adopt offline backup, restore and testing policies and procedures;
- i) Implement defense-in-depth techniques with firewall technologies (network and host), intrusion detection and prevention systems, traffic analyzers and anti-malware; and
- j) Promote organizational culture focused on cybernetic protection.³⁸⁹

On 15 December 2021, National Telecommunications Agency and the Federal University of Campina Grande signed a Decentralized Execution Term (TED) to carry out studies on cyber security.³⁹⁰ Through TED, a research and innovation project will be carried out on cyber security of telecommunications networks, especially in 5G mobile communications systems. The project aims to elucidate cybersecurity aspects in various dimensions of telecommunications networks, including technological advances and economic impacts, in addition to providing subsidies for an eventual reassessment and readjustment of the regulatory model and the actions adopted by Anatel in terms of cybersecurity.

On 16 December 2021, Board of Directors of the National Telecommunications Agency approved a public consultation on a Normative Instruction that complements the Cyber Security Regulation Applied to the Telecommunications Sector.³⁹¹ According to the Agency's proposal, all telecommunications service providers, regardless of size, must change the default configuration for authentication of equipment provided on a lending basis to their users. Even Small Service Providers – which have a national market share of less than 5 per cent in each retail market – are subject to compliance with this obligation.

On 17 December 2021, Presidential Declaration on Digital Integration in MERCOSUR was issued.³⁹² MERCOSUR Presidents reaffirmed their commitment to stimulating strategies and the development of a digital infrastructure for health, education, research and innovation, with the proper interoperability of systems and the necessary regulations on privacy and information security, for the actors involved in each ecosystem. They identified the need to promote greater structural and organizational convergence in the field of cybersecurity, with joint initiatives aimed at strengthening MERCOSUR in the area, with a view to a secure digital environment for the progress of regional integration and exchanges with third countries.

On 21 December 2021, Brazil's accession to the Budapest Convention on Cyber Crime was approved by the parliament.³⁹³ The Budapest Convention aims to facilitate and strengthen the means available to prevent and tackle cybercrime. By June 2021, the Convention had been ratified by 66 countries and the Brazilian initiative was added to the Marco Civil da Internet law, for the criminal prosecution of cybercrimes and the General Law for the Protection of Personal Data.

³⁸⁹ Tendências de ameaças cibernéticas às infraestruturas críticas, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 3 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/ctir/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/tendencias-de-ameacas-ciberneticas-as-infraestruturas-criticas>

³⁹⁰ Anatel e UFCG assinam acordo para estudos em segurança cibernética, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 15 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/anatel/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/anatel-e-ufcg-assinam-acordo-para-estudos-em-seguranca-cibernetica>

³⁹¹ Anatel aprova consulta pública sobre Instrução Normativa do GT Ciber, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 16 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/anatel/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/anatel-aprova-consulta-publica-sobre-instrucao-normativa-do-gt-ciber>

³⁹² Declaração Presidencial sobre a Integração Digital no Mercosul, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 20 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/funag/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/politica-externa-brasileira/declaracao-presidencial-sobre-a-integracao-digital-no-mercosul>

³⁹³ Aprovada adesão do Brasil à Convenção de Budapeste sobre o Crime Cibernético, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 21 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mj/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/aprovada-adesao-do-brasil-a-convencao-de-budapeste-sobre-o-crime-cibernetico>

On 23 March 2022, Brazil launched the first Tactical Plan to Combat Cyber Crimes, with the objective of preventing and suppressing this type of crime in the country.³⁹⁴ One of the points of the Tactical Plan is a Cooperation Agreement between the Federal Police and the Brazilian Federation of Banks that will facilitate the sharing of information, aiming at preventive and educational measures, in order to make the cyber space safer, identifying and punishing criminal organizations.

Brazil has taken actions that match both subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to promote of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 10 September 2021, the Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media announced that an international forum “Interpointex” on a state digital development and cyber security would be held in Moscow on 19 – 22 October 2021.³⁹⁵ One of the forum’s vital discussion topics – information security within the national security context. The event is to be attended by representatives of Russia’s governmental bodies, private entities and international organizations.

On 25 November 2021, Russia and Syria held talks on cooperation in media and ICT spheres.³⁹⁶ The parties also discussed issues related to cybersecurity pointing out the importance of bilateral contacts.

On 31 March 2022, President Putin promulgated an executive order on promoting technological sovereignty and security of critical information infrastructure.³⁹⁷ The order prohibits procurements and usage of non-Russian software on critical infrastructure facilities from 1 January 2025, and delegates the Government authority to establish a new facility that would work on development and implementation of trusted software solutions. Also, the order requires investing in staff and skills development in media sphere and software production.

On 5 May 2022, Deputy Head of the Ministry of Digital Affairs Shoitov Alexander Mikhailovich opened a new cyber polygon in Orenburg. Such establishments are financed under the Federal project “Information Security.”³⁹⁸ The Orenburg facility is the third one opened in 2022;³⁹⁹ the Ministry of Digital Development,

³⁹⁴ Governo Federal lança Plano Tático de Combate a Crimes Cibernéticos, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 23 March 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date 29 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/pt-br/noticias/justica-e-seguranca/2022/03/governo-federal-lanca-plano-tatico-de-combate-a-crimes-ciberneticos>

³⁹⁵ Mezhdunarodnyj forum «Interpoliteh: cifrovaja transformacija bezopasnosti gosudarstva» projdet v Moskve s 19 po 22 oktjabrja (International Forum “Interpolitech: State Security Digital Transformation” is to be held in Moscow on 19 – 22 October), Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 10 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41259/>

³⁹⁶ Rossija i Sirija obsudili sotrudnichestvo v sfere massovyh kommunikacij i IT (Russia and Syria to Discuss Cooperation in Mass Media and ICT), Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 18 January 2022. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41366/>

³⁹⁷ Decree on providing technological sovereignty and critical information infrastructure security, President of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 30 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <http://kremlin.ru/events/president/news/68090>

³⁹⁸ Cyber Polygon was opened in Orenburg, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 5 May 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41553/>

³⁹⁹ National Cyber Polygon control point was opened in Samara, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 4 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41444/>

Communications and Mass Media plans to launch another 15 until 2024. The purpose of a cyber polygon – provide a training ground to enhance cybersecurity capabilities and competences.⁴⁰⁰

Russia has taken actions that match both subject areas and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment to promote of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies (ICT).

On 21 October 2021, the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technologies kicked-off the India Internet Governance Forum (IIGF) which major events were scheduled on 8 – 11 November 2021.⁴⁰¹ The 2021 IIGF was dedicated to discussions around the issues related to realization of the Digital India program and the country's posture in the global Internet governance. The IIGF is an initiative associated with the United Nations Internet Governance Forum; the event is intended to provide continuous dialog among relevant stakeholders on the Internet governance issues.

On 15 December 2021, it was announced that India intends to provide INR76,000 crore (approximately USD10.2 billion) of incentives to facilitate semiconductor and electronics manufacturing. It is said that these industries “hold strategic importance and are key to the security of critical information infrastructure.”⁴⁰² Along with domestic industry capacity building, the program would ensure proliferation of necessary skills and employment opportunities.

On 16 December 2021, India and Vietnam held a meeting on bilateral cooperation in digital sphere.⁴⁰³ The countries have signed an agreement to extend inter-ministerial cooperation and exchanges between private entities and other stakeholders to enhance capacity building in ICT.

On 4 May 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi held a meeting with counterparts from Finland. The parties discussed issues of mutual interest including digital spheres – artificial intelligence technologies, quantum

⁴⁰⁰ Cyber Polygon was opened in Orenburg, Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 5 May 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://digital.gov.ru/ru/events/41553/>

⁴⁰¹ India Internet Governance Forum to be conducted in November, 2021 to bring all stakeholders of internet governance on a single platform. Voice of internet users should resound in National and International forums: Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar at IIGF Curtain Raiser event. Internet should be a open, safe, trusted and accountable to its stakeholders: Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 21 October 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1765476>

⁴⁰² Incentives of INR 2,30,000 crore to position India as global hub for electronics manufacturing with semiconductors as the foundational building block. Rs.76000 crore (>10 billion USD) approved for development of semiconductors and display manufacturing ecosystem in India. Setting up of India Semiconductor Mission (ISM) to drive this sector, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1781724>

⁴⁰³ MoU intends to foster active cooperation between private entities, Governments, institutions involved in enhancing capacity building of two countries in field of ICT, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 16 December 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1782377>

computing, cut-edge mobile technologies, etc.⁴⁰⁴ On the margins of the India-Nordic summit, Prime Ministers also met with representatives of Iceland,⁴⁰⁵ Norway⁴⁰⁶ and Sweden.⁴⁰⁷

India has taken actions that match two subject areas – Capacity building and Confidence-building, and none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the rules/principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment to promote of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies.

On 18 October 2021, the 1st Boao Forum for Asia (BFA), [proposed and organized by the government](#), kicked-off in Changsha, the capital of Hunan province.⁴⁰⁸ The BFA was focused on risks and non-traditional security challenges in the broader context of economic development. The forum is intended to deliberation of solutions to create a secure and stable environment in the region and the rest of the world. On the BFA margins more than 20 sub-forums, including the one dedicated to cybersecurity, took place on 18 – 20 October 2021. More than 2,600 participants representing governmental bodies, business community and academia from China and other countries attended the forum.

On 16 November 2021, China and the United States held an online meeting on bilateral cooperation priorities.⁴⁰⁹ The parties agreed on importance of the two countries cooperation that “may not solve all problems” adding that “few problems can be solved without China-US cooperation.” The participants claimed that along with economy, law-enforcement, education, science and technology, etc. the cyber domain remains the matter of mutual interest. The two sides agreed to maintain close communication in different forms and formats.

On 25 March 2022, China and Egypt held talks on bilateral cooperation in digital sphere.⁴¹⁰ The parties expressed willingness to strengthen cooperation in the fields of information and communications technology with a focus on digital capacity building. In their joint statement, China’s representatives pledged to urge Chinese companies to invest in the Egyptian market.

On 20 – 22 April 2022, the Boao Forum for Asia took place in China.⁴¹¹ President Xi Jinping delivered an opening remark on the occasion of the Forum’s Annual Conference and highlighted the importance of multilateral cooperation on issues related to cybersecurity.

⁴⁰⁴ Prime Minister’s meeting with Prime Minister of Finland, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 4 May 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822643>

⁴⁰⁵ Prime Minister’s meeting with Prime Minister of Iceland, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 4 May 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822601>

⁴⁰⁶ Prime Minister’s meeting with Prime Minister of Norway, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 4 May 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822575>

⁴⁰⁷ Prime Minister’s meeting with Prime Minister of Sweden, Public Information Bureau (New Delhi) 4 May 2022, Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822605>

⁴⁰⁸ Officials, merchants, scholars worldwide discuss economic development at forum, Xinhua (Changsha) 19 October 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-10/19/c_1310256023.htm

⁴⁰⁹ Xi, Biden pledge to steer China-U.S. relations back on right track, Xinhua (Beijing) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-11/16/c_1310315008.htm

⁴¹⁰ China, Egypt hope to strengthen digital cooperation, Xinhua (Cairo) 25 March 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220326/3e04ef8588b44548aaa2bfb097d0ef84/c.html>

⁴¹¹ Xi Focus: Xi proposes Global Security Initiative, Xinhua (Beijing) 21 April 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220421/2c0c40da15af4dbeabb1df4d8a9911be/c.html>

China has taken actions that match both the subject areas – Confidence-building and Capacity. Also, none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the Rules / Principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to promote of an open, secure, stable, accessible, and peaceful environment for information and communications technologies.

On 27 September 2021, it was announced that South Africa and the United Kingdom would co-host the inaugural Information Communication Technology Cyber Dialogue.⁴¹² The Dialogue would facilitate exchanges in opinions, expertise and practices on various cyber-related issues including combatting cybercrime, emerging technologies standardization and regulation and cyber-governance.

On 4 March 2022, South Africa announced an investment of ZAR100 million to facilitate spreading of working skills including programming as a way to cope with high youth unemployment.⁴¹³

South Africa has taken actions that match both the subject areas – Confidence-building and Capacity building; it should be noted, that Capacity Building measures taken by South Africa were taken within its own jurisdiction without a firm connection with international programs/institutions/multilateral cooperation agreements. However, none of its actions could be regarded as inconsistent with the Rules/Principles of responsible behavior of states.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁴¹² International Relations co-hosts inaugural Information Communication Technology Cyber Dialogue, 28 Sept, South African Government (Pretoria) 27 September 2021. Access Date: 20 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/international-relations-co-hosts-inaugural-information-communication-technology-cyber>

⁴¹³ R100m to benefit learners in digital learning space, SA News (Pretoria) 4 March 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/r100m-benefit-learners-digital-learning-space>

9. Health: Infectious Diseases

“We support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the WHO’s [World Health Organization’s] Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia			+1
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average		+0.40 (70%)	

Background

The discussion surrounding the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System did not begin until the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic. However, the general subject area of BRICS cooperation on health was a long-standing subject of BRICS discussion. The BRICS first discussed health at the 2011 Sanya Summit. At this summit, BRICS leaders committed to “strengthen dialogue and cooperation in the fields of social protection, decent work, gender equality, youth, and public health, including the fight against HIV/AIDS.”⁴¹⁴ Immediately after, at the 2012 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS leaders made a general commitment to address common public health challenges including the growing burden of communicable and non-communicable diseases.⁴¹⁵

The next discussion of health came at the 2015 Ufa Summit, where the BRICS affirmed “the right of every person” to “the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.”⁴¹⁶ Specifically, the leaders also expressed their concern with growing global threats posed by communicable and non-communicable diseases. In addition, the BRICS agreed to work together in risk management related to emerging infections with pandemic potential, compliance with commitments to stop the spread of communicable diseases, and research, develop, produce and supply medicines for communicable diseases.⁴¹⁷

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders emphasized the “importance of cooperation among BRICS countries in promoting research and development of medicines and diagnostic tools to end epidemics and to facilitate access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines.”⁴¹⁸

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders agreed to enhance the BRICS role in global health governance, “especially in the context of the World Health Organization and ~~UN~~ United Nations agencies, and foster the development and improve the availability of innovative medical products through promotion of research and development and access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services through enhanced health systems and health

⁴¹⁴ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁴¹⁵ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

⁴¹⁶ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁴¹⁷ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁴¹⁸ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

financing.²²²⁴¹⁹ They also agreed to improve surveillance capacity and medical services to combat infectious diseases, including Ebola, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, as well as non-communicable diseases, and encouraged greater application of ICTs to improve the level of health service provision.⁴²⁰

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders emphasized “the importance of [BRICS] collective action in promoting research and development of medicines and diagnostic tools to end epidemics, to combat communicable diseases and to facilitate access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines, as well as activities to strengthen non-communicable diseases prevention.”²²²⁴²¹

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS reiterated their commitment to strengthen BRICS cooperation on addressing health challenges. Specifically, in the context of discussions of the COVID-19 pandemic, the BRICS noted Russia’s proposal to set up the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks.²²²⁴²² This discussion is the predecessor to the current commitment of the 2021 New Delhi Summit.⁴²³

Commitment Features

In this commitment, “support²²²” means to give assistance to, promote the interests of, to assist, to provide financial assistance for,⁴²⁴ or to back up an initiative or entity.⁴²⁵ “Progress²²²” refers to a forward movement or the gradual betterment of something,⁴²⁶ in this case, the establishment of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System.

The “BRICS Integrated Early Warning System²²²” is the name of an institution proposed by Russia at the 2020 Moscow Summit. The aim of this system is to prevent mass infectious diseases risks and to provide a platform for institutional collaboration on identifying upcoming pandemics and forecasting future outbreaks.⁴²⁷ “Mass infectious diseases²²²” are diseases with the potential for mass infection, such as diseases that result from infection from the entrance of a large number of pathogens into the circulation or tissues.⁴²⁸

The “International Health Regulations 2005²²²” is the third edition of the International Health Regulations adopted by the World Health Assembly in 1969. This document discusses issues related to the management of the global regime for the control of the international spread of disease. The purpose of the 2005 edition of this document is “to prevent, protect against, control and provide a public health response to the international spread of disease in ways that are commensurate with and restricted to public health risks, and which avoid unnecessary interference with international traffic and trade.”²²²⁴²⁹

⁴¹⁹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴²⁰ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴²¹ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁴²² XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁴²³ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁴²⁴ Definition of Support, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/support>

⁴²⁵ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 2 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

⁴²⁶ Definition of Progress, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/progress>

⁴²⁷ XI BRICS Health Ministers’ Meeting Declaration, BRICS India Summit Official Website, July 2021. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://brics2021.gov.in/brics/public/uploads/docpdf/getdocu-29.pdf>

⁴²⁸ Mass Infection, Medical Dictionary. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://medical-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/mass+infection>

⁴²⁹ International Health Regulations (2005) Third Edition, World Health Organization. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789241580496>

The ~~“WHO World Health Organization’s (WHO) “Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network”~~ (GOARN) is an institution established in 2000 with the aim of improving the coordination of international outbreak responses. It consists of a network of over 250 technical institutions that respond to public health events. Specifically, its primary aims are to ~~“assist countries with disease control efforts by ensuring rapid and appropriate technical support to affected populations; investigate and characterize events and assess risks of rapidly emerging epidemic disease threats; and support national outbreak preparedness by ensuring that responses contribute to sustained containment of epidemic threats.”~~⁴³⁰

~~“Identifying”~~ means to know and say who someone is or what something is.⁴³¹ In this context, identify refers to the identification of particular diseases. ~~“Forecasting”~~ means to predict in advance a future happening or condition.⁴³² In this context, forecasting refers to the forecasting of instances of outbreaks of future pandemics. ~~“Institutional collaboration”~~ refers to collaboration between institutions. In this context, institutional collaboration refers to the collaboration between institutions that respond to public health events, such as those in the GOARN network of institutions.⁴³³

This commitment requires states to engage in actions that support the progress towards establishing the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System. As noted in the commitment text, the aim of this system is to prevent mass infectious disease risks by identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration. The commitment text also notes that the system needs to be established in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the WHO’s GOARN. The BRICS Integrated Early Warning System is currently only a proposed initiative that has yet to take shape, and support at this initial stage of development can take several forms:

- 1) A BRICS member can provide verbal or political assistance by affirming their commitment to the establishment of the system, or by affirming the value of this system. This corresponds with the definition of support as backing up an initiative or entity.
- 2) A BRICS member can also provide financial assistance to the establishment of the system. This corresponds with the definition of support as the provision of financial assistance towards an initiative or entity.
- 3) A BRICS member can also act in a way that promotes the interests or aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system. This corresponds with the definition of support as promoting the interests of an initiative or entity. A wide range of actions can count towards compliance under this category. For example:
 - a. Engaging in collaborative effort towards the goal of preventing mass infectious diseases
 - b. Collaborating on identifying and forecasting future pandemics
 - c. Engaging in discussions or activities related to the International Health Regulations 2005 (since the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System needs to be established in accordance with these regulations)
 - d. Engaging in discussions or activities related to the WHO’s GOARN (since the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System needs to be established in accordance with the GOARN)

⁴³⁰ Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, World Health Organization. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.who.int/csr/outbreaknetwork/goarnenglish.pdf>

⁴³¹ Definition of Identify, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/identify>

⁴³² Definition of Forecast, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/forecast>

⁴³³ About Us, GOARN. Access Date: 12 November, 2021. <https://extranet.who.int/goarn/about-us>

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member needs to engage in activities that fall under at least two of the three categories above. (In engaging with the first and third group of actions above, there would need to be explicit support for the Integrated Early Warning System for full compliance). Partial compliance requires the BRICS member to engage in activities that fall under one of the three categories above, or to engage in the first and third group of actions above without an explicit link to the Integrated Early Warning System. Failure to undertake any relevant activities in any of the three above categories indicates the lack of compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not take any relevant activities that demonstrate support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System.
0	The BRICS member demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by taking ONE of the following types of actions: 1) providing verbal or political support; 2) providing financial assistance towards the establishment of the system; or 3) acting in a way that promotes the aims of the system; OR The BRICS member took actions in 1) providing verbal or political support (WITHOUT explicit reference to the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System); and 3) acting in a way that promotes the aims of the system (WITHOUT explicit reference to the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System).
+1	The BRICS member demonstrated support towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System by taking TWO OR MORE of the following types of actions: 1) providing verbal or political support (with explicit reference to the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System); 2) providing financial assistance towards the establishment of the system; or 3) acting in a way that promotes the aims of the system (with explicit reference to the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System).

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinbe Wang

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the World Health Organization's Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 24 December 2021, the Brazilian government announced its donation of 500,000 doses of COVID-19 vaccines to Paraguay.⁴³⁴ Brazil reaffirmed its commitment to the promotion of vaccine equity and equal and fair access to medicines and other supplies to the fight the pandemic.

On 28 December 2021, Ambassador Carlos Alberto Franco França outlined Brazil's efforts to tackle and prevent COVID-19 cases. He stated that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has "acted decisively to import immunization doses and the substances needed for their production."⁴³⁵ Brazil has also responded to requests made by 24 partner countries through the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC) which received BRL28 million in resources for the use of international cooperation actions to confront the pandemic. The Ambassador also stated that Brazil has underlined a possible decision to relax the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights protection in order to contribute to the production of vaccines to fight COVID-19.

⁴³⁴ Nota conjunta do Ministério das Relações Exteriores e do Ministério da Saúde sobre doação de vacinas contra a COVID-19 para o Paraguai, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 24 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/nota-conjunta-do-ministerio-das-relacoes-exteriores-e-do-ministerio-da-saude-sobre-doacao-de-vacinas-contra-a-covid-19-para-o-paraguai

⁴³⁵ O Itamaraty no combate à COVID-19 (Revista Distrito Internacional, n.1, 27/12/2021), Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasília) 28 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/publicacoes/discursos-artigos-e-entrevistas/ministro-das-relacoes-exteriores/artigos-mre/o-itamaraty-no-combate-a-covid-19-revista-201cdistrito-internacional201d-27-12-2021>

On 18 January 2022, Brazil's representative attended the first meeting of BRICS sherpas after the commencement of China's Chairmanship. Given "the current complex and bleak environment [worldwide], with a raging pandemic," BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment to a multilateral approach to "pandemic response and economic recovery."⁴³⁶

On 24 March 2022, Minister of Health Marcelo Queiroga attended the 1st ExpoEIOS (Epidemic Intelligence for Open Source) by the WHO to create a united "One Health" approach for "early detection, verification, assessment, and communication of public health threats."⁴³⁷ The platform's practices were discussed as well as improving of national security strategies for public health threats.

From 12 to 13 April 2022, Brazil's representative participated in the second meeting of BRICS sherpas. Delegates discussed the planning of meetings and activities over the remainder of the year 2022, which included collaboration in "public health" as well as "cultural and people-to-people exchanges and mechanism building" to promote safe and vibrant interactions and facilitate flows of goods and services across borders.⁴³⁸

On 14 April 2022, the Ministry of Health sent a shipment of 3 million doses of COVID-19 for adults and children to different Brazilian states.⁴³⁹

Brazil has acted in a way that promotes the interests and aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system, particularly through its efforts to produce and distribute medicines, medical equipment, and vaccines to tackle the COVID-19 pandemic and through its participation in cooperative BRICS activities in the field of health. However, they have not provided explicit verbal or political support of the system or financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Brazil has acted in a way that promotes the interests or aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system, particularly through its efforts to produce and distribute medicines, medical equipment, and vaccines to tackle the COVID-19 pandemic. However, they have not provided explicit verbal or political support of the system or financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analysts: Tanmaya Ramprasad and Kelley Prendergast

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the World Health Organization's Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 26 November 2021, Deputy Prime Minister Tatyana Golikova chaired a meeting of the Emergency Response Centre to prevent the import and spread of the novel coronavirus.⁴⁴⁰ Following the identification of

⁴³⁶ BRICS' solutions expected to solve major issues, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202201/20/content_WS61e8f875c6d09c94e48a3fa1.html

⁴³⁷ WHO platform allows early detection of potential health emergencies, Ministry of Health (Brasilia) 24 March 2022. Access date: 23 April 2022. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/marco/plataforma-da-oms-permite-deteccao-precoce-de-potenciais-emergencias-em-saude>

⁴³⁸ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Chairs the Second BRICS Sherpas' Meeting 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202204/t20220414_10667820.html

⁴³⁹ Health sends 3 million Covid-19 vaccines to apply booster in adults and 2nd dose in children, Ministry of Health (Brasilia) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 23 April 2022. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/abril/saude-envia-3-milhoes-de-vacinas-covid-19-para-aplicar-o-reforco-em-adultos-e-2a-dose-em-criancas>

⁴⁴⁰ Decisions of the Emergency Response Centre for preventing the import and spread of the novel coronavirus in Russia, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 8 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43922/>

a new variant of the coronavirus, Russia restricted entry into the country for foreign citizens from a list of countries and territories. The Ministry of Transport also organized express tests to detect novel coronavirus infection for citizens of Russia arriving from certain territories, in addition to ensuring that they comply with the sanitary and epidemiological requirements.

On 13 December 2021, the Ministry of Health sent specialists and sanitary watchdog to South Africa to help develop techniques for combatting the Omicron variant.⁴⁴¹ These specialists and the sanitary watchdog studied clinical manifestations caused by the Omicron coronavirus variant and how the disease progressed. They visited patients and maintained close contacts with medics and scientists in the local community.

On 15 December 2021, Deputy Foreign Minister Sergei Ryabkov attended the fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas.⁴⁴² BRICS members stayed committed to combat the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and highlighted the “finalization of Agreement on Cooperation in the Field of Regulation of Medical Products for Human Use.”⁴⁴³

On 22 December 2021, the Russian-South African Scientific Mission released their results on the features of the Omicron variant.⁴⁴⁴ The mission took place from 13 to 22 December 2021 in South Africa specifically with organized visits to Johannesburg and Pretoria. Three working groups that consisted of virological, epidemiological and clinical scientists and experts discussed approaches to combat the Omicron variant with diagnosis, virological monitoring, immunology and therapies. The Russian-South African Scientific Mission agreed to ensure bilateral scientific cooperation and promote anti-epidemic measures and further areas for epidemic prevention cooperation along with a road map for 2022-2024.

On 18 January 2022, Deputy Foreign Minister Ryabkov attended the first meeting of BRICS sherpas after the commencement of China’s Chairmanship.⁴⁴⁵ Given “the current complex and bleak environment [worldwide], with a raging pandemic,” BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment to a multilateral approach to “pandemic response and economic recovery.”⁴⁴⁶

From 12 to 13 April 2022, Deputy Foreign Minister Ryabkov attended the second meeting of BRICS sherpas.⁴⁴⁷ Delegates discussed the planning of meetings and activities over the remainder of the year 2022, which included collaboration in “public health” as well as “cultural and people-to-people exchanges and mechanism building” to promote safe and vibrant interactions and facilitate flows of goods and services across borders.⁴⁴⁸

⁴⁴¹ Russian specialists studying clinical manifestations of Omicron strain in South Africa, TASS (Moscow) 17 December 2021. Access Date: 8 January 2022. <https://tass.com/society/1377483>

⁴⁴² BRICS Sherpas, Sous Sherpas Meet For Final Time In 2021 With India At the Helm, Republic World (Mumbai) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.republicworld.com/world-news/rest-of-the-world-news/brics-sherpas-sous-sherpas-meet-for-final-time-in-2021-with-india-at-the-helm.html>

⁴⁴³ Fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34661/Fourth_meeting_of_BRICS_Sherpas_and_Sous_Sherpas

⁴⁴⁴ Joint statement on results of Russian-South African Scientific Mission to study features of new coronavirus infection (Johannesburg) 22 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/joint-statement-results-russian-south-african-scientific-mission-study-features-new>

⁴⁴⁵ BRICS’ solutions expected to solve major issues, The State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://english.www.gov.cn/news/internationalexchanges/202201/20/content_WS61e8f875c6d09c94e48a3fa1.html

⁴⁴⁶ BRICS’ solutions expected to solve major issues, The State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://english.www.gov.cn/news/internationalexchanges/202201/20/content_WS61e8f875c6d09c94e48a3fa1.html

⁴⁴⁷ Ryabkov discusses with BRICS Sherpas preparations for summit, meeting of foreign ministers, TASS (Moscow) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://tass.com/politics/1437873>

⁴⁴⁸ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Chairs the Second BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202204/t20220414_10667820.html

On 11 May 2022, Minister Murashko took part in 12th Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Health. Murashko urged the parties to activate work on establishing a comprehensive early-warning system for mass infectious diseases and expressed the idea of creating an international BRICS medical research journal and a medical association of BRICS countries.⁴⁴⁹

Russia has acted in a way that promotes the interests and aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system, particularly through assisting other countries in combatting mass infectious diseases, implementing necessary health and safety measures, and through its participation in cooperative BRICS activities in the field of health. They have also provided explicit verbal for the establishment of the system.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Wenny (Yiyao) Jin

India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005) and the World Health Organization's Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 22 September 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi delivered a speech at the Global COVID-19 Summit where he iterated India's continued efforts to provide developing countries with cost-effective diagnostic kits, drugs, medical devices, and personal protective equipment kits.⁴⁵⁰ During the speech, Modi outlined efforts to increase production of existing vaccines, resuming vaccine supplies and highlighting that along with South Africa, India has proposed a waiver of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights at the World Trade Organization for COVID-19 vaccines, diagnostics and medicines.

On 6 December 2021, Prime Minister Modi invited Russian President Vladimir Putin to the 21st India-Russia Annual Summit where both leaders expressed gratitude for the ongoing bilateral cooperation in the fight against COVID-19, especially with regards to the Sputnik-V vaccine.⁴⁵¹ During the Summit, India reiterated its commitment to enhanced cooperation within the BRICS and recognised the role of the New Development Bank as vital to addressing development challenges which includes the health and economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic.

On 7 December 2021, Minister of State for External Affairs Dr. Rajkumar Ranjan Singh spoke at the Maitri Diwas Cultural Event hosted by Bangladesh High Commission in New Delhi, where he identified India's support to Bangladesh in tackling the pandemic by supplying liquid medical oxygen through rail and by training health professionals from Bangladesh in their local language.⁴⁵²

⁴⁴⁹ Russian Health Minister proposes to create medical association of BRICS countries, TASS (Moscow) 11 May 2022. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <https://tass.com/politics/1449517>

⁴⁵⁰ Prime Minister's comments at the Global COVID-19 Summit: Ending the Pandemic and Building Back Better Health Security to Prepare for the Next, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 22 September 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34297/prime+ministers+comments+at+the+global+covid19+summit+ending+the+pandemic+and+building+back+better+health+security+to+prepare+for+the+next>

⁴⁵¹ India- Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34606/india+russia+joint+statement+following+the+visit+of+the+president+of+the+russian+federation>

⁴⁵² Address by Minister of State for External Affairs Dr. Rajkumar Ranjan Singh at the Maitri Diwas Cultural Event hosted by Bangladesh High Commission in New Delhi (December 06, 2021), Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34612/address+by+minister+of+state+for+external+affairs+dr+raj+kumar+ranjan+singh+at+the+maitri+diwas+cultural+event+hosted+by+bangladesh+high+commission+in+new+delhi+december+06+2021>

On 8 December 2021, India's G20 Sherpa and Minister of Commerce & Industry, Textiles, Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution Shri Piyush Goyal spoke at the first Sherpa Meeting held by Indonesia where he conveyed that India will produce five billion vaccines doses to strengthen international efforts to tackle the COVID-19 pandemic.⁴⁵³ Additionally, he stressed the need for the equality of global health standards which include travel, vaccine documentation and acceptance and wider recognition of national pharmacopoeia.

On 15 December 2021, India attended the BRICS Sherpa and Sous Sherpas meeting, chaired by Secretary Shri Sanja Bhattacharyya as India's BRICS Sherpa.⁴⁵⁴ During this meeting, India reaffirmed their commitment to fight the COVID-19 pandemic.

On 15 December 2021, India hosted the 8th edition of the Indian Ocean Dialogue under the theme "Post Pandemic India Ocean: Leveraging Digital Technologies for Health, Education, Development and Trade in [Indian Ocean Rim Association] IORA Member States.⁴⁵⁵ During the dialogue, IORA Member States and Dialogue partners shared their successes and best practices with regards to digital technologies to fight the pandemic among other problems. Honorable Minister of State Dr Rajkumar Ranjan Singh underlined the need for collaboration among IORA Member States to combat the pandemic.

On 15 December 2021, Minister of State for External Affairs Dr. Ranjan Singh addressed the 8th Indian Ocean Dialogue where he outlined India's efforts in the Ind-Pacific region.⁴⁵⁶ These efforts include the supply of essential food items, protective wear, and healthcare equipment; deployment of Rapid Response Teams as well as Medical Assistance Teams; and supply of critical medicines and vaccines, liquid oxygen and concentrators. Additionally, India provided COVID-19 related online training through eITEC programmes for 802 healthcare professionals, administrators, nursing officers, counsellors, drug regulatory authorities and other stakeholders of Indo-Pacific region.

On 16 December 2021, Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs Shri V. Muraleedharan answered a question on India-Israel cooperation regarding the COVID-19 pandemic.⁴⁵⁷ He stated that since the outbreak of the pandemic, India has provided five tonnes of hydroxychloroquine and 50,000 N95 masks to Israel.

On 19 December 2021, the 3rd meeting of the India-Central Asia Dialogue was held. During this meeting, the Foreign Ministers of Central Asian countries noted India's assistance with vaccines and essential medicines during their early stages of the pandemic.⁴⁵⁸ The External Affairs Minister of India stressed the importance of extensive vaccination, transfer of technology, development of local production capacities, promotion of supply chains for medical products and of price transparency.

On 18 January 2022, Secretary at the Ministry of External Affairs Shri Sanjay Bhattacharyya attended the first meeting of BRICS sherpas after the commencement of China's Chairmanship. Given "the current complex

⁴⁵³ India participates in the first G20 meeting since joining the Troika, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 8 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34613/india+participates+in+the+first+g20+meeting++since+joining+the+troika>

⁴⁵⁴ Fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas, Ministry of Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34661/fourth+meeting+of+brics+sherpas+and+sous+sherpas>

⁴⁵⁵ 8th Indian Ocean Dialogue, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34660/8th+indian+ocean+dialogue>

⁴⁵⁶ Keynote Address by Minister of State for External Affairs, Dr. Rajkumar Ranjan Singh at the 8th Indian Ocean Dialogue, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34658/keynote+address+by+minister+of+state+for+external+affairs+dr+rajkumar+ranjan+singh+at+the+8th+indian+ocean+dialogue>

⁴⁵⁷ QUESTION NO.2154 INDIA-ISRAEL COOPERATION, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 16 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/rajya-sabha.htm?dtl/34673/question+no2154+indiaisrael+cooperation>

⁴⁵⁸ Joint Statement of the 3rd meeting of the India-Central Asia Dialogue, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 19 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34705/joint+statement+of+the+3rd+meeting+of+the+indiacentral+asia+dialogue>

and bleak environment [worldwide], with a raging pandemic,” BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment to a multilateral approach to “pandemic response and economic recovery.”⁴⁵⁹

From 12 to 13 April 2022, Secretary at the Ministry of External Affairs Dammu Ravi led India’s delegation to participate in the second meeting of BRICS sherpas.⁴⁶⁰ Delegates discussed the planning of meetings and activities over the remainder of the year 2022, which included collaboration in “public health” as well as “cultural and people-to-people exchanges and mechanism building” to promote safe and vibrant interactions and facilitate flows of goods and services across borders.⁴⁶¹

India has acted in a way that promotes the interests or aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning system, particularly through its efforts to produce and distribute medicines, medical equipment, and vaccines to tackle ongoing cases of COVID-19 as well as prevent the proliferation of further cases domestically and internationally. However, they have not provided explicit verbal or political support of the system or financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analysts: Tanmaya Ramprasad and Wenny (Yiyao) Jin

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the World Health Organization’s Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 30 November 2021, President Xi Jinping addressed the Eighth Ministerial Conference of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation through video link and announced various measures to assist African countries in fighting the COVID-19 pandemic.⁴⁶² Among these measures, China proposed to provide another one billion doses of COVID-19 vaccines to Africa to help the African Union achieve its goal to vaccinate 60 per cent of the population by 2022. Additionally, China proposed to send 1,500 medical personnel and public health experts to Africa, as well as to undertake 10 medical and health projects for African countries.

On 6 December 2021, Sierra Leonean President Julius Maada Bio met with senior Chinese diplomat Yang Jiechi.⁴⁶³ The two countries pledged to further boost cooperation in fighting the Ebola virus and the COVID-19 pandemic among other public health emergencies.

On 15 December 2021, Coordinator of China’s BRICS Affairs and Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu attended the final meeting of BRICS Coordinators.⁴⁶⁴ BRICS members stayed committed to combat the ongoing

⁴⁵⁹ BRICS’ solutions expected to solve major issues, The State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202201/20/content_WS61e8f875c6d09c94e48a3fa1.html

⁴⁶⁰ BRICS Sherpas discuss meetings, activities planned for 2022, ANI (New Delhi) 13 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

<https://www.aninews.in/news/world/asia/brics-sherpas-discuss-meetings-activities-planned-for-202220220413230210/>

⁴⁶¹ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Chairs the Second BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202204/t20220414_10667820.html

⁴⁶² Xi Focus: What are the latest measures to boost China-Africa cooperation, Xinhua (Beijing) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 7 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-11/30/c_1310343004.htm

⁴⁶³ China, Sierra Leone pledge to boost cooperation, Xinhua (Freetown) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 7 January 2022.

http://www.news.cn/english/africa/2021-12/07/c_1310355430.htm

⁴⁶⁴ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Attends Video Meeting of BRICS Coordinators, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 16 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022.

https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202112/t20211216_10470580.html

COVID-19 pandemic and highlighted the “finalization of Agreement on Cooperation in the Field of Regulation of Medical Products for Human Use.”⁴⁶⁵

On 18 January 2022, Vice Foreign Minister Ma chaired the First BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting of the year. China emphasized its commitment to good chairmanship during the year through facilitating BRICS members cooperation in important areas such as upholding “solidarity in combating the pandemic.”⁴⁶⁶

On 22 February 2022, China issued a statement detailing the “Theme and Cooperation Priorities of 2022” to prepare for the 14th BRICS Summit. This document identified the priority to “Strengthen Public Health Cooperation” and called for BRICS members’ to “[cooperate] in traditional medicine and digital health” and to “accelerate the establishment of BRICS Integrated Early Warning System” to enhance the prevention and response to mass infectious diseases in the future.⁴⁶⁷

From 12 to 13 April 2022, Vice Foreign Minister Ma chaired the second meeting of BRICS sherpas. Delegates discussed the planning of meetings and activities over the remainder of the year 2022, which included collaboration in “public health” as well as “cultural and people-to-people exchanges and mechanism building” to promote safe and vibrant interactions and facilitate flows of goods and services across borders.⁴⁶⁸

China has acted in a way that promotes the aims and interests of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System, particularly through assisting other countries in combatting mass infectious diseases. It has also provided explicit verbal support for the establishment of the system through its chairmanship of the BRICS summit.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Wenny (Yiyao) Jin

South Africa: 0

South Africa partially complied with its commitment to support the progress towards establishing a BRICS Integrated Early Warning System for preventing mass infectious diseases risks, in accordance with the International Health Regulations (2005), and the World Health Organization’s Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network, for identifying future pandemics and forecasting outbreaks through institutional collaboration.

On 28 November 2021, President Cyril Ramaphosa announced that South African scientists discovered the new variant through their genomic surveillance and stated South Africa’s national effort to decrease the spread of the COVID-19 pandemic.⁴⁶⁹ The World Health Organization later identified the variant of concern as Omicron variant.

On 8 December 2021, South African Health Products Regulatory Authority approved the cost effective COVID-19 antigen detection kit, The MD SARS-nCoV-2 Antigen Device, which was developed by Medical

⁴⁶⁵ Fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34661/Fourth_meeting_of_BRICS_Sherpas_and_Sous_Sherpas

⁴⁶⁶ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Hosts 2022 the First BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 19 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjbxw/202201/t20220119_10630548.html

⁴⁶⁷ Theme and Cooperation Priorities of 2022, XIV BRICS Summit (Beijing) 2 February 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. http://brics2022.mfa.gov.cn/eng/dtxw/202203/t20220302_10647107.html

⁴⁶⁸ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Chairs the Second BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202204/t20220414_10667820.html

⁴⁶⁹ President Cyril Ramaphosa: Address on South Africa’s response to Coronavirus COVID-19 pandemic (Johannesburg) 28 November 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-address-south-africas-response-coronavirus-covid-19-pandemic-28>.

Diagnostech.⁴⁷⁰ This differs from antibody tests regarding previous infection or immune response against the virus. Medical Diagnostech was also creating a smartphone application to ensure data generation and analysis. Test kits were developed in Cape Town where 20 million units annually could be produced.

On 9 December 2021, President Ramaphosa called for global leaders to fully fund the ACT Accelerator Facilitation Council which has served to aid low-income countries during the pandemic.⁴⁷¹ Fully-funded access to COVID-19 Tools Accelerator would provide low middle-income countries and low-income countries with vaccines, treatments, testing and PPE for frontline health care workers.

On 10 December 2021, South Africa invited BRICS scientists to collaborate on COVID-19 research specifically on genomic sequencing of the virus and its mutations. This virtual cooperation was to promote “intra-BRICS cooperation for preparedness and responses to the pandemic in the New Delhi Declaration at the 13th BRICS Summit in September 2021.”⁴⁷² South Africa was the host of the BRICS Vaccine Research Centre including research on the Omicron variant. This collaboration aimed to help with information sharing on laboratory, clinical and epidemiological experiences on the future of the virus.

On 15 December 2021, South Africa’s representative attended the fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas.⁴⁷³ BRICS members stayed committed to combat the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and highlighted the “finalization of Agreement on Cooperation in the Field of Regulation of Medical Products for Human Use.”⁴⁷⁴

On 22 December 2021, the Russian-South African Scientific Mission released their results on the features of the Omicron variant.⁴⁷⁵ The mission took place from 13 to 22 December 2021 in South Africa specifically with organized visits to Johannesburg and Pretoria. Three working groups that consisted of virological, epidemiological and clinical scientists and experts discussed approaches to combat the Omicron variant with diagnosis, virological monitoring, immunology and therapies. The Russian-South African Scientific Mission agreed to ensure bilateral scientific cooperation and promote anti-epidemic measures and further areas for epidemic prevention cooperation along with a road map for 2022-2024.

On 18 January 2022, South Africa’s representative attended the first meeting of BRICS sherpas after the commencement of China’s Chairmanship. Given “the current complex and bleak environment [worldwide], with a raging pandemic,” BRICS members reaffirmed their commitment to a multilateral approach to “pandemic response and economic recovery.”⁴⁷⁶

⁴⁷⁰ SAHPRA approves affordable, locally developed Coronavirus COVID-19 antigen test (Johannesburg) 8 December 2021. Access Date: 18 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/sahpra-approves-affordable-locally-developed-coronavirus-covid-19-antigen-test-8-dec-2021>

⁴⁷¹ President Cyril Ramaphosa: 8th ACT Accelerator Facilitation Council Meeting (Johannesburg) 9 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-8th-act-accelerator-facilitation-council-meeting-9-dec-2021-0000>

⁴⁷² President Cyril Ramaphosa invites BRICS scientists to cooperate on COVID-19 research (Johannesburg) 10 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-invites-nvites-brics-scientists-cooperate-covid-19-research-10>

⁴⁷³ BRICS Sherpas, Sous Sherpas Meet For Final Time In 2021 With India At the Helm, Republic World (Mumbai) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.republicworld.com/world-news/rest-of-the-world-news/brics-sherpas-sous-sherpas-meet-for-final-time-in-2021-with-india-at-the-helm.html>

⁴⁷⁴ Fourth meeting of BRICS Sherpas and Sous Sherpas, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34661/Fourth_meeting_of_BRICS_Sherpas_and_Sous_Sherpas

⁴⁷⁵ Joint statement on results of Russian-South African Scientific Mission to study features of new coronavirus infection (Johannesburg) 22 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/joint-statement-results-russian-south-african-scientific-mission-study-features-new>

⁴⁷⁶ BRICS’ solutions expected to solve major issues, The State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202201/20/content_WS61e8f875c6d09c94e48a3fa1.html

From 12 to 13 April 2022, South Africa’s representative attended the second meeting of BRICS sherpas.⁴⁷⁷ Delegates discussed the planning of meetings and activities over the remainder of the year 2022, which included collaboration in “public health” as well as “cultural and people-to-people exchanges and mechanism building” to promote safe and vibrant interactions and facilitate flows of goods and services across borders.⁴⁷⁸

On 12 May 2022, at the 2nd Global Summit on COVID-19, South Africa announced their support for the Financial Intermediary Fund to promote global health and to increase global access to vaccines and testing.⁴⁷⁹ South Africa also gave financial support to the Global Fund and announced that it will be establishing an Enhanced Surveillance Strategy to understand community-based testing. Overall, South Africa called for supporting manufacturing vaccines, medicines, tests and other therapies on the continent.

South Africa has acted in a way that promotes the aims of the BRICS Integrated Early Warning System, particularly through engaging in collaborate efforts towards the goal of identifying, forecasting and preventing the spread of the current pandemic and future pandemics. However, it has not provided explicit verbal or political support of the system or financial assistance towards the establishment of the system.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Kelley Prendergast

⁴⁷⁷ Ryabkov discusses with BRICS Sherpas preparations for summit, meeting of foreign ministers, TASS (Moscow) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://tass.com/politics/1437873?>

⁴⁷⁸ Vice Foreign Minister Ma Zhaoxu Chairs the Second BRICS Sherpas’ Meeting 2022, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 14 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202204/t20220414_10667820.html

⁴⁷⁹ President Cyril Ramaphosa: 2nd Global Summit on COVID-19, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 12 May 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-2nd-global-summit-covid-19-12-may-2022-0000>

10. Health: Major Diseases and Tuberculosis

“We reiterate our commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially Tuberculosis.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India	-1		
China		0	
South Africa		0	
Average		-0.20 (40%)	

Background

The issue area of health was first discussed at the 2011 Sanya Summit. At this summit, BRICS leaders committed to “strengthen dialogue and cooperation in the fields of social protection, decent work, gender equality, youth, and public health, including the fight against HIV/AIDS.”⁴⁸⁰ At the 2012 New Delhi Summit, BRICS leaders made a general commitment to address common public health challenges including the growing burden of communicable and non-communicable diseases.⁴⁸¹

The next discussion of health came at the 2015 Ufa Summit, where the BRICS affirmed “the right of every person” to “the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.”⁴⁸² Specifically, the leaders expressed their concern with growing global threats posed by communicable and non-communicable diseases. In addition, BRICS leaders specifically mentioned Tuberculosis (TB) for the first time. In the declaration, they noted the rising challenge of antimicrobial resistance and the spread of major diseases like HIV/AIDS, TB, malaria, and others, and the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential including the novel coronavirus or Ebola. In this context, they noted their willingness to take coordinated efforts to tackle global health challenges.⁴⁸³

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders again specifically mentioned major diseases like TB. In their declaration, they noted “that BRICS countries face challenges of communicable diseases including HIV and Tuberculosis” and in this context noted efforts by BRICS Health Ministers to achieve the 90-90-90 HIV treatment target by 2020. In addition, they underlined “the imperative to advance cooperation and action on HIV and TB in the BRICS countries, including in the production of quality-assured drugs and diagnostics.”⁴⁸⁴ Furthermore, the BRICS took note of the forthcoming Global Conference on TB to be held in Moscow in 2017.⁴⁸⁵

Major diseases, and specifically TB, was next discussed at the 2017 Xiamen Summit. On a general level, the BRICS leaders agreed to enhance the BRICS’ role in global health governance and “foster the development

⁴⁸⁰ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁴⁸¹ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

⁴⁸² VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁴⁸³ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁴⁸⁴ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁴⁸⁵ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

<http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

and improve the availability of innovative medical products through promotion of research and development and access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services through enhanced health systems and health financing.”⁴⁸⁶ They also agreed “to improve surveillance capacity and medical services to combat infectious diseases, including Ebola, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, as well as non-communicable diseases and encourage greater application of ICTs to improve the level of health service provision.”⁴⁸⁷ In addition, they welcomed “the decision to set up the Tuberculosis Research Network, to be presented at the First World Health Organization (WHO) Global Ministerial Conference Ending Tuberculosis in the Sustainable Development Era: A Multisectoral Response, Moscow, Russian Federation, 16-17 November 2017.”⁴⁸⁸ The leaders also expressed support for the First United Nations General Assembly High-Level Meeting on Tuberculosis in 2018.⁴⁸⁹

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS again discussed specific issues related to TB. The leaders welcomed the 1st WHO Global Ministerial Conference on Ending Tuberculosis in the Sustainable Development Era: A Multisectoral Response, in Moscow in 2017, and the resulting Moscow declaration to End TB. They also stressed the importance of the upcoming 1st High-Level Meeting of the United Nations General Assembly on Ending Tuberculosis and the 3rd High-Level Meeting of the UN General Assembly on the Prevention and Control of non-communicable diseases, to be held in September 2018.⁴⁹⁰

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS welcomed “the 9th Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers and the Collaborative Research Program for TB, developed by BRICS TB Research Network in 2019, aimed at promoting new scientific, technological and innovative approaches to tackle the TB burden, by supporting scientific projects in a wide range of relevant issues related to TB.”⁴⁹¹ They also emphasized the importance of “collective action in promoting research and development of medicines and diagnostic tools to end epidemics, to combat communicable diseases and to facilitate access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines, as well as activities to strengthen non-communicable diseases prevention.”⁴⁹²

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS reiterated its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation “in addressing the challenges to health and human well-being including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (HIV/AIDS, TB, malaria and others) and the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential.”⁴⁹³ Specifically, given the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, BRICS leaders also welcomed “the efforts of States in developing and implementing policies and initiatives regarding the fight against the COVID-19 pandemic that are fit for their specific national situations” and recognized “the fundamental role of the United Nations system, including the WHO, in coordinating the comprehensive global response to COVID-19 pandemic and the central efforts of States therein.”⁴⁹⁴ In addition, they emphasized the

⁴⁸⁶ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴⁸⁷ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴⁸⁸ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴⁸⁹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁴⁹⁰ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 11 November 2021.

⁴⁹¹ Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁴⁹² Brasilia Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁴⁹³ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁴⁹⁴ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

importance of “enhancing BRICS countries’ positive contribution to international public health security” and “the need to pursue coordinated and decisive actions, both individually and collectively.”⁴⁹⁵

Commitment Features

This commitment requires BRICS countries to enhance their cooperation in addressing health challenges. Specifically, it requires BRICS countries to develop “effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially Tuberculosis.” “Enhance” means to increase or improve something.⁴⁹⁶ Thus, merely continuing existing, ongoing cooperative activities that address health challenges do not count towards compliance. The BRICS members must either improve upon existing cooperative efforts or initiate new efforts.

“Other health challenges” refer to health challenges other than the COVID-19 pandemic. Given that the 2021 summit took place amidst the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, the health section of the BRICS declaration is dominated by discussions of how to respond to the pandemic. In this context, the wording of “other health challenges” requires BRICS members to enhance cooperative efforts at addressing health challenges beyond COVID-19.

“Effective” means producing a result that is wanted or having an intended effect.⁴⁹⁷ “Joint responses” require that actions of BRICS members must be taken in collaboration with other BRICS members in order to count towards compliance. Taken together, “effective joint responses” require BRICS members to take actions with other BRICS members (or another BRICS member) targeted at an intended outcome of addressing a specific health challenge (or a group of specific health challenges).

“Major diseases” refer to diseases that are the leading causes of death. WHO data show that the following diseases are the leading causes of death globally: ischaemic heart disease, stroke, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, lower respiratory infections, neonatal conditions, trachea, bronchus, and lung cancers, Alzheimer’s disease, Diarrhoeal diseases, diabetes mellitus, and kidney disease. WHO data also show that the following ten diseases are the leading causes of death in low-income countries: neonatal conditions, lower respiratory infections, ischaemic heart disease, stroke, diarrhoeal diseases, malaria, tuberculosis, HIV/AIDS, and cirrhosis of the liver. Any disease within these lists count towards the classification as a “major disease.”⁴⁹⁸

Overall, this commitment contains three distinct requirements with increasing levels of specificity:

1. At the most general level, the commitment requires BRICS members to enhance their cooperation in addressing health challenges. Here, health challenges refer to the broad category of health-related issues, with the exception of COVID-19. Thus, any cooperation on health challenges beyond those related to the pandemic counts towards compliance on this level.
2. On the second level, this commitment requires BRICS members to develop “effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases.” This requires members to take actions with other BRICS members specifically on the “major diseases” identified above.

⁴⁹⁵ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁴⁹⁶ Definition of Enhance, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/enhance>

⁴⁹⁷ Definition of Effective, Merriam Webster. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/effective>

⁴⁹⁸ The top 10 causes of death, World Health Organization (9 December 2020). Access Date: 12 November 2021. <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/the-top-10-causes-of-death>

For a more comprehensive list, see data on leading causes of death in lower-middle income countries, upper middle income countries and high income countries. However, given the BRICS’ orientation as a group representing the developing world, the list of major diseases listed in the commitment features are restricted to those that are the leading causes of death globally and in low-income countries. The focus on low-income countries is further supported by the commitment’s specific mention of tuberculosis, which is only a major cause of death in low-income countries.

3. On the third and most specific level, this commitment requires BRICS members to take joint actions that respond to the spread of tuberculosis.

Thus, taking general cooperative action in addressing health challenges (beyond the COVID-19 pandemic) is a pre-requisite to complying with the more specific requirements of this commitment. The failure to take any health-related cooperative action is thus an indication of lack of compliance. Cooperative actions related to the COVID-19 pandemic also do not count towards compliance.

Full compliance requires the BRICS member to take action at all three levels. In other words, full compliance requires cooperative action on addressing the spread of Tuberculosis specifically, in addition to at least one other major disease.

Partial compliance requires the BRICS member to take action at the first two levels. In other words, the BRICS member needs to take cooperative action on addressing the spread of any of the major diseases listed above (but not specifically tuberculosis).

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not engage in cooperative action with other BRICS members on addressing health challenges (beyond the COVID-19 pandemic).
0	The BRICS member engaged in developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (beyond COVID-19) BUT did not specifically take action on responding to the spread of tuberculosis.
+1	The BRICS member engaged in developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (beyond COVID-19) AND specifically took actions on responding to the spread of tuberculosis.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinbe Wang

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially tuberculosis.

On 16 February 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro and Russian President Vladimir Putin held talks in Russia.⁴⁹⁹ Through a joint statement, both presidents “called for further strengthening of the BRICS strategic partnership and welcomed the progress in the development of the cooperation among the five countries in areas such as health care.”⁵⁰⁰

Brazil has taken some action to engage in cooperative action with other BRICS members on addressing health challenges (beyond the COVID-19 pandemic) through the meeting with Russia

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Warisa Rahman

⁴⁹⁹ Joint Statement by the President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin and President of the Federative Republic of Brazil Jair Bolsonaro, President of Russia (Moscow) 16 February 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5774>

⁵⁰⁰ Joint Statement by the President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin and President of the Federative Republic of Brazil Jair Bolsonaro, President of Russia (Moscow) 16 February 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5774>

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially Tuberculosis.

On 26 November 2021, the deputy Prime Ministers of each Russia and China signed three agreements, one of which is a letter of intent for establishing a “joint Russian-Chinese Centre for Standardisation and Technology Transfer in Healthcare.”⁵⁰¹ However, the explicit purpose of the centre has not been discussed.

On 4 February 2022, President Vladimir Putin and Chinese President Xi Jinping held talks in Beijing. Through a joint statement, both presidents declared that they intend to “encourage interaction in the fields of public health” and “foster interaction in such areas as cultural ties, education, science and technology, healthcare.”⁵⁰²

On 16 February 2022, President Putin and Brazilian President Jair Bolsonaro held talks in Russia. Through a joint statement, both presidents “called for further strengthening of the BRICS strategic partnership and welcomed the progress in the development of the cooperation among the five countries in areas such as health care.”⁵⁰³

Russia engaged in developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (beyond COVID-19) but did not specifically take action on responding to the spread of tuberculosis.

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1 .⁵⁰⁴

Analyst: Ethan Ullmann

India: -1

India has not complied with its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially Tuberculosis.

India has not taken any actions or made any collaborative commitments to engage in cooperative action with other BRICS members on addressing health challenges (beyond the COVID-19 pandemic).

Thus, India receives a score of -1 .⁵⁰⁵

Analyst: Warisa Rahman

⁵⁰¹ Deputy prime ministers of Russia and China hold a closing ceremony for the Russia-China Years of Scientific, Technical and Innovative Cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43916/>

⁵⁰² Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People’s Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Moscow) 4 February 2022. Access Date 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770>

⁵⁰³ Joint Statement by the President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin and President of the Federative Republic of Brazil Jair Bolsonaro, President of Russia (Moscow) 16 February 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5774>

⁵⁰⁴ This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: Russian Governments News Website: <http://government.ru/en/news/>; Russian Ministry of Health Website: <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/en/>; TASS Russian News Agency: <https://tass.com/>; Moscow Times: <https://www.themoscowtimes.com/>;

⁵⁰⁵ This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: <https://www.nhp.gov.in/>, <https://www.mohfw.gov.in/>, <https://main.mohfw.gov.in/>, <https://tbcindia.gov.in/>, <https://www.india.gov.in/>, <https://www.who.int/>, <https://nhm.gov.in/>, <https://dhr.gov.in/>, <https://www.mygov.in/covid-19/>, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world/asia/india>.

China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially Tuberculosis.

On 26 November 2021, the deputy Prime Ministers of each Russia and China signed three agreements, one of which is a letter of intent for establishing a “joint Russian-Chinese Centre for Standardisation and Technology Transfer in Healthcare.”⁵⁰⁶ However, the explicit purpose of the centre has not been discussed.

On 4 February 2022, President Xi Jinping and Russian President Vladimir Putin held talks in Beijing.⁵⁰⁷ Through a joint statement, both presidents declared that they intend to “encourage interaction in the fields of public health...” and “foster interaction in such areas as cultural ties, education, science and technology, healthcare.”⁵⁰⁸

China engaged in developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (beyond COVID-19) but did not specifically take action on responding to the spread of tuberculosis.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ethan Ullmann

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing other health challenges, including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases, especially tuberculosis.

On 25 October 2021, a four-day workshop was hosted by South Africa in Cape Town, which “aimed at bridging communication between sectors of the African and Chinese traditional medicine for their innovation.”⁵⁰⁹ While the workshop focused on the treatment of COVID-19, topics on diseases beyond COVID-19 were also discussed.

On 6 December 2021, Deputy President David Mabuza hosted the 21st International Conference on AIDS and Sexually Transmitted Infections in Africa.⁵¹⁰ The conferences discussed strategies towards the goal of ending AIDS as a public health epidemic by 2030. However, there was no evidence of BRICS collaboration at the conference.

On 16 November 2021, Deputy President Mabuza, spoke at the virtual meeting of the Inter-Ministerial Committee of the South African National AIDS Council, calling for integration of delivery systems and

⁵⁰⁶ Deputy prime ministers of Russia and China hold a closing ceremony for the Russia-China Years of Scientific, Technical and Innovative Cooperation, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43916/>

⁵⁰⁷ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People’s Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Moscow) 4 February 2022. Access Date 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770>

⁵⁰⁸ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People’s Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Moscow) 4 February 2022. Access Date 15 May 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770>

⁵⁰⁹ South Africa, China hold workshop on traditional medicine, National Health Commission of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 27 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2021. http://en.nhc.gov.cn/2021-10/27/c_84892.htm

⁵¹⁰ Deputy President David Mabuza: 21st International Conference on Aids and sexually transmitted infections in Africa, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-david-mabuza-21st-international-conference-aids-and-sexually-transmitted>

platforms for HIV/AIDS.⁵¹¹ Deputy President Mabuza stated that an integrated response regarding HIV, AIDS, TB and COVID-19 ought to be designed and focused upon marginalized communities. Efforts have occurred to locate missing TB patients and promote diagnosis and treatment and socioeconomic conditions and inequalities need to be addressed regarding HIV and AIDS for young girls, adolescent girls and women from ages 15-24.

On 27 November 2021, Deputy President Mabuza announced the priorities of the South African National AIDS Council, which included improving partnerships in the government, civil society, and private sector for HIV and TB and promoting the Provincial and District AIDS Councils regarding HIV and TB.⁵¹²

On 1 December 2021, Deputy President Mabuza commemorated World AIDS Day and promoted the campaign against AIDS and COVID-19. The theme for 2021 World AIDS Day is “Working Together to End Inequalities, AIDS, TB and COVID-19. Get Tested. Get Vaccinated. Adhere to Treatment.” The campaign calls for full integration of health services and full collaboration from international organizations and members to address inequities and promote vaccinations.⁵¹³

On 6 December 2021, Deputy President Mabuza spoke about ending AIDS as a public health epidemic by 2030 at the 21st International Conference on AIDS and Sexually Transmitted Infections in Africa. South Africa announced further investment in research and innovation, which will bring access to vaccines, drugs, and medical supplies for health programmes. Similarly, South Africa created the Human Rights Plan, relaunched the Sex Worker Plan, and implemented the LGTQI+ plan to ensure a holistic implementation of health services in all public health facilities and partner facilities.⁵¹⁴

On 7 December 2021, Deputy President Mabuza created an outreach programme for HIV, TB, and COVID-19 vaccines in Mpumalanga. Deputy President Mabuza will act as the leader of the HIV, AIDS, TB, and COVID-19 vaccination outreach programme. This programme is a series of stakeholder consultations with traditional leaders and practitioners, the private sector, inter-faith leaders, and civil society in order to promote responses in this programme.⁵¹⁵

On 24 March 2022, South Africa developed a TB Recovery Plan. The Plan included four dimensions including searching for undiagnosed people with TB, improving linkages to care where those who are diagnosed receive quality TB care, ensuring that patients receive full treatment for TB, and improving infection control measures.⁵¹⁶

South Africa engaged in developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (beyond COVID-19). South Africa also took action on responding to the spread of Tuberculosis but did not engage in a joint response with other BRICS members on tuberculosis.

⁵¹¹ Deputy President David Mabuza: Inter-Ministerial Committee of the South African National AIDS Council, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/opening-remarks-16-nov-2021-0000>

⁵¹² Deputy President David Mabuza: Hybrid Extended Plenary of South African National Aids Council, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 27 November 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-david-mabuza-hybrid-extended-plenary-south-african-national-aids-council>

⁵¹³ Deputy President David Mabuza: World AIDS Day commemoration, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 1 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-david-mabuza-world-aids-day-commemoration-1-dec-2021-0000>

⁵¹⁴ Deputy President David Mabuza: 21st International Conference on Aids and sexually transmitted infections in Africa, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-david-mabuza-21st-international-conference-aids-and-sexually-transmitted>

⁵¹⁵ Deputy President Mabuza leads outreach programme on HIV, TB and COVID-19 vaccines in Mpumalanga, 07 Dec, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 21 December 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-mabuza-leads-outreach-programme-hiv-tb-and-covid-19-vaccines-mpumalanga-07>

⁵¹⁶ Deputy President David Mabuza: World TB Day commemoration, The Presidency (Johannesburg) 24 March 2022. Access Date: 23 April 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-president-david-mabuza-world-tb-day-commemoration-24-mar-2022-0000>

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Kelley Prendergast

11. Health: COVID-19 Pandemic

“We reaffirm our strong commitment to continue our ongoing efforts in supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic through financing, donation, local production and facilitating export of vaccines, therapeutics, diagnostics and other life saving equipment.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.80 (90%)		

Background

BRICS countries addressed health and medicine issues for the first time in 2011 in the Sanya declaration, where the BRICS leaders stated, “firm commitment to strengthen dialogue and cooperation in the fields of social protection, decent work, gender equality, youth, and public health, including the fight against HIV/AIDS.”⁵¹⁷

In 2012 BRICS health ministers committed to “focus on cooperation in combating HIV/AIDS through approaches such as innovative ways to reach out with prevention services, efficacious drugs and diagnostics, exchange of information on newer treatment regimens, determination of recent infections and HIV-TB [tuberculosis] co-infections.”⁵¹⁸ At their third meeting in 2013 they reiterated their joint commitment to “collaborate on key thematic areas focusing on strengthening health surveillance systems; reducing Non-Communicable Disease risk factors through prevention and health promotion; Universal Health Coverage; strategic health technologies, with a focus on communicable and non-communicable diseases; medical technologies; and drug discovery and development.”⁵¹⁹

In 2014 at their fourth meeting, health ministers during Brazil’s presidency expressed deep concern about recent outbreak of Ebola in West African countries and called for “urgent and comprehensive international support to the efforts coordinated by the UN [United Nations], and particularly to the actions undertaken by the WHO [World Health Organization], to accelerate the response to the Ebola outbreak.”⁵²⁰

In 2015, under Russia’s presidency, BRICS leaders expressed deep concern with “continuing spread of major diseases (HIV/AIDS, [tuberculosis], malaria and others), and with the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential, such as highly pathogenic influenza, novel coronavirus or Ebola” and agreed to work together in such areas as:

- Management of risks related to emerging infections with pandemic potential;

⁵¹⁷ Sanya Declaration, 2011, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/chpresidency1/Sanya%20Declaration.pdf>

⁵¹⁸ Communiqué of the II Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEPА (Moscow) 11 January 2013. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/health%202013%201.pdf>

⁵¹⁹ Communiqué of the III Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEPА (Moscow) 7 November 2013. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/health2013.pdf>

⁵²⁰ Communiqué of the IV Meeting of BRICS Health Ministers, RANEPА (Moscow) 5 December 2014. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/Communiqu%C3%A9%20of%20the%20IV%20Meeting%20of%20BRICS%20Health%20Ministers.pdf>

- Compliance with commitments to stop the spread of and eradicate communicable diseases that hamper development (HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, “neglected” tropical diseases, poliomyelitis, measles);
- Research, development, production and supply of medicines aimed at providing increased access to prevention and treatment of communicable diseases.⁵²¹

Between 2011 and 2015 BRICS countries discussed such issues as HIV/AIDS, Ebola, and sexual and reproductive health. At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS made its first commitment on antimicrobial resistance.⁵²²

In 2017 in Xiamen leaders agreed to foster the development and improve the availability of innovative medical products through promotion of research and development, foster access to affordable, quality, effective and safe drugs, vaccines, diagnostics and other medical products and technologies as well as to medical services through enhanced health systems and health financing and to improve surveillance capacity...to combat infectious diseases, including Ebola, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, as well as non-communicable diseases.⁵²³

In 2018 in Johannesburg BRICS leaders committed to strengthening the coordination and cooperation on vaccine research and development within BRICS countries.⁵²⁴

In 2020 Moscow declaration leaders acknowledged initiatives by the WHO, governments, non-profit organisations, research institutes and the pharmaceutical industry to expedite the research, development and production of the COVID-19 vaccine and therapeutics and support cooperative approaches in this regard and promised to ensure that, when available, it is disseminated in a fair, equitable and affordable basis. They supported the Access to COVID-19 Tools Accelerator (ACT-A) initiative. BRICS countries also reiterated their commitment to further enhance BRICS cooperation in addressing the challenges to health and human well-being including through developing effective joint responses to the continuing spread of major diseases (HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and others) and the emergence of infections with a pandemic potential.⁵²⁵

In 2021 Delhi declaration BRICS leaders pledged to continue “ongoing efforts in supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic through financing, donation, local production and facilitating export of vaccines, therapeutics, diagnostics and other life saving equipment.”⁵²⁶

Commitment Features

BRICS leaders pledged to support countries around the world to combat the pandemic through financing, donation, local production and facilitating export of vaccines, therapeutics, diagnostics and other life-saving equipment. This commitment requires taking actions on several aspects: providing financing and donating, production and export of the vaccines, equipment supply.

⁵²¹ Ufa Declaration, 2015, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 21 January 2022.

http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

⁵²² Goa Declaration, 2016, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 21 January 2022.

<http://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

⁵²³ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 21 January 2022.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwxo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

⁵²⁴ A Review of South Africa’s Trade and Investment Relationship with BRIC, RANEPА (Moscow) 2018. Access Date: 21 January 2022.

https://www.ranepa.ru/eng/images/CiIR/BRICS/brics_15_year_review.pdf

⁵²⁵ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 21 January 2022.

<https://eng.brics-russia2020.ru/images/114/81/1148126.pdf>

⁵²⁶ New Delhi Declaration, 2021. RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 8 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indiyskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

Financing and donating

BRICS members should provide financial assistance, investments, credit. They can finance or co-finance different health projects in recipient countries, contribute financing to the international organisations and carry out other activities. BRICS members can also donate medical supplies, pharmaceuticals, personal protective equipment.

Production and export of the vaccines

BRICS members can organise export of the vaccines, conclude agreements to produce the vaccines on the territory of the partner country, provide financing to the COVAX facility and take other actions which ensure vaccine supply.

Equipment supply

BRICS members can transfer the medical equipment or the technology to produce it, conclude agreements to produce it together with or on the territory of the partner country, supply necessary parts, help with maintenance and personnel qualification.

To achieve full compliance BRICS member should actions on all three aspects of the commitment. Partial compliance and a score of 0 is awarded if BRICS member takes actions in one or two areas. If BRICS member fails to take actions on any of the aspects of the commitments, it will receive a score of -1.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	BRICS member has failed to take actions on any of the three aspects of the commitment: financing and donating, vaccines and equipment supply
0	BRICS member has taken actions on ONE or TWO of the three aspects of the commitment: financing and donating, vaccines, equipment supply
+1	BRICS member has taken actions on ALL THREE aspects of the commitment: financing and donating, vaccines, equipment supply

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov
Lead Analyst: Irina Popova*

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to continue efforts in supporting countries to combat the pandemic.

On 17 October 2021, Brazil donated to Lebanon two “kits” of medicines and strategic health supplies, with a capacity to serve up to 10,000 people each, per month, from public stocks managed by the Ministry of Health.⁵²⁷

On 20 December 2021, the Ministry of Health announced the donation of vaccines against COVID-19 to other countries as international humanitarian cooperation through the COVAX facility.⁵²⁸

On 31 December 2022, Brazil donated, from public stocks managed by the Ministry of Health, 1,000 tablets of the drug oseltamivir phosphate 75mg, used in the treatment of flu-like syndromes, for use by the Ministry of Health of Saint Vincent and the Grenadines.⁵²⁹

⁵²⁷ Brasil doa medicamentos e insumos de saúde ao Líbano, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 17 October 2021. Translation provided by the author of the report. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022.

<https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-doa-medicamentos-e-insumos-de-saude-ao-libano>

⁵²⁸ Brasil anuncia doação de vacinas contra COVID-19 a outros países por meio do mecanismo COVAX, PAHO (Washington, D.C.) 20 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.paho.org/pt/noticias/20-12-2021-brasil-anuncia-doacao-vacinas-contra-covid-19-outros-paises-por-meio-do>

⁵²⁹ Brasil doa medicamentos a São Vicente e Granadinas, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 31 December 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-doa-medicamentos-a-sao-vicente-e-granadinas>

On 3 January 2022, Brazil donated to São Tomé and Príncipe, as part of humanitarian cooperation, 750 capsules of the drug oseltamivir phosphate, in 45mg and 75mg presentations.⁵³⁰ The drug is used for the treatment of flu-like syndromes.

On 22 March 2022, the BRICS members launched the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre in an online ceremony. A physical structure for research and development is planned to be built in Johannesburg, South Africa. The main objective of the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre is to share best practices, strengthen cooperation and develop mechanisms for prevention, diagnosis and responses to viruses. It also has a focus on supporting the COVID-19 vaccination distribution.⁵³¹ Each member of the BRICS will set-up a coordination center that would participate in joint projects and initiatives in this regard. Also, the same day the BRICS members participated in a workshop on vaccination campaigning.⁵³²

On 25 March 2022, Minister of Health Marcelo Queiroga proposed to the members of the Community of Portuguese Speaking Countries a common plan dedicated to public policies on non-communicable chronic diseases. The action was presented and approved during the VI Meeting of Health Ministers of the bloc, in Luanda, Angola. Minister Queiroga also suggested cooperation actions in the area of telemedicine. “The Working Group designated for the topic can support the dissemination of information and knowledge technologies to mitigate the impacts caused by COVID-19, particularly in access to health care and in the training and optimization of human resources,” highlighted the minister.⁵³³

On 8 April 2022, Brazilian government donated USD86.7 million to the COVAX Advanced Market Commitment (AMC) initiative.⁵³⁴ The COVAX AMC supports the participation of 92 low- and middle-income countries in the COVAX mechanism.

On 26 May 2022, Brazil made the donation of 80,000 doses of immunizations to the Maldives.⁵³⁵ The donation to the Maldives is 50,000 doses of varicella vaccine; 10,000 doses of measles, mumps and rubella vaccine; 10,000 doses of inactivated polio vaccines and 10,000 doses of diphtheria, tetanus, pertussis vaccine. The operation was coordinated by the Brazilian Cooperation Agency, of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Brazil took actions on all three aspects of the commitment.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

⁵³⁰ Brasil entrega medicamentos a São Tomé e Príncipe, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 3 January 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/abc/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-entrega-medicamentos-a-sao-tome-e-principe>

⁵³¹ BRICS Launches Vaccine R&D Centre, Modern Diplomacy (Athens) 27 March 2022. Access Date: 4 June 2022. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2022/03/27/brics-launches-vaccine-rd-center/>

⁵³² Minister Murashko to Participate in the BRICS Vaccine Center Opening Ceremony, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/03/24/18526-ministr-zdravoohraneniya-rf-mihail-murashko-vystupil-na-tseremonii-zapuskatsentra-briks-po-issledovaniyu-i-razrabotke-vaktsin>

⁵³³ Brasil apresenta plano de políticas públicas para doenças crônicas não transmissíveis em reunião da Comunidade dos Países de Língua Portuguesa, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 25 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/marco/brasil-apresenta-plano-de-politicas-publicas-para-doencas-cronicas-nao-transmissiveis-em-reuniao-da-comunidade-dos-paises-de-lingua-portuguesa>

⁵³⁴ Brasil doa 86,7 milhões de dólares para contribuir com distribuição igualitária de vacinas Covid-19 no mundo, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 8 April 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/abril/brasil-doa-86-7-milhoes-de-dolares-para-contribuir-com-distribuicao-igualitaria-de-vacinas-covid-19-no-mundo>

⁵³⁵ Brasil doa 80 mil doses de vacinas para a República das Maldivas, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 26 May 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/maio/brasil-doa-80-mil-doses-de-vacinas-para-a-republica-das-maldivas>

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with the commitment to continue efforts in supporting countries to combat the pandemic.

On 26 October 2021, Russia granted regulatory approval for Korea's GL Rapha to produce and market the Sputnik vaccine.⁵³⁶ The parties agreed to produce more than 150 million doses of the Sputnik V vaccine annually.

On 27 October 2021, Russia and Israel discussed issues related to combatting the COVID-19 pandemic via a telephone call.⁵³⁷ The parties expressed their interest in mutual approval of vaccine certificates and agreed on establishing a working group.

On 17 November 2021, Russia and China held a bilateral meeting on humanitarian cooperation.⁵³⁸ The parties expressed their interest in continuous operational traffic of data on spread of the COVID-19 pandemic and exchanges in expertise and practical recommendations. Also, the two countries discussed matters related to vaccine development and production.

On 10 December 2021, Russia sent a group of medical experts to South Africa to facilitate an immediate response to an omicron outbreak.⁵³⁹ The delegation is said to bring testing equipment enough for 200 thousand COVID-19 tests.

On 13 December 2021, Russia and Belarus held a joint inter-ministerial meeting on health-related issues in Moscow.⁵⁴⁰ The parties discussed matters related to bilateral cooperation on vaccine clinical studies and the Russia-made "Sputnik V" vaccine production in Belarus.

On 13 December 2021, a joint Russia-South Africa scientific mission on studying clinic and epidemiologic characteristics of a novel coronavirus infection started operating. 20 experts from Russia took part in joint sessions on three major working tracks: epidemiology, virology and clinic studies.⁵⁴¹ South African counterparts presented data on epidemic situation and shared experience on coronavirus-infected patients' treatment. Also, the expert group from Russia visited several medical facilities in Johannesburg and Pretoria. The mission has been completed by 22 December 2021.

⁵³⁶ S.Korea's GL Rapha certified to produce Sputnik COVID-19 vaccines, Reuters (Moscow) 26 October 2021. Access Date: 4 February 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/business/healthcare-pharmaceuticals/skoreas-gl-rapha-certified-produce-sputnik-covid-19-vaccines-2021-10-26/>

⁵³⁷ Mihail Murashko obsudil voprosy protivodejstvija COVID-19 s Ministrom zdravoohraneniya Izrailja Nicanom Gorovicem (Mikhail Murashko to Discuss Combatting COVID-19 Pandemic with Israel Health Minister Nitzan Horowitz), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 27 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/10/27/17687-mihail-murashko-obsudil-voprosy-protivodejstvija-covid-19-s-ministrom-zdravoohraneniya-izrailja-nitsanom-gorovitsem>

⁵³⁸ Sostojalos' 22-e zasedanie Rossijsko-Kitajskoj Komissii po gumanitarnomu sotrudnichestvu (22nd Russia-China Humanitarian Cooperation Commission Meeting), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 17 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/11/17/17809-sostoyalos-22-e-zasedanie-rossijsko-kitajskoj-komissii-po-gumanitarnomu-sotrudnichestvu>

⁵³⁹ Rospotrebnadzor to Send Experts to South Africa on Omicron Outbreak, Interfax (Moscow) 10 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <https://www.interfax.ru/russia/808758>

⁵⁴⁰ V Moskve sostojalos' sovmešt'naja kollegija Minzdrava Rossii i Minzdrava Belarusi (Russia-Belarus Health Ministerial Panel Meeting in Moscow), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 13 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/12/13/17994-v-moskve-sostoyalos-sovmešt'naya-kollegiya-minzdrava-rossii-i-minzdrava-belarusi>

⁵⁴¹ Rossijskie uchenye v JuAR podelilis' opytom bor'by s rasprostraneniem COVID-19 (Russian Scientists to Engage with South African Partners to Cope with COVID-19 pandemic), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 22 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/12/22/18077-rossijskie-uchenye-v-juar-podelilis-opytom-borby-s-rasprostraneniem-covid-19>

On 31 December 2021, Russia delivered 22 tons of humanitarian aid to Cuba, including protective medical costumes and syringes.⁵⁴²

On 28 January 2022, Russia and Argentina held a meeting on bilateral cooperation in healthcare.⁵⁴³ The two countries discussed issues related to cancer treatment research, post-COVID recovery treatment, production of new types of medicine, etc. Also, the parties shared the data on usage of the Russia-made “Sputnik V” vaccine and further cooperation on vaccine development and production.

On 22 March 2022, the BRICS members launched the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre in an online ceremony. A physical structure for research and development is planned to be built in Johannesburg, South Africa. The main objective of the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre is to share best practices, strengthen cooperation and develop mechanisms for prevention, diagnosis and responses to viruses. It also has a focus on supporting the COVID-19 vaccination distribution.⁵⁴⁴ Each member of the BRICS will set-up a coordination center that would participate in joint projects and initiatives in this regard. Also, the same day the BRICS members participated in a workshop on vaccination campaigning.⁵⁴⁵

Russia maintains close ties with other countries on supporting vaccines production and equipment supply but did not provide financing to combat the pandemic.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment on supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic.

During the compliance period India has provided commercial exports and granted COVID-19 vaccines to several countries in the framework of its Vaccine Maitri (Vaccine Friendship) initiative.⁵⁴⁶ In particular, in the period 10 September 2021 – 28 January 2022 India dispatched 12.3 million doses to Bangladesh, 16.4 million to Myanmar, around 7 million – to Nepal, 0.5 million – to Afghanistan, 90,000 – to Dominican Republic, 90,000 – to El Salvador, 1.06 million – to Ghana, 4.34 million – to Nigeria, 100,000 – to Cambodia, 0.5 million – to Rwanda, 0.5 million – to Somalia, 100,000 – to Botswana, 0.7 million – to Mozambique, 0.7 million – to Tajikistan, 1 million – to Iran, 0.4 million – to Paraguay, 40,000 – to Zimbabwe, 9 million – to Indonesia, 0.2 million – to Vietnam, 22.5 million – to the Netherlands, and 125,000 – to UN Health workers. These vaccines have been either granted by the Government of India, or supplied by vaccine producers on commercial terms, or supplied under India’s COVAX obligations.

On 29 November 2021, India offered support to African countries in dealing with the COVID-19 Omicron variant, including by supplies of vaccines, drugs, test kits, gloves, personal protective equipment kits and medical equipment

⁵⁴² Russia to Provide Humanitarian Aid to Cuba, RIA (Buenos Aires) 31 December 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <https://ria.ru/20211231/pomosch-1766330724.html>

⁵⁴³ Mikhail Murashko Had a Meeting with the Minister of Health of Argentina, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 28 January 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022.

⁵⁴⁴ BRICS Launches Vaccine R&D Centre, Modern Diplomacy (Athens) 27 March 2022. Access Date: 4 June 2022. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2022/03/27/brics-launches-vaccine-rd-center/>

⁵⁴⁵ Minister Murashko to Participate in the BRICS Vaccine Center Opening Ceremony, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/03/24/18526-ministr-zdravoohraneniya-rf-mihail-murashko-vystupil-na-tseremonii-zapuskatsentra-briks-po-issledovaniyu-i-razrabotke-vaktsin>

⁵⁴⁶ Vaccine Supply, Ministry of External Affairs of India (New Delhi) 22 January 2022. Access Date: 1 February 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/vaccine-supply.htm>

such as ventilators, as may be required.⁵⁴⁷ Moreover, Indian institutions were instructed to consider cooperation in genomic surveillance and virus characterization related research work with African scientific centers.

On 11 December 2021, India dispatched medical supplies as humanitarian assistance to Afghanistan. The medicines were handed over to the representatives of the World Health Organization in Kabul.⁵⁴⁸

On 12 February 2022, India sent a consignment of medical supplies to Kiribati.⁵⁴⁹ It contained pulse oximeters, swabs with viral transport medium, specimen bags for swabs, PPE kits (surgical masks, gloves, N95 masks, shoe covers, hair caps) and emergency COVID-19 medication supplies.

On 22 March 2022, the BRICS members launched the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre in an online ceremony. A physical structure for research and development is planned to be built in Johannesburg, South Africa. The main objective of the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre is to share best practices, strengthen cooperation and develop mechanisms for prevention, diagnosis and responses to viruses. It also has a focus on supporting the COVID-19 vaccination distribution.⁵⁵⁰ Each member of the BRICS will set-up a coordination center that would participate in joint projects and initiatives in this regard. Also, the same day the BRICS members participated in a workshop on vaccination campaigning.⁵⁵¹

India has taken actions on all three aspects of the commitment on health.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on supporting countries around the world to combat the pandemic.

On 29 October 2021, China donated medical equipment to the Bahamas, including 10 high flow oxygen machines, 30 patient monitors, and 10 portable ventilators to assist patients with COVID-19.⁵⁵²

On 17 November 2021, Russia and China held a bilateral meeting on humanitarian cooperation.⁵⁵³ The parties expressed their interest in continuous operational traffic of data on spread of the COVID-19 pandemic and

⁵⁴⁷ India offers support for Africa to fight the Omicron variant, Ministry of External Affairs of India (New Delhi) 29 November 2021. Access Date: 1 February 2022. <https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34546/india+offers+support+for+africa+to+fight+the+omicron+variant>

⁵⁴⁸ Evacuation of Indians and Afghans under 'Operation Devi Shakti' and shipment of humanitarian assistance for the people of Afghanistan, Ministry of External Affairs of India (New Delhi) 11 December 2021. Access Date: 1 February 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34643/Evacuation_of_Indians_and_Afghans_under_Operation_Devi_Shakti_and_shipment_of_humanitarian_assistance_for_the_people_of_Afghanistan

⁵⁴⁹ India sends medical supplies to Kiribati after Covid-19 triggers a state of disaster, Ministry of External Affairs of India (New Delhi) 12 February 2021. Access Date: 30 May 2022. https://mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34861/India_sends_medical_supplies_to_Kiribati_after_Covid19_triggers_a_state_of_disaster

⁵⁵⁰ BRICS Launches Vaccine R&D Centre, Modern Diplomacy (Athens) 27 March 2022. Access Date: 4 June 2022. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2022/03/27/brics-launches-vaccine-rd-center/>

⁵⁵¹ Minister Murashko to Participate in the BRICS Vaccine Center Opening Ceremony, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/03/24/18526-ministr-zdravoohraneniya-ff-mihail-murashko-vystupil-na-tseremonii-zapuskatsentra-briks-po-issledovaniyu-i-razrabotke-vaktsin>

⁵⁵² Medical supplies from Chinese Government will aid in COVID-19 fight, says MOH, Government of the Bahamas (Nassau) 29 October 2021. Access Date: 1 February 2022. <https://www.bahamas.gov.bs/wps/portal/public/gov/government/news/medical%20supplies%20from%20chinese%20government%20will%20aid%20in%20covid-19%20fight%20says%20moh>

⁵⁵³ Sostojalos' 22-e zasedanie Rossijsko-Kitajskoj Komissii po gumanitarnomu sotrudnichestvu (22nd Russia-China Humanitarian Cooperation Commission Meeting), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 17 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/11/17/17809-sostoyalos-22-e-zasedanie-rossijsko-kitajskoj-komissii-po-gumanitarnomu-sotrudnichestvu>

exchanges in expertise and practical recommendations. Also, the two countries discussed matters related to vaccine development and production.

On 29 November 2021, President Xi Jinping announced that China would provide an additional 1 billion doses of COVID-19 vaccines to African countries. 600 million doses would be provided as donation and 400 million doses – through such means as joint production by Chinese and local companies. Moreover, China would carry out ten health projects, and send 1,500 medical personnel and public health experts to African countries.⁵⁵⁴

On 22 March 2022, the BRICS members launched the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre in an online ceremony. A physical structure for research and development is planned to be built in Johannesburg, South Africa. The main objective of the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre is to share best practices, strengthen cooperation and develop mechanisms for prevention, diagnosis and responses to viruses. It also has a focus on supporting the COVID-19 vaccination distribution.⁵⁵⁵ Each member of the BRICS will set-up a coordination center that would participate in joint projects and initiatives in this regard. Also, the same day the BRICS members participated in a workshop on vaccination campaigning.⁵⁵⁶

China has taken actions on all three aspects of the commitment on health.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to continue efforts in supporting countries to combat the pandemic.

On 13 December 2021, a joint Russia-South Africa scientific mission on studying clinic and epidemiologic characteristics of a novel coronavirus infection started operating.⁵⁵⁷ 20 experts from Russia took part in joint sessions on three major working tracks: epidemiology, virology and clinic studies. South African counterparts presented data on epidemic situation and shared experience on coronavirus-infected patients' treatment. Also, the expert group from Russia visited several medical facilities in Johannesburg and Pretoria. The mission has been completed by 22 December 2021.

On 17 December 2021, South Africa announced a donation of 2 million doses of the COVID-19 vaccines to other African countries through the African Vaccination Acquisition Trust as to facilitate better response to spread of COVID-19 pandemic.⁵⁵⁸

⁵⁵⁴ Xi announces supplying Africa with additional 1 bln COVID-19 vaccine doses, pledges to jointly implement nine programs (Beijing), Xinhua 30 November 2021. Access Date: 1 February 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-11/30/c_1310341310.htm

⁵⁵⁵ BRICS Launches Vaccine R&D Centre, Modern Diplomacy (Athens) 27 March 2022. Access Date: 4 June 2022. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2022/03/27/brics-launches-vaccine-rd-center/>

⁵⁵⁶ Minister Murashko to Participate in the BRICS Vaccine Center Opening Ceremony, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/03/24/18526-ministr-zdravoohraneniya-rf-mihail-murashko-vystupil-na-tseremonii-zapuskatsentra-briks-po-issledovaniyu-i-razrabotke-vaktsin>

⁵⁵⁷ Rossijskie uchenye v JuAR podelilis' opytom bor'by s rasprostraneniem COVID-19 (Russian Scientists to Engage with South African Partners to Cope with COVID-19 pandemic), Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 22 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2021/12/22/18077-rossijskie-uchenye-v-yuar-podelilis'-opytom-borby-s-rasprostraneniem-covid-19>

⁵⁵⁸ UNICEF welcomes South Africa's commitment to donate some 2 million COVID-19 Vaccine doses, UNICEF South Africa (Pretoria) 18 December 2021. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/press-releases/unicef-welcomes-south-africas-commitment-donate-some-2-million-covid-19-vaccine>

On 19 January 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa launched a new vaccine manufacturing facility to bolster vaccine production not only for the local use but for all the African countries.⁵⁵⁹ The facility will produce a wide range of vaccines including COVID-19, tuberculosis and HIV/AIDs.

On 22 March 2022, the BRICS members launched the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre in an online ceremony. A physical structure for research and development is planned to be built in Johannesburg, South Africa. The main objective of the BRICS Vaccine Research and Development Centre is to share best practices, strengthen cooperation and develop mechanisms for prevention, diagnosis and responses to viruses. It also has a focus on supporting the COVID-19 vaccination distribution.⁵⁶⁰ Each member of the BRICS will set-up a coordination center that would participate in joint projects and initiatives in this regard. Also, the same day the BRICS members participated in a workshop on vaccination campaigning.⁵⁶¹

South Africa maintains close ties with other countries on supporting vaccines production and provides financing and equipment to combat the pandemic.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁵⁵⁹ Premier Alan Winde on launch of Africa's Access to Advanced Healthcare coalition with NANTSAs, South African Government (Pretoria) 19 January 2022. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/premier-alan-winde-launch-africa%E2%80%99s-access-advanced-healthcare%C2%A0coalition-nantsa-19-jan-2022>

⁵⁶⁰ BRICS Launches Vaccine R&D Centre, Modern Diplomacy (Athens) 27 March 2022. Access Date: 4 June 2022. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2022/03/27/brics-launches-vaccine-rd-center/>

⁵⁶¹ Minister Murashko to Participate in the BRICS Vaccine Center Opening Ceremony, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 28 May 2022. <https://minzdrav.gov.ru/news/2022/03/24/18526-ministr-zdravoohraneniya-rf-mihail-murashko-vystupil-na-tseremonii-zapuska-tsentra-briks-po-issledovaniyu-i-razrabotke-vaktsin>

12. Terrorism: BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan

“We endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy which was adopted by our National Security Advisors which is aimed at implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy and defines the approach and actions of the BRICS countries towards counter-terrorism cooperation, including ensuring coordinated efforts to understand, identify and collaboratively respond to persistent and emerging terrorist threats, as well as cooperation within the framework of the UN [United Nations] and other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil	-1		
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+0.60 (80%)		

Background

Counter-terrorism has been an important subject of discussion since the first meeting of the BRICS leaders. At the 2009 Yekaterinburg BRICS Summit, BRICS leaders condemned terrorism in all its forms and manifestation and called for the urgent adoption of the Comprehensive Convention against International Terrorism.⁵⁶² At the 2010 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders again condemned all acts of terrorism. In their declaration, the leaders noted that “the fight against international terrorism must be undertaken with due respect to the United Nations Charter, existing international conventions and protocols, the UN General Assembly and Security Council resolutions.”⁵⁶³ In addition, they urged the early conclusion of negotiations in the UN General Assembly of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.⁵⁶⁴

At the 2011 Sanya Summit, in addition to voicing their condemnation of terrorism, BRICS leaders also reiterated that “the United Nations has a central role in coordinating the international against terrorism within the framework of the UN Charter and in accordance with principles and norms of the international law.”⁵⁶⁵ Again, BRICS leaders urged the early conclusion of the negotiations in the UN General Assembly of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.⁵⁶⁶

At the 2012 New Delhi Summit, BRICS leaders discussed terrorism in the context of regional stability in Afghanistan, affirming their commitment to support “Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism, and underscore the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilisation of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.”⁵⁶⁷ In addition, the BRICS leaders again reiterated that “the United Nations has a central role in coordinating international

⁵⁶² Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>

⁵⁶³ 2nd BRIC Summit of Heads of State and Government: Joint Statement, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 15 April 2010. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100415-leaders.html>

⁵⁶⁴ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁵⁶⁵ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁵⁶⁶ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁵⁶⁷ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

action against terrorism, within the framework of the UN Charter and in accordance with principles and norms of international law” and urged an early adoption of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism.⁵⁶⁸

At the 2013 Durban Summit, BRICS leaders, following the footsteps of the preceding New Delhi Summit, discussed terrorism in the context of regional security in Afghanistan and reiterated their commitment “to support Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism, and underscore the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilisation of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.”⁵⁶⁹ Similarly, following previous summits, they reaffirmed the UN’s central role in coordinating international counter-terrorism actions. In their declaration, BRICS leaders also affirmed their support for the implementation of the UN General Assembly Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy.⁵⁷⁰

At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, BRICS leaders mentioned terrorism in a wide range of security-related discussions, which include the activities of the Boko Haram, the instability of Iraq, security issues in Afghanistan, as well as the activities of Al-Qaeda in Syria. Again, following previous summits, BRICS leaders emphasized the central role of the UN in coordinating international actions against terrorism, with respect to human rights and fundamental freedoms. They also affirmed their commitment to implement the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy. In addition, for the first time, the BRICS voiced their concern with the increasing use by terrorists of information and communications technologies, particularly the internet and other media.⁵⁷¹

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders again discussed terrorism in a wide range of contexts including Syria, Iraq, Afghanistan, Somalia, and Kenya. Following previous summits, BRICS leaders emphasized the central role of the UN in coordinating international action against terrorism, and called upon the international community to implement the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy. In addition, for the first time, the BRICS reaffirmed “their commitment to the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) International Standards on Combating Money Laundering and the Financing of Terrorism and Proliferation.”⁵⁷²

At the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders discussed terrorism in the context of a wide range of regional security issues, including those in Syria, Afghanistan, and Iraq. Specifically, the leaders also condemned recent terrorist attacks in India. The BRICS thus committed to strengthen cooperation in combating international terrorism at the bilateral level and the international fora. The BRICS also reiterated their previous commitment to combat terrorist financing by intensifying cooperation in the FATF. In addition, the leaders built on previous discussions of terrorism and information and communications technologies (ICT), and agreed to strengthen joint efforts to enhance security in the use of ICT. For the first time, addressed the issue of chemical and biological terrorism, and the BRICS emphasized the need for launching multilateral negotiations on an international convention to suppress chemical and biological terrorism, and particularly one that addresses the weapons of mass destruction–terrorism nexus. Furthermore, the BRICS leaders welcomed the setting up and first meeting of the BRICS Joint Working Group on Counter-Terrorism in New Delhi.⁵⁷³

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, BRICS leaders again addressed terrorism in their discussions of Afghanistan, and Iraq, as well as other regional security issues. They also addressed issues related to terrorist financing and ICT,

⁵⁶⁸ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

⁵⁶⁹ BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Durban) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>

⁵⁷⁰ BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Durban) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>

⁵⁷¹ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

⁵⁷² VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁵⁷³ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

building upon the discussions at previous summits. Specifically, the leaders welcomed the Meeting of BRICS High Representatives for Security Issues in Beijing, as well as the second BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group Meeting. Furthermore, the leaders called for the establishment of a broad international counter-terrorism coalition, and committed to increase the effectiveness of the UN counter-terrorism framework.⁵⁷⁴

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, BRICS leaders acknowledged the devastating effects of terrorism. The leaders continued their call for an international counter-terrorism coalition, encouraged the adoption of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism by the UN General Assembly, and supported the launch of multilateral negotiations on an international convention suppressing acts of chemical and biological terrorism. Furthermore, the BRICS leaders again noted the importance of combating terrorism in Afghanistan and Syria and the Financing of Terrorism and Proliferation in the FATF.⁵⁷⁵

At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders welcomed sub-working groups under the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group. The leaders reaffirmed their commitments to fight terrorism under the UN's framework, tackle the misuse of ICTs for terrorist activities, address the threat of chemical and biological terrorism, counter the financing of terrorism, and support efforts against terrorism in Syria and Afghanistan. In addition, the leaders noted the process made in the Fourth Meeting of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group, particularly the establishment of thematic sub-working groups.⁵⁷⁶

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, BRICS leaders reaffirmed long-standing commitments to fight terrorism in Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan, to address the threat of chemical and biological terrorism, to respect the central role of the UN, and to combat terrorist financing. In addition, the leaders welcomed the outcomes of the Fifth BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group and endorsed the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy. Specifically, the leaders designated the BRICS High-Representatives for Security to lead the review of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group's development of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan.⁵⁷⁷ On 20 November 2020, shortly after the Moscow Summit, the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy was published. The document outlined the main principles and goals of BRICS counter-terrorism cooperation.⁵⁷⁸

Finally, at the 2021 New Delhi Summit, terrorism was discussed in a variety of different contexts. In a stand-alone section of the summit declaration titled "Peace, Security and Counter-Terrorism Cooperation," BRICS leaders discussed terrorism and its relationship to a wide range of regional conflicts, the misuse of ICT, and illicit financing. The leaders also welcomed the outcomes of the meeting of the BRICS High Representatives for Security, and welcomed the decision to adopt the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for the implementation of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

Commitment Features

This commitment requires BRICS member states to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy. In this context, to "endorse" means to publicly support or approve of something.⁵⁷⁹

⁵⁷⁴ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁵⁷⁵ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁵⁷⁶ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁵⁷⁷ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁵⁷⁸ BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-counterterrorism.html>

⁵⁷⁹ "Endorse," Merriam-Webster. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/endorse>

The BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan was adopted on 29 July 2021 to “define the approach and actions of the BRICS countries towards areas of counter-terrorism cooperation.”⁵⁸⁰ Three pillars of BRICS counter-terrorism cooperation are defined in this document. These include: 1) “ensuring coordinated efforts to understand, identify and collaboratively respond to persistent and emerging terrorist threats; 2) seeking cooperation among the intelligence, law enforcement and security agencies of the BRICS countries; and 3) cooperation within the framework of the UN and other multilateral Counter Terrorism fora. However, only the first and third pillars are highlighted in the text of the commitment itself (see below).

The BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy was adopted in November 2020. This document outlines the goals and principles of BRICS counter-terrorism cooperation. (see Appendix 12-A for the list of principles and goals that underwrite BRICS counter-terrorism cooperation include.)

The selected commitment highlights two (of the three) main pillars to the approach and actions of the BRICS countries towards counter-terrorism cooperation, as outlined in the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan:

1. Ensuring coordinated efforts to understand, identify and collaboratively respond to persistent and emerging terrorist threats

Here, “coordinated efforts” refer to efforts that are well-organized or effectively organized so that all parts work well together;⁵⁸¹ “understand” means to have the knowledge and ability to judge a particular situation or subject;⁵⁸² “identify” means to know who someone or what something is;⁵⁸³ “collaboratively” means to work jointly with others;⁵⁸⁴ “respond” means to do something in reaction to something, in this case, terrorism or threats of terrorism; “persistent and emerging terrorism threats” include but are not limited to all of the threats that the BRICS leaders mentioned in their previous summit communiqués, including region-specific terrorist threats in Afghanistan, Iraq, Syria, India, etc. They also include thematic issues related to terrorism that were discussed by BRICS leaders including terrorist financing, the use of ICTs by terrorist organizations, biological and chemical terrorism, etc. The inclusion of the term “emerging” signifies that taking actions towards previously un-discussed terrorist threats – including terrorism in other regions and new forms of terrorist threats – can also count towards compliance.

Examples of actions that contribute to compliance under this pillar include:

- Undertaking concerted measures against those involved in organizing, instigating, facilitating, participating in, financing, encouraging or tolerating terrorist activities;
- Improving the practical cooperation among security and law-enforcement authorities to prevent and combat terrorism, including by sharing timely and accurate information, and consider, if necessary, creating legal framework for such sharing;
- Undertaking steps to improve relevant necessary measures to strengthen border and customs controls in order to prevent and detect the cross-border movement of terrorists, including by comprehensively using, whenever appropriate, international databases on terrorism and the consolidated list of sanctioned individuals and groups by the UN Security Council;

⁵⁸⁰ BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan, BRICS India 2021 (New Delhi) 29 July 2021. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://brics2021.gov.in/brics/public/uploads/docpdf/getdocu-52.pdf>

⁵⁸¹ “Coordinated,” Cambridge Dictionary. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/coordinated>

⁵⁸² “Understanding,” Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/understanding>

⁵⁸³ “Identify,” Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/identify>

⁵⁸⁴ “Collaborate,” Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/collaboratively>

- Utilizing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group to strengthen intelligence and information sharing and cooperation on terrorist organizations listed by the UN Security Council;⁵⁸⁵

2. Cooperation within the framework of the UN and other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.

“Cooperation” means to work together towards the same end.⁵⁸⁶ To cooperate “within the framework of the UN” refers to acting in accordance with the UN Charter and other UN General Assembly and Security Council resolutions relating to international terrorism, including the UN Global Counter-terrorism Strategy.⁵⁸⁷ “Other multilateral counter-terrorism fora” are multilateral bodies that address terrorism or terrorism-related issues including (but not limited to) the FATF and the G20.⁵⁸⁸

Examples of actions that count towards compliance under this pillar include:

- Verbally reaffirming the support for the central and coordinating role of the UN in combating international terrorism, the need for strict and full implementation of the relevant UN Security Council resolutions related to counter terrorism, comprehensive implementation of the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy in a balanced way, and implementation of the provisions of the relevant international counter-terrorism conventions and protocols;
- Countering the global threat of terrorism on the basis of the purposes and principles of the UN Charter, relevant UN Security Council resolutions and international counter-terrorism conventions and protocols, where applicable;
- Broadening counter-terrorism cooperation with the United Nations, as well as the G20 and the FATF.⁵⁸⁹

A full list of examples of actions that count towards compliance are listed in the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy (see Appendix 12-A).

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must take actions that demonstrate support of both pillars of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan. Specifically, full compliance requires the BRICS member to engage in cooperation with other BRICS members in ways that respond to persistent or emerging terrorist threats, as well as in accordance with the framework of the UN or other multilateral counter-terrorism bodies like the FATF and G20.⁵⁹⁰ For this commitment, one single action can count towards compliance with both pillars if the action addresses both dimensions (for example, if the action is a response to persistent terrorist threat and is also in line with a particular UN framework). Similarly, a combination of separate actions that each address

⁵⁸⁵ Adapted from BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-counterterrorism.html>

⁵⁸⁶ Definition of “Cooperation,” Merriam-Webster. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/cooperation>

⁵⁸⁷ This meaning is supported by the more elaborated texts in many previous declarations where the BRICS used the language of “framework of the UN”: See Brasilia, Sanya, New Delhi and Ufa declarations. For a list of relevant UN resolutions, see: https://treaties.un.org/Pages/DB.aspx?path=DB/studies/page2_en.xml&menu=MTDSG

⁵⁸⁸ These are two examples listed in the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

⁵⁸⁹ Adapted from BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-counterterrorism.html>

⁵⁹⁰ While the original commitment text uses the link-word “and,” the use of the term “and” in the commitment is taken directly from the language of the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan. The commitment explains that “the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan defines the approach and actions of the BRICS countries towards counter-terrorism cooperation, including ensuring coordinated efforts to understand, identify and collaboratively respond to persistent and emerging terrorist threats, as well as cooperation within the framework of the UN and other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.” The language of “and” is a part of the explanation of the scope of the Action Plan. However, the main action word in this commitment is to “endorse” the Action Plan which means to support or approve publicly. In this case, full compliance does not require states to endorse every aspect under each of the pillars of the Action Plan (that is, BRICS members need not respond to BOTH persistent AND emerging terrorist threats; they also do not need to cooperate within the framework of the UN AND other multilateral counter-terrorism fora). Full compliance merely requires the member state to endorse *both of the two pillars* of the Action Plan (that is, they need to respond to 1) Either persistent OR emerging terrorist threats AND 2) cooperate within the framework of the UN OR other multilateral counter-terrorism fora).

one specific pillar can result in full compliance if the member has demonstrated compliance with both pillars by the end of the compliance cycle.

A BRICS member can achieve partial compliance if they undertake actions that only address one of the two pillars. For example, if a member only verbally reaffirms support (across more than one area) for the central role of the UN in countering terrorism without engaging in concrete collaborative actions with other BRICS members that respond to terrorism, this will be a demonstration of partial compliance. Similarly, if a member cooperates with other BRICS members in facilitating research and development on measures to counter terrorism but did not explicitly reference any UN or other multilateral frameworks related to counter-terrorism, this would be a demonstration of partial compliance.

Finally, lack of compliance would result if a BRICS member did not engage in any collaborative counter-terrorism activities with other BRICS members, nor affirmed the framework of the UN and other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not engage in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats NOR cooperated within the framework of the United Nations or other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.
0	The BRICS member engaged in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats OR cooperated within the framework of the UN or other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.
+1	The BRICS member engaged in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats AND cooperated within the framework of the UN or other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinbe Wang

Brazil: -1

Brazil has not complied with its commitment to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

On 25 October 2021, a bill amending the “counter-terrorism” laws in Brazil was put forth, Bill No. 1595.⁵⁹¹ On 1 December 2021, the lower House of Congress requested to fast track this bill. This bill includes expanded powers of the police to detain and survey suspect groups under the permission of the President. However, there was no evidence of BRICS collaboration or collaboration within a multilateral fora.

Brazil did not engage in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats, nor cooperated within the framework of the UN or other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Simren Sharma

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

⁵⁹¹ Lower House wants to speed up vote on bill that creates Bolsonaro’s “secret police” 1 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2021. <https://www.conectas.org/en/noticias/lower-house-wants-to-speed-up-vote-on-bill-that-creates-bolsonaros-secret-police/>

On 17 September 2021, the members of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held their 20th summit.⁵⁹² The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism, and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 25 November 2021, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin participated in a council meeting hosted by the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation with other heads of government, including Minister of External Affairs of the Republic of India Subrahmanyam Jaishankar and Premier of the State Council of the People's Republic of China Li Keqiang. During the meeting, Prime Minister Mishustin delivered a statement to the council, asserting that “it is in [their] common interests to ensure the peace, sovereignty and territorial integrity of the Afghan state, freeing it from terrorism and drugs.”⁵⁹³

On 25 March 2022, Russia attended the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) meeting which discussed regional security, countering terrorism, separatism, and extremism in the member countries.⁵⁹⁴ SCO members exchanged views and identified joint measures to tackle threats to security from international terrorist organizations.

Russia engaged in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats. It also cooperated within the framework of the UN.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yana Sadeghi

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

On 17 September 2021, the members of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held their 20th summit.⁵⁹⁵ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism, and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 28 October 2021, India released a joint statement with the United States regarding working together to counter terrorism at the fourth session of the U.S.-India Designations Dialogue in Washington.⁵⁹⁶ Here, both countries affirmed cooperation against terrorism as an important pillar in their global strategic partnership. As such, they pledged to increase their cooperation in information sharing, increasing strategic ideologue and law enforcement. Other issues discussed include ways to prevent international terrorists from travel, the use of the internet for terrorism, and their procedures for designating terror groups and individuals involved. The

⁵⁹² Strany ShOS prinjali sovmetstvuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021.

Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753> (in Russian)

⁵⁹³ Meeting of the SCO Heads of Government Council, Government House (Moscow) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 8 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43901/>

⁵⁹⁴ SCO countries discuss regional security, counter-terrorism efforts, Xinhua News (Beijing) 26 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220326/94f4fab1e64447f1bdad6247d4360af1/c.html>

⁵⁹⁵ Strany ShOS prinjali sovmetstvuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021.

Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753> (in Russian)

⁵⁹⁶ Joint Statement on U.S.-India Counter Terrorism Joint Working Group and Designations Dialogue (Office of the Spokes Person) 28 October 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2021. <https://www.state.gov/joint-statement-on-u-s-india-counter-terrorism-joint-working-group-and-designations-dialogue/>

participants also agreed to share information regarding countering terrorism financing. However, there was no evidence of collaboration in multilateral fora.

On 25 March 2022, India attended the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) meeting which discussed regional security, countering terrorism, separatism, and extremism in the member countries.⁵⁹⁷ SCO members exchanged views and identified joint measures to tackle threats to security from international terrorist organizations.

India engaged in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats. It also cooperated within the framework of the UN.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Simren Sharma

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

On 17 September 2021, the members of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held their 20th summit.⁵⁹⁸ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism, and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 23 September 2021, State Councillor and Foreign Minister Wang Yi urged the lifting of unilateral sanctions and restrictions on Afghanistan during a video conference of G20 foreign ministers.⁵⁹⁹ Minister Wang declared that the international community shares the responsibility to prevent Afghanistan from becoming a breeding ground for terrorism by building a united front against terrorism and firmly opposing double standards to counter-terrorism.

On 24 September 2021, Minister Wang affirmed China's determination to stand firmly with Libya in a phone conversation with Chairman of the Presidential Council of Libya Mohamed Menfi.⁶⁰⁰ In order to prevent extremist and terrorist forces from seizing power in Libya, he stated that all Libyan parties must strengthen international anti-terror cooperation and intelligence exchanges, while strictly fighting against the cross-border movement of terrorists.

On 8 October 2021, Minister Wang remarked on the 11th Ministerial Plenary Meeting of the Global Counter-terrorism Forum that the international community should unite and work together to eradicate the "cancer" of terrorism.⁶⁰¹ He further expressed China's determination to contribute its solutions to combat terrorism globally.

⁵⁹⁷ SCO countries discuss regional security, counter-terrorism efforts, Xinhua News (Beijing) 26 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220326/94f4fab1e64447f1bdad6247d4360af1/c.html>

⁵⁹⁸ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753> (in Russian)

⁵⁹⁹ FM urges lifting economic sanctions on Afghanistan at G20 meeting, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 23 September 2022. Access Date: 2 January 2021. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202109/23/content_WS614c5c49c6d0df57f98e0ba2.html

⁶⁰⁰ FM calls for efforts to promote political settlement process in Libya, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 25 September 2021. Access Date: 2 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202109/25/content_WS614e719fc6d0df57f98e0cf2.html

⁶⁰¹ Chinese FM calls for joint efforts to remove "cancer" of terrorism, Xinhua News (Beijing) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-10/08/c_1310232478.htm

On 13 October 2021, Minister Wang said that China is accelerating to provide emergency assistance to Afghanistan worth RMB 200 million (USD 31 million) in food, winter materials, vaccines, and medicines.⁶⁰² China called on the international community for concerted efforts on various Afghan-related mechanisms to protect it from terrorism.

On 27 October 2021, Minister Wang noted on the Second Meeting of Foreign Ministers of the Neighboring Countries on Afghanistan that China is prepared to cooperate with Afghanistan's neighboring countries to help it achieve lasting peace and stability in the country.⁶⁰³ In this regard, Minister Wang proposed to expand multilateral coordination guided by the UN, strengthen counter-terrorism cooperation, and promote peace and reconstruction in accordance with the international law.

On 25 November 2021, Premier Li Keqiang announced at the 20th meeting of the Council of Heads of Government of Member States of the SCO that China will collaborate with other SCO members to further enhance political mutual trust, consolidate the basis of law enforcement and security cooperation, and collectively promote prosperity and stability in the region.⁶⁰⁴ Premier Li affirmed that China is dedicated to combat extremism and to enhance cooperation in counter-terrorism.

On 25 November 2021, External Security Commissioner of the Foreign Ministry Cheng Guoping exchanged views on global counter-terrorism cooperation with Russian Ambassador to China Andrey Denisov.⁶⁰⁵ The two sides reached the consensus in further enhancing policy communication on counterterrorism and security to steer the global counter-terrorism cooperation.

On 26 November 2021, Minister Wang exchanged opinions of the international development with foreign ministers of Russia and India via video meeting.⁶⁰⁶ Three ministers reached a consensus that China, Russia, and India share common interests and responsibilities in promoting the global stability and jointly tackling global challenges, including the COVID-19 pandemic, climate change, and terrorism through trilateral cooperation.

On 30 November 2021, the United Nations Fund for Counter-Terrorism published a report noting that China has contributed USD8,141,209 since the establishment of the UN Office of Counter-Terrorism in 2009, ranking as the 4th among all 35 donor countries.⁶⁰⁷

On 9 December 2021, Deputy Director of the Public Security Department of Xinjiang Yalkun Yakup stated in a recent interview with Xinhua News that the anti-terrorism and deradicalization efforts in Xinjiang have achieved important results, leading to effective elimination of frequent terrorist activities and rectification of religious extremism.⁶⁰⁸ Years of counter-terrorism struggle in Xinjiang has helped people of all ethnic groups achieve a much higher sense of security and stability.

⁶⁰² FM calls on G20 to contribute to Afghan peace, stability, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 2 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202110/13/content_WS61662daec6d0df57f98e18e3.html

⁶⁰³ FM calls for stronger cooperation among neighboring countries of Afghanistan for lasting peace, stability, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 29 October 2021. Access Date: 2 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202110/29/content_WS617b376ec6d0df57f98e431f.html

⁶⁰⁴ Premier calls for enhanced political mutual trust, practical cooperation among SCO members, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 2 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/premier/news/202111/26/content_WS61a01a6cc6d0df57f98e58d9.html

⁶⁰⁵ External Security Commissioner of the Foreign Ministry Cheng Guoping Meets with Russian Ambassador to China Andrey Denisov, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. https://www.mfa.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202111/t20211126_10453921.html

⁶⁰⁶ FM calls for China-Russia-India solutions for uncertain world, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 27 November 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202111/27/content_WS61a185e3c6d0df57f98e5a2a.html

⁶⁰⁷ Funding and donors, the United Nations Office of Counter-Terrorism (New York) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <https://www.un.org/counterterrorism/funding-and-donors>

⁶⁰⁸ Xinjiang Speaks: Counter-terrorism measures effective, legitimate: public security official, Xinhua News (Beijing) 9 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-12/09/c_1310361754.htm

On 21 December 2021, Commissioner Cheng exchanged views on counter-terrorism cooperation with Deputy Secretary of the Russian Security Alexander Venediktov that China stands ready to enhance cooperation with Russia in counter-terrorism and to jointly address the terrorism threat, dedicating to maintain regional and international security.⁶⁰⁹

On 22 December 2021, Assistant Foreign Minister Wu Jianghai called on the 2nd International Anti-Terrorism Symposium for strengthening international counter-terrorism dialogue and cooperation while adhering to a common, comprehensive, cooperative, and sustainable global security concept facing today's endless threats of terrorism.⁶¹⁰ To achieve this, he stated it is necessary for countries to abide by the principles of the UN Charter and give full play to the central coordinating role of UN in combatting against terrorism.

On 10 January 2022, Minister Wang expressed during the phone conversation with Kazakh Deputy Prime Minister and Foreign Minister Mukhtar Tleuberdi, that China is willing to pay tribute to the front-line law enforcement personnel who died in the fight against violence and terrorism in Kazakhstan.⁶¹¹ The enhanced cooperation between the two countries in the fields of law enforcement and security department is expected to combat terrorism and promote peace in the region.

On 12 January 2022, Minister Wang met with visiting Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) Secretary-General Nayef bin Falah Al-Hajraf.⁶¹² Minister Wang said that China will continue to oppose any country's interference in the internal affairs of GCC countries under the pretext of "human rights" and oppose linking terrorism with any particular religion or ethnic group.

On 28 January 2022, State Councillor and Minister of Public Security Zhao Kezhi stressed the importance of implementing counterterrorism measures, and of efforts to maintain the positive momentum achieved on China's counterterrorism front.⁶¹³ Minister Zhao also expressed China's determination in tackling domestic terrorist activities and preventing terrorism threat from emerging through legal and international cooperation means.

On 8 March 2022, Minister Wang held a phone conversation with Pakistani Foreign Minister Shah Mahmood Qureshi. Minister Wang expressed China's firm support on Pakistan's efforts in combatting terrorism and safeguarding national security and stability.⁶¹⁴ The two sides reached consensus that Pakistan-China friendship is the guarantee of regional peace and stability.

On 25 March 2022, China attended the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) meeting which discussed regional security, countering terrorism, separatism, and extremism in the member countries.⁶¹⁵ SCO members exchanged views and identified joint measures to tackle threats to security from international terrorist organizations.

⁶⁰⁹ External Security Commissioner of the Foreign Ministry Cheng Guoping Speaks with Deputy Secretary of the Russian Security Council Alexander Venediktov on the Phone, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 21 December 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2022. https://www.mfa.gov.cn/mfa_eng/wjbxw/202112/t20211222_10474296.html

⁶¹⁰ Adapt to Changes in International Counterterrorism Landscape and Join Hands to Write a New Chapter for Counterterrorism Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 23 December 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2022. https://www.mfa.gov.cn/wjbxw_673019/202112/t20211223_10474625.shtml

⁶¹¹ FM: China firmly supports Kazakhstan in maintaining stability, stopping violence, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 10 January 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202201/10/content_WS61dc28e6c6d09c94e48a3661.html

⁶¹² FM meets with GCC secretary-general, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 12 January 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202201/12/content_WS61de27cdc6d09c94e48a37ab.html

⁶¹³ Police chief stresses need to maintain counterterrorism momentum, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 28 January 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/zhaokezhi/202201/28/content_WS61f34465c6d09c94e48a4651.html

⁶¹⁴ Chinese, Pakistani FMs hold phone talks, the State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 9 March 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202203/09/content_WS6227f2bcc6d09c94e48a64b3.html

⁶¹⁵ SCO countries discuss regional security, counter-terrorism efforts, Xinhua News (Beijing) 26 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220326/94f4fab1e64447f1bdad6247d4360af1/c.html>

On 31 March 2022, Minister Wang chaired the “Afghanistan neighbors + Afghanistan” foreign ministers’ dialogue in Tunxi, Anhui Province in east China.⁶¹⁶ Minister Wang expressed the necessity to further gather consensus and synergy to help Afghanistan effectively fight terrorism and stabilize the local situation. The meeting aims to facilitate the peaceful reconstruction of Afghanistan through joint collaboration among its neighbors.

On 31 March 2022, Minister Wang met with Uzbek Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Investments and Foreign Trade Sardor Umurzakov during the third foreign ministers’ meeting among the neighboring countries of Afghanistan.⁶¹⁷ Minister Wang expressed China’s willingness to collaboratively oppose external interference and fight against the three “evil” forces of terrorism, extremism, and separatism.

On 31 March 2022, Minister Wang met with Tajik Minister of Justice, Muzaffar Ashouriyon during the third foreign ministers’ meeting among the neighboring countries of Afghanistan.⁶¹⁸ The two sides agreed to strengthen cooperation on the “evil” forces of terrorism, extremism, and separatism in order to safeguard regional stability.

On 29 April 2022, Chinese foreign ministry spokesperson Zhao Lijian stated at a regular press briefing that fighting terrorism is a shared responsibility of the international community, calling for coordination and cooperation to combat terrorism.⁶¹⁹ His remarks were in response to the UN Security Council’s condemnation of the terrorist attack in the University of Karachi in Pakistan.

On 12 May 2022, Minister Wang reached consensus with Pakistani Foreign Minister Bilawah Bhutto Zardari on taking immediate action and effective measures to deal with a series of terrorist attacks targeting Chinese nationals in Pakistan over a period of time.⁶²⁰ Through mutual collaboration, China endeavors to support Pakistan in enhancing its counter-terrorism capability and to thwart any attempt of undermining China-Pakistan relations.

China fully complied with its commitment to engage in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying, and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats and cooperated within the framework of the UN or other multilateral counter-terrorism fora. China has provided firm verbal affirmation for the central role of the UN in coordinating international actions against terrorism within the framework of the UN Charter and in accordance with principles and norms of the international law. China has also shared dialogues and implemented concrete actions in collaborating with other BRICS members in addressing terrorism threat and maintaining both regional and international stability.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Han Xin

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to endorse the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Action Plan for implementing the BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy.

⁶¹⁶ FM chairs ‘Afghanistan’s neighbors + Afghanistan’ foreign ministers’ dialogue, the State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 1 April 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202204/01/content_WS6246c749c6d02e53353289e3.html

⁶¹⁷ FM meets with Uzbek deputy PM on bilateral ties, the State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 2 April 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202204/02/content_WS62479a5ec6d02e5335328a50.html

⁶¹⁸ FM meets Tajik Minister of Justice, the State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 2 April 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202204/02/content_WS62479e13c6d02e5335328a7c.html

⁶¹⁹ Fighting terrorism shared responsibility of international community: FM spokesperson, Xinhua News (Beijing) 29 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220429/9c9260e75f0749bf80c7bbebf8b80fae/c.html>

⁶²⁰ FM Meets Pakistani counterpart, the State Council of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 12 May 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/wangyi/202205/12/content_WS627c5a3cc6d02e533532a943.html

On 24 August 2021, Deputy Minister for State Security Zizi Kodwa MP attended two strategic meetings of BRICS which will review the activities of BRICS Working Groups on Counter Terrorism and Security in the use of Information and Technology.⁶²¹

On 5 October 2021, President Cyril Ramaphosa chaired the Summit of organ Troika of Southern African Development Community (SADC).⁶²² The summit commended members states' personnel, equipment, and financial resources during the operations of SADC Mission in Mozambique in support of the Republic of Mozambique to combat acts of terrorism and violent extremism.

On 12 October 2021, Deputy Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Alvin Botes remarked on the High-Level Commemorative Meeting of the 60th anniversary of the Non-Aligned Movement that in order to defeat the global challenge of terrorism, the international community needs to encourage the peaceful resolution of conflicts within and between countries.⁶²³

On 13 November 2021, President Ramaphosa exchanged opinions with Kenyan President Uhuru Kenyatta over the bilateral cooperation between the two countries.⁶²⁴ The two leaders expressed mutual agreement on the necessity of bringing peace to the continent engulfed in violent unrest and terrorism.

On 1 December 2021, President Ramaphosa noted on the 10th session of the Binational Commission between South Africa and Nigeria with concern of the continued instability and conflict in some parts of the continent, and in particular the threat of terrorism and extremism.⁶²⁵ He remarked that peace, stability, democracy, and good governance are key to the Africa Union's Agenda 2063.⁶²⁶

On 7 January 2022, the SADC held a virtual extraordinary summit of heads of state and government on the mission in Mozambique in combatting terrorism and acts of violent extremism in its northern Cabo Delgado province.⁶²⁷

On 12 January 2022, President Ramaphosa delivered a remark at the SADC Extraordinary Organ Troika Summit.⁶²⁸ He emphasized that because the presence of terrorism will reverse the stability and progress SADC has achieved, it cannot be allowed to continue to thrive in any corner of the region.

⁶²¹ Deputy Minister Zizi Kodwa participates in BRICS and IBSA meetings, 24-25 August, South African Government (Pretoria) 24 August 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-zizi-kodwa-participates-brics-and-ibsa-meetings-24-25-aug-24-aug-2021-0000>

⁶²² Communiqué of Extra-ordinary Summit of organ Troika of Southern African Development Community (SADC) plus the Republic of Mozambique, South African Government (Pretoria) 5 October 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022.

⁶²³ Deputy Minister Alvin Botes: 60th anniversary of Non-Aligned Movement, South African Government (Pretoria) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-alvin-botes-60th-anniversary-non-aligned-movement-12-oct-2021-0000>

⁶²⁴ SA, Kenta strengthen ties, South African News Agency (Pretoria) 23 November 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2021. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/sa-kenya-strengthen-ties>

⁶²⁵ President Cyril Ramaphosa: 10th session of the Binational Commission between South Africa and Nigeria, South African Government (Pretoria) 1 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-official-talks-during-state-visit-and-10th-session-binational>

⁶²⁶ President Cyril Ramaphosa: 10th session of the Binational Commission between South Africa and Nigeria, South African Government (Pretoria) 1 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-official-talks-during-state-visit-and-10th-session-binational>

⁶²⁷ SADC to hold an extraordinary summit on Mozambique, Independent Online (Pretoria) 5 January 2022. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/africa/sadc-to-hold-an-extraordinary-summit-on-mozambique-29a26c8b-3897-5875-972d-53752341c9fb>

⁶²⁸ President Ramaphosa: Terrorism cannot be permitted to continue to thrive, South African News Agency (Pretoria) 12 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/president-ramaphosa-terrorism-cannot-be-permitted-continue-thrive>

On 27 January 2022, President Ramaphosa exchanged opinions with Zambian President Hakainde Hichilema on the two countries' bilateral relations.⁶²⁹ They reached the consensus on the collective solidarity of the SADC community in combatting against terrorism and insurgencies.

On 4 March 2022, the National Treasury and the Department of Justice and Correctional Services announced that they were working with U.S. authorities to track down individuals who were alleged involving terrorist organization ISIS in South Africa.⁶³⁰ The Department stated that it is committed to fighting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations and is firmly determined to prohibit any fund on terrorism in South Africa's territory.

South Africa engaged in collaborative actions with other BRICS members that contribute to understanding, identifying and responding to persistent or emerging terrorist threats. It also cooperated within the framework of other multilateral counter-terrorism fora.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Han Xin

Appendix 12-A⁶³¹

Principles of BRICS Counter-Terrorism Cooperation:

- full respect for the sovereignty of the participating countries and noninterference in their internal affairs;
- commitment to the principles of international law and recognition of the central and coordinating role of the United Nations on the issues of peace and security;
- recognition of the role of regional organizations in countering the threat of terrorism;
- need for all States to refrain from organizing, instigating, facilitating, participating in, financing, encouraging or tolerating terrorist activities and to take appropriate practical measures to ensure that their territories are not used for terrorist bases or preparation or organization of terrorist acts intended to be committed against other States or their citizens;
- due consideration of national interests and priorities;
- openness, information sharing, and consensus-based decision-making;
- recognition of the decisive role of States and their competent authorities in combating terrorism and extremism conducive to terrorism with due account for national experience and countries' specificities;
- inadmissibility of using terrorist groups, or issues pertaining to countering international terrorism and extremism conducive to terrorism, for political ends;
- adoption of a comprehensive approach to combating terrorism;
- ejection of double standards on countering terrorism and extremism conducive to terrorism;
- addressing of the conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism and attach full importance to countering the extremism conducive to terrorism.

⁶²⁹ SA, Zambia cement bilateral relations, South African News Agency (Pretoria) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/sa-zambia-cement-bilateral-relations>

⁶³⁰ SA partners with US authorities to catch alleged ISIS backers, South African News Agency (Pretoria) 4 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.sanews.gov.za/south-africa/sa-partners-us-authorities-catch-alleged-isis-backers>

⁶³¹ BRICS Counter-Terrorism Strategy, BRICS Information Center (Moscow) November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-counterterrorism.html>

Goals of counter-terrorism cooperation:

- strengthen their unity in countering international terrorism and its financing;
- consider undertaking concerted measures against those involved in organizing, instigating, facilitating, participating in, financing, encouraging or tolerating terrorist activities;
- call upon all nations to take appropriate measures to prevent the use of their territories for terrorist bases or the perpetration or organization of terrorist acts intended to be committed against other States or their citizens;
- deepen their cooperation to reaffirm the support for the central and coordinating role of the UN in combating international terrorism, the need for strict and full implementation of the relevant UN Security Council resolutions related to counter terrorism, comprehensive implementation of the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy in a balanced way, and implementation of the provisions of the relevant international counter-terrorism conventions and protocols;
- counter the global threat of terrorism on the basis of the purposes and principles of the UN Charter, relevant UN Security Council resolutions and international counter-terrorism conventions and protocols, where applicable;
- improve the practical cooperation among security and law-enforcement authorities to prevent and combat terrorism, including by sharing timely and accurate information, and consider, if necessary, creating legal framework for such sharing;
- suppress the facilitation of terrorist groups, entities and associated persons by not making available to them any resources, such as human, financial, or material, including weaponry;
- undertake steps to improve relevant necessary measures to strengthen border and customs controls in order to prevent and detect the cross-border movement of terrorists, including by comprehensively using, whenever appropriate, international databases on terrorism and the consolidated list of sanctioned individuals and groups by the UN Security Council;
- utilize BRICS Counter-Terrorism Working Group to strengthen intelligence and information sharing and cooperation on terrorist organizations listed by the UN Security Council;
- pursue collectively the adoption of a Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism;
- prevent further geographical expansion of terrorism and address the threats posed by terrorists returning from conflict zones to countries of departure or traveling to third countries;
- facilitate research and development on measures to counter terrorism;
- counteract to the growing links, where applicable, between forms of transnational organized crime and terrorism;
- undertake all necessary measures to ensure that any person who participates in the financing, planning, preparation or perpetration of terrorist acts or in support of terrorist acts is brought to justice, with due respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, and that such terrorist acts are established as serious criminal offence in their domestic laws;
- enhance cooperation in the sphere of mutual legal assistance and extradition, in conformity with their domestic laws and regulations, to afford the widest measure of assistance in connection with investigation or criminal proceedings against terrorists;

- counter extremist narratives conducive to terrorism and the misuse of the Internet and social media for the purposes of terrorist recruitment, radicalization and incitement and providing financial and material support for terrorists;
- counter public calls for and incitement of terrorism and extremism conducive to terrorism;
- strengthen cooperation against the misuse of information and telecommunication technology for terrorist and other criminal purposes; create counter-narratives disrupting the propaganda of terrorist and extremist ideas conducive to terrorism;
- broaden their counter-terrorism cooperation with the United Nations, as well as the G-20 and the FATF;
- strengthen de-radicalization cooperation to address conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism by education, skills development and employment facilitation while recognizing that none of the conditions can excuse or justify acts of terrorism.
- cooperate to address the threat of terrorism in all its forms and manifestations;
- promote capacity building, including training, experience sharing, and technical cooperation in counter-terrorism efforts;
- promote public awareness and participation in counter-terrorism efforts, as well as enhancement of inter-faith and intra-faith dialogue.

13. Terrorism: Combatting Terrorism

“We commit to combating terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including the cross-border movement of terrorists, and terrorism financing networks and safe havens.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average		+0.80 (90%)	

Background

The BRICS addressed the issue of terrorism in 2011 during China’s presidency. In the Sanya declaration, the BRICS leaders committed to “strong condemnation of terrorism in all its forms and manifestations.”⁶³² In 2012, the BRICS leaders have reiterated this commitment and expressed their support for “an early finalization of the draft of the Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism in the United Nations General Assembly and its adoption by all Member States.”⁶³³ Since that support for the UN-led process on issues related to terrorism prevention has been reiterated several times – in Durban, 2013;⁶³⁴ in Fortaleza, 2014;⁶³⁵ in Goa, 2016;⁶³⁶ in Xiamen, 2017;⁶³⁷ in Johannesburg, 2018;⁶³⁸ in Brasilia, 2019;⁶³⁹ in Moscow, 2020.⁶⁴⁰

In 2016, during India’s BRICS presidency, the BRICS specified the scope of counter-terrorism cooperation. In Goa, the BRICS leaders supported and emphasized “the need for launching multilateral negotiations on an international convention for the suppression of acts of chemical and biological terrorism, including at the Conference on Disarmament.”⁶⁴¹ Also in Goa the BRICS members committed to the International Standards on Combating Money Laundering and the Financing of Terrorism and Proliferation published by the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) and called for “effective and universal implementation of FATF Consolidated Strategy on Combating Terrorist Financing.” The commitments on fight against proliferation of weapons of

⁶³² Sanya Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/chpresidency1/Sanya%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶³³ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/Fourth%20BRICS%20Summit.pdf>

⁶³⁴ Fifth BRICS Summit, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/130327-statement.pdf>

⁶³⁵ Fortaleza Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 July 2014. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

⁶³⁶ Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶³⁷ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 5 September 2017. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

⁶³⁸ Johannesburg Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

⁶³⁹ Brasilia Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

⁶⁴⁰ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶⁴¹ Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

mass destruction within the broader anti-terrorism framework and implementation of the FATF recommendations were reiterated in Xiamen in 2017⁶⁴² and in 2019 in Brasilia.⁶⁴³

During Russia's 2020 BRICS Presidency the BRICS has approved the Counter-Terrorism Strategy.⁶⁴⁴ In the concluding Moscow declaration the leaders expressed their support for fight against terrorist groups in Iraq, Yemen and Syria, condemned the terrorist attacks in Afghanistan and designated the BRICS High Representatives for Security "to lead the review of the implementation of the Strategy."⁶⁴⁵

In 2021 in New Delhi the BRICS leaders has approved the BRICS Counter Terrorism Action Plan⁶⁴⁶ and also reiterated all the commitments regarding counter-terrorism cooperation made on previous summits.⁶⁴⁷

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the BRICS members to take actions aimed at combatting terrorism in all its forms and manifestations. The commitment also specified that particular attention should be given to the cross-border movement of terrorist along with terrorism financing networks and safe havens.

The term "terrorism" itself is of dubious nature.⁶⁴⁸ The most widely used definition adopted on the general basis refers to terrorism as "criminal acts intended or calculated to provoke a state of terror in the general public, a group of persons or particular persons for political purposes are in any circumstance unjustifiable, whatever the considerations of a political, philosophical, ideological, racial, ethnic, religious or other nature that may be invoked to justify them."⁶⁴⁹

The BRICS Counter Terrorism Action Plan (here and after referred as "the Plan") embraces general actions and more specific ways to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, including cross-border movements, safe havens and terrorism financing networks.

General considerations regarding fight against terrorism suggest the follow list of actions:

- Strengthening national legal frameworks in line with the relevant UN Security Council and General Assembly resolutions on counter terrorism;
- Calling upon all nations to take appropriate measures to prevent the use of their territories for terrorist bases or the perpetration or organization of terrorist acts intended to be committed against other States or their citizens;

⁶⁴² BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 5 September 2017. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

⁶⁴³ Brasilia Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

⁶⁴⁴ BRICS Counter Terrorism Strategy, RANEP (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovaniy/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/BRICS%20COUNTER-TERRORISM%20STRATEGY.pdf>

⁶⁴⁵ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovaniy/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶⁴⁶ BRICS Counter Terrorism Action Plan, RANEP (Moscow) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovaniy/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/BRICS%20counter%20terrorism%20action%20plan%202021.pdf>

⁶⁴⁷ XIII BRICS summit – New Delhi Declaration, RANEP (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovaniy/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶⁴⁸ Negative effects of terrorism on the enjoyment of human rights, United Nations (New York) 22 January 2020. Access Date: 13 December 2021. https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/HRCouncil/AdvisoryCom/Session24/A_HRC_AC_24_CRP1.docx

⁶⁴⁹ Resolution 51/210 Measures to eliminate international terrorism, United Nations (New York) 16 January 1997. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://undocs.org/en/A/RES/51/210>

- Considering undertaking concerted measures against those involved in organizing, instigating, facilitating, participating in, financing, encouraging or tolerating terrorist activities;
- Rejecting double standards in countering terrorism and extremism conducive to terrorism;
- Promoting cooperation among the BRICS countries in combating terrorism through capacity building workshops, expert level meetings, training of experts, developing toolkits and handbooks etc.

Special attention was given to online terrorist threats. The Plan suggests the follow to be done by the BRICS nations:

- Strengthening cooperation among BRICS countries in countering misuse of internet and other information and communication technologies for propaganda, radicalization and recruitment by terrorist groups;
- Exchanging best practices in countering terrorist activities to radicalize youth including effective monitoring of illicit content online; disseminating counter-narratives and disrupting the propaganda of terrorist and extremist ideas conducive to terrorism;
- Exchanging best practices on identification of extremist and terrorist activities online and disrupting the chain of radicalization, etc.

According to the Plan, combatting the terrorist financing schemes implies but is not limited to:

- Strengthening BRICS countries' capabilities to address terrorism-organized crime nexus, where applicable, to disrupt illicit funding of terrorists;
- Cooperating in preventing movement of illegal funds across borders, freeze terrorist assets, and suppress illicit trade and trafficking in drugs, arms, cultural property and other resources;
- Exchanging information on the sources and channels of terrorist financing, including suspicious hawala operators, travel agencies, money changers etc.;
- Developing a Handbook on the Integration of Financial Intelligence and Risk Assessment and strengthening capabilities of financial and banking sectors to safeguard their activities from terrorist abuse;
- Exchanging best practices for suppressing the financing of terrorism including through emerging and new methods such as online crowd funding, digital payments, dark web, crypto currencies, etc.;
- Promoting, as appropriate, effective public-private partnerships for exchange of information on countering terrorism financing between competent national authorities and the private sector.

Regarding the cross-border movement of terrorists, the Plan proposes:

- Exchanging best practices on immigration control to monitor and disrupt the movement of terrorists through all possible entry points like airports, maritime ports and land routes;
- Exchanging national experiences in the implementation and operation of Advance Passenger Information and Passenger Name Record;
- Sharing of experience on the challenges faced in the prosecution of terrorist-fighters returnees and their family members, where applicable, and evolving a handbook of best practices on this issue;
- Implementing effective border security and management to prevent and counter the flow of known and suspected terrorists;

- Strengthening border and customs control at regular custom ports/entry points to prevent and detect cross-border movement of terrorist, illicit trafficking of cultural property, trafficking in persons, as well as the illicit trade in natural resources including gold and other precious metals and stones, minerals, charcoal and oil, and illicit trafficking in wild life, materials used in chemical, biological, nuclear and explosive materials, and for terrorist purposes;
- Enhancing the skill and capacity of Screeners in detecting document fraud and profiling at regular custom ports/entry points and sharing good practices and national experiences in this area.

The Plan does not specify actions that could be taken against terrorist safe havens. Here we employ the UN General Assembly Resolution 73/211 that calls upon all States “to deny safe haven and bring to justice or, where appropriate, extradite, on the basis of the principle of extradite or prosecute, the perpetrators of terrorist acts or any person who supports, facilitates or participates or attempts to participate in the financing, planning or preparation of terrorist acts.”⁶⁵⁰ Any action taken by the BRICS member that matches the abovementioned list of proposed steps counts contributes to this member’s compliance score.

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member should not only take steps aimed at combatting terrorism in general, including online terrorism, but at the same time some of these steps should tackle upon at least two out of three key issues specified in the commitment’s texting: combatting cross-border movement of terrorists; fighting against terrorist financing networks; and terrorist safe havens. Partial compliance means that the BRICS member takes steps against terrorist activities, but these steps fall under the most general recommendations presented in the BRICS Counter Terrorism Action Plan and tackle no more than one of the abovementioned key directions. Absence of actions taken in order to curb the cross-border movement of terrorists, terrorist financing or safe havens accompanied with at least some general counter-terrorist actions counts as partial compliance. Lack of any action that somehow contributes to fight against terrorism serves as a precondition for a “-1” score and the “no compliance” verdict.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member has taken no action against terrorist activities
0	The BRICS member has taken actions against terrorist activities and some of them matches at least ONE out of THREE key directions namely: cross-border movements; terrorist financing; and safe havens
+1	The BRICS member has taken actions against terrorist activities and some of them matches at least TWO out of THREE key directions namely: cross-border movements; terrorist financing; and safe havens

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations.

On 23 September 2021, Brazil announced that it is “willing to cooperate” to strengthen Mozambican forces that face terrorism in Cabo Delgado province, in the north of that African country.⁶⁵¹

On 21 October 2021, the Third Plenary Meeting of the International Financial Action Task Force (FATF) was held.⁶⁵² Participating delegates worked on a comprehensive agenda to strengthen global safeguards and detect,

⁶⁵⁰ Resolution 73/211 Measures to eliminate international terrorism, United Nations (New York) 14 January 2019. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <https://undocs.org/en/A/RES/73/211>

⁶⁵¹ Brasil quer cooperar no combate ao terrorismo em Cabo Delgado, DW (Berlin) 24 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.dw.com/pt-002/brasil-quer-cooperar-no-combate-ao-terrorismo-em-cabo-delgado/a-59292242>

⁶⁵² Resultados da Terceira Reunião Plenária do Gafi – Ano XXXII, Brazilian Government (Brasilia) 22 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/coaf/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/publicacoes/publicacoes-do-coaf-1/notas-do-coaf-1/resultados-da-terceira-reuniao-plenaria-do-gafi-2013-ano-xxxii>

prevent and stop the financial flows that fuel money laundering, its predicate offenses, as well as terrorism and its financing. The Plenary discussed the evolution of the situation in Afghanistan and issued a statement on the matter. The Plenary also discussed and issued a statement on the risks associated with funding Islamic State in Iraq and the Levant, Al-Qaeda and Affiliates. The Brazilian delegation was coordinated by the Financial Activities Control Council and consisted of more than a dozen national institutions, including bodies of the Executive Branch, supervisory bodies, investigation and prosecution bodies.

On 19 November 2021, National Financial System Appeals Council and the Financial Activities Control Council participated in a virtual meeting with the aim of sharing reflections and knowledge on administrative process issues sanctioning – instrument by which possible infractions to rules of an administrative or regulatory nature are determined and corresponding penalties are applied – in terms of preventing money laundering and the financing of terrorism and the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction.⁶⁵³

From 29 November-3 December 2021, Brazil participated in the meeting of the Financial Action Task Force of Latin America (GAFILAT).⁶⁵⁴ The 17 representatives at the meeting discussed measures to strengthen the regional system for the Prevention and Combat of Money Laundering and the Financing of Terrorism and the Proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction.

From 13-16 December 2021, the XIX Plenary Meeting of the Brazilian National Strategy to Combat Corruption and Money Laundering was held.⁶⁵⁵ Several issues were discussed: creating mechanisms for the direct and continuous sharing of databases, in a secure environment, among state actors responsible for preventing, detecting and repressing corruption, money laundering and the financing of terrorism; diagnosing the challenges and propose measures to improve the requirements for identifying the final beneficiary in accordance with FATF Recommendation 24 – Transparency and Corporate Ownership; identifying the challenges and propose measures to improve the control of cross-border transport of valuables in accordance with FATF Recommendation 32 - Transporters of Value; understanding, within the scope of civil society organizations, the segments and activities that pose the greatest risk to the financing of terrorism and propose measures for their mitigation and others. For each action area the Plenary Meeting appointed coordinating and collaborating bodies.

Brazil took actions on all three key dimensions of terrorism combat and prevention.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit.⁶⁵⁶ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively.

⁶⁵³ CRSFN e Coaf debatem prevenção à lavagem de dinheiro e ao financiamento do terrorismo, Government of the Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 19 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/novembro/crsfn-e-coaf-debaterem-prevencao-a-lavagem-de-dinheiro-e-ao-financiamento-do-terrorismo>

⁶⁵⁴ 44ª Plenária do Gafilat define agenda de medidas para fortalecer salvaguardas regionais em PLD/FTP, Brazilian Government (Brasília) 8 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/coaf/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ultimas-noticias/44a-plenaria-do-gafilat-define-agenda-de-medidas-para-fortalecer-salvaguardas-regionais-em-pld-ftp>

⁶⁵⁵ XIX Reunião Plenária da Estratégia Nacional de Combate à Corrupção e à Lavagem de Dinheiro, Estratégia Nacional de Combate à Corrupção e à Lavagem de Dinheiro (Brasília) 16 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://enccla.camara.leg.br/acoas>

⁶⁵⁶ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753>

The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 19-21 October 2021, the Rosfinmonitoring (Federal Financial Monitoring Service of the Russian Federation) delegation took part in FATF-led plenary session in Paris.⁶⁵⁷ The parties discussed issues related to combatting terrorist financing, illegal migrant movements and tackling threats arising due to digitalization.

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁶⁵⁸ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

On 6 December 2021, President Vladimir Putin arrived at New Delhi.⁶⁵⁹ President Putin had a round of talks with Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi on a broad agenda including effective bilateral cooperation to intensify fight against terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking. The parties agreed on deepening cooperation to facilitate further development of the regional counter-terrorist SCO-affiliated structures.

On 4 February 2022, Russia and China held a bilateral meeting and presented a joint declaration.⁶⁶⁰ The parties expressed their condemnation of terrorism in all forms and supported the centrality of the UN in forming the global counter-terrorism coalition. Also, the two countries criticized attempts to intervene into domestic affairs under cover of counter-terrorism.

On 9 March 2022, member states of the Collective Security Treaty Organization issued a joint declaration on bettering coordination to eradicate chemical terrorism.⁶⁶¹ The parties claimed to enhance cooperation to prevent intrusion of terrorist groups possessing knowledge of how to produce and utilize chemical weaponry. The parties also expressed firm support for the Organization for Prohibition of Chemical Weapons as the key multilateral cooperation platform on the issue.

Russia actively participates in multilateral initiatives on terrorist-related issues led by the relevant international bodies and also engages in bilateral talks on the matter.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁶⁵⁷ Ob Uchastii V Plenum FATF (On Participating in FATF Plenary Session), Federal Financial Monitoring Service of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 23 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 4 February 2022. <https://www.fedrfm.ru/releases/5379>

⁶⁵⁸ Sovmestnoe zjavlenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsultacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/

⁶⁵⁹ Sovmestnoe zjavlenie po itogam XXI rossijsko-indijskogo sammita «Rossija – Indija: partnjorstvo vo imja mira, progressa i procvetanja» (Russia – India Joint Declaration “Partnership for Peace, Progress and Prosperity”), President of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 6 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <http://kremlin.ru/supplement/5745>

⁶⁶⁰ Russia – China joint declaration on international affairs in the new age and global sustainable development, RG.RU 6 February 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://rg.ru/2022/02/06/sovmetnoe-zajavlenie-rf-i-kr.html>

⁶⁶¹ Collective Security Treaty Organization members signed a joint declaration on bettering cooperation to prevent the spread of chemical weapons, the Hague, Commonwealth of the Independent States 11 March 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://e-cis.info/news/566/98866/>

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit.⁶⁶² The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁶⁶³ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

On 6 December 2021, Russian President Vladimir Putin arrived at New Delhi.⁶⁶⁴ Prime Minister Narendra Modi and President Putin discussed a broad agenda including effective bilateral cooperation to intensify fight against terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking. The parties agreed on deepening cooperation to facilitate further development of the regional counter-terrorist SCO-affiliated structures.

India actively participates in multilateral initiatives on terrorist-related issues led by the relevant international bodies and also engages in bilateral talks on the matter.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit.⁶⁶⁵ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

⁶⁶² Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753>

⁶⁶³ Sovместnoe zavajvenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsul'tacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/

⁶⁶⁴ Sovместnoe zavajvenie po itogam XXI rossijsko-indijskogo sammita «Rossija – Indija: partnjorstvo vo imja mira, progressa i procvetanija» (Russia – India Joint Declaration “Partnership for Peace, Progress and Prosperity”), President of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 6 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <http://kremlin.ru/supplement/5745>

⁶⁶⁵ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753> (in Russian)

On 13 October 2021, representatives of 15 countries took part in an international workshop on counter-terrorism cooperation issues held in Guangzhou.⁶⁶⁶ Nearly 100 scholars, officials and reporters attended the meeting.

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁶⁶⁷ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

On 4 February 2022, Russia and China held a bilateral meeting and presented a joint declaration.⁶⁶⁸ The parties expressed their condemnation of terrorism in all forms and supported the centrality of the UN in forming the global counter-terrorism coalition. Also, the two countries criticized attempts to intervene into domestic affairs under cover of counter-terrorism.

On 7 February 2022, China and Kyrgyzstan held a meeting on bilateral cooperation issues.⁶⁶⁹ The parties discussed various topics, including fight against terrorism and organized crime.

China actively participates in multilateral initiatives on terrorist-related issues led by the relevant international bodies covering all three key dimensions of the commitment.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment to combat terrorism in all its forms and manifestations

On 12 January 2022, the South African Development Community (SADC) announced a plan to support Mozambique in dealing with instability caused by terrorist activities.⁶⁷⁰ The SADC's decision to provide the country with economic and social support followed the resolution adopted by the bloc's Organ on Politics, Defense and Security Cooperation chaired by President Cyril Ramaphosa.

On 23 February 2022, South Africa took part in the UN-backed multilateral discussion on terrorist threat in Eastern and Southern Africa alongside participants from the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Kenya,

⁶⁶⁶ Scholars, government officials call for joint response and abandoning double standards in fighting against global terrorism, Global Times (Guangzhou) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 4 February 2022. <https://www.globaltimes.cn/page/202110/1236366.shtml>

⁶⁶⁷ Sovmestnoe zavajlenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsul'tacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/ (in Russian)

⁶⁶⁸ Russia – China joint declaration on international affairs in the new age and global sustainable development, RG.RU 6 February 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://rg.ru/2022/02/06/sovmetnoe-zaiavlenie-rf-i-kr.html>

⁶⁶⁹ Xi Jinping and Sadyr Jarapov agreed on cooperation in agriculture, transport and security, CGTN 7 February 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://russian.cgtn.com/n/BfJIA-IA-BcA/EJFJAA/index.html>

⁶⁷⁰ South African bloc commits to support Mozambique in fighting terrorism, Anadolu Agency (Malawi) 12 January 2022. Access Date: 27 January 2022. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/africa/south-african-bloc-commits-to-support-mozambique-in-fighting-terrorism/2472453>

Mozambique, Somalia, and Tanzania.⁶⁷¹ During a two-part training course, the participants discussed specific challenges they have faced working on judicial cooperation matters, including those based on differences in languages and legal systems; besides, they noted the importance of enhancing mechanisms of cooperation in order to share information, intelligence, and evidence between states and build strong cases for prosecution.

South Africa inspires and participates in multilateral regional initiatives aimed at eradication of terrorist safe heavens within neighboring countries' territory with their full consent, but no action tackling issues of terrorist financing and movement has been founded yet.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁶⁷¹ UNODC and partners addressing growing terrorism threats in Eastern and Southern Africa, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (Maputo) 23 February 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022.
<https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/frontpage/2022/February/unodc-and-partners-addressing-growing-terrorism-threats-in-eastern-and-southern-africa.html>

14. Regional Security: Intra-Afghan Dialogue

“We stress the need to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa	-1		
Average		+0.40 (70%)	

Background

Afghanistan and its people face severe political, security and socioeconomic challenges due to ongoing regional instability and recent political events. The fall of central government in August 2021 after a long armed stand-off against Taliban and other militant and terrorist groups caused massive civil unrest and credible apprehension concerning further internal deterioration and regional instability. In September 2021, the United Nations Security Council adopted the Resolution 2596 (2021) concerning the recent developments in political situation in the country that extended the mandate of the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA) until 17 March 2022. The Council stressed “the critical importance of a continued presence of UNAMA and other United Nations Agencies, Funds and Programmes across Afghanistan, and calls upon all Afghan and international parties to coordinate with UNAMA in the implementation of its mandate and to ensure the safety, security and freedom of movement of United Nations and associated personnel throughout the country.”⁶⁷² As of the moment this guideline was commended, the UNAMA headquarters remained temporary relocated to Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan, due to personnel security considerations.⁶⁷³

The BRICS leaders first addressed the situation in Afghanistan in 2012 in Delhi Summit Declaration committing to “support Afghanistan’s emergence as a peaceful, stable and democratic state, free of terrorism and extremism” and underscoring “the need for more effective regional and international cooperation for the stabilization of Afghanistan, including by combating terrorism.”⁶⁷⁴ This commitment was reaffirmed in Durban in 2013.⁶⁷⁵ Also in 2013 the BRICS Leaders for the first time expressed their full support for the decisions made in Bonn in 2011 concerning the interior situation in Afghanistan and capacity-building measures of the country’s central government. In 2014 in Fortaleza the BRICS leaders committed again “to remain engaged in Afghanistan during the transformation decade (2015-2024), as enunciated at the Bonn International Conference in December 2011.”⁶⁷⁶

⁶⁷² Resolution 2596 (2021), United Nations (New York) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

[https://undocs.org/en/S/RES/2596\(2021\)](https://undocs.org/en/S/RES/2596(2021))

⁶⁷³ UN statement on temporary relocation of the UNAMA staff to Almaty, United Nations Kazakhstan (Nur-Sultan) 20 August 2021.

Access Date: 14 December 2021. <https://kazakhstan.un.org/en/140984-un-statement-temporary-relocation-unama-staff-almaty>

⁶⁷⁴ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/inpresidency1/Fourth%20BRICS%20Summit.pdf>

⁶⁷⁵ Fifth BRICS Summit, RANEPa (Moscow) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency1/130327-statement.pdf>

⁶⁷⁶ Fortaleza Declaration, RANEPa (Moscow) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/brazpresidency2/6th_BRICS_Summit_Fortaleza_Declaration_and_Action_Plan.pdf

In 2015 during Russia's presidency the BRICS leaders called upon the international community "to remain engaged in Afghanistan and fulfill its long-term commitments on civilian and security assistance, including strengthening its security forces' capability."⁶⁷⁷

In 2016 in Goa declaration the BRICS leaders expressed "deep concern at the persisting security challenges in Afghanistan and significant increase in terrorist activities in Afghanistan" and reaffirmed "support to the efforts of the Afghan Government to achieve Afghan-led and Afghan-owned national reconciliation and combat terrorism, and readiness for constructive cooperation in order to facilitate security in Afghanistan, promote its independent political and economic course, becoming free from terrorism and drug trafficking."⁶⁷⁸ The BRICS commitment to "Afghan-led and Afghan-owned" peace and national reconciliation has been affirmed again in 2017 in Xiamen,⁶⁷⁹ in 2018 in Johannesburg,⁶⁸⁰ in 2019 in Brasilia,⁶⁸¹ and in 2020 in Moscow.⁶⁸²

In 2021 during India's presidency the BRICS members stressed "the need to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country" along with "the need to address the humanitarian situation and to uphold human rights, including those of women, children and minorities."⁶⁸³

Commitment Features

Following the commitment's reading, the BRICS countries' pledge to facilitate an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue. In this regard, we expect the BRICS members to support intra-Afghan process bringing all sides to the negotiations on an inclusive and representative government and transition to stability, law and order in the country. In practice, it means that the BRICS member could participate in bilateral and multilateral talks, meetings, conferences, workshops, etc. that touches upon issues relating to the interior situation in Afghanistan. Unilateral support for the Afghani government, e.g. engaging in joint training, expertise provision and technical support is also regarded as compliant with the commitment under consideration.

A major component of the transition to stability and order would be the country's economic stabilization. In this regard the BRICS are expected to help with injecting assistance, getting access to the Afghan central bank's foreign reserves blocked in the US, supporting economic and social development. Actions aimed at solving the issues related to interior economic and social development may take the form of: providing official development assistance of any scope and in any form to Afghanistan; granting trade preferences regarding goods originating from Afghanistan; providing access to international financing; entering bilateral and multilateral agreements concerning trade and investment cooperation; support in the form of educational grants and scholarships to Afghan nationals, etc.

Another dimension of the issue is facilitation of the regional security by combatting drug trafficking, terrorist activities and extremism. In this regard, the BRICS member is required to demonstrate its full support to the regional multilateral initiatives that counter the abovementioned threat. Support could come in a form of

⁶⁷⁷ VII BRICS Summit Ufa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 14 December 2021.
https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency2/Declaration_eng.pdf

⁶⁷⁸ Goa Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 16 October 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/indianpresidency2/Goa%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶⁷⁹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 4 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/2017/mEsqRkedzqYLDwXo6AbZnCkmAo9Xta3d.pdf>

⁶⁸⁰ 10th BRICS Summit Johannesburg Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 27 July 2018. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/sapresidency2/JOHANNESBURG_DECLARATION.pdf

⁶⁸¹ 11th BRICS Summit – Brasilia Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/BRICS_new_downloadings/2019/11th_BRICS_Summit_eng.pdf

⁶⁸² XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-rossijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2020/XII%20BRICS%20Summit%20Moscow%20Declaration.pdf>

⁶⁸³ XIII BRICS Summit – New Delhi Declaration, RANEPА (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 14 December 2021.

<https://www.ranepa.ru/ciir/sfery-issledovanij/briks/dokumenty-briks/briks-indijskoe-predsedatelstvo-2021-g/XIII%20BRICS%20Summit-%20New%20Delhi%20Declaration.pdf>

participation in multilateral discussion, engaging with relevant intra-governmental bodies, sharing of important information with regional partners, etc.

Finally, tackling humanitarian crisis in crucial for the country’s stabilization. Humanitarian assistance may include relief efforts inside the country and assistance to refugees that have left the country in their accommodation in new hosting countries and voluntary repatriation to.

To achieve a full compliance (+1) score, the BRICS member must demonstrate support for the government of Afghanistan in its efforts to ensure peace, security and the rule of law, participate in regional initiatives to combat drug trafficking, terrorist activities and extremism, assist the country in social and economic development and grant humanitarian assistance. Actions that match at least one of the abovementioned commitment’s components stand as a precondition for granting a 0 score meaning partial compliance. Lack of any actions regarding the situation in Afghanistan and the region leads to a –1 score or no compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not demonstrate support for the government of Afghanistan and does not address issues relating to regional security, social and economic development, and humanitarian situation.
0	The BRICS member has either demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan OR addressed issues relating to regional security OR social and economic development OR humanitarian situation
+1	The BRICS member has demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan AND addressed issues related to regional security, social and economic development, and humanitarian situation

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.

On 21 September 2021, President Jair Bolsonaro in his speech at the United Nations General Assembly opening session said that “Future of Afghanistan is of deep concern to Brazil” and that the country will “grant humanitarian visas to Afghan Christians, women, children and judges.”⁶⁸⁴

On 1 December 2021, it was announced that to implement Interministerial Ordinance No. of human rights or international humanitarian law in Afghanistan, the Brazilian government granted 339 visas, or nearly four visas a day.⁶⁸⁵ It was also reported that additional 393 visa applications were under review. The interviews were conducted by the Brazilian Embassies in Islamabad, Tehran, Moscow, Ankara, Doha and Abu Dhabi

On 26 January 2022, at the UN Security Council meeting Brazilian representative to the UN João Genésio de Almeida Filho said that “The international community cannot turn a blind eye to the Afghan people at this time of need.”⁶⁸⁶ He reported that as part of international efforts, Brazil established a humanitarian visa policy

⁶⁸⁴ Palavras do Senhor Presidente da República na abertura do Debate Geral da LXXVI Sessão da Assembleia Geral das Nações Unidas – 21 de setembro de 2021, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 21 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/centrais-de-conteudo/publicacoes/discursos-artigos-e-entrevistas/presidente-da-republica/presidente-da-republica-federativa-do-brasil-discursos/palavras-do-senhor-presidente-da-republica-na-abertura-do-debate-geral-da-lxxvi-sessao-da-assembleia-geral-das-nacoes-unidas-2021-21-de-setembro-de-2021>

⁶⁸⁵ Vistos humanitários para afegãos - 1º de dezembro de 2021, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 1 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 3 February 2022. https://www.gov.br/mre/pt-br/canais_atendimento/imprensa/notas-a-imprensa/vistos-humanitarios-para-afegaos-1deg-de-dezembro-de-2021

⁶⁸⁶ With Afghanistan ‘Hanging by a Thread’, Security Council Delegates Call on Taliban to Tackle Massive Security, Economic Concerns, Respect Women’s Equal Rights, United Nations (New York) 26 January 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <https://www.un.org/press/en/2022/sc14776.doc.htm>

with a focus on women and girls. He called the Council to go beyond the steps laid out in resolution 2516 (2021). He went on to call upon the de facto authorities to form an inclusive Government with the participation of women and ethnic and religious minorities; ensure respect for women's right to work, and girls' free access to education at all levels; adhere to the principles of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and related agreements; and take credible action to prevent the use of Afghan territory by terrorist organizations.

Brazil has demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan and addressed issues related to humanitarian situation, however no actions to promote regional security, social and economic development were registered yet.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit⁶⁸⁷ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

From 21 to 22 September 2021, in Kabul a multilateral meeting on recent events in Afghanistan took place. Representatives of Russia, China and Pakistan took part in the meeting.⁶⁸⁸ The parties discussed a wide range of issues related to maintaining peace and security in the region amid the interior situation in Afghanistan. The participants agreed on enhancing cooperation to ensure stability of the country and prosperity of its people.

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁶⁸⁹ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

⁶⁸⁷ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753>

⁶⁸⁸ O vstrechah v Kabule specpredstavitelej Rossii, Kitaja i Pakistana po Afganistanu (On Meeting of Russia, China and Pakistan Special Representatives Meeting in Kabul), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 22 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1778012/

⁶⁸⁹ Sovmestnoe zjavlenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsul'tacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/

On 18 November 2021, Russia has sent the first humanitarian aid batch to Afghanistan.⁶⁹⁰ 36 tons of food supplies including oils and flavor as well as blankets were delivered to Kabul. More than 200 Russian nationals and students from Afghanistan studying in Russia left the country and set back to Moscow.

On 1 December 2021, Russia has sent the second humanitarian aid batch to Afghanistan.⁶⁹¹ 36 tons of food supplies including flavor, sugar and tea were delivered to Kabul.

On 18 December 2021, Russia has sent the third humanitarian aid batch to Afghanistan.⁶⁹² Russia's special air mission has delivered about 36 tons of aid including medicines and foods.

On 31 March 2022, the foreign ministers of China, Russia, Iran, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan held a multilateral meeting in Tunxi, Anhui Province in China.⁶⁹³ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan. The participants concluded the meeting with the joint Declaration in support of "Afghan-led, Afghan-owned" reconciliation process.

Russia has demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan, helped students from Afghanistan, contributed to promotion regional security by participating in multilateral talks, and also granted humanitarian aid in food and medical supplies.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit.⁶⁹⁴ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁶⁹⁵ The parties

⁶⁹⁰ Kommentarij oficial'nogo predstavitelja MID Rossii M.V.Zaharovoj ob okazanii gumanitarnoj pomoshhi Afganistanu i vyvoze iz Afganistana grazhdan Rossii, Armenii, Belarusi i Ukrainy (Russian Foreign Ministry Spokeperson Zakharova to Comment on Humanitarian Assistance to Afghanistan and Rescuing Russian, Armenian, Belarussian and Ukrainian Nationals), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 19 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1786502/

⁶⁹¹ O dostavke vtoroj partii rossijskoj gumanitarnoj pomoshhi v Afganistan i vyvoznyh rejsah iz Kabula (Russia to Deliver Second Batch of Humanitarian Aid to Kabul), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 02 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1788546/

⁶⁹² O dostavke tret'ej partii rossijskoj gumanitarnoj pomoshhi v Afganistan i vyvoznyh rejsah iz Kabula (Russia to Deliver Third Batch of Humanitarian Aid to Kabul), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1791317/

⁶⁹³ Joint Statement of the Third Foreign Ministers' Meeting Among the Neighboring Countries of Afghanistan, Mission of the People's Republic of China to the European Union (Brussels) 31 March 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. http://eu.china-mission.gov.cn/eng/mhs/202203/t20220331_10658230.htm

⁶⁹⁴ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753>

⁶⁹⁵ Sovместnoe zavajlenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsul'tacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/

discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

On 8 January 2022, India has sent medical supplies to Afghanistan to help in improving basic health services in the country.⁶⁹⁶ India provided more than 500,000 doses of COVID-19 vaccines to Afghanistan.

India has demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan, contributed to promotion regional security by participating in multilateral talks, and also granted humanitarian aid in medical supplies.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.

On 17 September 2021, the members of Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO) held the 20th summit.⁶⁹⁷ The parties adopted a joint declaration on combatting international terrorism. The SCO states agreed on continuing joint counter-terrorist exercises to fight terrorism, extremism and drug trafficking more effectively. The participants also expressed their support for the United Nations-led counter-terrorist actions and peacekeeping activities.

From 21 to 22 September 2021, in Kabul a multilateral meeting on recent events in Afghanistan took place.⁶⁹⁸ Representatives of Russia, China and Pakistan took part in the meeting. The parties discussed a wide range of issues related to maintaining peace and security in the region amid the interior situation in Afghanistan. The participants agreed on enhancing cooperation to ensure stability of the country and prosperity of its people.

On 30 September 2021, China donated emergency aid to Afghanistan including blankets, down jackets and other winter supplies.⁶⁹⁹

On 20 October 2021, the third meeting of Russia, China, Pakistan, Iran, India, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Turkmenia, Uzbekistan and the provisional government of Afghanistan took place in Moscow.⁷⁰⁰ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan and regional peace and security. The discussion's results were summarized in the joint declaration. The participants expressed respect for sovereignty, territorial integrity and independency of Afghanistan and committed to provide the country with necessary help on its way to prosperity, stability and elimination of existing threats including drug trafficking, terrorism and extremism. The

⁶⁹⁶ Afghanistan receives Indian medical relief supplies, Xinhua (Kabul) 8 January 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220108/31befccb344847a39705ec8e9b8bb090/c.html>

⁶⁹⁷ Strany ShOS prinjali sovместnuju deklaraciju (SCO Countries to Adopt Joint Declaration), TASS (Dushanbe) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <https://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/12433753>

⁶⁹⁸ O vstrechah v Kabule specpredstavitelej Rossii, Kitaja i Pakistana po Afganistanu (On Meeting of Russia, China and Pakistan Special Representatives Meeting in Kabul), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 22 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1778012/ (in Russian)

⁶⁹⁹ China donates emergency supplies to Afghanistan, Xinhua (Kabul) 30 September 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-09/30/c_1310218999.htm

⁷⁰⁰ Sovместnoe zavajlenie uchastnikov Moskovskogo formata konsul'tacij po Afganistanu, Moskva, 20 oktjabrja 2021 goda (Moscow Consultative Format Participants Joint Declaration on Afghanistan, 20 October 2021, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 25 January 2022. https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/news/1784139/ (in Russian)

parties addressed the Talib government of Afghanistan and urged the counterparts to maintain peaceful and constructive stance on regional matters.

On 21 November 2021, China has sent a special freight train to Afghanistan containing more than 1,000 tons of humanitarian aid including daily necessities.⁷⁰¹

On 6 December 2021, China has provided more than 500 tons of food supplies and clothing to Afghanistan.⁷⁰² The humanitarian batch was delivered to the border city of Hairatan in northern Balkh province.

On 8 December 2021, China has delivered 3 million doses of COVID-19 vaccines and medical supplies to Afghanistan.⁷⁰³

On 14 December 2021, the second aid of Chinese-provided winter supplies has reached Afghanistan.⁷⁰⁴ The batch includes blankets and coats (more than 100,000 items in total) and food rations.

On 22 December 2021, China delivered humanitarian aid to Afghanistan that would be distributed among the local population by the Afghan Red Crescent foundation.⁷⁰⁵ Besides medical equipment, China provided a batch of school bags for school children.

On 1 January 2022, China has delivered humanitarian aid to Afghanistan's northern Jawzjan province.⁷⁰⁶ More than 500 local families would receive China-donated humanitarian batches.

On 10 January 2022, China addressed the United States to lift economic sanctions on Afghanistan.⁷⁰⁷ At the moment the US freezes Afghanistan's assets. China expressed concerns about the country's interior situation suffering from unilateral sanctions amid recent natural disasters.

On 17 March 2022, China delivered another batch of humanitarian assistance to Afghanistan via the Afghan Red Crescent Society.⁷⁰⁸ China has donated more than 131 tons of flour enough that grants approximately 25 kilo per person in need.

On 31 March 2022, the foreign ministers of China, Russia, Iran, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan held a multilateral meeting in Tunxi, Anhui Province in China.⁷⁰⁹ The parties discussed issues related to situation in Afghanistan. The participants concluded the meeting with the joint Declaration in support of "Afghan-led, Afghan-owned" reconciliation process.

⁷⁰¹ China offers winter supplies in aid of Afghanistan, Xinhua (Urimqi) 21 November 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-11/21/c_1310324308.htm

⁷⁰² China-donated humanitarian aid arrives in Afghanistan: official, Xinhua (Mazar-i-Sharif) 06 December 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-12/06/c_1310354165.htm

⁷⁰³ Afghanistan receives new batch of China-donated COVID-19 vaccines, Xinhua (Kabul) 09 December 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-12/09/c_1310361423.htm

⁷⁰⁴ Afghanistan receives second batch of China-donated winter supplies, Xinhua (Kabul) 14 December 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/asiapacific/2021-12/14/c_1310370777.htm

⁷⁰⁵ Afghanistan receives new batch of China-donated supplies, Xinhua (Kabul) 22 December 2021. Access Date: 25 January 2022. http://www.news.cn/english/2021-12/22/c_1310387291.htm

⁷⁰⁶ China-donated aid distributed among destitute families in Afghanistan's Jawzjan province, Xinhua (Shiberghan) 1 January 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220101/c900fd82ab20451d883e46697205326e/c.html>

⁷⁰⁷ China urges U.S. to lift unilateral sanctions on Afghanistan, Xinhua (Beijing) 10 January 2022. Access Date: 25 January 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220110/6867820dbb5c486998629264e499cc2f/c.html>

⁷⁰⁸ New batch of China-donated supplies arrive in Afghanistan, Xinhua (Kabul) 17 March 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220317/393288fc38a843e791888196d802cb41/c.html>

⁷⁰⁹ Joint Statement of the Third Foreign Ministers' Meeting Among the Neighboring Countries of Afghanistan, Mission of the People's Republic of China to the European Union (Brussels) 31 March 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. http://eu.china-mission.gov.cn/eng/mhs/202203/t20220331_10658230.htm

On 23 April 2022, Ministry for Refugees and Repatriation Affairs of Afghanistan started to distribute China-donated humanitarian assistance to local people in need.⁷¹⁰ China delivered food batch enough to provide 50 kilos of rice to each of 1500 destitute Afghan nationals.

On 9 May 2022, China cooperated with the United Nations Refugee Agency to distribute another batch of humanitarian supplies for local vulnerable groups – kitchenware, blankets, gas tanks, etc.⁷¹¹

China has demonstrated support for the government of Afghanistan, raised the issue of economic sanctions against Afghanistan on international fora, contributed to promotion regional security by participating in multilateral talks, and also granted humanitarian aid in food and medical supplies.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: -1

South Africa has not complied with the commitment to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country.

No action taken by South Africa to contribute to fostering an inclusive intra-Afghan dialogue so as to ensure stability, civil peace, law and order in the country has been found within the monitoring period. Also it's should be noted that shortly before the BRICS summit in New Delhi, on 1 September 2021 the Government announced that it cannot accommodate refugees from Afghanistan en route to their final destination explaining that the country “is already home to a substantial number of refugees and is seized with addressing their needs.”⁷¹²

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.⁷¹³

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

⁷¹⁰ 1,500 destitute Afghans receive China-donated humanitarian assistance, Xinhua (Kabul) 23 April 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220423/ed75b9f17ba34171857b407606677a35/c.html>

⁷¹¹ China, UNHCR distribute humanitarian supplies to Afghanistan, Xinhua (Kabul) 11 May 2022. Access Date: 29 May 2022. <https://english.news.cn/20220511/461e013db6c242f38c2c11878e887d82/c.html>

⁷¹² South Africa is unable to receive Afghan refugees, Department of International Relations and Cooperation (Pretoria) 01 September 2021. Access Date: 26 January 2022. <http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/2021/afgh0901.htm>

⁷¹³ This score of non-compliance was determined after searching the following websites: <https://www.thepresidency.gov.za/>; <http://www.dirco.gov.za/>; <https://www.gov.za/>; <https://www.greengazette.co.za/>

15. Crime and Corruption: International Anti-Corruption

“We reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia		0	
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa	-1		
Average		+0.40 (70%)	

Background

The United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) entered into force on 14 December 2005 and is the only legally binding universal anti-corruption instrument.⁷¹⁴ This Convention focuses on preventive measures, criminalization and law enforcement, international cooperation, asset recovery and technical assistance, and information exchange.

The UNCAC has 187 parties. Brazil signed the UNCAC on 9 December 2003 and ratified it on 15 June 2005.⁷¹⁵ China signed the UNCAC on 10 December 2003 and ratified it on 13 January 2006. India signed the UNCAC on 9 December 2005 and ratified it on 9 May 2011. Russia signed the UNCAC on 9 December 2003 and ratified it on 9 May 2006. and South Africa signed the UNCAC on 9 December 2003 and ratified it on 22 November 2004.

The UNCAC is frequently referenced at BRICS summits and meetings that address crime and corruption.⁷¹⁶ On 27 March 2013, at the Durban Summit, BRICS leaders explored the theme of “BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialization.” While corruption was not explicitly a topic of discussion, BRICS leaders acknowledged that anti-corruption is an emerging area of cooperation.

On 15 July 2014, BRICS leaders met in Fortaleza, Brazil, where they made a commitment “to combat domestic and foreign bribery, and strengthen international cooperation, including law enforcement cooperation, in accordance with multilaterally established principles and norms, especially the UN Convention Against Corruption.”⁷¹⁷ This was the first explicit reference to corruption made by BRICS leaders.

On 9 July 2015, at the Ufa Summit, BRICS leaders declared corruption a legal challenge that requires international cooperation to tackle and reaffirmed a commitment to the UNCAC.⁷¹⁸ Furthermore, BRICS leaders announced the creation of a BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption Cooperation.

⁷¹⁴ United Nations Convention against Corruption, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (New York City) 14 December 2005. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/uncac.html>

⁷¹⁵ Signature and Ratification Status, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (New York City) 6 February 2020. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/ratification-status.html>

⁷¹⁶ BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>

⁷¹⁷ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

⁷¹⁸ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 28 December 2020. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

On 1 November 2015, the BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption met for the first time.⁷¹⁹ The Group expressed its intention to work with the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group and other relevant multilateral organizations.

On 16 October 2016, at the 2016 Goa Summit, BRICS leaders met under the theme of “Building Responsive, Inclusive and Collective Solutions.”⁷²⁰ BRICS leaders stated that they will support the strengthening of international cooperation against corruption, including on issues relating to asset recovery and persons sought for corruption, and with the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group.

Before the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on 22 January 2017 in Berlin and on 9 April 2017 in Brasilia.⁷²¹ On 4 September 2017, at the Xiamen leaders’ summit, BRICS leaders declared their support for improving BRICS anti-corruption cooperation, reaffirming their commitment to experience-sharing and compiling a compendium on fighting corruption.⁷²² BRICS leaders reiterated their support for strengthening international cooperation against corruption, including through the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group, based on the UN Convention against Corruption and other international legal instruments.

On 26 February 2018, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met in Buenos Aires, Argentina.⁷²³ A subsequent meeting was convened on 26 June 2018 in Paris, France.

On 28 July 2018, BRICS leaders met in Johannesburg, where they discussed the negative impacts of corruption and its effect on economic growth. The leaders also reaffirmed their commitment to international cooperation under Chapter IV of UNCAC and committed to strengthening international cooperation under the BRICS Working Group on Anti-Corruption Cooperation, stating that “subject to our domestic legal systems, we will cooperate in an anti-corruption law enforcement, extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders and repatriation in matters relating to assets recovery and other related criminal and non-criminal matters involving corruption and call on the international community to deny safe haven to corrupt persons and proceeds of corruption.”⁷²⁴

On 28 June 2019, on the sidelines of the G20 Osaka Summit, BRICS leaders held an informal meeting and released a joint statement. The statement reaffirmed their commitment to fighting corruption, promoting international anti-corruption cooperation, strengthening legal frameworks, improving mutual efforts in prosecuting corrupt persons, and “recogniz[ing] the need to strengthen cooperation, subject to domestic legal systems, in anti-corruption law enforcement, extradition of fugitives, economic and corruption offenders, and in recovering stolen assets.”⁷²⁵

On 26 July 2019, BRICS ministers of foreign affairs and international relations met in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, where they reiterated their commitment “to strengthen[ing] the legal framework related to the resolution of

⁷¹⁹ Media Note on the Informal Meeting of the BRICS Leaders on the Margins of the G20 Summit in Antalya, BRICS Information Centre (Antalya) 15 November 2015. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/151115-antalya.html>

⁷²⁰ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

⁷²¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁷²² BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁷²³ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁷²⁴ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁷²⁵ Joint Statement on BRICS Leaders’ Informal Meeting on the Margins of G20 Summit, BRICS Information Centre (Osaka) 28 June 2019. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/190628-osaka.html>

cases of corruption, in accordance with the United Nations Convention against Corruption and other multilateral principles and norms.”⁷²⁶

On 14 November 2019, at the 2019 Brasilia Summit, BRICS leaders “reaffirmed our commitment to fight corruption, inter alia, through the strengthening of domestic legal frameworks, as appropriate, to more effectively address cases of corruption. We remain committed to adopting integrity measures in the public sector and promoting integrity standards in private enterprises and to build a stronger global commitment to a culture of intolerance towards corruption. We will maintain our ongoing efforts on anti-corruption law enforcement cooperation and returning of assets, including on civil and administrative proceedings. We will make full use of the BRICS Meeting on Asset Recovery and strengthen experience-sharing and case-cooperation on asset recovery among BRICS countries. We will enhance our exchange of views within multilateral frameworks such as UNCAC and the G20 Anti-Corruption Working Group, with the aim of joining efforts in denying safe haven to economic and corruption offenders and to facilitate the repatriation of proceeds of crime.”⁷²⁷

On 3 February 2020, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on the sidelines of the G20 Meeting of the Anti-Corruption Working Group.⁷²⁸

On 4 September 2020, BRICS ministers of foreign affairs and international relations met virtually due to the pandemic. They reaffirmed “their commitment to promote international anti-corruption cooperation and strengthen BRICS collaboration, subject to domestic legal systems, on issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on extradition of fugitives, economics and corruption offenders and in recovering stolen assets.”⁷²⁹

On 7 September 2020, the BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group met on the sidelines of the G20 Meeting of the Anti-Corruption Working Group.⁷³⁰ They met again on 19 October 2020.

On 17 November 2020, the BRICS leaders met under the theme of “BRICS Partnership for Global Stability, Shared Security and Innovative Growth.” The BRICS leaders reaffirmed their commitment to promoting international anti-corruption and to promote the UNCAC as an integral mechanism for international anti-corruption cooperation. They stated “We reaffirm our commitment to promote international anti-corruption cooperation, particularly, in light of the 2021 Special Session of the United Nations General Assembly against corruption, strengthen BRICS collaboration, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, on all issues related to anti-corruption law enforcement, including on matters related to asset recovery and denying safe haven to corrupt persons and proceeds of corruption.”⁷³¹

Commitment Features

The BRICS commitment is “We reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially

⁷²⁶ Media Statement: Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Foreign Affairs/International Relations, BRICS Information Centre (Rio de Janeiro) 26 July 2019. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/190726-foreign.html>

⁷²⁷ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

⁷²⁸ 1st Meeting of BRICS Anti-Corruption Working Group (ACWG) – on the margins of the G20 Meeting of Anti-Corruption Working Group, BRICS Russia 2020 (Riyadh) 3 February 2020. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <https://eng.brics-russia2020.ru/calendar/20200203/9811/1st-Meeting-of-BRICS-Anti-Corruption-Working-Group-ACWG--on-the-margins-of-the-G20-Meeting-of.html>

⁷²⁹ From coronavirus to terrorism to trade: What was discussed at BRICS meet, India Today (New Delhi) 5 September 2020. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <https://www.indiatoday.in/world/story/from-coronavirus-terrorism-trade-what-discussed-brics-meet-1718897-2020-09-05>

⁷³⁰ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 28 December 2020. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

⁷³¹ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.” This commitment has three main components: asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and the identification of proceeds of corruption. The breadth component includes taking action both nationally and internationally, including within multilateral frameworks.

“Reaffirm” is to “affirm again, whereby affirm is to assert strongly, state as fact, confirm or ratify a judgement.”⁷³² “Stronger cooperation and commitment to action” refers to building on previous commitments on international anti-corruption issues. The BRICS leaders made a similar commitment at the 2020 Moscow Summit reaffirming this commitment that has been on the agenda for several years, yet at the 2021 New Delhi Summit, the leader’s commitment to “stronger” cooperation and commitment to action. This means that the BRICS leaders’ commitment to undertaking more substantial and concrete actions on anti-corruption issues, including through working together with each other and other countries.

“International anti-corruption issues” refer to criminalizing bribery, illicit trade, lobbying, business integrity, development assistance, natural resources, public integrity, public procurement, tax cooperation and whistleblower protection.⁷³³ Among these are asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption, which are the focus for this commitment.

“Multilateral frameworks” refers to “a system of rules, ideas of beliefs that is used to plan or decide something”⁷³⁴ and is “involving more than two groups or countries.”⁷³⁵ Multilateral frameworks on international anti-corruption issues include the United Nations Convention Against Corruption, which is “the only legally binding universal anti-corruption instrument. The Convention covers five main areas: preventive measures, criminalization and law enforcement, international cooperation, asset recovery, and technical assistance and information exchange. The Convention covers many different forms of corruption, such as bribery, trading in influence, abuse of functions, and various acts of corruption in the private sector.”⁷³⁶ Other multilateral frameworks such as the World Bank, Financial Action Task Force and Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development also address international anti-corruption issues.

“Subject to domestic legal systems” refers to being dependent on the “law or legal system established within a state to govern events, transactions, and persons within or having a connection to that state.”⁷³⁷ “Especially” refers to “more than usual.”⁷³⁸

“Asset recovery” refers to “the process by which the proceeds of corruption transferred abroad are recovered and repatriated to the country from which they were taken or to their rightful owners.” It is estimated that developing countries lose between USD20-40 billion each year to corruption. Quoting from UNCAC, “several provisions specify how cooperation and assistance will be rendered. In particular, in the case of embezzlement of public funds, the confiscated property would be returned to the state requesting it; in the case of proceeds of any other offence covered by the Convention, the property would be returned providing the proof of ownership or recognition of the damage caused to a requesting state; in all other cases, priority consideration would be given to the return of confiscated property to the requesting state, to the return of such property to the prior legitimate owners or to compensation of the victims... Accordingly, Article 51 provides for the return

⁷³² Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 9 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

⁷³³ Topics, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (Paris) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://www.oecd.org/corruption-integrity/explore/topics/>

⁷³⁴ Framework, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/framework>

⁷³⁵ Multilateral, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/multilateral>

⁷³⁶ United Nations Convention against Corruption, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (Vienna) 2003. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/treaties/CAC/>

⁷³⁷ Domestic Law, Irwin Law (Toronto) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://irwinlaw.com/cold/domestic-law/>

⁷³⁸ Especially, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/especially>

of assets to countries of origin as a fundamental principle of this Convention. Article 43 obliges state parties to extend the widest possible cooperation to each other in the investigation and prosecution of offences defined in the Convention. With regard to asset recovery, in particular, the Article provides inter alia that ‘In matters of international cooperation, whenever dual criminality is considered a requirement, it shall be deemed fulfilled irrespective of whether the laws of the requested State Party place the offence within the same category of offence or denominate the offence by the same terminology as the requesting State Party, if the conduct underlying the offence for which assistance is sought is a criminal offence under the laws of both States Parties.’”

⁷³⁹

“Denying safe havens to corrupt persons” refers to not allowing persons involved in corruption “a place where [they] are protected from harm or danger,” specifically prosecution by law.⁷⁴⁰ Governments must cooperate to ensure that corrupt public officials are not immune or sheltered by impunity due to a lack of cross-border policy coordination. Possible measures to this end include denying entry or visas to foreign figures alleged to be corrupt.⁷⁴¹

“Identification of proceeds of corruption” refers to recognizing “any property derived from or obtained, directly or indirectly, through the commission of an offence.”⁷⁴²

For full compliance, a BRICS member must take strong action on fulfilling all three components of asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption. If a BRICS member only takes strong action on two of three components and partial action on the other, it would still be considered full compliance. If a BRICS member only takes action, strong or partial, on two of the three components, it would be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member takes strong action on one of the components, it would also be considered partial compliance. However, if a BRICS member only takes partial action on one component, it would be considered no compliance. Furthermore, a BRICS member must take both international and domestic action to earn full compliance. If a BRICS member takes action against this commitment, it is considered negative compliance.

As this commitment specifies “stronger” action, actions that are considered partial action, such as verbal reaffirmation of the commitment or attending meetings on the subject do not count towards compliance. The depth component relates to how significant the domestic and/or international actions are, but all actions must be concrete actions. Less significant actions could be contributing to existing initiatives, signing agreements, drafting a new law or policy, or making proposals. More significant actions could be those that relate to launching new projects or programs, ratifying agreements, working in partnership with or assisting other BRICS members or countries, engaging with multilateral frameworks or implementing new policies or laws.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member does not take stronger action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.
0	The BRICS member somewhat takes stronger action on international anti-corruption issues in ONE or TWO of the following areas: asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.

⁷³⁹ Convention highlights, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (New York City) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/convention-highlights.html>

⁷⁴⁰ Safe haven, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/safe-haven>

⁷⁴¹ Unmask the Corrupt: Denying Safe Haven to the Corrupt and Their Ill-Gotten Gains, Transparency International (Berlin) 2014. Access Date: 9 November 2021. http://transparency.org.my/laravel-filemanager/files/shares/Unmask-the%20Corrupt-Campaign-3/2014_UnmaskTheCorrupt_Report_EN.pdf

⁷⁴² United Nations Convention Against Corruption, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (New York City) 31 October 2003. Access Date: 9 November 2021. https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNCAC/Publications/Convention/08-50026_E.pdf

+1	The BRICS member takes strong action on international anti-corruption issues in all THREE of the following areas: asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.
----	--

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Sonja Dobson

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.

On 5 October 2021, the Administration Council for Economic Defense fined Parker Hannigin, Industria e Comercio and Mann + Hummel Brasil for cartel practices in the car filters industry.⁷⁴³ The companies involved agreed on “prices, conditions, and competitive advantages,” hindering free competition in Brazil’s independent automotive aftermarket industry. The fines amount to BRL235 million.

On 16 October 2021, the Federal Comptroller General (CGU) and the Federal Attorney General (AGU) signed a leniency agreement with Statkraft, a Norwegian State-owned hydropower company.⁷⁴⁴ Prior to Statkraft’s takeover of Desenvix Energias Renovaveis S.A. in 2015, Desenvix had made illegal payments to expedite government approvals between 2011 and 2014. Statkraft will pay BRL18 million in fines and “redress of improper advantages,” as per Brazil’s anti-corruption laws.

On 26 October 2021, the CGU and AGU announced that Rolls-Royce agreed to pay approximately USD27.8 million to settle allegations that the company had bribed government official between 2003 and 2007 in order to win contracts from Petroleo Brasileiro S.A. (Petrobras), Brazil’s national oil company.⁷⁴⁵

On 26 October 2021, Congress passed the new Administration Misconduct Law, which implements changes to the country’s anti-corruption legal framework.⁷⁴⁶ These changes include a narrower definition of misconduct, the introduction of corporate successor’s liability, and a reduction in fines and sanctions for wrongdoers, especially individuals. Most notable, however, is the introduction of *non bis in idem* (no double punishment for the same crime), a principle aligned with global anti-corruption efforts. The goal of these changes is to prevent excessive prosecution and encourage more organizations and individuals to enter leniency agreements.

On 10 November 2021, Jose Gonzalez-Valencia, a Mexican national accused of international drug trafficking, was extradited from Brazil to the United States to face criminal charges.⁷⁴⁷ Brazilian police arrested Mr. Gonzalez-Valencia in December 2017 at the request of the United States. Mr. Gonzalez-Valencia was detained in Fortaleza, Brazil, until he was extradited.

⁷⁴³ CADE fines cartel in market of car filters BRL 235 million, Ministério da Justiça e Segurança Pública (Brasília) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/cade/en/matters/news/cade-levies-fines-against-cartel-in-the-market-of-automotive-filters>

⁷⁴⁴ Statkraft signs leniency agreement in Brazil, Statkraft (Oslo) 16 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.statkraft.com/newsroom/news-and-stories/archive/2021/agreement-in-brazil/>

⁷⁴⁵ Rolls-Royce settles Brazilian bribery case, Global Investigations Review (Washington D.C.) 27 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://globalinvestigationsreview.com/anti-corruption/rolls-royce-settles-brazilian-bribery-case>

⁷⁴⁶ The New Brazilian Administrative Misconduct Law, Lefosse (São Paulo) 14 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://lefosse.com/en/noticias/the-new-brazilian-administrative-misconduct-law-2/>

⁷⁴⁷ Mexican National Extradited from Brazil to Face International Cocaine Trafficking Charge, The United States Department of Justice (Washington D.C.) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/mexican-national-extradited-brazil-face-international-cocaine-trafficking-charge>

On 11 November 2021, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Brazil began its first initiative under the Global Action for Business Integrity project.⁷⁴⁸ The project is a collaborative effort between Brazil, Columbia, Egypt, Ethiopia, Malaysia, Saudi Arabia and Uzbekistan. Brazil's first initiative involves surveying private and public organizations to collect information regarding their views on corruption and to allow them to share experiences and recommendations.

On 15 December 2021, federal law enforcement announced that it had expanded its investigation of JP Morgan Chase & Co. and Petrobras.⁷⁴⁹ In 2011, JP Morgan Chase & Co. allegedly bribed Petrobras employees to fix the price of fuel. The investigation has expanded to include four deals that occurred in 2011. If allegations are true, the parties involved would be in violation of Brazilian anti-bribery law.

On 2 February 2022, the protocol updating the 2011 Trade and Economic Cooperation agreement between Brazil and the US entered into force.⁷⁵⁰ The protocol will provide greater transparency about Brazilian regulatory practices and updates commitments on anti-corruption, including on denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identifying the proceeds of corruption.⁷⁵¹

On 14 March 2022, members of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Brazil attended an anticorruption meeting in Mexico City. Attendees discussed best practices and prioritized anti-corruption initiatives for 2022 to 2024.⁷⁵² Brazil has taken strong action to reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues in two areas: denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identifying the proceeds of corruption. The government has denied safe havens to corrupt persons in the case of Jose Gonzalez-Valencia, and has investigated and fined multiple organizations for offering or accepting proceeds of corruption.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Elisabeth Iannucci

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to take stronger action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.

On 17 September 2021, President Vladimir Putin virtually attended the 21st meeting of the Council of Heads of State of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO).⁷⁵³ The summit concluded with the establishment of

⁷⁴⁸ UNODC Brazil launched national activities in global anti-corruption project, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (Brasilia) 11 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2021. <https://www.unodc.org/lpo-brazil/en/frontpage/2021/11/unodc-brazil-launches-national-activities-in-global-anti-corruption-project.html>

⁷⁴⁹ Exclusive: Brazil bribery probe expands to four JPMorgan fuel deals - documents and sources, Reuters (RIO DE JANEIRO) 15 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://ca.finance.yahoo.com/news/exclusive-brazil-bribery-probe-expands-111342361.html>

⁷⁵⁰ Updated trade protocol between U.S. and Brazil enters into force, The Rio Times (Rio de Janeiro) 3 February 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022. <https://www.riotimesonline.com/brazil-news/brazil/updated-trade-protocol-between-u-s-and-brazil-enters-into-force/>

⁷⁵¹ U.S. – Brazil 2020 Protocol on Transparency and Trade Rules Key Facts, US Trade Representative (Washington DC) 2 February 2022. Access Date: 3 February 2022.

<https://ustr.gov/sites/default/files/files/Press/Releases/ATEC%20Protocol%20Fact%20Sheet%20-%2010.19.20.pdf>

⁷⁵² UNODC Brazil participates in an anticorruption meeting in Mexico City, UNODC (Brasília) 22 March 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <https://www.unodc.org/lpo-brazil/en/frontpage/2022/03/unodc-brazil-participates-in-anti-corruption-meeting-in-mexico-city.html>

⁷⁵³ Putin likely to join Shanghai Cooperation Organization summit in Dushanbe, says envoy, Tass (Moscow) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 20 November 2021. <https://tass.com/politics/1335657>

the Dushanbe Declaration, in which member states expressed willingness to cooperate in justice to prevent crime of transnational nature, with intent to reinforce multilateral communication of legal information.⁷⁵⁴

On 28 September 2021, the Federal Security Service of the Russian Federation released a decree expanding the definition of “foreign agents” under Act No. 102766-6, originally adopted into legislation in 2012.⁷⁵⁵ This recent amendment to the Act classifies the release of information on military activities as grounds for “foreign agent” or “undesirable organization” status.⁷⁵⁶ Entities registered under these labels are required to submit frequent reports to the Ministry of Justice on their spending, planned activities, and property use. They must undergo regular audits and are fined based on their expenditure.⁷⁵⁷

On 30 and 31 October 2021, President Putin virtually attended the 16th G20 Summit, where he addressed fellow member states and was signatory of the conference’s concluding Leaders’ Declaration.⁷⁵⁸ This reiterated G20 countries’ commitment to anti-corruption efforts through support of academia and media, denying safe haven to corrupt persons, and the prevention of concealed corruption overall.

From 15-17 November 2021, Russian authorities participated in the inaugural meeting of the Global Operational Network of Anti-Corruption Law Enforcement Authorities, or GlobE Network. Russia served as a member of the Steering Committee, which enhanced the networks understanding of the reality of corruption amongst member states.⁷⁵⁹ The meeting affirmed a commitment from members towards sharing information and resources to bolster international anti-corruption cooperation.⁷⁶⁰

On 25 November 2021, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin virtually attended the 20th meeting of the SCO Council of Heads of Government, chaired by Kazakhstan.⁷⁶¹ He addressed fellow attendees and reaffirmed Russia’s commitment to multilateral cooperation through SCO.

On 26 November 2021, Minister of Foreign Affairs Sergey Lavrov virtually attended the 18th Meeting of Russia, India and China.⁷⁶² The meeting produced a Joint Communiqué, wherein the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to implementing BRICS Summit decisions, including those concerning crime and corruption.⁷⁶³

⁷⁵⁴ Dushanbe Declaration on the Twentieth Anniversary of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India, (New Delhi) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 12 December 2021. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34275/dushanbe+declaration+on+the+twentieth+anniversary+of+the+shanghai+cooperation+organisation>

⁷⁵⁵ EU-Russia CSF Russian members as ‘Foreign Agents’ under Act No. 121-FZ (No. 102766-6), EU-Russia Civil Society Forum (Prague). Access Date: 26 November 2021. <https://eu-russia-csf.org/eu-russia-csf-russian-members-as-foreign-agents-under-act-no-121-fz-no-102766-6/>

⁷⁵⁶ Russia extends ‘foreign agents’ law to critics of military and security, The Guardian (Moscow) 1 October 2021. Access Date: 26 November 2021. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/oct/01/russia-extends-foreign-agents-law-to-critics-of-military-and-security>

⁷⁵⁷ Created and (or) distributed: Discriminatory aspects of the application of legislation on ‘foreign agents’, OVD-Info (Moscow) n.d. Access Date: 26 November 2021. <https://ovdinfo.org/ino/created-and-or-distributed#6-1>

⁷⁵⁸ G20 Rome Leaders’ Declaration, European Council: Council of the European Union (Rome) 31 October 2021. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/52732/final-final-g20-rome-declaration.pdf>

⁷⁵⁹ First GlobE Network Meeting, United Nations, 19 November 2021. Access Date: 28 December 2021. <https://globenetwork.unodc.org/globenetwork/en/network/first-network-meeting-nov.2021.html>

⁷⁶⁰ Inaugural GlobE Network meeting connects frontline anti-corruption officials from across the world, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 19 November 2021. Access Date: 28 December 2021. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/frontpage/2021/November/inaugural-globe-network-meeting-connects-frontline-anti-corruption-officials-from-across-the-world.html>

⁷⁶¹ Meeting of the SCO Heads of Government Council, The Russian Government (Moscow) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 22 December 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43901/>

⁷⁶² Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov's remarks at a meeting of RIC foreign ministers held via videoconference, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 22 December 2021. https://archive.mid.ru/en/web/guest/meropriyatiya_s_uchastiem_ministra/-/asset_publisher/xK1BhB2bUjd3/content/id/4969746

⁷⁶³ Joint Communiqué of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 22 December 2021. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/joint+communique+of+the+18th+meeting+of+the+foreign+ministers+of+the+russian+federation+the+republic+of+india+and+the+peoples+republic+of+china>

On 26 November 2021, Russian Ambassador Anatoly Antonov joined Chinese Ambassador Qin Gang in the release of a cowritten op-ed article critiquing the motives of the upcoming Summit of Democracy. They state that the online meeting of states would cause and ideological divide, as both countries were not invited based on their perceived status as autocratic, rather than democratic, states.⁷⁶⁴ The Summit, held from 9-10 December 2021 and hosted by the United States, makes several commitments to increased efforts in multilateral anti-corruption cooperation.⁷⁶⁵

On 6 December 2021, President Putin visited New Delhi for the 21st India-Russia Annual Summit.⁷⁶⁶ The two countries reaffirmed their dedication to BRICS commitments and expressed willingness to further multilateral cooperation.

From 13 to 17 December 2021, a Russian delegation participated in the 9th session of the Conference of the States parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption. Russia sponsored resolutions L7 and L10.⁷⁶⁷ The first was a commitment to increasing international cooperation amongst anti-corruption law enforcement, while the other was to foster the use of “beneficial ownership information” for the sake of asset recovery.

Russia has taken some steps to strengthen multilateral cooperation in international anti-corruption issues concerning financial corruption and denying safe haven. Russia’s actions mainly consist of reaffirming BRICS commitments in various summits and meetings, showing willingness to participate in contributions towards international frameworks and legal systems that encourage asset recovery from financial corruption and extradition of corrupt persons but not demonstrating stronger action on international anti-corruption issues

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Faye Rozario

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to take stronger action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.

On 17 September 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi virtually led the Indian delegation at the 21st meeting of the Council of Heads of State of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation (SCO).⁷⁶⁸ Minister of External Affairs Subrahmanyam Jaishankar attended the hybrid summit in person in Dushanbe, Tajikistan. The summit produced a declaration in which member states expressed willingness to cooperate in justice to prevent crime of transnational nature, with intent to reinforce multilateral communication of legal information.⁷⁶⁹

⁷⁶⁴ Russian and Chinese Ambassadors: Respecting People’s Democratic Rights, The National Interest (Washington, D.C.) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2021. <https://nationalinterest.org/feature/russian-and-chinese-ambassadors-respecting-people-s-democratic-rights-197165>

⁷⁶⁵ Summit for Democracy Summary of Proceedings, The White House (Washington, D.C.) 23 December 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2021. <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/12/23/summit-for-democracy-summary-of-proceedings/>

⁷⁶⁶ India- Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2021. https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34606/India_Russia_Joint_Statement_following_the_visit_of_the_President_of_the_Russian_Federation

⁷⁶⁷ The Ninth Session of the UNCAC Conference of States Parties, UNCAC Coalition (New York) 21 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2021. <https://uncaccoalition.org/uncac-bodies/conference-of-states-parties/cosp9/>

⁷⁶⁸ India to join SCO summit in Dushanbe today, Afghanistan affairs high on agenda, Hindustan Times (New Delhi) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 26 November 2021. <https://www.hindustantimes.com/india-news/india-to-join-sco-summit-in-dushanbe-today-afghanistan-affairs-high-on-agenda-101631837729929.html>

⁷⁶⁹ Dushanbe Declaration on the Twentieth Anniversary of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India, (New Delhi) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 12 December 2021. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34275/dushanbe+declaration+on+the+twentieth+anniversary+of+the+shanghai+cooperation+organisation>

On 20 October 2021, Prime Minister Modi stressed the importance of corruption investigation and denying safe haven to corrupt persons in a videoconference with Central Vigilance Commission and Central Bureau of Investigation officials.⁷⁷⁰

On 30 and 31 October 2021, Prime Minister Modi virtually attended the 16th G20 Summit, where he addressed fellow member states and was signatory of the conference's concluding Leaders' Declaration.⁷⁷¹ This document reiterated G20 countries' commitment to anti-corruption efforts through support of academia and media, denying safe haven to corrupt persons, and the prevention of concealed corruption overall.

On 25 November 2021, Minister Jaishankar virtually attended the 20th meeting of the SCO Council of Heads of Government, chaired by Kazakhstan.⁷⁷² He addressed fellow attendees and reaffirmed India's commitment to SCO mandates, which includes commitments to anti-corruption.

On 26 November 2021, Minister Jaishankar virtually attended the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of Russia, India and China.⁷⁷³ The meeting produced a Joint Communiqué, wherein the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to implementing BRICS Summit decisions, including those concerning crime and corruption.

On 1 December 2021, the Ministry of External Affairs released a statement announcing the country joining the G20 Troika. Under this designation, India will accede to G20 presidency on 1 December 2022, and will work with the other Troika members – Indonesia and Italy – in continuing the G20 agenda.⁷⁷⁴ This includes commitments to anti-corruption, as discussed in the 30 to 31 October 2021 G20 Summit in Rome.⁷⁷⁵

On 6 December 2021, Prime Minister Modi hosted Russian President Vladimir Putin in New Delhi for the 21st India-Russia Annual Summit. The two countries reaffirmed their dedication to BRICS commitments and expressed willingness to further multilateral cooperation.⁷⁷⁶

From 9-10 December 2021, Prime Minister Modi attended the American-hosted Summit for Democracy, where he addressed fellow attending states.⁷⁷⁷ The Summit adopted various commitments to increased efforts in multilateral cooperation, with the second thematic session of the first day being focused on corruption prevention.⁷⁷⁸

⁷⁷⁰ PM ask CVC and CBI to ensure people deceive India denied safe haven in country, The Statesman (New Delhi) 20 October 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2021. <https://www.thestatesman.com/india/pm-asks-cvc-cbi-ensure-people-deceiving-india-denied-safe-heaven-country-1503019336.html>

⁷⁷¹ G20 Rome Leaders' Declaration, European Council: Council of the European Union (Rome) 31 October 2021. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/52732/final-final-g20-rome-declaration.pdf>

⁷⁷² Address by External Affairs Minister at the 20th Meeting of the SCO Council of Heads of Government, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 28 December 2021. <https://www.mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34532/address+by+external+affairs+minister+at+the+20th+meeting+of+the+sco+council+of+heads+of+government>

⁷⁷³ Joint Communiqué of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 22 December 2021. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/joint+communique+of+the+18th+meeting+of+the+foreign+ministers+of+the+russian+federation+the+republic+of+india+and+the+peoples+republic+of+china>

⁷⁷⁴ India enters G20 Troika, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 1 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/34551/India_enters_G20_Troika

⁷⁷⁵ G20 Rome Leaders' Declaration, European Council: Council of the European Union (Rome) 31 October 2021. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/52732/final-final-g20-rome-declaration.pdf>

⁷⁷⁶ India- Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2021. https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34606/India_Russia_Joint_Statement_following_the_visit_of_the_President_of_the_Russian_Federation

⁷⁷⁷ National Statement by Prime Minister Narendra Modi at the Summit for Democracy, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 23 December 2021. http://www.mea.gov.in/SpeechesStatements.htm?dtl/34637/National_Statement_by_Prime_Minister_Narendra_Modi_at_the_Summit_for_Democracy

⁷⁷⁸ Summit for Democracy Summary of Proceedings, The White House (Washington, D.C.) 23 December 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2021. <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/12/23/summit-for-democracy-summary-of-proceedings/>

India has demonstrated repeated conviction towards anti-corruption issues and has acted in accordance with the expectations of the XIII BRICS commitments on crime and corruption. The Indian government has participated in various summits and meetings that reaffirm their commitment to multilateral cooperation and has made independent domestic statements on identifying and denying safe haven to corrupt persons. India has encouraged both domestic and international legal proceedings in favour of asset recovery from financial corruption. As the next country designated to G20 presidency, India has demonstrated an internationally recognized precedence for the group's agenda, which includes multilateral cooperation in anti-corruption. Full compliance is also based on the Indian government not having made any statements or legislative decisions that are counterintuitive to the corruption commitments.

Thus, India receives a score +1.

Analyst: Faye Rozario

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons, and identification of proceeds of corruption.

On 12 October 2021, the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection launched a national anti-corruption inspection with a focus on financial institutions and regulators.⁷⁷⁹ Over 20 officials have been investigated or penalized since the inspection began. The inspection is part of President Xi Jinping's anti-corruption campaign, which has punished over 1.5 million Chinese officials since 2012.

On 13 October 2021, prosecutors initiated a case against Wang Fuyu, former chairperson of the Guizhou provincial committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference.⁷⁸⁰ Mr. Wang was charged with accepting USD70.7 million in bribes.

On 15 November 2021, Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Zhao Lijian announced that the former President of the Bank of China Xu Goujun had been repatriated to China.⁷⁸¹ Mr. Xu had fled to China in 2001 after he allegedly embezzled approximately USD500 million.⁷⁸² Spokesperson Zhao stated that Mr. Xu's repatriation was a major achievement and demonstrates China's dedication to punish corrupt persons and recover assets. He also urged the international community to combat international corruption and crime, strengthen cooperation in international law enforcement, and refuse safe havens to corruption persons.⁷⁸³

⁷⁷⁹ China's Anti-Graft Crackdown Has Ensnared Over 20 Officials So Far, Bloomberg (New York) 3 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2022-01-04/china-s-finance-crackdown-ensnares-more-than-20-officials>

⁷⁸⁰ Former senior political advisor of Guizhou charged with bribery, China Daily (Beijing) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202110/13/WS61668d0ea310cdd39bc6eaf0.html>

⁷⁸¹ Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Zhao Lijian's Regular Press Conference on November 15 2021, Office of the Commissioner of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Hong Kong) 15 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/ce/cohk/eng/Topics/fyrbt/t1919201.htm>

⁷⁸² Suspected Ex-Ban of China Embezzler Repatriated from U.S., Finews (Singapore) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.finews.asia/finance/35764-suspected-ex-bank-of-china-embezzler-repatriated-from-u-s>

⁷⁸³ Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Zhao Lijian's Regular Press Conference on November 15 2021, Office of the Commissioner of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Hong Kong) 15 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/ce/cohk/eng/Topics/fyrbt/t1919201.htm>

On 26 November 2021, China virtually attended the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of Russia, India and China.⁷⁸⁴ The meeting produced a Joint Communiqué, wherein the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to implementing BRICS Summit decisions, including those concerning crime and corruption.

On 17 December 2021, Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Wang Wenbin delivered a speech at the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) where he affirmed the importance of the UNCAC. He stated that “China seriously fulfills its obligations under the UNCAC, holds high the banner of multilateralism, attaches great importance to international cooperation against corruption, and actively carries out cross-border corruption governance and international repatriation of fugitives and recovery of assets.”⁷⁸⁵ Spokesperson Wang also urged all countries to deny safe havens to corrupt persons.

On 8 January 2022, the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection announced that Wang Bin, the chairman of China Life Insurance, will be investigated for “serious violations of discipline and law.”⁷⁸⁶

On 11 January 2022, President Xi urged the Communist Party’s top officials to continue its anti-corruption efforts. He stated that “there will be no mercy regardless of who you are if party rules and the county’s laws are broken.”⁷⁸⁷

On 13 January 2022, Sun Lijun, a former public security minister, was charged with accepting bribes and market manipulation.⁷⁸⁸

On 13 January 2022, Tong Daochi, former party chief of southern Hainan province’s city Sanya, pleaded guilty to accepting CNY274 million in bribes and insider trading.⁷⁸⁹

On 24 February 2022, the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection published its 2021 Anti-Corruption Report announcing that in 2021 the Commission had punished 4806 people for paying bribery.⁷⁹⁰ The report referenced the UN General Assembly Special Session against corruption and emphasized the Commissions intent to strengthen international cooperating in fighting corruption. The reported also represented a policy shift from only punishing government officials who accept bribes to also punishing companies and individuals who issue the bribes.

On 22 April 2022, Zeng Changhong, a former official at the China Securities Regulatory Commission’s investor protection bureau, was arrested for accepting bribes and using her position for personal financial gain.⁷⁹¹

⁷⁸⁴ Joint Communiqué of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 22 December 2021. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/joint+communique+of+the+18th+meeting+of+the+foreign+ministers+of+the+russian+federation+the+republic+of+india+and+the+peoples+republic+of+china>

⁷⁸⁵ Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Wang Wenbin’s Regular Press Conference on December 17 2021, Embassy of the People’s Republic of China in the United States of America (Washington D.C.) 17 December 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. http://www.china-embassy.org/eng/lcibt/wjbfyrbt/202112/t20211217_10471155.htm

⁷⁸⁶ China Insurance Tycoon Next Businessman to Face Corruption Probe (Beijing) 8 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.ndtv.com/world-news/china-insurance-tycoon-wang-bin-next-businessman-to-face-corruption-probe-2696337>

⁷⁸⁷ China’s Xi Jinping to his top leadership: ‘no mercy’ in fight against corruption, South China Morning Post (Beijing) 11 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://ca.news.yahoo.com/china-xi-jinping-top-leadership-180703088.html>

⁷⁸⁸ Former Chinese security minister Sun Lijun charged with taking ‘huge’ bribes, South China Morning Post (Beijing) 13 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.scmp.com/news/china/politics/article/3163294/former-chinese-security-minister-sun-lijun-charged-taking-huge>

⁷⁸⁹ Chinese anti-corruption blitz snares another senior official, South China Morning Post (Beijing) 14 January 2022. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.scmp.com/news/china/politics/article/3163455/chinese-anti-corruption-blitz-snares-another-senior-official>

⁷⁹⁰ Top 10 International Anti-Corruption Developments for February 2022, Morrison Forester (Washington, D.C.) 24 March 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <https://www.mofo.com/resources/insights/220323-anti-corruption-development-february.html>

⁷⁹¹ China Arrests IPO ‘Big Sister’ From CSRC on Bribery Charges, Bloomberg (New York) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2022-04-22/china-arrests-ipo-big-sister-from-csrc-on-bribery-charges>

On 1 May 2022, the “Anti-Organized Crime Law” was enacted into law, stating that “Anti-organized crime work shall be conducted in accordance of the law, respect and safeguard human rights, and protect the lawful rights and interests of citizens and organizations.”⁷⁹²

China has taken strong action to reaffirm stronger cooperation and commitment to action on international anti-corruption issues in all three areas: asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons, and identification of proceeds of corruption. The government recovered assets by repatriating and prosecuting officials for embezzlement. Chinese officials publicly affirmed the importance of denying safe havens to corrupt persons and the government identified proceeds of corruption by prosecuting officials for accepting bribes.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Elisabeth Iannucci

South Africa: -1

South Africa has not complied with its commitment to taking stronger action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption.

On 14 September 2021, South Africa announced that the Special Investigating Unit found that a construction group called Aventine Group CC forged documents to fraudulently obtain a sum of ZAR15.3 million from the Limpopo Provincial Government for the construction of 192 residential areas.⁷⁹³

On 21 September 2021, the Special Investigating Unit was granted an order to freeze the bank accounts holding ZAR7.9 million of service providers hired by the Gauteng government to refurbish the AngloGold Ashanti Hospital.⁷⁹⁴ This was based on reasonable grounds to believe the funds were proceeds of unlawful activity.

On 7 December 2021, the National Council of Provinces pushed the Municipal Systems Bill supported by multiple members of Parliament.⁷⁹⁵ The bill would prevent senior officials in municipalities from gaining power while facing corrupt charges.

On 9 December 2021, the Public Service Commission along with the United Nations in Africa represented by the Office on Drugs and Crime and UN Development Programme commemorated International Anti-Corruption Day, at which the Minister for Public Service and Administration Ayanda Dlodlo delivered a speech.⁷⁹⁶ This commemoration served to celebrate the United Nations Convention against Corruption signed in 2003.

⁷⁹² The Complexities of China’s Struggle for Justice, *The Diplomat* (Washington D.C.) 12 May 2022. Access Date: 12 May 2022 <https://thediplomat.com/2022/05/the-complexities-of-chinas-struggle-for-justice/>

⁷⁹³ Special Investigating Unit investigates tender for construction of Talana Shacks in Limpopo, South African Government (Johannesburg) 14 September 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/special-investigating-unit-investigates-tender-construction-talana-shacks-limpopo-14-sep>

⁷⁹⁴ Special Investigating Unit granted order to freeze service providers bank accounts, South African Government (Johannesburg) 21 September 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/siu-granted-order-21-sep-2021-0000>

⁷⁹⁵ MPs approve bill to prevent corruption by officials in municipalities (Johannesburg) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2021. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/mps-approve-bill-to-prevent-corruption-by-officials-in-municipalities-718ea850-0372-429a-a359-0122b0322a34>

⁷⁹⁶ Minister Ayanda Dlodlo delivers keynote address at commemoration of International Anti-Corruption Day, 9 Dec, South African Government (Johannesburg) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-ayanda-dlodlo-deliver-keynote-address-commemoration-international-anti-corruption>

On 9 February 2022, Minister of Justice Ronald Lamola established two additional specialised commercial crime courts in order to increase efforts to combat corruption.⁷⁹⁷ These courts aim to target COVID-19 corruption/procurement irregularities.

South Africa did not take stronger action on international anti-corruption issues, including within multilateral frameworks, subject to domestic legal systems, especially on matters related to asset recovery, denying safe havens to corrupt persons and identification of proceeds of corruption. South Africa took less significant actions such as commemorating International Anti-Corruption Day and the actions it did take towards anti-corruption were not within a multilateral framework nor on an international level.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Pantéa Jamshidi Nouri

⁷⁹⁷ Minister Ronald Lamola spearheads establishment of additional commercial crimes courts to fight corruption, South African Government (Johannesburg) 9 February 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022.
<https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-ronald-lamola-spearheads-establishment-additional-commercial-crimes-courts-fight>

16. Environment: Global Biodiversity Framework

“We [stress the importance and] support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the [Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)] in a balanced way.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil		0	
Russia		0	
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average		+0.40 (70%)	

Background

The environment has been discussed at the BRICS leaders’ summits since they first met in 2009, but it was not a significant focus for many years. In 2009, the BRICS leaders stated, “the implementation of...multilateral environmental agreements, should be a major vector in the change of paradigm of economic development.”⁷⁹⁸ At the 2010 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS leaders discussed environmentally friendly technologies for energy uses and creating jobs.⁷⁹⁹ At the 2011 summit, China, Russia, India and South Africa stated their desire to work with Brazil as the host of the 2012 UN Conference on Sustainable Development on environmental protection.⁸⁰⁰

At the 2012 New Delhi Summit, the BRICS leaders underlined the importance of environmental protection and viewing environmental issues through a sustainable development lens.⁸⁰¹ In 2013, the environment was not in the BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation communique.⁸⁰² At the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the environment was briefly mentioned in the context of “economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development” and “clean and environmentally sound technologies.”⁸⁰³

The first meeting of the BRICS Environment Ministers took place on 22 April 2015. At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the BRICS leaders supported “the establishment of a platform for sharing environmentally sound technologies as a new international mechanism for public-private partnerships that can assist in addressing environmental challenges in our countries.”⁸⁰⁴

The BRICS Environment Ministers met again in 2016 and adopted the Goa Statement on the Environment. At the 2016 Goa Summit, the BRICS leaders also welcomed the Goa Statement on the Environment, including

⁷⁹⁸ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries’ Leaders, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-leaders.html>

⁷⁹⁹ 2nd BRIC Summit of Heads of State and Government: Joint Statement, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 April 2010. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100415-leaders.html>

⁸⁰⁰ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html>

⁸⁰¹ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html>

⁸⁰² BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Development, Integration and Industrialisation, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 27 March 2013. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/130327-statement.html>

⁸⁰³ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 9 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

⁸⁰⁴ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 12 November 2021. [brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html](http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html)

particularly “the decision to share technical expertise in the areas of abatement and control of air and water pollution, efficient management of waste and sustainable management of bio-diversity...[and] recognise[d] the importance of participation by BRICS countries in environmental cooperation initiatives, including developing a platform for sharing environmentally sound technologies.”⁸⁰⁵

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS leaders discussed the environment in terms of sustainable development, agreeing to “take concrete actions to advance result-oriented cooperation in such areas as prevention of air and water pollution, waste management and biodiversity conservation.”⁸⁰⁶

At the 2018 Johannesburg Summit, the BRICS leaders committed to “strengthen BRICS cooperation in energy, especially in transitioning to more environmentally sustainable energy systems supportive of the global sustainable development agenda, balanced economic growth and the collective socio-economic wellbeing of [their]our citizens. We continue to strive toward universal energy access, energy security, energy affordability, reduced pollution and environmental conservation.”⁸⁰⁷

In 2019, the BRICS Environment Ministers met for the 5th time, agreeing to the BRICS Ministers of Environment’s Decision on Cooperation. At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, the BRICS leaders acknowledged “the crucial role of energy in promoting social and economic development, as well as environmental protection” and underlined “the importance of BRICS environmental cooperation initiatives that contribute to the quality of life in our cities, through the sharing of knowledge and experience on important issues such as waste management, circular economy, in the context of sustainable consumption and production, sanitation and water quality, urban air quality and urban green areas.”⁸⁰⁸

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS leaders stated “We reiterate our commitment to the implementation of the Paris Agreement adopted under the principles of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), including the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities, in the light of different national circumstances. We urge developed countries included in Annex II to scale up the provision of financial, technical, technological and capacity-building assistance to developing countries to support mitigation and adaptation action. We also acknowledge in this respect the Statement of the 6th BRICS Ministers of Environment Meeting on 30 July 2020. We welcome the progress within the BRICS Environmentally Sound Technology (BEST) Platform, including the initiative to establish the BEST Platform “matrix.” We look forward to further strengthening cooperation on environmental issues, in particular combating marine plastic litter as a key focus of the BRICS Clean Rivers Programme.”⁸⁰⁹

Commitment Features

The BRICS commitment is “We [stress the importance and] support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the [Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)] in a balanced way.”

⁸⁰⁵ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-goa.html>

⁸⁰⁶ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

⁸⁰⁷ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

⁸⁰⁸ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilgia.html>

⁸⁰⁹ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 12 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

“Support” refers to “the action, or act of providing aid, assistance or backing up an initiative, or entity.”⁸¹⁰ “Address” refers to giving attention to or dealing with a matter.⁸¹¹ “In a balanced way” refers to “containing an equal amount or number of similar things.”⁸¹²

“Adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework” refers to ensuring “the development, adoption and implementation of an effective post 2020 global biodiversity framework, that includes provision of the necessary means of implementation, in line with the Convention, and appropriate mechanisms for monitoring, reporting and review, to reverse the current loss of biodiversity and ensure that biodiversity is put on a path to recovery by 2030 at the latest, towards the full realization of the 2050 Vision of “Living in Harmony with Nature.”⁸¹³ This was agreed to at the first part of the UN Biodiversity Conference held from 11-15 October 2021, postponed from March 2020 due to COVID-19. The second part will be held from 25 April to 9 May 2022 and is when the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework is expected to be adopted.⁸¹⁴ The official draft framework from July 2021 outlines 4 long-term goals: 1) enhanced integrity of all ecosystems; 2) valuing, maintaining or enhancing Nature’s contributions to people through conservation and sustainable use; 3) fair and equitable sharing of the benefits from the utilization of genetic resources; and 4) closing the gap between available financial and other means of implementation, and those necessary to achieve the 2050 Vision.”⁸¹⁵ It also identifies 21 action-oriented targets for 2030 under the three categories of “reducing threats to biodiversity; meeting people’s needs through sustainable use and benefit sharing; and tools and solutions for implementation and mainstreaming.”⁸¹⁶

“The three objects of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)” “are the conservation of biological diversity, the sustainable use of its components and the fair and equitable sharing of the benefits arising out of the utilization of genetic resources, including by appropriate access to genetic resources and by appropriate transfer of relevant technologies, taking into account all rights over those resources and to technologies, and by appropriate funding.”⁸¹⁷

For full compliance, a BRICS member must strongly support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses: 1) biodiversity conservation; 2) sustainable use of biodiversity and 3) the fair and equitable sharing of genetic resources. If a BRICS member only supports the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that address one or two of the objectives of the CBD, it would be considered partial compliance. Strong action would be making speeches, publishing statements, hosting meetings or eventually adopting the final Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework when it is expected to be agreed to in May 2022.

Partial action would be attending meetings or being part of a group that publishes a statement without individually supporting the statement or making speeches at meetings. If a BRICS member supports all three objectives of the CBD in the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework without officially adopting the Framework, they will still only receive a score of partial compliance.

⁸¹⁰ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

⁸¹¹ Address, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/address>

⁸¹² Balanced, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/balanced>

⁸¹³ Kunming Declaration, Convention on Biological Diversity (Montreal) 18 October 2021. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.cbd.int/doc/c/df35/4b94/5e86e1ee09bc8c7d4b35aaf0/kunmingdeclaration-en.pdf>

⁸¹⁴ UN Biodiversity Conference (COP 15), UN Environment Programme (Nairobi) 18 August 2021. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.unep.org/events/conference/un-biodiversity-conference-cop-15>

⁸¹⁵ First Draft of Global Biodiversity Framework Identifies Four Goals for 2050, IISD (Geneva) 15 July 2021. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://sdg.iisd.org/news/first-draft-of-global-biodiversity-framework-identifies-four-goals-for-2050/>

⁸¹⁶ First Draft of Global Biodiversity Framework Identifies Four Goals for 2050, IISD (Geneva) 15 July 2021. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://sdg.iisd.org/news/first-draft-of-global-biodiversity-framework-identifies-four-goals-for-2050/>

⁸¹⁷ Article 1. Objectives, Convention on Biological Diversity (Montreal) 1992. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.cbd.int/convention/articles/?a=cbd-01>

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did not support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way.
0	The BRICS member somewhat supports the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way.
+1	The BRICS member strongly supports the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Sonja Dobson

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the Convention for Biological Diversity (CBD) in a balanced way.

On 7 October 2021, the Ministry of the Environment introduced Restage+, Brazil's National Wildlife Rescue Program, to help reduce the loss of wildlife biodiversity caused by environmental factors and human activity.⁸¹⁸ This program will rescue and protect animals across Brazil's six biomes.

On 31 October 2021, President Jair Bolsonaro attended the G20 Rome Summit where leaders affirmed their commitment to end and reverse biodiversity loss by year 2030 and to help make progress towards the goal of conserving or protecting at least 30 percent of global land and 30 percent of global ocean by 2030.⁸¹⁹

On 12 November 2021, Minister of the Environment Joaquim Leite attended the 26th session of the Conference of Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and made a statement on behalf of Brazil.⁸²⁰ Among the announcements Brazil made, Minister Leite announced that Brazil is committed to ending illegal deforestation by 2028 and restoring 18 million hectares of forest by 2030. Minister of Mines and Energy Bento Albuquerque also announced that Brazil has established 50 laboratories in the Amazon to study the biodiversity in the region.

On 3 February 2022, President Bolsonaro highlighted the actions of environmental protection and sustainable development carried out by Brazil.⁸²¹ These actions include the conservation, sustainable use and recovery of terrestrial and aquatic biomes and ecosystems.

On 7 April 2022, the Ministry of the Environment committed to supporting ten initiatives to help support the recovery of native vegetation in the Atlantic Forest.⁸²² Through these projects, the Brazilian government will invest over BRL38 million to the recovery of 3,000 hectares of land as a part of Brazil's Biodiversity and Climate Change Project in the Atlantic Forest.

On 19 May 2022, the Ministry of the Environment signed an agreement with the Getúlio Vargas Foundation to begin the second phase of the Sustainable Landscapes of the Amazon Project which involves expanding the

⁸¹⁸ Brazil unveils wildlife protection program, Agência Brasil (Brasília) 6 October 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/geral/noticia/2021-10/brazil-unveils-wildlife-protection-program#>

⁸¹⁹ Press Release N. 138: G20 Rome Leaders' Declaration, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Brasília) 2 November 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/g20-rome-leaders2019-declaration>

⁸²⁰ "Brazil is the protagonist in the negotiations," says Minister of the Environment at the end of COP26, Ministry of the Environment (Brasília) 13 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/201cbrasil-e-protagonista-nas-negociacoes201d-diz-ministro-do-meio-ambiente-em-encerramento-da-cop26>

⁸²¹ President of the Republic presents environmental measures of the Federal Government, Ministry of the Environment (Brasília) 3 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 5 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/presidente-da-republica-apresenta-medidas-ambientais-do-governo-federal>

⁸²² Ministry of the Environment selects 10 initiatives that will act in the recovery of native vegetation from the Atlantic Forest (Brasília) 7 April 2022. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ministerio-do-meio-ambiente-seleciona-10-iniciativas-que-vaio-atuar-na-recuperacao-da-vegetacao-nativa-da-mata-atlantica>

scale and scope of existing measures to reduce threats to biodiversity and recover terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems, among other goals.⁸²³

On 20 May 2022, representatives from the Ministry of the Environment met with representatives of the biogas, wind energy, aluminum, waste, and ethanol sectors to sign agreements to put into place the Sectoral Climate Change Migration plans and establish the National System for the Reduction of Greenhouse Gas Emissions.⁸²⁴ These agreements will contribute to the conservation of biological diversity by taking steps to reduce carbon emissions, thus mitigating the harmful effects that climate change has on wildlife.

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way. While Brazil has taken actions to support biodiversity conservation, it has not sufficiently supported the sustainable use of biodiversity or the fair and equitable sharing of genetic resources.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexandra Nicu

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with the commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) in a balanced way.

On 13 September 2021, the deputy prime ministers held a meeting to discuss Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin's commitment to protect forests and fight wildfires in Russia.⁸²⁵ Prime Minister Mishustin announced that Russia would allocate RUB24 billion by 2024 to help protect forests and fight wildfires in addition to RUB41 billion in subventions to help regions with the highest risk of wildfires, including the Far Eastern and Siberian federal districts, protect their forests. The funding will make wildfire detection and extinguishment more efficient, thus aiding in the preservation of biodiversity.

On 24 September 2021, the Ministry of Science and High Education approved a new granting programme for 2019 – 2027.⁸²⁶ According to the press release, 34 research institutions would receive RUB8.5 billion to facilitate genetic resource research-related projects.

On 9 November 2021, Deputy Chairman of the Government of the Russian Federation Alexey Overchuk attended the 26th session of the Conference of Parties (COP26) to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change and made a statement on behalf of Russia.⁸²⁷ Deputy Chairman Overchuk stated that Russia is working to achieve carbon neutrality by 2060 and work to preserve forests and other ecosystems. At COP26, Russia also signed a global pledge to stop deforestation by 2030.

⁸²³ MMA and FGV sign Cooperation Agreement for the 2nd phase of the Sustainable Landscapes of the Amazon Project 19 May 2022. Access Date: 23 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mma-e-fgv-assinam-acordo-de-cooperacao-para-2a-fase-do-projeto-paisagens-sustentaveis-da-amazonia>

⁸²⁴ MMA signs agreement with five sectors to reduce carbon emissions (Brasília) 20 May 2022. Access Date: 24 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mma-assina-acordo-com-cinco-setores-para-reduzir-emissao-de-carbono>

⁸²⁵ Meeting with Deputy Ministers, The Russian Government (Moscow) 13 September 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43248/#43248=11:1:PP3,11:122:llx>

⁸²⁶ 34 Universities and Research Institutions to Receive Grants for Genetic Research, Ministry of Science and High Education of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 24 September 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 June 2022. https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/press-center/news/?ELEMENT_ID=40387&sphrase_id=244639

⁸²⁷ Statement by Alexey Overchuk at the Conference of Parties to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, The Russian Government (Moscow) 9 November 2021. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/43759/>

On 2 February 2022, the first international center for preservation and reproduction of endangered predatory bird species was opened in the Kamchatka region.⁸²⁸ The center will start with reproduction of endangered falconine and bustard species. It is said that the commission of the center was sanctioned under the Presidential decree.

Russia has partially complied with the commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way. While Russia has taken actions that support biodiversity conservation, it has not supported the sustainable use of biodiversity or the fair and equitable sharing of genetic resources.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexandra Nicu

India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 13 September 2021, Union Minister of Environment, Forest and Climate Bhupender Yadav announced that India had entered into Climate Action and Finance Mobilization Dialogue (CAFMD) with the United States.⁸²⁹ The CAFMD aims to facilitate climate action and economic development between India and the United States in climate action, finance mobilization, adaptation and resilience, and forestry.

On 15 September 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi approved a Host Country agreement with the UN Environment Programme (UNEP).⁸³⁰ The agreement provides an independent legal structure for UNEP as other UN agencies in India. This will enable UNEP to work closely with the government on Indian and South Asian environment issues.

On 25 September 2021, Prime Minister Modi openly announced India's commitment to renewable energy.⁸³¹ India's target is to achieve 450 gigawatts of renewable energy capacity by 2030, with more decarbonize actions to come.

On 1 November 2021, Prime Minister Modi addressed the world leaders at United Nations Climate Change Conference at Glasgow about the five commitments of India to combat climate change.⁸³² Modi advised that India would achieve the target of net zero emissions by the year 2070, 500 giga watt non-fossil energy capacity by 2030, and will fulfil 50 per cent of its energy requirements from renewable energy sources by 2030.

On 11 February 2021, Prime Minister Modi announced the launch of India's "One Sun, One World, One Grid" at the UN Climate Change conference held in the United Kingdom.⁸³³ To meet this vision, the Indian government provides a common global framework with policies like investing in renewable energy generation,

⁸²⁸ Victoria Abramchenko: The First International Center for The Reproduction and Preservation Of Birds Of Prey Has Been Launched In Russia, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 2 February 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 17 June 2022. <http://government.ru/news/44461/>

⁸²⁹ Special Presidential Envoy for Climate John Kerry's Trip to India, U.S. Department of State (Washington, D.C.) 15 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.state.gov/special-presidential-envoy-for-climate-john-kerrys-trip-to-india/>

⁸³⁰ UNEP, Government of India sign Host Country Agreement, aiming to enhance collaborative environmental action, United Nations Environment Programme (Nairobi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.unep.org/news-and-stories/press-release/unep-government-india-sign-host-country-agreement-aiming-enhance>

⁸³¹ Statement: India reaffirms ambitious renewable energy target at United Nations, World Resource Institute (Washington, D.C.) 25 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.wri.org/news/statement-india-reaffirms-ambitious-renewable-energy-target-united-nations>

⁸³² COP26: India PM Narendra Modi pledges net zero by 2070, BBC News (London) 1 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-59125143>

⁸³³ Green Grids Initiative – One Sun One World One Grid: One Sun Declaration, UKcop26 (Glasgow) 11 February 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://ukcop26.org/one-sun-declaration-green-grids-initiative-one-sun-one-world-one-grid/>

building cross-border transmission lines to connect renewable energy generators and demand centres, and investing into solar mini-grids and off-grids systems. This scheme allows India and other participating countries to meet the target of Paris Agreement and to further achieve sustainable development goals.

On 18 March 2022, India called for including communications on digital sequence information and considerations on migratory species to form “ecological connectivity” in Geneva Biodiversity Conference.⁸³⁴

On 26 March 2022, the Convention on Biological diversity had discussed innovative inclusive processes to harmonize national and sub-national actions with India’s Global Biodiversity Framework.⁸³⁵

India has demonstrated its support on the adoption of the Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework. By setting up the dialogue with the United States, India fulfilled the objective of the conversation of biological diversity. By launching the “One Sun, One World, One Grid” program, India reached the objective of sustainability. However, India does not take significant steps on utilizing genetic resources.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Thomas Yue

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

On 13 September 2021, President Xi Jinping ordered the country’s coal industry to develop in a “green and low-carbon” direction that would emphasize climate goals. Specifically, President Xi called “for technological innovation for the coal-to-chemical industry.”⁸³⁶

On 21 September 2021, President Xi told the United Nations Assembly that China needed to accelerate transition to a green and low-carbon economy, while at the same time achieving green recovery and development.⁸³⁷ He expressed his hope that China will become carbon neutral before 2060 (reaching peak carbon dioxide emissions by 2030) and declared that China will no longer build or fund any coal-firing power overseas.

On 30 September 2021, the China Certified Emission Reduction (CCER) program was introduced “to pilot markets in offsetting carbon emissions for public welfare.”⁸³⁸ This contributes to China’s compensation mechanism for eco-environmental conservation and reduces the total trading volume of greenhouse gas voluntary emission to 334 million tons, with turnover approaching RMB3 million.

On 8 October 2021, China announced that it had set up numerous ex-situ conservation systems for plants, such as botanical gardens, wildlife rehabilitation, breeding centers, and gene banks.⁸³⁹ The country was also conducting surveys on essential biogenetic resources and conservation performance evaluations, like the third national survey on livestock and poultry genetic resources, and improved safety administration of genetically

⁸³⁴ Report of main proceedings for 18 March 2022. Geneva Biodiversity Conference (Geneva) 18 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://enb.iisd.org/cbd-sbstta24-sbi3-global-biodiversity-framework-daily-report-18Mar2022>

⁸³⁵ Highlights and images of main proceedings for 26 March 2022. Convention on Biological Diversity (Winnipeg) 26 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022 <https://enb.iisd.org/cbd-sbstta24-sbi3-global-biodiversity-framework-26Mar2022>

⁸³⁶ China Briefing, Xi’s ‘no overseas coal pledge; More orders on domestic coal; ‘Ball in China’s court’, CarbonBrief (London) 23 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.carbonbrief.org/china-briefing-23-september-2021-xis-no-overseas-coal-pledge-more-orders-on-domestic-coal-ball-in-chinas-court>

⁸³⁷ China headed towards carbon neutrality by 2060; President Xi Jinping vows to halt new coal plants abroad, United Nations (New York) 21 September 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://news.un.org/en/story/2021/09/1100642>

⁸³⁸ Document: Responding to Climate Change: China’s Policies and Actions, China Daily (Beijing) 28 October 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202110/28/WS6179dfdba310cdd39bc71b86.html>

⁸³⁹ Biodiversity Conservation in China, The State Council Information Office of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <http://www.scio.gov.cn/zfbps/32832/Document/1714277/1714277.htm>

modified organisms (GMOs). That includes the issuance of 200 technical norms on the safety testing, assessment, supervision and regulation of GMOs.

On 11 October 2021, the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity was held in Kunming, one of the largest cities in southwest China.⁸⁴⁰ The Chinese government agreed and expressed willingness to facilitate the adoption of post-2020 global biodiversity framework.

On 12 October 2021, President Xi attended the Leaders' Summit of the 15th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity.⁸⁴¹ He emphasized that to achieve its carbon peak and neutrality targets, China will release implementation plans for peaking carbon dioxide emissions in key areas and supporting measures. To that end, President Xi called for a "1+N" policy framework for carbon peak and carbon neutrality. Additionally, he claimed that the country will continue to readjust its industrial structure and energy mix, vigorously develop renewable energy, and make faster progress in planning and developing large wind power and photovoltaic bases in sandy areas, rocky areas and deserts.

On 13 October 2021, President Xi announced the creation of national parks aiming for wildlife protection, and they consist of 230,000 square kilometres of land across China.⁸⁴² The parks will help protect nearly 30 per cent of the country's terrestrial wildlife species, especially pandas, tigers, and leopards.

On 10 November 2021, China announced the US-China Joint Glasgow Declaration on Enhancing Climate Action in the 2020s with the United States.⁸⁴³ The plan is to cooperate on areas like regulatory frameworks and environmental standards of greenhouse gas emissions, decarbonization policies, the integration of low-cost intermittent renewable energy, electricity transmission and energy efficiency policies.

On 21 March 2022, the Ministry of Science and Technology released the draft "Detailed Rules For the Implementation of the Regulations on the Management of Human Genetic Resources."⁸⁴⁴ The Rules explains human genetic resources management regulations, such as general requirements and record-keeping requirements. The new draft will require foreign businesses that work with human genetic resources in China to reassess their exposure to new regulations to remain active in the market.

On 28 March 2022, China's National Development and Reform Commission issued new guidelines on greening the Belt and Road Initiative.⁸⁴⁵ The guidelines include building a green exchange and cooperation platform, establishing an environmental risk prevention and improving policy support for green development. China's target is to enhance overseas enterprises' green development capabilities and environmental risk prevention.

China has adopted various measures and actions to reduce greenhouse gases emissions. It has supported the conservation of biodiversity through CCER and also set up ex-situ conservation systems, thus reaching its objective of utilizing genetic resources. Additionally, in taking steps to administrate genetically modified organisms the country has achieved a sustainable use of biological diversity.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

⁸⁴⁰ China eyes biodiversity framework, The State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 11 October 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/news/international/exchanges/202110/11/content_WS61638ddb6d0df57f98e1770.html

⁸⁴¹ Biodiversity Conservation in China, The State Council Information Office of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <http://www.scio.gov.cn/zfbps/32832/Document/1715506/1715506.htm>

⁸⁴² China makes big move for biodiversity, Conservation International (Arlington) 13 October 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.conservation.org/blog/china-makes-big-move-for-biodiversity>

⁸⁴³ US-China Joint Glasgow Declaration on Enhancing Climate Action in the 2020s, U.S. Department of State (Washington, D.C) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.state.gov/u-s-china-joint-glasgow-declaration-on-enhancing-climate-action-in-the-2020s/>

⁸⁴⁴ Human Genetic Resources in China: New Draft Regulation () 4 May 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.china-briefing.com/news/human-genetic-resources-in-china-regulation-new-draft-rules/>

⁸⁴⁵ Experts React: China's National Development and Reform Commission Issues New Guidance on Greening the BRI (Boston) 31 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.bu.edu/gdp/2022/03/31/experts-react-chinas-national-development-and-reform-commission-issues-new-guidelines-on-greening-the-bri/>

Analyst: Thomas Yue

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) in a balanced way.

On 13 September 2021, the Department of Water and Sanitation issued a publication quoting Minister of Water and Sanitation Senzo Mchunu acknowledging and confirming that some of the municipalities face challenges with water delivery and quality.⁸⁴⁶ Minister Mchunu stated that the Department had intervened and reached consensus with the municipalities on a way forward.

On 15 September 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment announced that Minister Creecy was planning on virtually addressing the opening segment of the 18th Ordinary Session of the African Ministerial Conference on the Environment (AMCEN) on 16 September 2021. AMCEN would also provide “progress on the African Green Stimulus Program and launch the Program’s Online Platform.” It intends to provide an overarching framework that would bring together various sustainable development actions in Africa and identify “new areas requiring strategies interventions.”⁸⁴⁷

On 17 September 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment issued a publication informing that it would be hosting “clean-up activities across the country on Saturday, 18 September 2021 for International Coastal Clean-up Day.” The day would also conclude “the National Clean-Up and Recycle SA Week” which is held in Africa every September and “is intended to encourage communities to keep their environment clean and divert their waste away from the landfill sites through recycling, reusing and repurposing of waste materials.”⁸⁴⁸

On 20 September 2021, Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure Patricia De Lille announced the start of the Request for Information process for the Integrated Renewable Energy and Resource Efficiency Program which is expected to be “the largest programme for the procurement of renewable energy and resource efficiency for public facilities.”⁸⁴⁹ Among various benefits, the programme will protect the environment against climate change while rejuvenating the economy.

On 28 September 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment issued a publication reporting that Deputy Minister Makhotso Sotyú would lead “the planting of 4,000 indigenous trees in Vryburg, North West province on Thursday 30 September 2021, as part of the government’s commitment to the 10 Million Tree Programme which aims to have at least two million trees planted every year over a period of five years in South Africa.” The campaign was “coordinated under the theme: “Forest Restoration: a path to recovery and

⁸⁴⁶ Minister Senzo Mchunu on water and sanitation services, South African Government (Pretoria) 13 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-senzo-mchunu-water-and-sanitation-services-certain-provinces-13-sep-2021-0000>

⁸⁴⁷ Minister Barbara Creecy addresses 18th Ordinary Session of African Ministerial Conference on the Environment, 16 Sept, South African Government (Pretoria) 15 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-barbara-creecy-addresses-18th-ordinary-session-african-ministerial-conference>

⁸⁴⁸ Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment leads clean-up activities across the country as part of International Coastal Clean-up Day, 18 Sept, South African Government (Pretoria) 17 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/forestry-fisheries-and-environment-leads-clean-activities-across-country-part-international>

⁸⁴⁹ Minister Patricia De Lille: Briefing on request for information process for PV and water savings government programme, South African Government (Pretoria) 20 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-patricia-de-lille-briefing-request-information-process-pv-and-water-savings>

well-being,” satisfying the importance of protecting and conserving the country’s biodiversity as the backbone of our economy and livelihoods.”⁸⁵⁰

On 7 October 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment confirmed the arrest “of an official from the North West Department of Economic Development, Environment, Conservation and Tourism in connection with illegal rhino horn trade.” The official together with the owner “of a security company were arrested [...] in relation to alleged contraventions of the National Environmental Management: Biodiversity Act, the Rhino Norms and Standards and contravention of permit conditions.” The alleged had also been involved in the trade of rhino horns “using permits to cover up their illegal activities.”⁸⁵¹

On 12 October 2021, Government Communications announced that the Government Communication and Information System in partnership with the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment would be hosting a Masterclass on waste management for youth. The masterclass was anticipated to empower youth “with information on the economic, training and funding opportunities that exist within the waste sector and encourage entrepreneurship to create sustainable eco-friendly jobs and drive the country’s economic growth.”⁸⁵²

On 14 October 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment announced that draft policies on commercial fishing rights allocation had been published for public comment. The goal of the policies is “to guide the allocation and granting of commercial fishing rights prescribed by section 18 of the Marine Living Resources Act.”⁸⁵³

On 15 October 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment issued a report announcing that Deputy Minister Sotyú would be undertaking a ZAR29 million “waste management intervention for Mangaung Metro Municipality.” Deputy Minister Sotyú reported that the “intervention is in response to a request for assistance from Mangaung Metro Municipality due to waste management challenges and financial budget constrain that the municipality is facing.” She advised that the “intervention which we have prioritised and funded by the department for about ZAR29 million is on improvement in landfill operations, revitalisation of the 2 buy-back centres and clearing of illegal dumping/street cleaning.”⁸⁵⁴

On 21 October 2021, the Department of Transport reported that it had “put in place the Inland Waters Strategy, which it will launch on Friday, 22 October 2021 as part of October Transport Month. This strategy will ensure that all boating activities are done safely and responsible in the future. It will also help to protect our inland waters from pollution.”⁸⁵⁵ The Department of Water and Sanitation, Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment, and the South African Police Service are also expected to play an important role.

On 21 October 2021, the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment announced that the it was considering various measures to address the challenges of reduction in the West Coast Rock Lobster Total

⁸⁵⁰ Deputy Minister Makhotso Sotyú plants trees in Vryburg as part of the 10 Million Trees Programme, 30 Sept, South African Government (Pretoria) 28 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/plant-trees-vrybug-28-sep-2021-0000>

⁸⁵¹ Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment on arrest of an official from North West Economic Development, Environment, Conservation and Tourism in connection with illegal rhino horn trade, South African Government (Pretoria) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/forestry-fisheries-and-environment-arrest-official-north-west-economic-development>

⁸⁵² Government Communications and Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment hosts a Masterclass on waste management as a business model for youth, 13 Oct, South African Government (Pretoria) 12 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/government-communications-and-forestry-fisheries-and-environment-hosts-masterclass-waste>

⁸⁵³ Minister Barbara Creecy publishes draft Policies on Commercial Fishing Rights Allocation for public comment, South African Government (Pretoria) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/draft-policies-commercial-fishing-rights-allocation-published-public-comment-14-oct-2021>

⁸⁵⁴ Deputy Minister Makhotso Sotyú announces R29 million waste management intervention for Mangaung Metro Municipality, South African Government (Pretoria) 15 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-makhotso-sotyú-announces-r29-million-waste-management-intervention-mangaung>

⁸⁵⁵ Transport launches Inland Waters Strategy, 22 Oct, South African Government (Pretoria) 21 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/inland-waters-strategy-promotes-safe-and-responsible-boating-south-africa-21-oct-2021-0000>

Allowable Catch.⁸⁵⁶ Measures included (1) increasing compliance-related efforts to combat poaching and over-fishing, (2) improving the collection and processing of poaching and local market sales statistics, (3) piloting of a live traceability system, (4) the deployment of catch data monitors along the South African coastline and (5) increasing the capacity and scope to monitor landings in the commercial, small-scale, and recreational fishing sectors.

On 8 November 2021, the Department Forestry, Fisheries, and the Environment announced that it would host “over 30 traditional and community leaders from Eastern Cape in a Marine and coastal enforcement and compliance workshop from 9-10 November 2021, in Mbizana, Eastern Cape.” The Department’s aim is to “raise awareness of environmental legislation, whilst acknowledging the leadership authority vested in various traditional houses.” The initiative is anticipated to demonstrate “the importance of community integration and confronting challenges facing compliance and enforcement officials who operate primarily in the oceans and coastal spaces of the Eastern Cape Province.”⁸⁵⁷

On 9 November 2021, the Department of Mineral Resources and Energy called for the moving away “from all forms of fossil fuels-including resources such as gas, which have been regarded as key resources for industrialisation.” It welcomed the recent commitments made investment in to renewable energy and called for further investment “on research and development in the exploration of these resources toward a clean environment.”⁸⁵⁸

On 11 November 2021, the Department of Water and Sanitation announced that “the third day of the Breede-Gouritz Catchment Management Agency, Department of Water and Sanitation and Department of Environmental Affairs Development Planning Compliance Blitz in Klein Karoo.” The Compliance and Enforcement Blitz is intended to curb illegal water use activities in the Klein Karoo region and the Spokesperson for the National Department of Water and Sanitation advised that “more than 30 farm properties have been visited and inspected between Oudtshoorn, George, Uniondale and De Rust to date.”⁸⁵⁹

On 17 November 2021, the Department of Water and Sanitation announced that South Africa was renewing the water sector collaboration with Denmark. “The treaty was formally ratified by the Minister of Water and Sanitation Honourable Senzo Mchunu and Danish Ambassador His Excellency Tobias Elling Rehfeld during a dinner meeting at Waterkloof in Pretoria East on Tuesday, 16 November 2021.” The Danish Ambassador explained that “through th[e] partnership, issues such as water saving, recycling processes, metering and monitoring technology will be looked at with the aim of enhancement.”⁸⁶⁰

On 10 December 2021, the North West Economic Development, Environment, Conservation and Tourism reported that Member of the Executive Council Kenetswe Mosenogi was calling “for a massive clean-up campaign throughout the province in the wake of the Covid-19 pandemic, starting with Mahikeng as a capital city of the province.” Mr. Mosenogi stated that the province would “pull all strings to ensure that all the regions are free of litter and illegal dumping sites.” She further stressed that the main goal was “to change people’s attitudes and behaviour towards waste management and create awareness on the opportunities available towards the development of the local economy, as well as to begin taking charge and responsibility of keeping the areas clean.” The campaign is intended “to mobilize communities and various stakeholders to support and

⁸⁵⁶ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment concerned about reduced catch allowance on Rock Lobster, South African Government (Pretoria) 21 October 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/department-forestry-fisheries-and-environment-notes-concerns-about-reduction-west-coast>

⁸⁵⁷ Department to host traditional leaders’ Marine and coastal enforcement and compliance workshop in Mbizana, South African Government (Pretoria) 8 November 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/marine-and-coastal-enforcement-and-compliance-workshop-mbizana-8-nov-2021-0000>

⁸⁵⁸ Minister Gwede Mantashe: Africa Energy Week, South African Government (Pretoria) 9 November 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-gwede-mantashe-africa-energy-week-10-nov-2021-0000>

⁸⁵⁹ Water and Sanitation on Compliance Blitz in Klein Karoo, South African Government (Pretoria) 11 November 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/klein-karoo-compliance-and-enforcement-blitz-full-swing-11-nov-2021-0000>

⁸⁶⁰ Water and Sanitation renew water sector collaboration with Denmark, South African Government (Pretoria) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/renew-water-sector-collaboration-17-nov-2021-0000>

participate in the cleaning and greening of Mahikeng town, industrial area and its surrounding areas. [That] includes the eradication of all illegal waste dumping hotspots, cleaning main corridors of towns including entrance and exit routes, improving environmental awareness, resealing of roads and patching of potholes.” Additionally, she noted that the “plan is to instil environmental[ly] friendly behaviour and create a culture in which citizenry is aware of its role in attaining a cleaner and healthy environment through a litter-free and no dumping behaviour, waste minimization through the establishment of buy-back centres and advocating for entrepreneurship in the waste industry and access to the green economy.”⁸⁶¹

On 23 March 2022, South Africa received a five-year USD150 billion Sustainable Development Bond to conserve endangered species. ⁸⁶² This bond includes potential performance payment from the Global Environment Facility, which will assist to protect rhinos in the Addo Elephant National Park and Great Fish River National Reserve. Through protecting rhinos, the South Africa government helps to protect the whole ecosystem.

On 24 March 2022, South Africa endorsed the updated plan of action by SBI-4 in the Geneva Biodiversity Conference. ⁸⁶³ The country also joined together with Russia Federation, Switzerland, Morocco and Egypt to address hybrid meetings on considering SBI-4.

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to support the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework that addresses the three objectives of the CBD in a balanced way. The recent treaty that was ratified by the Minister of Water and Sanitation Honourable Senzo Mchunu and Danish Ambassador His Excellency Tobias Elling Rehfeld on 16 November 2021 was an important step especially in improving water sanitation and recycling processes. The waste interventions and clean-up campaigns, as well as the masterclass for youth on waste management, the compliance and enforcement workshop, the environmental programmes, and initiative to plant more trees are indicative of South Africa’s commitment to supporting the adoption of a Post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Miranda Bocci

⁸⁶¹ MEC Kenetswe Mosenogi on clean-up campaign in North West, South African Government (Pretoria) 10 December 2021.

Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/%E2%80%9Cnorth-west-we-can-do-it%E2%80%9D-let%E2%80%99s-clean-our-province-says-mec-mosenogi-10-dec-2021-0000>

⁸⁶² Wildlife Conservation Bond Boosts South Africa’s Efforts to Protect Black Rhinos and Support Local Communities (Pretoria) 23 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2022/03/23/wildlife-conservation-bond-boosts-south-africa-s-efforts-to-protect-black-rhinos-and-support-local-communities>

⁸⁶³ Report of main proceedings for 24 March 2022 (Geneva) 24 March 2022. Access Date: 14 May 2022. <https://enb.iisd.org/cbd-sbstta24-sbi3-global-biodiversity-framework-daily-report-24Mar2022>

17. Climate Change: Holistic Approach

“We emphasize the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1 (100%)		

Background

Addressing climate change is a substantial theme in the history of BRICS summitry. Dating back to the first BRIC leaders’ summit in Yekaterinburg in 2009, the BRIC countries have included climate action in their discussions. At this summit, the leaders reaffirmed the importance of international cooperation for energy efficiency and the principle of common but differentiated responsibility.⁸⁶⁴

On 15 April 2010, the BRIC leaders stated that “BRIC member countries can cooperate in training, R&D, consultancy services and technology transfer, in the energy sector.”⁸⁶⁵

On 14 April 2011, BRICS summitry referenced the concept of climate adaptation, committing to enhance cooperation in adapting BRICS economies and societies to climate change.⁸⁶⁶

On 30 October 2011, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development “committed to increasing comprehensive food productivity of farmers including smallholders by relying on scientific research and technology transfer, creating favorable environment for investment and sustainable utilization of agricultural resources, and promoting agricultural products trade to improve food access.”⁸⁶⁷ They further reiterated that “the international community should promptly establish effective technology transfer and dissemination mechanism, facilitate technology sharing, and ensure that the developing countries can afford environment friendly technologies in accordance with principle of common but differentiated responsibilities.”

On 29 March 2012, at the New Delhi Summit, the BRICS leaders emphasized that “developed country Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) shall provide enhanced financial, technology and capacity building support for the preparation and implementation of nationally appropriate

⁸⁶⁴ Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries Leaders, BRICS India 2021 (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://brics2021.gov.in/BRICSDocuments/2009/Yekaterinburg-Declaration-2009.pdf>

⁸⁶⁵ 2nd BRIC Summit of Heads of State and Government: Joint Statement, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 15 April 2010. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100415-leaders.html

⁸⁶⁶ Sanya Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Sanya) 14 April 2011. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/110414-leaders.html

⁸⁶⁷ Joint Declaration of the Second Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Chengdu) 30 October 2011. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/111030-agriculture.html

mitigation actions of developing countries.”⁸⁶⁸ This commitment was subsequently reiterated on 4 September 2017 at the Xiamen Summit and on 26 July 2018 at the Johannesburg Summit.^{869,870}

On 15 July 2014, at the Fortaleza Summit, BRICS leaders pledged to reduce the “negative impact of climate change on food security” and adapt “agriculture to climate change.”⁸⁷¹

On 9 July 2015, the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership was released at the Ufa Summit.⁸⁷² The Strategy stipulated that BRICS countries should “create the conditions and accelerate the development as well as transfer of energy efficient and environmentally friendly technologies and equipment.”

At the Ufa Summit, the BRICS leaders also adopted a standalone leaders’ declaration, which highlighted “the importance of transfer of technology and scientific knowledge to address climate change and its adverse effects and therefore agreed to conduct joint research on the priority issues of common interest.”⁸⁷³ The leaders further reiterated the commitment “to further develop agricultural cooperation, in particular, related to agricultural technologies and innovations, provision of food for the most vulnerable communities, mitigation of the negative impact of climate change on food security and the adaptation of agriculture to climate change.”

On 16 October 2016, the BRICS leaders met in Goa, India, and called on “developed countries to fulfil their responsibility towards providing the necessary financial resources, technology and capacity building assistance to support the developing countries with respect to both mitigation and adaptation for the implementation of the Paris Agreement.”⁸⁷⁴ They also discussed international cooperation to foster “access to clean energy technology and finance.”

On 23 June 2017, the BRICS Ministers of Environment urged the “full implementation of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on financing for sustainable development, including the Technology Facilitation Mechanism. The official development assistance, technology transfer and capacity building remain the key means in addressing global environmental challenges.”⁸⁷⁵

On 18 May 2018, the BRICS Ministers of Environment convened to reaffirm their “commitment to the Paris Agreement and urge developed countries to continue taking the lead and support developing countries, including the transfer of needed technology, which is one of the most critical enablers for climate action.”⁸⁷⁶

On 14 November 2019, at the Brasilia Summit, the BRICS leaders further urged “developed countries included in Annex II to scale up the provision of financial, technological and capacity-building assistance to developing

⁸⁶⁸ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html

⁸⁶⁹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.pdf

⁸⁷⁰ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution. BRICS Information Centre (Johannesburg) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html

⁸⁷¹ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2011. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html

⁸⁷² The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-partnership-strategy-en.html

⁸⁷³ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

⁸⁷⁴ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Goa) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html

⁸⁷⁵ Third Meeting of BRICS Environment Ministers Tianjin Statement on Environment, BRICS Information Centre (Tianjin) 23 June 2017. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170623-environment.html

⁸⁷⁶ Joint Statement for the Fourth BRICS Ministers of Environment Meeting, BRICS Information Centre (Zimbali) 18 May 2018. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180518-environment.html

countries to support mitigation and adaptation action.”⁸⁷⁷ This commitment was echoed in the subsequent year at the Moscow Summit on 17 November 2020.⁸⁷⁸

In November 2020, the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 was also released.⁸⁷⁹ In the area of energy, BRICS countries agreed to “cooperate on skills and capacity transfer in renewable energy technology development and deployment covering wind, solar and hydro-electric energy and bioenergy,” and “conduct capacity building activities among BRICS.”

On 9 September 2021, at the New Delhi leaders’ summit where the present commitment was adopted, the BRICS leaders also recalled “relevant Paris Agreement provisions that mandate developed countries included in its Annex II to provide the necessary means of implementation including through funding, capacity building and technology transfer to developing countries to enable implementation of their climate action in the context of sustainable development.”⁸⁸⁰

Commitment Features

The present commitment, adopted at the 2021 BRICS Leaders’ Summit, reads: “we emphasize the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.”⁸⁸¹

The word “emphasize” identifies this sentence as a measurable politically binding commitment.⁸⁸² It is a low binding commitment verb, and it is defined as actions “to show that something is very important or worth giving attention to.”⁸⁸³

“Ensure” means “to make something certain to happen.”⁸⁸⁴ “Holistic” is understood to mean “dealing with or treating the whole of something and not just a part.”⁸⁸⁵ This word qualifies the commitment’s characterization of actions to address climate change; namely, the commitment is concerned with six dimensions of climate action: “mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.”

“Climate change” refers to “a change in the state of the climate that can be identified (e.g., by using statistical tests) by changes in the mean and/or the variability of its properties and that persists for an extended period, typically decades or longer.”⁸⁸⁶ According to Article I of the UNFCCC, climate change is defined as “a change

⁸⁷⁷ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 1 December 2021.

www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html

⁸⁷⁸ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html

⁸⁷⁹ Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, BRICS Information Centre. November 2020. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html

⁸⁸⁰ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html

⁸⁸¹ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 1 December 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html

⁸⁸² Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 1 December 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

⁸⁸³ Emphasize, Cambridge English Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 1 December 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/emphasize>

⁸⁸⁴ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 1 December 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

⁸⁸⁵ Holistic, Cambridge English Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 1 December 2021.

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/holistic>

⁸⁸⁶ Annex I: Glossary in Global Warming of 1.5°C: An IPCC Special Report on the Impacts of Global Warming of 1.5°C Above Pre-Industrial Levels and Related Global Greenhouse Gas Emission Pathways, in the Context of Strengthening the Global Response to the Threat of Climate Change, Sustainable Development, and Efforts to Eradicate Poverty, Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (Geneva) 2018. Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://www.ipcc.ch/sr15/chapter/glossary/>

of climate which is attributed directly or indirectly to human activity that alters the composition of the global atmosphere and which is in addition to natural climate variability observed over comparable time periods.”

Dimension I – Climate Mitigation: In the context of climate change, “mitigation” broadly refers to “efforts to reduce or prevent emission of greenhouse gases.”⁸⁸⁷ Examples of climate mitigation include adopting new technologies and renewable energies, improving energy efficiency, or changing management practices and consumer behavior.

Dimension II – Climate Adaptation: Climate adaptation is defined as “adjustments in ecological, social, or economic systems in response to actual or expected climatic stimuli and their effects or impacts,” and “changes in processes, practices, and structures to moderate potential damages or to benefit from opportunities associated with climate change.”⁸⁸⁸ Adaptation solutions include examples such as fortifying flood defences in coastal regions, improving early warning systems for extreme weather events, investing in drought-resistant crops, and other measures to cope with the effects of climate change as they unfold.

Dimension III – Climate Financing: “Climate finance” is understood to mean “local, national or transnational financing - drawn from public, private and alternative sources of financing - that seeks to support mitigation and adaptation.”⁸⁸⁹ In other words, climate finance is about mobilizing resources to assist developing and Least Developed Countries in addressing climate change. For example, a BRICS member can demonstrate compliance with this dimension of its commitment by contributing to international instruments such as the Green Climate Fund, the Global Environment Facility, the Special Climate Change Fund, or the Least Developed Countries Fund. The BRICS member can also participate in international and/or intersectoral dialogue to improve the financial mechanisms in existing multilateral environmental agreements.

Dimension IV – Capacity Building: “Capacity building” is defined as “the process by which individuals or organisations obtain, improve or retain the skills, knowledge, tools, equipment or other resources to do their work competently.”⁸⁹⁰ Examples of climate-related capacity-building include supporting developing countries in their participation in climate negotiations and/or fulfillment of transparency and reporting requirements under existing climate agreements. Other forms of capacity-building include “climate change education, training, public awareness, public participation and public access to information,” as well as technical assistance in climate research and support for the implementation of international climate obligations.⁸⁹¹ A BRICS member can also demonstrate compliance by engaging in bilateral and multilateral funding schemes for climate adaptation and mitigation in developing countries; such actions would simultaneously constitute support for Dimension III – Climate Financing.

Dimension V – Technology Transfer: Technology transfer refers to “a broad set of processes covering the flows of know-how, experience and equipment for mitigating and adapting to climate change amongst different stakeholders such as governments, private sector entities, financial institutions, non-governmental organizations, and research/education institutions.”⁸⁹² In a climate-related context, BRICS members can demonstrate compliance in this regard by financing or facilitating the transfer of environmentally sound

⁸⁸⁷ Mitigation, UN Environment Programme (Nairobi) Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://www.unep.org/explore-topics/climate-action/what-we-do/mitigation>

⁸⁸⁸ What Do Adaptation to Climate Change and Climate Resilience Mean? United Nations Climate Change (Bonn) Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://unfccc.int/topics/adaptation-and-resilience/the-big-picture/what-do-adaptation-to-climate-change-and-climate-resilience-mean>

⁸⁸⁹ Introduction to Climate Finance, United Nations Climate Change (Bonn) Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://unfccc.int/topics/climate-finance/the-big-picture/introduction-to-climate-finance>

⁸⁹⁰ Capacity Building on Climate Change Adaptation, The European Climate Adaptation Platform Climate-ADAPT (Brussels) 2019. Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://climate-adapt.eea.europa.eu/metadata/adaptation-options/capacity-building-on-climate-change-adaptation>

⁸⁹¹ Capacity-Building in the Negotiations, United Nations Climate Change (Bonn) Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://unfccc.int/topics/capacity-building/the-big-picture/capacity-building-in-the-negotiations-0>

⁸⁹² Technology Transfer, Global Environment Facility (Washington DC) Access Date: 1 December 2021. <https://www.thegef.org/what-we-do/topics/technology-transfer>

technologies for improved climate performance, innovation, and low-carbon development in developing countries.

Dimension VI – Sustainable Lifestyles: A sustainable lifestyle has been defined as “a cluster of habits and patterns of behaviour embedded in a society and facilitated by institutions, norms and infrastructures that frame individual choice, in order to minimize the use of natural resources and generation of wastes, while supporting fairness and prosperity for all.”⁸⁹³ With linkages to Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) such as SDG 12 on responsible consumption and production, this dimension of the BRICS commitment focuses on combatting climate change through everyday behaviour change on a public scale (e.g. recycling, public transportation etc.)

The comprehensive predisposition of the commitment suggests that verbal affirmations, political statements, and other symbolic reiterations of climate action are insufficient to constitute full compliance. To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must concretely demonstrate climate action that touches on five or more of the aforementioned six dimensions. As explained above, it is possible for one policy action to contribute to multiple dimensions of climate action. Concrete is understood to mean strong action, such as mobilizing money or ending fossil fuel or other climate warming investments, passing relevant legislation and policies etc.

Partial compliance, or a score of 0, is attributed to BRICS members that have demonstrated substantial compliance with three or four of the aforementioned six dimensions (i.e. more than 50%). Alternatively, a member would also score 0 for partial compliance if it demonstrated less than strong and concrete compliance with more than three of the dimensions.

Non-compliance, or a score of -1, is assigned to BRICS members that have either demonstrated no climate action, or only meaningfully covered one of the six dimensions outlined in the present commitment.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member emphasizes the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on TWO OR FEWER dimensions: mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.
0	The BRICS member emphasizes the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on THREE OR FOUR dimensions: mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.
+1	The BRICS member emphasizes the need to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on FIVE OR MORE dimensions: mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

On 15 September 2021, the Central Bank and National Monetary Council published new rules regarding environmental, social, and corporate governance for organizations working in the national financial system.⁸⁹⁴ These measures were announced alongside the release of the Report on Social, Environmental and Climate-related Risks and Opportunities.

⁸⁹³ A Framework for Shaping Sustainable Lifestyles: Determinants and Strategies, United Nations Environment Programme (Nairobi) 2016. Access Date: 1 December 2021. https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/9995/-A_framework_for_shaping_sustainable_lifestyles__determinants_and_strategies-2016Sustainable_lifestyles_FINAL_not_for_print.pdf

⁸⁹⁴ Agenda BC# - the BCB publishes the Report on Social, Environmental and Climate-related Risks and Opportunities and enhances regulation on these issues, Banco Central do Brasil (Brasilia) 15 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.bcb.gov.br/en/pressdetail/2411/nota>

On 14 September 2021, the Ministry of Mines and Energy joined the United Nations Environment Programme's United for Efficiency Initiative to announce a two-year project that aims to improve the energy efficiency of commercial refrigerators.⁸⁹⁵ The initiative is expected to avoid six million tons of CO₂ per year and save USD1.2 billion annually.

On 18 October 2021, the government unveiled an updated version of the Sector Plan for Adaptation and Low Emission of Carbon in Agriculture.⁸⁹⁶ The plan aims at reducing carbon emissions by 1.1 billion tons by 2030. To achieve this goal, the plan will deploy sustainable technologies in 73 million hectares, increase the volume of animal waste treated by 208 million cube meters, and reduce cattle emissions. It also introduces an integrated approach for agriculture production areas.

On 25 October 2021, the government announced the creation of the National Green Growth Program, which aims to foster Brazil's sustainable growth.⁸⁹⁷ The Ministries of the Environment and the Economy will oversee the program through the Interministerial Committee on Climate Change and Green Growth. The National Green Growth Program will deploy economic and political incentives for green initiatives, market instruments, and institution transformations.⁸⁹⁸

On 3 November 2021, the Ministries of Foreign Affairs, Agriculture, Livestock and Food Supply, and the Environment announced that Brazil joined the Global Methane Pledge and the Glasgow Declaration on Forests and Land Use.⁸⁹⁹

On 9 November 2021, the Brazilian Development Bank approved the FG Energia program for guaranteeing loans aimed at improving energy efficiency for small and medium-sized enterprises.⁹⁰⁰ The National Electricity Conservation Program will provide up to USD6 million in loans.

On 10 November 2021, the Minister for the Environment participated in a joint statement on the 26th Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change on behalf of the BASIC Group. Along with ministerial counterparts from India, China, and South Africa, the Minister reassured Brazil's commitment to participating in the global response to climate change and announced new climate goals.⁹⁰¹ The announced goals include halving emissions by 2030, eradicating illegal deforestation by 2028, restoring and reforesting 18 million hectares of forests by 2030, and achieving the participation of 45-50 per cent of renewable energies in the composition of the energy matrix in 2030.

⁸⁹⁵ Leapfrogging to energy-efficient and climate-friendly commercial refrigerating appliances in Brazil, United For Efficiency (Nairobi) 24 September 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://united4efficiency.org/leapfrogging-to-energy-efficient-and-climate-friendly-commercial-refrigerating-appliances-in-brazil/>

⁸⁹⁶ Brazil expands carbon mission reductions targets, Agencia Brasil (Brasilia) 19 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/politica/noticia/2021-10/brazil-expands-carbon-emission-reduction-targets>

⁸⁹⁷ Brazil creates climate change committee days before COP26, Agencia Brasil (Brasilia) 26 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/politica/noticia/2021-10/brazil-creates-climate-change-committee-days-cop26>

⁸⁹⁸ National Green Growth Program, Governo Federal (Brasilia) 25 October 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/aceso-a-informacao/acoes-e-programas/NATIONALGREENGROWTHPROGRAMV2.pdf>

⁸⁹⁹ Joint press release by the Ministries of Foreign Affairs, of Agriculture, Livestock and Food Supply, and of Environment, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasilia) 3 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/joint-press-release-by-the-ministries-of-foreign-affairs-of-agriculture-livestock-and-food-supply-and-of-environment>

⁹⁰⁰ BNDES garantirá crédito destinado à eficiência energética para pequenas e médias empresas [BNDES will guarantee credit for energy efficiency for small and medium companies], Brazilian Development Bank (Brasilia) 9 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.bndes.gov.br/wps/portal/site/home/imprensa/noticias/conteudo/bndes-garantira-credito-destinado-a-eficiencia-energetica-para%20pequenas-e-medias-empresas>

⁹⁰¹ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment releases joint statement on UNFCCC's Glasgow Climate Change Conference, South African Government (Johannesburg) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/basic-ministerial-joint-statement-unfccc%E2%80%99s-glasgow-climate-change-conference-cop26cmp16cma3>

On 11 November 2021, Minister of the Environment Joaquim Álvaro Pereira Leite, along with the Ministers of the Environment from Argentina, Paraguay and Uruguay, announced the formation of a climate change negotiation group for MERCOSUR countries.⁹⁰²

On 12 November 2021, the government launched Floresta+, a digital platform providing financial incentives for conservation projects.⁹⁰³ Projects submitted to the platform that receive positive ratings will be eligible for funding from private organizations and international cooperation initiatives.

On 16 November 2021, the Brazilian Development Bank launched the Living Forest Initiative, which aims at funding forest restoration projects.⁹⁰⁴ The Development Bank will finance up to 50 per cent of the initiative. Through this project, the bank expects to reforest between 16,000 and 33,000 hectares.

On 7 December 2021, Minister of Mines and Energy Bento Albuquerque signed a memorandum of understanding with the Ministry of Climate, Energy and Utilities of the Kingdom of Denmark on renewable energy collaboration.⁹⁰⁵ The memorandum calls for cooperation in the fields of offshore wind energy, waste-to-energy generation, and energy transition.

On 18 December 2021, President Jair Bolsonaro ratified a proposition from the National Energy Policy Council to mandate the blending content of 10 per cent of biodiesel in fossil diesel oil for 2022.⁹⁰⁶

On 7 January 2022, President Bolsonaro signed a law establishing a new framework for the distributed generation of electricity.⁹⁰⁷ The legislation provides a legal framework for small-scale renewable energy sources, allowing the sustainable deployment of low-carbon power capacities.

On 25 January 2022, President Bolsonaro approved a decree providing guidelines for the deployment of offshore wind power.⁹⁰⁸ The new framework specifies, among others, the conditions under which a space can be assigned to an offshore venture.

On 27 January 2022, Minister Leite attended a virtual Ministerial Meeting of the Major Economies on Energy and Climate hosted by the United States.⁹⁰⁹

⁹⁰² MERCOSUR countries together in climate change, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasilia) 11 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mre/en/contact-us/press-area/press-releases/mercosur-countries-together-in-climate-change>

⁹⁰³ Brazil unveils platform with incentives for forest preservation, Agencia Brasil (Brasilia) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 8 January 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/geral/noticia/2021-11/brazil-unveils-platform-incentives-forest-preservation>

⁹⁰⁴ BNDES creates matchfunding to invest up to BRL 500 million in forest recovery with support from partners, Brazilian Development Bank (Brasilia) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. https://www.bndes.gov.br/SiteBNDES/bndes/bndes_en/Institucional/Press/Destaques_Primeira_Pagina/20211116_bndes_creat_es_matchfunding_to_invest_up_to_brl_500_million_in_forest_recovery_with_support_from_partners.html

⁹⁰⁵ Brasil e Dinamarca assinam memorando de entendimento sobre energias renováveis e transição energética [Brazil and Denmark sign a memorandum of understanding on renewable energy and energy transition], Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 7 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/brasil-e-dinamarca-assinam-memorando-de-entendimento-sobre-energias-renovaveis-e-transicao-energetica>

⁹⁰⁶ President approves mixture of 10% biodiesel in diesel oil, Agencia Brasil (Brasilia) 18 December 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/economia/noticia/2021-12/president-approves-mixture-10-biodiesel-diesel-oil>

⁹⁰⁷ Sancionada lei que institui marco legal da geração distribuída [Law enacted establishing a legal framework for distributed generation], Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 7 January 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/sancionada-lei-que-institui-marco-legal-da-geracao-distribuida>

⁹⁰⁸ Diretrizes iniciais para geração de energia offshore são publicadas pelo Governo Federal [Initial guidelines for offshore power generation are published by the Federal Government], Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasilia) 25 January 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/diretrizes-iniciais-para-geracao-de-energia-offshore-sao-publicadas-pelo-governo-federal>

⁹⁰⁹ John Kerry, U.S. Climate Envoy, Tells Top Polluters ‘We Must All Move Faster’, The New York Times (Washington) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/27/climate/john-kerry-climate-emissions.html>

On 23 February 2022, the Ministry of Economy released an updated version of the Country Program for the Green Climate Fund, detailing Brazil's priorities regarding the scheme.⁹¹⁰

On 23 February 2022, the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply signed a technical cooperation agreement with the National Bank for Economic and Social Development to study the creation of mechanisms to reduce carbon emissions from cattle farming.⁹¹¹

On 21 March 2022, the Ministry of Mines and Energy and the Ministry of Environment announced the Federal Strategy for Incentives to the Sustainable Use of Biogas and Biomethane.⁹¹² The strategy aims at encouraging the production and use of biomethane in order to reduce methane emissions.

On 6 April 2022, the Minister of Mines and Energy Bento Albuquerque signed the Ten-Year Energy Expansion Plan 2031, which sets a roadmap for the future expansion of the energy sector.⁹¹³ The plan estimates that the investments required will total BRL3.2 trillion.

On 7 April 2022, the Ministry of Environment signed a technical cooperation agreement with the Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation and the National Bank for Economic and Social Development to conduct feasibility studies on a scheme for financially rewarding forest conservation efforts.⁹¹⁴

Brazil has taken concrete action to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity-building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Thomas Houlié

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

On 5 October 2021, President Vladimir Putin met with government officials and recounted his earlier statement to the Federal Assembly on reducing aggregate emissions in Russia to below that of the European Union in the next 30 years.⁹¹⁵ He also emphasized the importance of maintaining high levels of growth while reducing the

⁹¹⁰ Ministério da Economia lança versão atualizada do Programa País para o Fundo Verde do Clima [Ministry of Economy launches updated version of the Country Program for the Green Climate Fund], Ministry of Economy (Brasília) 23 February 2022.

Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2022/fevereiro/ministerio-da-economia-lanca-versao-atualizada-do-programa-pais-para-o-fundo-verde-do-clima>

⁹¹¹ Acordo vai incentivar redução de emissões de CO₂ na pecuária bovina [Agreement will encourage reduction of CO₂ emissions in cattle ranching], Agência Brasil (Brasília) 23 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/economia/noticia/2022-02/acordo-vai-incentivar-reducao-de-emissoes-de-co2-na-pecuaria-bovina>

⁹¹² Governo Federal lança medidas de incentivo à produção e ao uso sustentável do biometano [Federal Government launches measures to encourage the production and sustainable use of biomethane], Ministry of Environment (Brasília) 21 March 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-lanca-medidas-de-incentivo-a-producao-e-ao-uso-sustentavel-do-biometano>

⁹¹³ Ministério de Minas e Energia lança Plano Decenal de Expansão de Energia (PDE) 2031 [Ministry of Mines and Energy launches Ten-Year Energy Expansion Plan (PDE) 2031], Ministry of Mines and Energy (Brasília) 6 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/ministerio-de-minas-e-energia-lanca-plano-decenal-de-expansao-de-energia-pde-2031>

⁹¹⁴ Forest conservation to be paid for in Brazil, Agência Brasil (Brasília) 7 April 2022. Access Date: 10 May 2022. <https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/geral/noticia/2022-04/forest-conservation-be-paid-brazil>

⁹¹⁵ Meeting with Government Members, Presidential Executive Office (Moscow) 5 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/catalog/persons/623/events/66863>

negative impacts of climate change on the economy. President Putin further aimed to enact related legal frameworks by July 2022 and asked government officials to submit progress reports on green technology by 2030.

On 6 October 2021, the government submitted a draft strategy that aims to reach net zero by 2060 with more ambitious measures to reduce emissions.⁹¹⁶ The goal to decrease carbon dioxide emissions by 79 per cent by 2050 and reach a carbon peak by 2030 serves as the baseline for the draft policy, which is awaiting approval by the cabinet. Specific measures include transitioning from coal power plants to gas, nuclear, hydroelectric, and other renewable energy sources and increasing the competitiveness of oil exports.

On 7 October 2021, the government adopted a list of 42 socio-economic development initiatives until 2030, including one on low-carbon development policy.⁹¹⁷ This initiative provided for the creation of national carbon monitoring and a greenhouse gas absorption system, aiming to attract RUB 600 billion in green climate project investment by 2024 and scale up climate investment to RUB 1.5 trillion by 2030. The initiative also included provisions to facilitate climate research and invest RUB10.9 billion in climate adaptation. Another initiative on clean energy sought to support the development of renewable energy technology, the production and exportation of hydrogen, and the creation of hydrogen technological test sites in the Russian Arctic Region.⁹¹⁸

On 13 October 2021, at the Russian Energy Week in Moscow, President Putin reiterated Russia's goal to reach carbon neutrality by 2060. The country had submitted its Nationally Determined Contribution to the United Nations prior.⁹¹⁹

On 2 November 2021, President Putin made a statement at the 26th Conference of the Parties (COP26) of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change in Glasgow.⁹²⁰ He emphasized Russia's role in forest conservation and offsetting emissions, including improved forest management, combatting illegal logging, and expanding reforestation. Putin also offered support to the joint declaration on forests drafted at COP26.

On 29 November 2021, Deputy Prime Minister Alexander Novak attended the third Russian-Chinese Energy Business Forum.⁹²¹ He noted that Russian companies are investing and building hydroelectric power plants and reactors in several Chinese cities, joining China in building carbon-free hydrogen energy projects.

On 20 December 2021, Prime Minister Mishustin met with Prime Minister Mamin of Kazakhstan, agreeing that renewable energy sources and the energy sector are promising areas of bilateral cooperation.⁹²²

On 30 December 2021, President Putin signed into law an "obligation for large enterprises to eliminate damage caused to the environment."⁹²³ Large enterprises will be required to identify and assess dangerous substances and eliminate unauthorized dumps by 2030. The law expands the contents of the Clean Air project to cities

⁹¹⁶ Russia Drafts New, More Ambitious Decarbonisation Strategy, Reuters (Moscow) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/business/environment/russia-considering-more-ambitious-climate-targets-2021-10-06/>

⁹¹⁷ The government approved a list of socio-economic development initiatives until 2030, Russian Government (Moscow) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 11 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/43451/>

⁹¹⁸ Strategic Initiatives, Government of Russia (Moscow) 7 October 2021. Access Date: 11 February 2022. <http://government.ru/static/viewer/#/media/files/zysfy960208YoOGVHbs7fscvLyNwU5tT>

⁹¹⁹ Russia on the way to Carbon Neutrality, United Nations Climate Change (Bonn) 14 October 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://unfccc.int/ru/news/rossiya-na-puti-k-klimaticheskoy-neytralnosti>

⁹²⁰ Video Address to Participants in Forum on Forests and Land Use within UN Climate Change Conference Framework, Presidential Executive Office (Moscow) 2 November 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <http://en.kremlin.ru/catalog/keywords/89/events/67055>

⁹²¹ Alexander Novak: We Can See Significant Potential for Expanding Russia-China Partnerships in Key Energy Segments, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 29 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022.

⁹²² Russia-Kazakhstan Talks, Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 20 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44162/>

⁹²³ Итоги 2021 года: экологическая безопасность [Results of 2021: Environmental Safety], Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 30 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. http://mnr.gov.ru/press/news/itogi_2021_goda_ekologicheskaya_bezopasnost/

with heavy pollution, which gives the Ministry of Natural Resources jurisdiction to take emergency measures against climate-related crises.

On 12 January 2022, the Ministry of Natural Resources and Ecology approved new policies to subsidize the proper disposal of harmful substances.⁹²⁴ The subsidy will be reviewed annually for its compliance with the government's Clean Country project.

On 27 January 2022, Special Representative Ruslan Edelgeriyev attended a virtual Ministerial Meeting of the Major Economies on Energy and Climate hosted by the United States.⁹²⁵

On 2 February 2022, in response to Germany's comments that an EU carbon tax may make renewables more attractive in Russia, Deputy Minister of Energy Pavel Snikkars stated that Russia was ready to support global action against climate change.⁹²⁶ However, any push for a transition to renewable energy should be gradual, given concerns regarding price volatility in the electric power sector.

On 10 February 2022, President Putin approved a list of proposals from the Presidential Council for Science and Education, investing RUB5.9 billion in the research and implementation of environmental development over the next three years.⁹²⁷

Russia has set climate targets and cooperated with global partners to reach carbon neutrality and reduce emissions. It has demonstrated actions under the commitment's pillars of climate adaptation, mitigation, capacity building, and sustainable lifestyles, and climate financing. However, Russia has not engaged in technology transfer, thus complying with five of the six dimensions of the present commitment.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Katherine Zhang

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

On 13 September 2021, India and the United States launched the Climate Action and Finance Mobilization Dialogue to foster the Climate and Clean Energy Agenda 2030 partnership established in April 2021.⁹²⁸ The dialogue aims at collaborating on the deployment of climate mitigating capacities and mobilizing American capital through grants and soft loans to help India reach its climate objectives.

⁹²⁴ Утверждены новые правила предоставления субсидий на ликвидацию объектов накопленного вреда [New Rules for Granting Subsidies for the Elimination of Objects of Accumulated Harm Have Been Approved], Ministry of Natural Resources (Moscow) 12 January 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 13 January 2022.

http://mnr.gov.ru/press/news/utverzhdeny_novye_pravila_predostavleniya_subsidiy_na_likvidatsiyu_obektov_nakoplenного_vreda/
⁹²⁵ John Kerry, U.S. Climate Envoy, Tells Top Polluters 'We Must All Move Faster', The New York Times (Washington) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/27/climate/john-kerry-climate-emissions.html>

⁹²⁶ Russia warns of power price spike if energy transition is hasty, Reuters (Moscow) 2 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/markets/commodities/russia-warns-power-price-spike-if-energy-transition-is-hasty-2022-02-02/>

⁹²⁷ Meeting with deputy prime ministers, The Russian Government (Moscow) 14 February 2022. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44534/>

⁹²⁸ India and US launch the Climate Action and Finance Mobilization Dialogue (CAFMD), Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 13 September 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1754590>

On 22 September 2021, the Commission for Air Quality Management disclosed directions for mitigating air pollution in Punjab and National Capital Region states.⁹²⁹ The Commission advises states in their transition from coal to less carbonized fuels and to decarbonize the transport sector.

On 22 October 2021, Minister for Power Raj Kumar Singh announced the start of Energy Saving Certificates trading starting 26 October 2021, along with a proposal for a National Carbon Market.⁹³⁰ The Bureau of Energy Efficiency has been tasked with designing the market, for which a draft blueprint was released entitled “National Carbon Market for Stakeholder Consultation.”

On 28 October 2021, the government and the Asian Development Bank agreed to a USD251 million loan for deploying flood mitigation capacities in the Chennai-Kosasthalaiyar basin.⁹³¹

On 30 October 2021, the Ministry of Power proposed to amend the 2001 Energy Conservation Act by defining a minimum proportion of renewable energy consumption by industries or organizations, promoting the use of hydrogen and facilitating the development of the carbon certificate market.⁹³²

On 31 October 2021, Minister for Environment, Forest and Climate Change Shri Bhupender Yadav announced that the Climate Equity Monitor, a tool developed by independent researchers to assess international climate action, went online.⁹³³

On 1 November 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi announced that India aims to reach net zero carbon emissions by 2070.⁹³⁴ India will also strive to reach 50 per cent of renewable energy production by 2030, by targeting 500 GW of renewable installed capacity at the end of the decade. Prime Minister Modi engaged India in reducing its total projected carbon emissions by one billion tons and reducing its carbon intensity by 45 per cent by 2030.⁹³⁵

On 10 November 2021, Prime Minister Modi launched the Green Grids Initiative One Sun One World One Grid, an initiative from the International Solar Alliance, presided by India, and the United Kingdom’s core team for the 26th Conference of the Parties (COP26) to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate

⁹²⁹ Commission for Air Quality Management in the National capital region and adjoining areas takes a series of steps towards abatement of Air Pollution, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 22 September 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1757070>

⁹³⁰ Power Minister calls for enhanced action on energy efficiency by States, Shri R.K Singh chairs meeting to review current level of activities in the field of energy efficiency and clean energy transition being implemented by State Agencies, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Power (New Delhi) 22 October 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1765860>

⁹³¹ India, ADB sign \$251 million loan for integrated urban flood management in Chennai, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Finance (New Delhi) 28 October 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=226053>

⁹³² To Promote Clean Energy Consumption, Power Ministry proposes amendment to Energy Conservation Act, 2001, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Power (New Delhi) 30 October 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1767783>

⁹³³ Climate Equity Monitor an online dashboard for assessing, at the international level, equity in climate action, inequalities in emissions, energy and resource consumption across the world, goes LIVE, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 31 October 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1768174>

⁹³⁴ Modi says India targets net zero emissions by 2070, Reuters (London) 2 November 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://www.reuters.com/world/india/modi-says-india-targets-net-zero-emissions-by-2070-2021-11-01/>

⁹³⁵ National Statement by Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi at COP26 Summit in Glasgow, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Prime Minister’s Office (New Delhi) 1 November 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1768712>

Change.⁹³⁶ The initiative, endorsed by 83 countries as of December 2021, aims at progressively integrating transnational power grids.

On 10 November 2021, the government and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) signed a Host Country Agreement on the margins of COP26, granting UNEP the same status as other United Nations agencies on Indian territory.⁹³⁷ The agreement will enhance joint environmental action between UNEP and India.

On 10 November 2021, the Minister for Environment, Forest and Climate Change participated in a joint statement on COP26 on behalf of the BASIC Group of Brazil, South Africa, India and China.⁹³⁸ Along with ministerial counterparts from Brazil, China, and South Africa, the Prime Minister announced new and updated targets for India: increasing non-fossil fuel installed electricity capacity to 500 Gigawatts by 2030, achieving 50 per cent of cumulative electric power installed capacity from renewable energy by 2030, reducing total projected carbon emissions by 1 billion tons by 2030, reducing the emissions intensity of GDP by 45 per cent by 2030, and achieving net zero emissions by 2070.

On 2 December 2021, the Ministry of Heavy Industries invited institutions from the public sector and private entities to develop electric vehicle charging infrastructures on highways, as part of the second phase of the Faster Adoption and Manufacturing of Hybrid and electric vehicle program.⁹³⁹

On 9 December 2021, the Commission on Air Quality Management designed a framework and action plan for the prevention and control of stubble burning to reduce air pollution in the National Capital Region and neighboring areas.⁹⁴⁰

On 6 January 2022, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved the building of 10,750 kilometers of power transmission lines with substations to support the integration of 20 GW of renewable energy projects.⁹⁴¹

On 27 January 2022, Minister Yadav attended a virtual Ministerial Meeting of the Major Economies on Energy and Climate hosted by the United States.⁹⁴²

⁹³⁶ PM Launches India-UK Green Grids Project at COP26, Invest In India (New Delhi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 3 January 2021. <https://www.investindia.gov.in/team-india-blogs/pm-launches-india-uk-green-grids-project-cop26>

⁹³⁷ UNEP, Government of India sign Host Country Agreement, aiming to enhance collaborative environmental action, United Nations Environment Programme (Nairobi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 4 January 2022. <https://www.unep.org/news-and-stories/press-release/unep-government-india-sign-host-country-agreement-aiming-enhance>

⁹³⁸ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment releases joint statement on UNFCCC's Glasgow Climate Change Conference, South African Government (Johannesburg) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/basic-ministerial-joint-statement-unfccc%E2%80%99s-glasgow-climate-change-conference-cop26cmp16cma3>

⁹³⁹ Electric Vehicle Charging Station on National Highways, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways (New Delhi) 2 December 2021. Access Date: 6 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1777239>

⁹⁴⁰ Measures to Reduce Pollution Due to Stubble Burning, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 9 December 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseSelfframePage.aspx?PRID=1779712>

⁹⁴¹ Cabinet approves Intra-State Transmission System – Green Energy Corridor Phase-II, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (New Delhi) 6 January 2022. Access Date: 9 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/newsite/pmreleases.aspx?mincode=63#:~:text=The%20Cabinet%20Committee%20on%20Economic,of%20transmission%20lines%20and%20approx>

⁹⁴² John Kerry, U.S. Climate Envoy, Tells Top Polluters 'We Must All Move Faster', The New York Times (Washington) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/27/climate/john-kerry-climate-emissions.html>

On 1 February 2022, India announced its Union Budget 2022-23, which contained an emphasis on combatting the impact of climate change and announced pilot projects in solar power, biomass, and other forms of low-carbon development.⁹⁴³

On 3 February 2022, Union Minister for Power and New and Renewable Energy Shri R.K Singh announced the adoption of several incentives for supporting the deployment of renewable energy, such as permitting and attracting foreign direct investment, waiving Inter-State Transmission System charges for the sale of solar and wind-produced electricity for projects commissioned by 30 June 2025, planning for the building of transmission infrastructure as part of the Green Energy Corridor Scheme, establishing bidding guidelines for renewable projects, and supporting R&D initiatives.⁹⁴⁴

On 17 February 2022, Prime Minister Narendra Modi launched the National Hydrogen Mission, which promotes hydrogen and ammonia use to reach a production of 5 million tons of green hydrogen by 2030.⁹⁴⁵

On 16 March 2022, Minister of State for Education Smt. Annapurna Devi announced that the notion of climate change has been incorporated into the National Council of Educational Research and Training's school curriculum.⁹⁴⁶

On 22 March 2022, the government adopted multiple initiatives to incentivize domestic renewable energy R&D and production, such as financial schemes, a national preference for public procurement, domestic content requirements, and technology development programs.⁹⁴⁷

On 24 March 2022, the government implemented a scheme to support up to 30 per cent of the project cost of 50 solar parks, totaling a capacity of 40 GW.⁹⁴⁸

On 30 March 2022, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved an extension of the deadline for ten power projects to apply to become "megaprojects" in order to be eligible for tax exemptions and competitive power purchase agreements.⁹⁴⁹

On 2 May 2022, Union Minister of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Shri Bhupender Yadav and his German counterpart, Minister for Environment, Nature Conservation, Nuclear Safety, and Consumer Protection Steffi Lemke, signed a Joint Declaration of Intent on forest landscape restoration.⁹⁵⁰ The declaration provides a framework for fostering an Indo-German bilateral partnership for forest management.

⁹⁴³ Budget 2022: Sitharaman commits to fight climate change with clean energy, India Today (New Delhi) 2 February 2021. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.indiatoday.in/science/story/budget-2022-climate-change-action-solar-clean-energy-narendra-modi-net-zer-cop26-1907221-2022-02-01>

⁹⁴⁴ Incentives for Adoption of Renewable Energy, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (New Delhi) 3 February 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1795250>

⁹⁴⁵ Ministry of Power notifies Green Hydrogen/Green Ammonia Policy, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Power (New Delhi) 17 February 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1799067>

⁹⁴⁶ Incorporation of climate change in the school curriculum, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Education (New Delhi) 16 March 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1806707>

⁹⁴⁷ Government incentivizes local development and manufacturing of renewable energy technologies, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (New Delhi) 22 March 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1808349>

⁹⁴⁸ Government implements schemes to set up 50 Solar Parks of aggregate capacity 40,000 MW in the country, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (New Delhi) 24 March 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1809373>

⁹⁴⁹ Cabinet approves amendment in Mega Power Policy 2009 for Provisional Mega Power Projects, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA) (New Delhi) 30 March 2022. Access Date: 25 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1811355>

⁹⁵⁰ Joint Declaration of Intent on Forest Landscape Restoration between India and Germany signed virtually, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 2 May 2022. Access Date: 5 May 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822121>

On 2 May 2022, Minister Singh and German Minister for Economic Affairs and Climate Change Robert Habeck signed a joint declaration of intent to form a hydrogen task force.⁹⁵¹ Completing the National Green Hydrogen Mission, the task force will promote the production and use of hydrogen.

India has taken action to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Thomas Houlié

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

On 14 September 2021, the Ministry of Ecology and Environment issued a notice on controlling the emission of by-product trifluoromethane (HFC-23), which follows the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer.⁹⁵² The policy, which came fully into effect on 15 September 2021, prohibited the direct release of HFC-23 into the environment and required the use of disposal techniques approved by the Conference of the Parties to the Montreal Protocol. Chinese enterprises must establish operating ledgers for disposal facilities and strengthen the maintenance and management of equipment that prevent leakages.

On 21 September 2021, at the General Debate of the 76th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, President Xi Jinping announced that China will aim for carbon peaking before 2030 and carbon neutrality before 2060.⁹⁵³ China will also aid developing countries in achieving greener and low-carbon growth, as well as halting all projects of coal-fired power plants abroad.

On 24 October 2021, the State Council issued the Carbon Peak Before 2030 Notice of Action Plan.⁹⁵⁴ China pledged that the proportion of non-fossil energy consumption will be reduced to 2 per cent by 2025, and the energy consumption per unit of gross domestic product (GDP) will decrease by 18 per cent compared to 2020. The coal industry will be controlled during the 14th Five-Year Plan (2021-2025) and reduced during the 15th Five-Year Plan (2026-2030), by when new sectors must have at least 50 per cent renewable energy. China also plans to develop new hydropower plants in its southwestern region and promote the synergy between hydro, wind, and solar power generation. Basic knowledge about carbon peaking and carbon neutrality will be incorporated into the national educational curriculum, and the government will publish demonstration models to encourage greener and less extravagant lifestyles, enhancing national awareness of conservation.

⁹⁵¹ Joint declaration of Intent on Indo – German Green Hydrogen Task Force signed, Press Information Bureau, Government of India, Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (New Delhi) 2 May 2022. Access Date: 5 May 2022.

<https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1822146>

⁹⁵² 关于控制副产三氟甲烷排放的通知 [Notice on Controlling the Emission of By-product Trifluoromethane], Ministry of Ecology and Environment (Beijing) 9 September 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 10 January 2021. https://www.mee.gov.cn/xxgk/2018/xxgk/xxgk06/202109/t20210915_943345.html

⁹⁵³ China's Achievements, New Goals and New Measures for Nationally Determined Contributions, United Nations NDC Registry (Berlin) 29 October 2021. Access Date: 8 January 2021.

<https://www4.unfccc.int/sites/ndcstaging/PublishedDocuments/China%20First/China%E2%80%99s%20Achievements,%20New%20Goals%20and%20New%20Measures%20for%20Nationally%20Determined%20Contributions.pdf>

⁹⁵⁴ 国务院关于印发 2030 年前碳达峰行动方案的通知 [Notice of the State Council on Printing and Distributing the Action Plan for Carbon Peaking Before 2030], State Department of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 24 October 2021 Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 9 January 2021. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2021-10/26/content_5644984.htm

On 28 October 2021, China submitted its nationally determined contribution (NDC) to the United Nations.⁹⁵⁵ In addition to the goals of carbon peaking and carbon neutrality, the government also committed to raising the percentage of non-fossil fuels in the country's energy consumption to 25 per cent by 2030, higher than its previous goal of 20 per cent. China's NDC stated the goal of increasing the capacity of alternative energy sources to more than 1,200 gigawatts, including wind and solar power.

On 29 October 2021, the Ministry of Ecology and Environment released the 2021-2022 Autumn and Winter Air Pollution Comprehensive Control Plan.⁹⁵⁶ The policy emphasized the importance of controlling emissions and substituting for clean energy, setting a goal for major cities to complete the PM2.5 concentration control target by 31 March 2022. The policy also introduced the shutdown of all coal boilers with less than 35 steam tonnes per hour by December 2021, as well as increased financial support to maintain affordable prices for citizens.

On 31 October 2021, at 26th Conference of the Parties (COP26) to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change in Glasgow, China was among the 153 countries that submitted its NDC to strengthen climate mitigation measures and finalized the Paris Rulebook to increase transparency, create a system to move toward net zero objectives, increase natural disaster preparedness, and collaborate with other governments.⁹⁵⁷

On 4 November 2021, China joined India, Indonesia, and others in the Like-Minded Developing Countries to support the demand for wealthy developed nations to direct at least USD1.3 trillion annually in climate finance to less developed countries starting in 2030.⁹⁵⁸ The group proposed that half the funds should be used to finance renewable energy in developing countries, and the remaining funds should be dedicated to protecting them from the negative effects of global warming.

On 9 November 2021, the first nuclear power plant was completed in Haiyang, Shandong Province.⁹⁵⁹ The city is China's first to provide carbon-free winter heating, eliminating over 180,000 metric tonnes of carbon emissions per year.

On 10 November 2021, China and the United States issued a joint statement at COP26, reiterating their commitment to the goals provided in the Paris Agreement, including limiting the global temperature increase to below two degrees Celsius and reducing emissions.⁹⁶⁰ The two countries also outlined expected cooperation on regulatory policies, the clean energy transition and its benefits, and the use of related technology such as carbon capture, utilization and storage (CCUS). Before the next COP meeting, both countries plan to improve domestic measures on methane emission control at all government levels. China is developing a new National Action Plan in addition to its recently submitted NDC, which includes details on reducing methane emissions in the 2020s.

On 10 November 2021, the Special Envoy for Climate Change and Ministry of Ecology and Environment participated in a joint statement on COP26 on behalf of the BASIC Group of Brazil, South Africa, India and

⁹⁵⁵ China Submits Updated Climate Pledges to UN Ahead of Glasgow Talks, Reuters (Shanghai) 28 October 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/business/cop/china-submits-updated-climate-pledges-united-nations-2021-10-28/>

⁹⁵⁶ 关于印发《2021-2022年秋冬季大气污染综合治理攻坚方案》的通知 [Notice on Printing and Distributing the "2021-2022 Autumn and Winter Air Pollution Comprehensive Control Plan"], Ministry of Ecology and Environment (Beijing) 29 October 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. https://www.mee.gov.cn/xxgk2018/xxgk/xxgk03/202110/t20211029_958394.html

⁹⁵⁷ COP26: The Negotiations Explained, UN Climate Change Conference (Glasgow) 12 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. www.ukcop26.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/COP26-Negotiations-Explained.pdf

⁹⁵⁸ China, India and Other Developing Nations Seek \$1.3 Trillion a Year in Climate Finance, Wall Street Journal (Glasgow) 4 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2021. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/climate-finance-china-india-11636039142>

⁹⁵⁹ Nation Moves Ahead with Ambitious Climate Goals, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 January 2022. Access Date: 12 January 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202201/07/content_WS61d79648c6d09c94e48a34c1.html

⁹⁶⁰ U.S.-China Joint Glasgow Declaration on Enhancing Climate Action in the 2020s, U.S. Department of State Office of the Spokesperson (Washington D.C.) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022. <https://www.state.gov/u-s-china-joint-glasgow-declaration-on-enhancing-climate-action-in-the-2020s/>

China.⁹⁶¹ Along with ministerial counterparts from Brazil, India, and South Africa, Chinese representatives committed to further climate action in reducing its carbon dioxide emissions per unit of GDP by over 65 per cent vis-à-vis 2005 levels. They also pledged to increase the share of non-fossil fuels in primary energy consumption to approximately 25 per cent, increase the forest stock volume by 6 billion cubic meters from 2005 levels, and bring the total installed capacity of wind and solar power to over 1.2 billion kilowatts.

On 29 November 2021, China attended the 8th Ministerial Conference of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation in Dakar, Senegal. The national leaders of China and 53 African countries established a strategic partnership to combat climate change. China and Africa agreed to “speed up the implementation of South-South cooperation,” signed documents regarding the delivery of relevant aid materials and the construction of low-carbon and low greenhouse gas model areas.⁹⁶² China committed to using advanced technology such as the Beidou and Fengyun meteorological satellites, big data, and artificial intelligence for disaster prevention and mitigation, and to support African climate initiatives.

On 1 December 2021, the Ministry of Ecology and Environment launched a program to encourage the use of non-motor vehicles as a means of transportation.⁹⁶³ The program reduced carbon emissions by 10 tonnes in December, with the aggregate mileage of green transportation reaching 40,000 kilometres.

On 15 December 2021, Deputy Permanent Representative of China to the UN Dai Bing stated that China will continue to support multilateralism and “deeply participate in the process of global climate governance” to assist green and low-carbon energy projects in developing countries.⁹⁶⁴ Regarding the upcoming Beijing Winter Olympics, Dai stressed the importance of China operating all event venues using 100 per cent green electricity. China also reaffirmed its willingness to communicate and cooperate with other parties attending the 15th Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity, which will be hosted in Kunming in 2022.

On 22 December 2021, the Chinese Meteorological Administration announced the completion of the country’s first greenhouse gas observation network after 40 years of construction.⁹⁶⁵ The network consists of 60 stations covering key climate areas and includes a carbon neutrality effectiveness evaluation system to distinguish carbon flux on global and regional levels.

On 13 January 2022, at a press conference, the State Council announced that the Beijing 2022 Winter Olympics had achieved “98 per cent of its sustainable development commitments,” including zero carbon emissions during the games, the use of green electricity, and the construction of all stadiums reaching green standards.⁹⁶⁶ Officials state that the replacement of traditional coal power will reduce carbon emissions by 320,000 tons.

⁹⁶¹ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment releases joint statement on UNFCCC’s Glasgow Climate Change Conference, South African Government (Johannesburg) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/basic-ministerial-joint-statement-unfccc%E2%80%99s-glasgow-climate-change-conference-cop26cmp16cma3>

⁹⁶² 《中非应对气候变化合作宣言》 [Declaration on China-Africa Cooperation on Climate Change], Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 2 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/web/wjzbzhd/202112/t20211202_10461063.shtml

⁹⁶³ 生态环境部开展绿色骑行活动 月骑行四万公里减碳达十吨 [The Ministry of Ecology and Environment Launched Green Cycling Program, Reducing Carbon Emissions by 10 Tonnes and Reaching 40,000 Kilometres], Ministry of Ecology and Environment (Beijing) 1 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 12 January 2022. http://www.mee.gov.cn/ywdt/spxw/202112/t20211202_962564.shtml

⁹⁶⁴ 中方呼吁落实 COP26 成果 大力推动绿色低碳发展 [China Calls for the Implementation of COP26 Outcomes to Vigorously Promote Green and Low-Carbon Development], State Department of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 15 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2021-12/15/content_5660810.htm

⁹⁶⁵ 历时近四十年 我国首个温室气体观测网基本建成 [After nearly 40 years, China’s first greenhouse gas observation network basically completed], Government of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 22 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 12 January 2022. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2021-12/22/content_5663929.htm

⁹⁶⁶ Beijing 2022 Achieves 98% Sustainable Commitments, to Neutralize All Carbon Emissions During Games, Global Times (Beijing) 13 January 2022. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.globaltimes.cn/page/202201/1245839.shtml>

On 27 January 2022, Special Envoy Xie Zhenhua attended a virtual Ministerial Meeting of the Major Economies on Energy and Climate hosted by the United States.⁹⁶⁷

On 5 February 2022, President Xi and State Councillor Wang Yi met with the UN Secretary-General Antonio Guterres.⁹⁶⁸ The meeting discussed enhanced cooperation between China and the UN on issues of climate change, biodiversity, and climate finance for mitigation and adaptation, among other topics.

On 12 February 2022, the National Energy Administration and the National Development and Reforms Commission issued the “Opinions on Improving Institutions, Mechanisms, and Policy Measures for Green Energy and Low-Carbon Transformation.”⁹⁶⁹ The release put forth specific recommendations on technology upgrades, low-carbon power plant constructions, enhanced consolidation of national and provincial power grids to encourage renewable energy consumption, and a green energy policy system to be completed by 2030.

On 22 February 2022, the State Council published its Guiding Opinions on Green, Low-Carbon and Circular Development of the Economic System to promote low-emissions upgrades to infrastructure, accelerate the transition to green agriculture, create a green circular economy with emphasis on industrial sectors, and improve existing laws and regulations relating to clean energy.⁹⁷⁰

On 31 March 2022, the National Energy Administration released the “Guiding Opinions on Energy Work in 2022,” which sets goals on increasing the proportion of non-fossil fuel energy production through hydro and wind power and organizes the Pilot Program for Central Heating and Comprehensive Utilization of Nuclear Energy.⁹⁷¹

On 15 April 2022, the National Center for Climate Change Strategy and International Cooperation, a sub-organization under the Ministry of Ecology and Environment, organized tree planting activities to promote green lifestyles and advocate for sustainability.⁹⁷²

On 28 April 2022, Vice Foreign Minister Xie Feng attended the launch of the China-Pacific Islands Cooperation Committee on Climate Change, establishing sister cities and signing official projects with numerous Pacific Island countries on mutually beneficial innovation, partnerships, and financial aid.⁹⁷³

On 5 May 2022, the Ministry of Ecology and Environment announced a series of ecological and environmental activities to be implemented during National Science and Technology Activity Week, scheduled for 21 May

⁹⁶⁷ John Kerry, U.S. Climate Envoy, Tells Top Polluters ‘We Must All Move Faster’, The New York Times (Washington) 27 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/27/climate/john-kerry-climate-emissions.html>

⁹⁶⁸ Readout of the Secretary-General's meetings with the authorities of the People's Republic of China, United Nations Secretary-General (Beijing) 5 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.un.org/sg/en/node/261760>

⁹⁶⁹ By 2030, Basically Establish a Complete Policy System for Green Energy and Low-Carbon Development, Government of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 25 February 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 15 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-02/12/content_5673204.htm

⁹⁷⁰ State Council on Accelerating the Establishment and Improvement of Guiding Opinions on Green, Low-Carbon and Circular Development of the Economic System, State Department (Beijing) 22 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2021-02/22/content_5588274.htm

⁹⁷¹ China Will Speed Up Green Energy and Low-Carbon Transformation, Government of the People's Republic of China (Beijing), 31 March 2022. Translation provided by analyst. Access Date: 15 May 2022. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/31/content_5682611.htm

⁹⁷² National Climate Strategy Center Launches Spring Voluntary Tree Planting Activities, National Center for Climate Change Strategy and International Cooperation (Beijing) 18 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. http://www.ncsc.org.cn/xwdt/zxxw/202204/t20220418_975039.shtml

⁹⁷³ Work Together to Tackle Climate Change and Build a Closer China-Pacific Island Country Community with a Shared Future, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. https://www.mfa.gov.cn/web/ziliao_674904/zyjh_674906/202204/t20220428_10675213.shtml

2022 to 10 June 2022.⁹⁷⁴ The program includes lectures, exhibitions, and submissions from both experts and ordinary citizens to educate the public.

During the compliance cycle, China has ensured a holistic approach to climate change, focusing on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles. It has followed the goals outlined by the Paris Agreement, issued numerous domestic policies committing to net zero targets, enhanced its domestic systems, and worked multilaterally to support developing countries.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Katherine Zhang

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to ensure a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles.

On 30 September 2021, a delegation of ministers led by the Minister of Forestry, Fisheries, and the Environment Barbara Creecy met with Climate Envoys from France, the United States, the United Kingdom, Germany, and the European Union before the 26th Conference of the Parties (COP26) to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change to discuss opportunities to finance South Africa's Just Transition to a low-carbon economy.⁹⁷⁵ During the meeting, the delegation discussed South Africa's nationally determined contribution (NDC) to decrease greenhouse gas emissions and emphasized the need for equally ambitious financial support from developed countries.

On 22 October 2021, Minister Creecy briefed the public ahead of COP26 and announced that the Climate Investment Funds invited South Africa and three other countries to participate in the Accelerating Coal Transition Investment Program.⁹⁷⁶ As a participant, South Africa will develop an investment plan to finance the country's Just Transition to a low-carbon economy.

On 9 November 2021, Minister Creecy delivered a statement at COP26 in Glasgow.⁹⁷⁷ Creecy called for a two-year work programme on the Global Goal on Adaptation and stated that South Africa is developing a plan to allow for the transition to a low-carbon economy.

On 10 November 2021, the Ministry of Forestry, Fisheries, and Environment participated in a joint statement on COP26 on behalf of the BASIC Group of Brazil, South Africa, India and China.⁹⁷⁸ Along with ministerial counterparts from Brazil, China, and India, the Minister updated its NDC plan and aimed for a 17 per cent decrease in emissions by 2025 and a 32 per cent decrease in emissions by 2030.

⁹⁷⁴ Notice on Carrying Out a Series of Activities of Ecological Environment Science Popularization in the National Science and Technology Activity Week in 2022, Ministry of Ecology and Environment (Beijing) 5 May 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. https://www.mee.gov.cn/xxgk/2018/xxgk/xxgk06/202205/t20220505_976897.html

⁹⁷⁵ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment meets climate envoys ahead of COP26, South African Government (Johannesburg) 30 September 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/forestry-fisheries-and-environment-meets-climate-envoys-ahead-cop26-30-sep-2021-0000>

⁹⁷⁶ Minister Barbara Creecy on Glasgow International Climate Talks, South African Government (Johannesburg) 22 October 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-barbara-creecy-glasgow-international-climate-talks-22-oct-2021-0000>

⁹⁷⁷ Minister Barbara Creecy: South Africa, High-Level Segment UN Climate Change Conference, South African Government (Johannesburg) 9 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/un-climate-change-conference-cop26cmp16cma3-9-nov-2021-0000>

⁹⁷⁸ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment releases joint statement on UNFCCC's Glasgow Climate Change Conference, South African Government (Johannesburg) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 10 January 2021. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/basic-ministerial-joint-statement-unfccc%E2%80%99s-glasgow-climate-change-conference-cop26cmp16cma3>

On 16 November 2021, the Department of Water and Sanitation and the Danish Environmental Protection Agency under the Ministry of Environment extended their working agreement for five additional years in a treaty ratified by the Minister of Water and Sanitation Senzo Mchunu and Danish Ambassador Tobias Elling Rehfeld.⁹⁷⁹ The agreement focuses on technology transfer, capacity-building, research to support entities such as the Water Research Commission, and industrial water efficiency. Moreover, the agreement will aim to enhance water saving, recycling, and monitoring technology.

On 30 November 2021, Deputy Minister Candith Mashego-Dlamini attended the 8th Forum on China-Africa Cooperation in Dakar, Senegal.⁹⁸⁰ In his speech, he welcomed the adoption of the Declaration on China-Africa Cooperation on Climate, which agreed to advocate for cooperation for sustainable development.⁹⁸¹

On 6 February 2022, President Cyril Ramaphosa delivered an address to the African Union, concluding South Africa's term as the outgoing coordinator of the Committee of African Heads of State and Government on Climate Change.⁹⁸² He also lunched the finalized African Climate Change and Resilient Development Strategy and Action Plan for 2022-2032, which includes an outline for "harmonised and coordinated actions to respond to the impacts of climate change, as well as to plan for the continent's low-emission and climate-resilient future."⁹⁸³

On 1 March 2022, Minister of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment Barbara Creecy welcomed the 6th IPCC Assessment Report, "Climate Change 2022: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability," stating that the report "is an important contribution to enhancing scientific understanding on climate change on the impacts, adaptation and vulnerability, that must inform international policy."⁹⁸⁴

On 5 April 2022, South Africa welcomed the 6th IPCC Assessment Report on Climate Mitigation, which "emphasizes the urgency of acting on mitigation."⁹⁸⁵

South Africa ensured a holistic approach to climate change, focused on all dimensions including mitigation, adaptation, financing, capacity building and technology transfer along with sustainable lifestyles. It has taken domestic actions to finance its Just Transition to a low-carbon economy and engage in broader efforts of emission reduction and climate financing. Moreover, South Africa extended its bilateral agreement with Denmark, which focuses on capacity building, technological transfer, and recycling as a part of sustainable lifestyles.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Pantéa Jamsbidi Nouri

⁹⁷⁹ Water and Sanitation renew water sector collaboration with Denmark, South African Government (Johannesburg) 17 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/renew-water-sector-collaboration-17-nov-2021-0000>

⁹⁸⁰ Deputy Minister Candith Mashego-Dlamini: Eighth Ministerial Conference of FOCAC, South African Government (Johannesburg) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/deputy-minister-candith-mashego-dlamini-eighth-ministerial-conference-focac-30-nov-2021>

⁹⁸¹ China, Africa to strengthen cooperation on tackling climate change, China Global Television Network (Beijing) 2 December 2021. Access Date: 12 January 2022. <https://news.cgtn.com/news/2021-12-02/China-Africa-to-strengthen-cooperation-on-tackling-climate-change-15FcUW8CnHG/index.html>

⁹⁸² Statement by H.E. Cyril Ramaphosa, President of the Republic of South Africa and Outgoing Coordinator of the Committee of African Heads of State and Government on Climate Change, African Union (Addis Ababa) 6 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://au.int/sw/node/41459>

⁹⁸³ President Cyril Ramaphosa: CAHOSCC Committee of African Heads of State and Government on Climate Change, South African Government (Johannesburg) 6 February 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-cahoscc-committee-african-heads-state-and-government-climate>

⁹⁸⁴ Forestry, Fisheries and Environment welcomes 6th IPCC assessment on Climate Change on Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability, South African Government (Johannesburg) 1 March 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/south-africa-welcomes-6th-ipcc-assessment-climate-change-impacts-adaptation-and>

⁹⁸⁵ South Africa welcomes IPCC 6th Assessment Report on Climate Mitigation, South African Government (Johannesburg) 5 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/south-africa-welcomes-ipcc-6th-assessment-report-climate-mitigation-5-apr-2022-0000>

18. Climate Change: UNFCCC

“We reaffirm our commitment to the full implementation of the UNFCCC [United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change], its Kyoto Protocol and Paris Agreement, and to the principles of UNFCCC including ‘Common But Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective Capabilities’ in the light of different national circumstances.”

2021 BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India		0	
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.60 (80%)		

Background

The BRICS first committed to fight climate change at the 2009 Yekaterinburg Summit, where the leaders pledged to “support international cooperation in the field of energy efficiency” and expressed readiness to engage in “a constructive dialogue on how to deal with climate change based on the principle of common but differentiated responsibility, given the need to combine measures to protect the climate with steps to fulfill our socio-economic development tasks.” Since then, the BRICS members have maintained climate change as an integral agenda item, committing to support international efforts to combat its effects and immediate causes.⁹⁸⁶

The Paris Agreement, signed in 2015 stipulates three major goals: a) holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursuing efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels, recognizing that this would significantly reduce the risks and impacts of climate change; b) increasing the ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change and foster climate resilience and low greenhouse gas emissions development, in a manner that does not threaten food production; and c) making finance flows consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate resilient development.⁹⁸⁷

The concept of common but differentiated responsibilities first manifested in the Rio Declaration at the first Rio Earth Summit in 1992 as Principle 7, which states: “In view of the different contributions to global environmental degradation, States have common but differentiated responsibilities. The developed countries acknowledge the responsibility that they bear in the international pursuit of sustainable development in view of the pressures their societies place on the global environment and of the technologies and financial resources they command.” Similar language exists in the Framework Convention on Climate Change; parties should act to protect the climate system “on the basis of equality and in accordance with their common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities.”⁹⁸⁸

Thus, the common-but-differentiated principle stipulates that although all countries are equally responsible for creating the global public good, each has a different set of capabilities that can be applied to this end.

⁹⁸⁶ First Summit: Joint Statement of the BRIC Countries Leaders, BRICS (Moscow) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/brics/ruspresidency1/First%20Summit.pdf>

⁹⁸⁷ Paris Agreement, United Nations (New York) 12 December 2015. Access Date: 21 January 2022. https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english_paris_agreement.pdf

⁹⁸⁸ Rio Declaration on Environment and Development 1992, United Nations (New York) 14 June 1992. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <https://www.jus.uio.no/lm/environmental.development.rio.declaration.1992/portrait.a4.pdf/>

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the BRICS members to both take action aimed at the implementation of the Paris Agreement. As the Paris Agreement has three major components: greenhouse gases emissions reduction; climate adaptation and resilience; and climate finance mobilization, the BRICS countries must take actions on all three of these areas to fully comply with the commitment.

Actions tackling emissions reduction can include: introduction of financial stimuli for companies to cut emissions (e.g., carbon pricing, carbon tax), stimulating research and development (R&D) in innovative and/or green energy sources and utilization thereof, providing financial stimuli for private companies to adopt renewables, etc.

Actions on climate change adaptation can include: investing in resilient infrastructure, public awareness campaigns, investing in reconstruction of natural habitats and biomes, etc.

Actions on climate finance mobilization can include: engaging in private-public partnerships with private sector on climate-related projects, providing stimuli for private companies to invest in climate-related projects and R&D, etc.

The three areas of Paris Agreement may be covered by national strategic planning documents and/or concrete actions taken during the monitoring period. To fully comply with the commitment the BRICS member must both have a strategic policy document in place (regardless of the time of adoption) and take action on the above-mentioned goals during the monitoring period.

Partial compliance implies either not having the strategic policy documents in place, or not taking significant action on the Paris Agreement goals, or not covering all three issue areas of the Agreement.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS country does not take actions on any of the three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, climate adaptation and resilience, and climate finance mobilization.
0	The BRICS country takes action to address one or two of the three main issue areas of the Paris Agreement: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, climate adaptation and resilience, OR climate finance mobilization.
+1	The BRICS country takes action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing all three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction AND climate adaptation and resilience AND climate finance mobilization.

*Compliance Director: Alexander Ignatov
Lead Analyst: Andrei Sakharov*

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to implement the Paris Agreement.

On 10 September 2021, Brazil through the Ministry of Regional Development reported the launch of the sustainable urban drainage system in Sertãozinho, São Paulo.⁹⁸⁹ The Federal Government invested BRL81.2 million (USD15.42 million) into this project, which is expected to benefit the entire population of the city of about 33,000 families by preventing floods, expanding access to clean and safe water and sanitation services, as well as improving water usage efficiency. Among the objectives of the project is widening the existing canal, creating a retention reservoir, and building 15 reinforced concrete bridges and a linear park on the banks of the stream.

⁹⁸⁹ Obra de drenagem urbana sustentável é entregue no estado de São Paulo, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasilia) 10 September 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/casacivil/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/2021/setembro/obra-de-drenagem-urbana-sustentavel-e-entregue-no-estado-de-sao-paulo>

On 31 October 2021, on the first day of the United Nations Climate Change Conference the Brazilian Government announced that it was committed to reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 50 per cent by 2030 with an ultimate goal of reaching carbon neutrality by 2050. Brazil also shared its plans to eliminate illegal deforestation in the country.⁹⁹⁰ The explicit actions for the country to reach this goal are contained in the document “Guidelines for a National Strategy for Climate Neutrality,” presented at the event. The publication includes the “National Plan for the Control of Illegal Deforestation and Recovery of Native Vegetation 2020-2023.”⁹⁹¹

On 17 January 2021, the Ministry of Mines and Energy of Brazil affirmed the decision of the National Energy Policy Council to maintain the mandatory biodiesel content in diesel fuel at 10 per cent throughout 2022.⁹⁹² This policy is aimed at reducing carbon dioxide emissions resulting from the use of diesel fuel and promote the clean bioenergy sector. It also acts as one of the staples of the Guidelines for a National Strategy for Climate Neutrality.

On 18 January 2022, the Ministry of Mines and Energy of Brazil published a report on the importance of the building sector for energy consumption.⁹⁹³ The report, titled “Implementing the Paris Agreement and Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions Throughout the Life Cycle of Buildings: European Public Policies, Tools and Market Initiatives,” was prepared by the Buildings Performance Institute Europe in partnership with the Ministry. The study presents public policies developed to assist in the adoption of strategies and reduce the environmental impact of the building sector.

On 21 March 2022, the Ministry of Mines and Energy and the Ministry of Environment launched a set of incentive measures for the production and sustainable use of biomethane.⁹⁹⁴ The initiative contributes to the commitments made by the country during the 26th United Nations Climate Change Conference. The document, signed by Brazil and more than a hundred other countries, provides for a global effort to reduce methane emissions by 30 per cent by 2030 in relation to the 2020 levels. The Ministry of Environment Administrative Rule no. 71, dated 21 March 2022, establishes the National Program for Methane Emission Reduction and the Special Regime of Incentives for Infrastructure Development.

On 13 April 2022, President Jair Bolsonaro signed a Federal Decree No. 11.043, establishing the National Solid Waste Plan.⁹⁹⁵ The plan includes guidelines, strategies, actions and sets targets to modernize solid waste management in the country, in order to put into practice the objectives set out in the National Policy for Solid Waste - Law No. 12.305 of 2010. Among the objectives set by the plan is the elimination of all landfill sites in the country by 2024.

⁹⁹⁰ Brasil encerra primeira semana de negociações com importantes avanços, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 6 November 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/brasil-encerra-primeira-semana-de-negociacoes-com-importantes-avancos>

⁹⁹¹ Diretrizes para uma Estratégia Nacional para Neutralidade Climática, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 31 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/DiretrizesparaumaEstrategiaNacionalparaNeutralidadeClimtica.pdf>

⁹⁹² MME reafirma o acerto da decisão do CNPE de manter o teor de biodiesel no diesel em 10% ao longo de 2022, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 17 January 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mme-reafirma-o-acerto-da-decisao-do-cnpe-de-manter-o-teor-de-biodiesel-no-diesel-em-10-ao-longo-de-2022>

⁹⁹³ MME publica relatório sobre importância de edificações no consumo energético, Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil (Brasília) 19 January 2022. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mme/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mme-publica-relatorio-sobre-importancia-de-edificacoes-no-consumo-energetico>

⁹⁹⁴ Governo Federal lança medidas de incentivo à produção e ao uso sustentável do biometano, Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasília) 21 March 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-lanca-medidas-de-incentivo-a-producao-e-ao-uso-sustentavel-do-biometano>

⁹⁹⁵ Governo Federal acaba com espera de mais de 10 anos e publica decreto do Plano Nacional de Resíduos Sólidos Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasília) 14 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-federal-acaba-com-a-espera-de-mais-de-10-anos-e-publica-decreto-do-plano-nacional-de-residuos-solidos>

On 26 April 2022, Brazil published the joint Interministerial Ordinance No. 107, of 25 April 2022, which provides for the controlled elimination of polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), approves the PCB Management Manual for electric equipment and implements the PCB National Inventory system.⁹⁹⁶ PCBs are a class of persistent organic pollutants, banned by the Stockholm Convention in 2001.

Brazil has taken action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing all three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, climate adaptation and resilience, and climate finance mobilization.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment to implement the Paris Agreement.

On 7 October 2021, the Government of Russia approved a list of socio-economic development initiatives until 2030.⁹⁹⁷ The initiatives on the list are divided into six categories: social sphere, construction, ecology, digital transformation, technological breakthrough and the “state for citizens.” The “Ecology” category contains four initiatives aimed at recycling and careful extraction of mineral resources, reducing greenhouse gas emissions, eliminating hazardous landfills and emergency facilities. The estimated government spending on the initiatives by 2024 amounts to RUB4.6 trillion (USD61 billion).

On 13 October 2021, the Government of Russia signed an agreement with the state “Gazprom” company on cooperation in the field of hydrogen energy.⁹⁹⁸ The agreement is aimed at accelerating the development of natural gas-based technologies in the field of hydrogen energy and establishing pilot projects. “Gazprom” is expected to develop and submit a roadmap with the technological development targets for the Government’s approval.

On 15 October 2021, at the Strategic session on the development of hydrogen energy in Russia the Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin announced, that more than RUB9 billion (USD120 million) would be invested over the three years in the development of competitive domestic technologies for production, transportation, and storage of hydrogen, creation hydrogen energy technologies test sites.⁹⁹⁹

On 29 October 2021, the Government of Russia approved the Strategy of Socio-Economic Development of the Russian Federation with Low Greenhouse Gas Emissions until 2050.¹⁰⁰⁰ The strategy provides for the establishment of the national system for greenhouse gas emissions reduction and sustainable development support, creating a system of public non-financial reporting by companies, improvement of energy and environmental efficiency in economic sectors, finalization of information and technical manuals on the best

⁹⁹⁶ Governo regulamenta eliminação controlada de substâncias tóxicas, Ministério do Meio Ambiente (Brasília) 26 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/mma/pt-br/noticias/governo-regulamenta-eliminacao-controlada-de-substancias-toxicas>

⁹⁹⁷ Pravitel'stvo utverdilo perechen' iniciativ social'no-jekonomicheskogo razvitija do 2030 goda (The government approved a list of socio-economic development initiatives until 2030), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 7 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/43451/>

⁹⁹⁸ «Gazprom» i Pravitel'stvo RF podpisali soglasenie o namerenijah v oblasti vodorodnoj jenergetiki (Gazprom and the Russian Government Signed an Agreement of Intent in the field of Hydrogen Energy), Gazprom (Moscow) 13 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gazprom.ru/press/news/2021/october/article539806/>

⁹⁹⁹ Strategicheskaja sessija po razvitiju v Rossii vodorodnoj jenergetiki (Strategic session on the development of hydrogen energy in Russia), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 15 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/43558/>

¹⁰⁰⁰ Strategija social'no-jekonomicheskogo razvitija Rossijskoj Federacii s nizkim urovnem vybrosov parnikovyh gazov do 2050 goda (Strategy of Socio-Economic Development of the Russian Federation with Low Greenhouse Gas Emissions until 2050), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 29 October 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://static.government.ru/media/files/ADKkCzp3fWO32e2yA0BhtlpyzWfHaiJa.pdf>

available technologies, taking into account energy and resource efficiency practices, incentivizing recycling and reuse of energy resources and goods, promoting the practices of waste reduction and re-utilization, reforestation, etc. The ultimate goal of the strategy is to ensure Russia's compliance with its international obligations to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

On 10 December 2021, Minister of Energy Nikolai Shulginov launched the Russko-Polyanskaya solar power plant in Omsk oblast. The plant is expected to provide an annual reduction of harmful emissions by 12,700 tons and improve the environmental situation in the Omsk region. Commissioning of the Russko-Polyanskaya power plant will increase the total installed capacity of solar generation in the region's energy system to 60 MW, according to the minister. Total investment into the solar power plant construction amounted to RUB2.8 billion (USD37 million).¹⁰⁰¹

On 16 December 2021, the Government of Russia approved the rules for posting publicly available information on the state of the environment.¹⁰⁰² According to the new rules, federal, regional, and local authorities are obligated to publish information on the state of the environment, including the quality of atmospheric air, soil, water, and forest resources, harmful emissions, as well as radiation levels on their official websites or make it available to the public through state and municipal information systems.

On 29 March 2022, the Federal Project "Clean Air" was extended by two years – until 31 December 2026.¹⁰⁰³ The project aims to ensure a significant reduction in air pollution in 12 major industrial centers: Bratsk, Krasnoyarsk, Lipetsk, Magnitogorsk, Mednogorsk, Nizhny Tagil, Novokuznetsk, Norilsk, Omsk, Chelyabinsk, Cherepovets and Chita through measures to reduce emissions from industrial enterprises, municipal and transport infrastructure facilities.

On 21 April 2022, the Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment announced that in March-April 2022 four new projects for the reclamation of landfills near Moscow "Safonovo," "Yadrovo," "Zavolenye" and "Taldomsky" were launched in accordance with the federal project "Clean Country" of the national project "Ecology."¹⁰⁰⁴ Additionally, in December 2021, contracts were signed for the reclamation of the Egorievsky and Volovichi landfills.

On 22 April 2022, the Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment reported that it had finished the drafting of the federal law "On Amending the Forest Code of the Russian Federation" and Article 9 of the Federal Law "On Limiting Greenhouse Gas Emissions."¹⁰⁰⁵ The draft law is aimed at the implementation of climate projects in the field of forest relations on the territory of Russia, ensuring the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and increasing the absorption of greenhouse gases.

¹⁰⁰¹ Nikolaj Shul'ginov Dal Start Rabote Russko-Poljanskoj Solnechnoj Jelektrostantsii V Omskoj Oblasti (Nikolay Shulginov Gave the Go-Ahead For The Operation of the Russko-Polyanskaya Solar Power Plant in the Omsk Region), Ministry of Energy of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 10 December 2021. Translation provided by the analyst. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://minenergo.gov.ru/node/22185>

¹⁰⁰² Pravitel'stvo utverdilo pravila razmeshhenija obshhedostupnoj informacii o sostojanii okruzhajushhej sredy (The Government of Russia approved the rules for posting publicly available information on the state of the environment), Government of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 December 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <http://government.ru/news/44150/>

¹⁰⁰³ A law was passed that expanded the terms of the federal "Clean Air" project, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 29 March 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/prinyat_zakon_kotoryy_rasshiril_sroki_realizatsii_federalnogo_proekta_chistyy_vozdukh/

¹⁰⁰⁴ "Clean Country": six new projects for the elimination of large landfills in the Moscow region started in 2022, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 21 April 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/chistaya_strana_v_2022_godu_startovali_shest_novykh_proektov_po_likvidatsii_krupnykh_poligonov_tko_v/

¹⁰⁰⁵ Forest climate projects will help reduce greenhouse gas emissions, Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment (Moscow) 22 April 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

https://www.mnr.gov.ru/press/news/klimaticheskie_proekty_v_oblasti_lesnykh_otnosheniy_pomogut_sokratit_vybrosy_parniko_vykh_gazov/

Russia has taken action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing all three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, climate adaptation and resilience, and climate finance mobilization.

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

India: 0

India has partially complied with the commitment to implement the Paris Agreement

On 2 November 2021 the Prime Minister Narendra Modi addressed the United Nations Climate Change Conference (COP26), announcing the country's goals of increasing non-fossil energy capacity to 500GW, while meeting about 50 per cent of its energy requirements from renewables by 2030; reducing carbon intensity of its economy by more than 45 per cent by 2030, and reaching Net Zero by 2070.¹⁰⁰⁶

On 6 November 2021, at COP26 the Indian Delegation stated that while India represented 17 per cent of the global population, its historical cumulative emissions amounted to only 4 per cent, and annual greenhouse gas emissions to about 5 per cent.¹⁰⁰⁷ The achievement of 24 per cent reduction in gross domestic product emission intensity in 2005-2014 was also noted, as well as 17-fold increase in India's solar energy generation capacity.

On 1 February 2022, the Ministry of Finance of India presented the Budget 2022-2023, unveiling a set of Government policies on sustainable development promotion.¹⁰⁰⁸ These included: measures to promote a shift to increased use of public transportation in urban areas, as well as supporting technology applications, such as electric vehicles; the allocation of additional funds to facilitate the domestic manufacturing of solar panels; a plan on circular economy transition; the introduction of 5-7 per cent biomass pellets to thermal power plants, which would allegedly result in CO2 savings of 38 MMT annually.

India has taken action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing two of the three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, and climate finance mobilization.

Thus, India receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment to implement the Paris Agreement.

On 30 November 2021, China Petroleum and Chemical Corp, launched a project in Kuqa, Xinjiang Uygur autonomous region, building a green hydrogen plant, which would be powered entirely by solar energy.¹⁰⁰⁹ The project is expected to reduce carbon dioxide emissions by 485,000 tons annually after it becomes operational in 2022.

¹⁰⁰⁶ National Statement by Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi at COP26 Summit in Glasgow, Ministry of External Affairs of India (Delhi) 2 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/34466/National+Statement+by+Prime+Minister+Shri+Narendra+Modi+at+COP26+Summit+in+Glasgow>

¹⁰⁰⁷ India speaks on climate change from a position of strength and responsibility at the Facilitative Sharing of Views (FSV) of India's Third Biennial Update Report (BUR) at COP26, Indian Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (New Delhi) 6 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://moef.gov.in/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/PIB1769796.pdf>

¹⁰⁰⁸ Budget 2022-2023 Speech of Nirmala Sitharaman Minister of Finance, Government of India (Delhi) 1 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. https://www.indiabudget.gov.in/doc/budget_speech.pdf

¹⁰⁰⁹ Nation moves ahead with ambitious climate goals, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202201/07/content_WS61d79648c6d09c94e48a34c1.html

On 7 December 2021, the National Energy Administration announced that it would launch the second phase of the wind and solar power projects focusing on the Gobi Desert and other arid regions by 2022.¹⁰¹⁰ The new power plants are expected to get connected to the grid by 2023-24, generating clean energy for the region.

On 24 January 2022, the State Council released a Comprehensive work plan for energy conservation and emission reduction, detailing the country's efforts "to build and improve an economic structure conducive to green, low-carbon and circular development in its ongoing anti-pollution fight to achieve its carbon peak and neutrality goals" set to be reached by 2060. The Plan is a part of the 14th five-year plan. It contains 10 measures aimed at energy conservation and emissions reduction, including improvements in building and infrastructure sectors, transport and logistics, curbing energy consumption, promoting green technologies, providing stimuli for industrial enterprises to improve waste pollution management and control, and dealing with waste accumulation. According to the plan, by 2025 China aims to reduce energy consumption per unit of gross domestic product by 13.5 percent from 2020 while keeping total energy consumption "at reasonable levels."¹⁰¹¹

On 29 January 2022, the Civil Aviation Administration issued a roadmap for green development during the 14th Five-Year Plan period (2021-2025). The plan set up targets to "make civil aviation smarter, low-carbon and resource-efficient to achieve green transformation," including by optimizing aircraft fuel consumption and reducing airport CO2 emissions.¹⁰¹²

On 23 March 2022, the National Development and Reform Commission and the National Energy Administration released a plan on the development of hydrogen energy for the 2021-2035. The plan provides for the creation of a complete cycle hydrogen energy industry development system "with the innovation capability significantly improved and the core technologies and manufacturing processes basically mastered."¹⁰¹³

On 30 May 2022, the State Council released a circular on the implementation plan to promote the high-quality development of new energy in the new era, prepared by the National Development and Reform Commission and the National Energy Administration.¹⁰¹⁴ The plan provides for the acceleration of the construction of a clean, low-carbon, safe and highly efficient energy system with the total installed electricity capacity of wind and solar power of 1.2 billion kilowatts by 2030.

China has taken action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing all three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, climate adaptation and resilience, and climate finance mobilization.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment to implement the Paris Agreement.

¹⁰¹⁰ More Gobi green projects in pipeline, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/news/topnews/202112/07/content_WS61aeb114c6d09c94e48a1c9b.html

¹⁰¹¹ 5-year plan spotlights green development, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 24 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022. http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202201/24/content_WS61ee88b6c6d09c94e48a4301.html

¹⁰¹² China's civil aviation sets out roadmap for green development, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 29 January 2022. Access Date: 2 February 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202201/29/content_WS61f4ecef6d09c94e48a4879.html

¹⁰¹³ China maps 2021-2035 plan on hydrogen energy development, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 23 March 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/statecouncil/ministries/202203/23/content_WS623ac568c6d02e53353282a4.html

¹⁰¹⁴ China to develop high-quality new energy in new era, State Council of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 30 May 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022.

http://english.www.gov.cn/policies/latestreleases/202205/30/content_WS62946dc4c6d02e533532b7e5.html

On 2 November 2021, at the United Nations Climate Change Conference (COP26), President Cyril Ramaphosa announced a revised Nationally Determined Contribution with the goals of reducing domestic carbon emissions to between 420 and 350 million tons of carbon dioxide equivalent by 2030.¹⁰¹⁵ President Ramaphosa also announced a partnership with the governments of France, Germany, the United Kingdom and the United States, as well as the European Union, to support a transition to a low-carbon economy in South Africa. The Partnership pledged to mobilize ZAR131 billion (USD 8.5 billion) over the next three years to implement the vision outlined in the Political Declaration on the just energy transition in South Africa, also unveiled at COP26. The Declaration laid out medium and long-term goals for “accelerated decarbonization” of the country’s energy system with particular attention to vulnerable demographics, e.g. coal miners, women and youth.

On 23 February 2022, in his 2022 Budget Speech, Minister of Finance of South Africa Enoch Godongwana announced the government’s plans to reform the electricity sector, including through the amendment of the 2006 Electricity Regulation Act,¹⁰¹⁶ that allow for private sector renewable energy generation projects of up to 100 megawatt without licensing.¹⁰¹⁷

On 23 May 2022, the Minister of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries, Barbara Creecy, announced the launch of the national waste management fleet, with an estimated worth of ZAR44.5 million (USD2.87 million).¹⁰¹⁸ The fleet, according to the Minister, consists of 22 vehicles including skip loader trucks, front end loaders, compactor trucks and other trucks required to transport waste within these areas. The vehicles will be active across 19 municipalities of the country.

South Africa has taken action to implement the Paris Agreement, addressing two three issue areas: greenhouse gases emissions reduction, and climate finance mobilization.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

¹⁰¹⁵ President Cyril Ramaphosa: COP26 Energy Session, Government of South Africa (Pretoria) 4 November 2021. Access Date: 2 February 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/cop26-energy-session-4-nov-2021-0000>

¹⁰¹⁶ Minister Enoch Godongwana: 2022 Budget Speech, South African Government (Pretoria) 23 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-enoch-godongwana-2022-budget-speech-23-feb-2022-0000>

¹⁰¹⁷ Electricity Regulation Amendment Bill, South African Government (Pretoria) 10 February 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://cer.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ELECTRICITY-REGULATION-AMENDMENT-BILL-10.02.2022-DMRE.pdf>

¹⁰¹⁸ Minister Barbara Creecy: Launch of national waste management fleet, South African Government (Pretoria) 23 May 2022. Access Date: 30 May 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-barbara-creecy-launch-national-waste-management-fleet-23-may-2022-0000>

19. Food and Agriculture: Intra-BRICS Cooperation

“Recognizing the importance of agriculture and rural revitalization for achieving the 2030 Agenda, we reiterate our commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.”

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa		0	
Average	+0.80 (90%)		

Background

Agriculture and cooperation therein are crucial areas of work for the BRICS as a consortium of emerging economies. At the leader, ministerial, and working group levels, issues of agricultural cooperation, food security, and rural development have consistently appeared in the agenda and outcome documents of BRICS summity.

On 16 June 2009, the Joint Statement on Global Food Security was adopted by the consortium.¹⁰¹⁹ The document recognized the impact of the global financial crisis on food security and resource availability in the agriculture sector. The statement welcomed international cooperation through agriculture-related fora such as the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) and the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 26 March 2010, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development met for the first time in Moscow, Russia.¹⁰²⁰

On 30 October 2011, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development agreed to “develop bio-energy while ensuring food security by giving consideration to the factors of energy demand, environmental protection and sustainable development.”¹⁰²¹ The Ministers acknowledged “FAO’s analytical framework of Bioenergy and Food Security), as one of the instruments that may play a role in assisting the development of national bio-energy policy compatible with the national strategies of poverty reduction, rural development, local energy and food security.” Importantly, at this meeting, the Ministers adopted the Working Procedures for Agricultural Cooperation Working Group of BRICS Countries, as well as the BRICS Agriculture Action Plan 2012-2016.^{1022,1023}

On 29 March 2012, the BRICS leaders adopted the Delhi Declaration, which recalled the ministerial-level progress on agriculture in Chengdu in October 2011. The leaders directed their Ministers to “take this process forward with particular focus on the potential of cooperation amongst the BRICS to contribute effectively to global food security and nutrition through improved agriculture production and productivity, transparency in

¹⁰¹⁹ BRIC’s Joint Statement on Global Food Security. BRICS Information Centre (Yekaterinburg) 16 June 2009. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/090616-food-security.html

¹⁰²⁰ Moscow Declaration of BRIC Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 26 March 2010. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/100326-agriculture.html

¹⁰²¹ Joint Declaration of the Second Meeting of BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Chengdu) 30 October 2011. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/111030-agriculture.html

¹⁰²² Working Procedures for Agricultural Cooperation Working Group of BRICS Countries, BRICS Information Centre (Chengdu) 30 October 2011. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/111030-agriculture-acwg.html

¹⁰²³ Action Plan 2012-2016 for Agricultural Cooperation of BRICS Countries, BRICS Information Centre (Chengdu) 30 October 2011. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/111030-agriculture-plan.html

markets and reducing excessive volatility in commodity prices, thereby making a difference in the quality of lives of the people particularly in the developing world.”¹⁰²⁴

On 29 October 2013, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development “resolved that the enhancement of agricultural cooperation among BRICS countries is of great significance for ensuring global food security and agricultural development towards attaining sustainable development, eradicating poverty and achieving the United Nations Millennium Development Goals.”¹⁰²⁵

On 15 July 2014, in the Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS leaders “committed to promoting agricultural cooperation and to exchange information regarding strategies for ensuring access to food for the most vulnerable population, reduction of negative impact of climate change on food security and adaptation of agriculture to climate change.”¹⁰²⁶

On 13 March 2015, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development met in Brasilia and “agreed that the Group would exchange views amongst themselves and with BRICS representations to the UN in New York, in particular, on the negotiations of Sustainable Development Goals in the context of the Post-2015 Development Agenda, and to other UN instances where matters related to agriculture, agrarian and rural development are being discussed.”¹⁰²⁷

On 9 July 2015, the BRICS leaders released the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership at the Ufa Summit. Agricultural cooperation was one of the main pillars of the Strategy, placing emphasis on 1) the development of a general strategy for ensuring access to food for the most vulnerable population, 2) trade and investment promotion, 3) basic agricultural information exchange system, 4) agricultural technology cooperation and innovation, and 5) reduction of negative impact of climate change on food security and adaptation of agriculture to climate change.¹⁰²⁸

On 9 October 2015, at a meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, the Ministers reiterated their commitment to advance agricultural cooperation. They also took stock of the work of the BRICS Agricultural Cooperation Working Group and progress in implementing the 2012-2016 Action Plan.¹⁰²⁹

On 23 September 2016, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture noted progress “in enhancing agriculture technology cooperation and innovation through the creation of a basic agricultural information exchange system, in reducing the impact of climate variability and change on food security and adaptation of agriculture to such changes.”¹⁰³⁰ The Ministers proceeded to support “giving differentiated yet coordinated considerations to transient and persistent food insecurity and nutrition” and “eliminating hunger and poverty through increased agricultural production on a sustainable basis.”

¹⁰²⁴ Fourth BRICS Summit: Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 29 March 2012. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/120329-delhi-declaration.html

¹⁰²⁵ Third Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Pretoria) 29 October 2013. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/131029-agriculture.html

¹⁰²⁶ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Fortaleza) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html

¹⁰²⁷ Joint Declaration of the 4th Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Brasilia) 13 March 2015. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150315-agriculture.html

¹⁰²⁸ The Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership, BRICS Information Centre (Ufa) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-partnership-strategy-en.html

¹⁰²⁹ Joint Declaration of the 5th Meeting of the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture and Agrarian Development, BRICS Information Centre (Moscow) 9 October 2015. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/151009-agriculture.html

¹⁰³⁰ Joint Declaration of BRICS Ministers of Agriculture, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 23 September 2016. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/160923-agriculture.html

On 4 September 2017, BRICS leaders adopted the Action Plan 2017-2020 for Agricultural Cooperation of BRICS Countries as one of Xiamen Summit's BRICS cooperation outcome documents.¹⁰³¹

On 26 September 2019, the BRICS Ministers of Agriculture met in Bonito, Brazil. They reiterated their commitment to further agricultural cooperation, and expressed a readiness “to strengthen mechanisms and enhance communication and coordination on major international issues, such as the encouragement of new solutions for food production increase, entrepreneurship in agri-tech start-ups, increase in international trade, fulfillment of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and food security in developing countries.”¹⁰³² They further pledged to “make continuous efforts in improving mechanisms of cooperation to promote further development of agriculture.” In particular, the Ministers recognized “the potential for rural revitalization, in order to safeguard and expand common interests.” They also committed “to implementing the BRICS Action Plan 2017-2020 for Agricultural Cooperation.”

On 14 November 2019, the BRICS leaders underscored “the importance of BRICS cooperation in agriculture,” acknowledging that the BRICS economies are world-leading producers of agricultural goods.¹⁰³³ The leaders recognized “the importance of science-based agriculture and of deploying ICT [information and communications technologies]” and “the need of ensuring food security, food safety, addressing malnutrition, eliminating hunger and poverty through increased agricultural production, productivity, sustainable management of natural resources and trade in agriculture among the BRICS countries.”

On 17 November 2020, the BRICS leaders adopted the Moscow Declaration, which committed to “reinforce the resilience of agriculture, rural areas and farmers in light of the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic through deepening agricultural cooperation including South-South and the promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas, through forms of support compatible with WTO rules on agriculture. Rural development is of great significance to the balanced improvement of the world agricultural production, food security and the implementation of sustainable goals in agriculture.”¹⁰³⁴

In November 2020, the Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025 was also released. The Strategy included a dedicated section on food security under the heading of “sustainable development.”¹⁰³⁵

On 27 August 2021, under India's BRICS presidency, the BRICS leaders adopted the Action Plan 2021-2024 for Agricultural Cooperation of BRICS Countries.¹⁰³⁶

Commitment Features

Adopted as part of the 2021 BRICS New Delhi Declaration, the commitment reads: “recognizing the importance of agriculture and rural revitalization for achieving the 2030 Agenda, we reiterate our commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.”¹⁰³⁷ The commitment is contextualized by the ensuing sentence, which reads: “we

¹⁰³¹ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Xiamen) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.pdf

¹⁰³² Bonito Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Bonito) 26 September 2019. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/190926-agriculture.html

¹⁰³³ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Brasília) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html

¹⁰³⁴ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html

¹⁰³⁵ Strategy for BRICS Economic Partnership 2025, BRICS Information Centre. November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/2020-strategy.html

¹⁰³⁶ Action Plan 2021-2024 for Agricultural Cooperation of BRICS Countries, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 27 August 2021. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210827-agriculture-action-plan.pdf

¹⁰³⁷ XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (New Delhi) 9 September 2021. Access Date: 25 November 2021. www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/210909-New-Delhi-Declaration.html

welcome the BRICS Agriculture Information Exchange System and the BRICS Agricultural Research Platform, as well as the adoption of the Action Plan 2021-2024 for Agricultural Cooperation of BRICS Countries.”

The commitment begins by recognizing “the importance of agriculture and rural revitalization for achieving the 2030 Agenda.” “Rural revitalization” refers to ways to positively transform rural areas for present and future generations, notably by forging links with urban economies and improving employment opportunities, rural incomes, and market linkages.¹⁰³⁸ The “2030 Agenda” refers to the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and 169 targets embodied in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.¹⁰³⁹ Of the SDGs, Goal 2 on Zero Hunger and Goal 11 on Sustainable Cities and Communities are especially pertinent to rural development, according to the Sustainable Development Goals Knowledge Platform.¹⁰⁴⁰

The commitment verb “reiterate” is a low binding word indicating that the present commitment was established at previous BRICS summits yet not completed.¹⁰⁴¹ Consequently, the verb also indicates that the BRICS leaders intended for new efforts to be made before the next summit, providing a basis to assess compliance within the current compliance cycle.

“Enhance” refers to actions “to heighten or intensify.”¹⁰⁴² The term “intra-BRICS” connotes that full compliance with the present commitment requires cooperation between the governments of Brazil, Russia, India, China and/or South Africa. Cooperation between a BRICS Member and other non-BRICS governments fall outside the scope of this commitment.

“Cooperation” is understood to mean “the action or process of working together to the same end.”¹⁰⁴³ In the context of agriculture, examples of cooperation include supporting research partnerships and knowledge-sharing, addressing trade barriers facing agricultural commodities, initiating technology transfer initiatives, implementing international standards, or participating in and contributing to relevant international organizations (e.g. FAO, World Food Council, agricultural negotiations at the WTO etc.).

Part I – Agricultural Cooperation for Food Security

The first pillar of the commitment pledges intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security i.e. “all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient safe and nutritious food that meets their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life.”¹⁰⁴⁴ The concept of food security has four dimensions: “availability, access, utilization and stability.”¹⁰⁴⁵

Part II – Agricultural Cooperation for Promotion of Comprehensive Development of Rural Areas

The second pillar of the commitment provides that intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation should strive to promote comprehensive development of rural areas. “Promotion” refers to actions that “support or renew old

¹⁰³⁸ Rural Revitalization: Tapping into New Opportunities, International Food Policy Research Institute (Washington DC) 2019. Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://www.ifpri.org/publication/rural-revitalization-tapping-new-opportunities>

¹⁰³⁹ Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (New York) Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda>

¹⁰⁴⁰ Decisions by Topic: Rural Development, Sustainable Development Goals Knowledge Platform (New York) Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/topics/ruraldevelopment/decisions>

¹⁰⁴¹ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁰⁴² Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁰⁴³ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁰⁴⁴ An Introduction to the Basic Concepts of Food Security, Food and Agriculture Organization (Rome) 2008. Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://www.fao.org/3/al936e/al936e.pdf>

¹⁰⁴⁵ Global Strategic Framework for Food Security & Nutrition (GSF), Committee on World Food Security, Food and Agriculture Organization (Rome) 2014. Access Date: 25 November 2021. https://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/cfs/Docs1314/GSF/GSF_Version_3_EN.pdf

efforts or create new efforts in the area,” and/or “contribute to the growth or prosperity” of something and “to help bring into being.”¹⁰⁴⁶

“Comprehensive” is understood to mean “complete and including everything that is necessary.”¹⁰⁴⁷ The word qualifies the multisectoral and interdisciplinary nature of “rural development,” which spans areas of work including poverty, inequality, natural resources, agricultural goods and services, manufacturing, infrastructure, education, health, environmental sustainability, gender, and demographics and more.¹⁰⁴⁸ “Rural development” refers to developmental strategies and efforts to improve the socioeconomic, political, environmental, and technological conditions of rural communities and their localities.¹⁰⁴⁹

To achieve full compliance, the BRICS member must demonstrate compliance with both pillars of the commitment by reaffirming its pledge to enhance intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for 1) food security *and* 2) promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

In assessing compliance, a depth analysis will be applied accordingly. For example, if a BRICS member dedicates financial resources to fostering intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation, such a concrete action would be assessed with greater weight for compliance than a rhetorical reiteration of the commitment. As another example, if a BRICS member demonstrates agricultural cooperation through multiple intra-BRICS channels, this would constitute more robust compliance than pursuing one platform of cooperation.

A score of partial compliance, or 0, is attributed to BRICS members that only demonstrate solid compliance with one pillar of the commitment, or somewhat comply with both pillars. Less than strong compliance refers to verbal affirmations, political statements, participation in international meetings, and other symbolic reiterations of the present commitment.

Non-compliance, denoted by a score of -1, is scored by BRICS members that have not taken any actions to comply with the present commitment within the compliance cycle.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member did NOT reiterate its commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security NOR promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.
0	The BRICS member reiterated its commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security OR promote comprehensive development of rural areas.
+1	The BRICS member reiterated its commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security AND promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Angela Minyi Hou

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to reiterate enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

On 17 September 2021, Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply Tereza Cristina spoke at a meeting of G20 agriculture ministers, criticizing protectionist measures that hurt rural communities in developing

¹⁰⁴⁶ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 25 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹⁰⁴⁷ Comprehensive, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/comprehensive>

¹⁰⁴⁸ 1.2 Defining Rural Development, SOAS University of London (London) Access Date: 25 November 2021. https://www.soas.ac.uk/cedep-demos/000_P530_RD_K3736-Demo/unit1/page_09.htm

¹⁰⁴⁹ What is Rural Development, IGI Global (Hershey) Access Date: 25 November 2021. <https://www.igi-global.com/dictionary/concept-and-approach-to-land-management-interventions-for-rural-development-in-africa/58467>

countries.¹⁰⁵⁰ She called for an increase of resources for rural producers to adopt innovative and sustainable agricultural practices.

On 18 September 2021, Minister Cristina spoke at a meeting of G20 agriculture ministers and called for the world's main economies to comply with the Sustainable Development Goals.¹⁰⁵¹

On 24 September 2021, Minister Cristina delivered a recorded message at the United Nations Food Systems Summit. She emphasized the importance of ongoing work towards developing “a more productive, inclusive and sustainable food system by 2030, based on increasing productivity without using new areas and reducing food waste.”¹⁰⁵²

On 14 October 2021, at a virtual event held by the Brazil-China Business Council, Minister Cristina stated that China is a “fundamental partner” in the process of placing sustainability and technology at the core of economic development.¹⁰⁵³ Secretary of Innovation, Rural Development and Irrigation Fernando Camargo specifically highlighted the importance of sustainability and technology in Brazil's agricultural industry.

On 6 November 2021, Secretary of Sustainable Development and Irrigation of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply Fernando Camargo stated that Brazil will continue to seek partnerships and an inclusive approach to forestry, agriculture, and commodity trade.¹⁰⁵⁴

On 17 November 2021, Minister Cristina met with Russian authorities and businessmen in Moscow to discuss the supply of fertilizers to Brazil, which is essential to domestic agricultural production.¹⁰⁵⁵ Russian Minister of Economic Development Maksim Reshetnikov committed to maintaining and potentially increasing the supply of potassium and phosphate fertilizers.

¹⁰⁵⁰ No G20, ministra Tereza Cristina defende mais recursos para práticas inovadoras e sustentáveis no agro mundial [At the G20, Minister Tereza Cristina defends more resources for innovative and sustainable practices in global agriculture], Ministério da Agricultura, Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 17 September 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/no-g20-ministra-tereza-cristina-defende-mais-recursos-para-praticas-inovadoras-e-sustentaveis-no-agro-mundial>

¹⁰⁵¹ Países do G20 devem liderar ações para crescimento com gestão social e ambiental, diz ministra [G20 countries should lead actions for growth with social and environmental management, says Minister], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 18 September 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/paises-do-g20-devem-liderar-acoes-para-crescimento-com-gestao-social-e-ambiental>

¹⁰⁵² Em Cúpula da ONU, ministra Tereza Cristina defende reconhecimento da diversidade dos sistemas produtivos de alimentos [At the UN Summit, Minister Tereza Cristina defends recognition of the diversity of food, livestock and supply production systems], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 24 September 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/em-cupula-da-onu-ministra-tereza-cristina-defende-a-diversidade-dos-sistemas-produtivo-de-alimentos>

¹⁰⁵³ Sustentabilidade e tecnologia devem ser as bases para relação entre Brasil e China, diz ministra [Sustainability and technology must be the basis for the relationship between Brazil and China, says Minister], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 14 October 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/sustentabilidade-e-tecnologia-devem-ser-as-bases-para-relacao-entre-brasil-e-china-diz-ministra>

¹⁰⁵⁴ Experiências do Brasil na agricultura podem ajudar outros países a mitigar emissões, diz secretário do Mapa na COP26, [Brazil's experiences in agriculture can help other countries to mitigate emissions, says MAPA secretary at COP26, Livestock and Supply], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 6 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/experiencias-do-brasil-na-agricultura-podem-ajudar-outros-paises-a-mitigar-emissoes-diz-secretario-do-mapa-na-cop26>

¹⁰⁵⁵ Autoridades e empresários da Rússia garantem a continuidade da exportação de fertilizantes ao Brasil [Russian authorities and businessmen guarantee the continuity of fertilizer exports to Brazil, Livestock and Supply], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 18 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/autoridades-e-empresarios-da-russia-garantem-a-continuidade-da-exportacao-de-fertilizantes-ao-brasil>

On 15 December 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply formalized two decentralized execution terms worth BRL300,00.¹⁰⁵⁶ The terms will allow rural producers to gain access to new technologies, which will contribute to local agricultural productivity.

On 15 December 2021, Brazil and China agreed to resume beef shipments after the World Organization for Animal Health determined that the Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) detected in the beef was of negligible health risk.¹⁰⁵⁷ Brazil had suspended exports in compliance with the bilateral protocol after identifying and reporting two atypical cases of BSE.

On 27 December 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply announced the creation of four working groups to monitor the agriculture sector regarding the implementation of commitments made by Brazil at the 26th UN Climate Change Conference of the Parties in Glasgow (COP26).¹⁰⁵⁸ The groups will focus on topics of environmental sustainability, such as methane mitigation in agriculture, land use change and environmental compliance.

On 31 December 2021, President Jair Bolsonaro authorized an additional BRL700 million for assistance to those affected by heavy rain, with BRL200 million dedicated to food security.¹⁰⁵⁹ The remainder of the funds were allocated to infrastructure and social services.

On 21 February 2022, Secretary of Innovation, Sustainable Development and Irrigation at the Ministry of Agriculture Fernando Camargo participated in the first high-level government meeting of the Agriculture Innovation Mission for Climate in Dubai.¹⁰⁶⁰ Brazil made its experience in the development of sustainable solutions for agriculture available to the countries in attendance.

On 15 March 2022, the government edited a provisional measure that improves the use of rural guarantees.¹⁰⁶¹ The change will allow more financing for rural farmers.

On 16 March 2022, Minister Cristina asserted that fertilizers should be excluded from the sanctions regime in order to preserve food security.¹⁰⁶² Minister Cristina stated that repressing the trade of fertilizers affects rural productivity, reduces food availability, and reinforces the inflation of main commodities.

¹⁰⁵⁶ Mapa disponibiliza recursos para implantação de tecnologia de ponta no Cariri Paraibano [Map makes resources available for the deployment of cutting-edge technology in Cariri Paraibano], Pecúária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 17 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mapa-disponibiliza-recursos-para-implantacao-de-tecnologia-de-ponta-no-cariri-paraibano>

¹⁰⁵⁷ China libera entrada de carne bovina do Brasil [China allows entry of beef from Brazil], Pecúária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 15 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/china-libera-entrada-de-carne-bovina-do-brasil>

¹⁰⁵⁸ Mapa cria grupos de trabalho para acompanhar compromissos estabelecidos na COP 26 [Mapa creates working groups to follow up on commitments established at COP 26], Pecúária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 27 December 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mapa-cria-grupos-de-trabalho-para-acompanhar-compromissos-estabelecidos-na-cop-26>

¹⁰⁵⁹ Brazil Releases Another \$125.6 Million to Flooded States, Bloomberg News (New York) 31 December 2021. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.bnnbloomberg.ca/brazil-releases-another-125-6-million-to-flooded-states-1.1701854>

¹⁰⁶⁰ Mapa participa de reunião de alto nível sobre inovação global na agricultura [Mapa participates in high-level meeting on global innovation in agriculture], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasília) 21 February 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mapa-participa-de-reuniao-de-alto-nivel-sobre-inovacao-global-na-agricultura>

¹⁰⁶¹ Governo Federal aprimora regras para facilitar acesso do produtor a garantias rurais [Federal Government improves rules to facilitate producer access to rural guarantees], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasília) 15 March 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/governo-aprimora-regras-para-facilitar-acesso-do-produtor-a-garantias-rurais>

¹⁰⁶² Assim como alimentos, fertilizantes devem ser excluídos de regime de sanções, diz ministra [Like food, fertilizers should be excluded from sanctions regime, says minister], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasília) 16 March 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/assim-como-alimentos-fertilizantes-devem-ser-excluidos-de-regime-de-sancoes-diz-ministra>

On 31 March 2022, the government opened a credit of BRL1.2 billion for rural farmers affected by drought.¹⁰⁶³ Small farmers will be provided with a rebate to cover some of their debt.

On 2 April 2022, the government authorized the granting of a rebate of 35.2 per cent on installments of rural credit operations contracted under the National Program for Strengthening Family Agriculture for rural producers affected by drought.¹⁰⁶⁴

On 6 April 2022, the government initiated a task force “to guarantee land titling to a large number of families settled in the country.”¹⁰⁶⁵ This will help more farmers gain access to rural credit.

On 28 April 2022, the Congress approved the Executive Branch's PLN 01/2022, which allocates BRL868.49 million to the Safra Plan.¹⁰⁶⁶ The funds will support the financing of rural financing contracts.

On 3 May 2022, the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply and the Brazilian Development Association signed a protocol of intentions. The collaboration “aims to hold territorial planning workshops, support territorial governance, prepare strategic studies and raise funds to finance programs and projects with a sustainability.”¹⁰⁶⁷

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas. Brazil has taken strong action to work with its BRICS counterparts regarding imports and exports of food and fertilizers, and it has further invested in rural areas domestically.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Joy Fan

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to reiterate enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

On 27 September 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture announced the participation of KA Timiryazev State Agrarian University, Kuban State Agrarian University, Stavropol State Agrarian University and Saratov State

¹⁰⁶³ Governo abre crédito de R\$ 1,2 bilhão para agricultores familiares afetados pela estiagem [Government opens credit of R\$ 1.2 billion to family farmers affected by drought], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasilia) 31 March 2022.

Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/governo-abre-credito-de-r-1-2-bi-para-agricultores-familiares-afetados-pela-estiagem>

¹⁰⁶⁴ Governo regulamenta desconto de 35,2% nos financiamentos para produtores rurais atingidos pela seca [Government regulates 35.2% discount on financing for rural producers affected by drought], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasilia) 2 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/governo-regulamenta-desconto-de-35-2-nos-financiamentos-para-produtores-rurais-atingidos-pela-seca>

¹⁰⁶⁵ Campanha Abril Verde e Amarelo terá força-tarefa para entrega de títulos de propriedade rural no país [Abril Verde e Amarelo campaign will have a task force to deliver rural property titles in the country], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasilia) 6 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/campanha-abril-verde-e-amarelo-tera-forca-tarefa-de-entrega-de-titulos-de-propriedade-rural-no-pais>

¹⁰⁶⁶ Congresso aprova liberação de recursos para o Plano Safra 2021/2022 [Congress approves release of resources for the 2021/2022 Crop Plan], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasilia) 28 April 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/congresso-aprova-liberacao-de-recursos-para-o-plano-safra-2021-2022>

¹⁰⁶⁷ Mapa e ABDE estabelecem parceria para o desenvolvimento sustentável da agropecuária no semiárido e norte do país [Mapa and ABDE establish a partnership for the sustainable development of agriculture in the semi-arid region and north of the country], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply (Brasilia) 3 May 2022. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 15 May 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/mapa-e-abde-estabelecem-parceria-para-o-desenvolvimento-sustentavel-da-agropecuaria-no-semiarido-e-norte-do-pais>

Agrarian University in the Priority 2030 program.¹⁰⁶⁸ The Priority 2030 program is a strategic academic leadership initiative that provides grants for scientific research. Participation will allow these academic institutions to conduct research in fields such as digital agriculture, agro-robotics, and agro-biotechnology.

On 28 October 2021, Deputy Minister of Agriculture Sergey Levin and Chinese Deputy Minister of Agriculture Ma Youxiang met to discuss agricultural trade and cooperation.¹⁰⁶⁹ The ministers identified key priority areas of future cooperation, which include mutual access to food, swift resolutions to issues concerning exporters and importers, and scientific and technical collaboration in agriculture.

On 17 November 2021, government authorities and businessmen met with Brazilian Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply Tereza Cristina in Moscow to discuss the supply of fertilizers to Brazil, which is essential to domestic agricultural production.¹⁰⁷⁰ Minister of Economic Development Maksim Reshetnikov committed to maintaining and potentially increasing the supply of potassium and phosphate fertilizers.

On 26 November 2021, the Foreign Ministers of Russia, India, and China met to discuss trilateral cooperation on key issues of concern, including food security.¹⁰⁷¹ The ministers welcomed the outcomes of the 13th BRICS summit and agreed to work towards strengthening their strategic partnership. The ministers also reaffirmed their commitment to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and climate action via the Kyoto Protocol and Paris Agreement.

On 26 November 2021, the government convened to discuss legal acts drafted by the Ministry of Agriculture aimed at promoting agricultural activity. The acts proposed initiatives such as the development of an information system of digital services for the agricultural sector and the provision of financial aid to farmers.¹⁰⁷² During this meeting, Russia committed to allocating RUB 10 billion in reimbursements to those that breed and keep cattle after a rise in fodder prices. An additional RUB 6 billion was allocated to reimbursing agricultural producers for upgrades of facilities, such as fruit and vegetable storage and seed production centers.¹⁰⁷³

On 30 December 2021, President Vladimir Putin approved a federal law relating to state monitoring of agricultural land.¹⁰⁷⁴ Under the law, monitoring will be conducted by federal authorities to collect information

¹⁰⁶⁸ Agrarian universities of the Ministry of Agriculture passed the first stage of defense of development programs within the framework of the Priority 2030 project, Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 27 September 2021. Access Date: 15 December 2021. <https://mcx.gov.ru/press-service/news/agrarnye-vuzy-minselkhoza-proshli-pervyy-etap-zashchity-programm-razvitiya-v-ramkakh-proekta-priorit/>

¹⁰⁶⁹ Russian-Chinese cooperation in the agricultural sector was discussed, Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 8 November 2021. Access Date: 15 December 2021. <https://mcx.gov.ru/en/news/Russian-Chinese-cooperation-in-the-agricultural-sector-was-discussed/>

¹⁰⁷⁰ Autoridades e empresários da Rússia garantem a continuidade da exportação de fertilizantes ao Brasil [Russian authorities and businessmen guarantee the continuity of fertilizer exports to Brazil, Livestock and Supply], Pecuária e Abastecimento [Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply] (Brasília) 18 November 2021. Translation provided by Google Translate. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.gov.br/agricultura/pt-br/assuntos/noticias/autoridades-e-empresarios-da-russia-garantem-a-continuidade-da-exportacao-de-fertilizantes-ao-brasil>

¹⁰⁷¹ Joint Communique of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/Joint_Communique_of_the_18th_Meeting_of_the_Foreign_Ministers_of_the_Russian_Federation_the_Republic_of_India_and_the_Peoples_Republic_of_China

¹⁰⁷² The Russian Government meeting discussed agricultural sector development, Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 15 December 2021. <https://mcx.gov.ru/en/news/The-Russian-Government-meeting-discussed-agricultural-sector-development/>

¹⁰⁷³ Government meeting, The Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 15 December 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43914/>

¹⁰⁷⁴ Amendments have been made to the legislation aimed at improving the legal regulation of relations arising in connection with the implementation of state monitoring of agricultural land, Kremlin (Moscow) 30 December 2021. Access Date: 21 January 2022. <http://www.kremlin.ru/catalog/keywords/44/events/67518>

on the fertility of lands, which will then be entered into a registry. The law also outlines the procedures landowners may take to obtain information collected about their land.

On 4 February 2022, President Putin and President Xi Jinping of China met in Beijing and took part in the opening ceremony of the XXIV Olympic Winter Games.¹⁰⁷⁵ They published a Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, which referenced food security as an area of cooperation to accelerate the implementation of the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

On 28 February 2022, the government announced the expansion of grants for agribusinesses involved in implementing comprehensive science and technology.¹⁰⁷⁶ RUB1 billion will be invested in newly eligible projects, such as those in the live-stock breeding sector, and for farmers growing oil-bearing seed crops.

On 10 March 2022, the government suspended exports of agricultural machinery (among other goods and equipment) to all countries except member states of the Eurasian Economic Union, Abkhazia and South Ossetia.¹⁰⁷⁷ The suspension was adopted as a follow-up to the Presidential Executive Order on Application of Special Economic Measures in Foreign Economy Activity to Ensure the Security of the Russian Federation, effective until the end of 2022.

On 21 March 2022, amid global sanctions, the government announced plans to increase agricultural imports from over 140 companies in countries including Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Belarus, Turkey, India, and China.¹⁰⁷⁸ In addition, the government announced RUB2.5 billion to support baking enterprises and stabilise bread prices.

On 24 March 2022, the government announced an investment of RUB2 billion in subsidies for the transport of agricultural produce by rail.¹⁰⁷⁹ The investment aims to increase freight carriage of items such as grain, vegetables, and fish by at least 1 million tons.

On 12 April 2022, the government announced an investment of RUB5 billion to support the construction of a large livestock breeding facility to scale up the production of poultry.¹⁰⁸⁰ The government also announced that citizens will be able to buy out state-owned land plots for farming or horticulture.

On 25 April 2022, the government announced new measures to promote agricultural production, including subsidies for small and medium-sized enterprises as well as the owners of household plots.¹⁰⁸¹ Funding will also be available for those implementing novel technologies for farming and greenhouse use.

Russia has taken action to strengthen agricultural trade and cooperation with China and Brazil, recognizing the need to promote mutual access to food and cooperate on agricultural innovation. Russia has also taken measures to promote the development of rural areas by investing in agricultural research and providing financial support to agricultural producers.

¹⁰⁷⁵ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Beijing) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770

¹⁰⁷⁶ Meeting with deputy ministers on current issues, Kremlin (Moscow) 28 February 2022. Access Date: 1 March 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44669/>

¹⁰⁷⁷ The Government approves a list of goods and equipment the export of which will be suspended, Kremlin (Moscow) 10 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <http://government.ru/en/docs/44762/>

¹⁰⁷⁸ Meeting with deputy ministers on current issues, Kremlin (Moscow) 21 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44876/>

¹⁰⁷⁹ Government meeting, Kremlin (Moscow) 24 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/44912/>

¹⁰⁸⁰ Meeting of the Presidium of the Government Commission to Increase the Sustainability of the Russian Economy under the Sanctions, Kremlin (Moscow) 12 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/45119/>

¹⁰⁸¹ Meeting with deputy prime ministers on current issues, Kremlin (Moscow) 25 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. <http://government.ru/en/news/45261/>

Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Amandeep Saini

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to reiterate enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

On 14 September 2021, Minister of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare Narendra Singh Tomar signed memorandums of understanding to initiate digital agriculture pilot projects with CISCO, Ninjacart, Jio Platforms Limited, ITC Limited and NCDEX e-Markets Limited.¹⁰⁸² The various projects aim to assist farmers in making decisions such as which crops to grow for optimal yield and whether to sell or store their produce.

On 11 October 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare announced the distribution of 820,000 seed mini-kits containing seeds of high-yield crops to 343 farming districts across 15 states.¹⁰⁸³ The programme operates under the government's National Food Security Mission.

On 10 November 2021, Minister Tomar announced the launch of the Nutrition Smart Village initiative, which promotes nutritional education and nutrition-sensitive agriculture in 75 villages to help them overcome malnutrition.¹⁰⁸⁴ The initiative also partners with the All India Coordinated Research Project and the Indian Council of Agricultural Research's Central Institute for Women in Agriculture to inform women farmers of their legal rights.

On 10 November 2021, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved a committed support price of INR174,088.5 million to the Cotton Corporation of India (CCI), a government agency under the administrative control of the Ministry of Textiles.¹⁰⁸⁵ The CCI performs operations, such as procuring cotton from cotton farmers when market prices fall below the designated Minimum Support Price (MSP), to promote economic stability for farmers. The price support was provided to reimburse CCI for losses incurred from procuring cotton at MSP during the 2014-15 and 2020-21 period.

On 26 November 2021, the Foreign Ministers of India, Russia, and China met to discuss trilateral cooperation on key issues of concern, including food security.¹⁰⁸⁶ The ministers welcomed the outcomes of the 13th BRICS summit and agreed to work towards strengthening their strategic partnership. The ministers also reaffirmed their commitment to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and climate action via the Kyoto Protocol and Paris Agreement.

On 6 December 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with President Vladimir Putin of Russia at the 21st India-Russia Annual Summit. Both countries expressed satisfaction with the progression of investment in

¹⁰⁸² Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers welfare signs 5 MOUs with private companies for taking forward Digital Agriculture, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 14 September 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1754848>

¹⁰⁸³ Free 8.20 lakh hybrid seed mini kits will be distributed to farmers in 343 districts of 15 states, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 11 October 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1763037>

¹⁰⁸⁴ 75 Nutrition smart villages will strengthen India's campaign against malnutrition, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1770657>

¹⁰⁸⁵ Cabinet approves incurring expenditure for reimbursing the losses under MSP operations for cotton during the cotton season (October to September) 2014-15 to 2020-21, Ministry of Textiles (New Delhi) 10 November 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseDetailm.aspx?PRID=1770515>

¹⁰⁸⁶ Joint Communique of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/Joint_Communique_of_the_18th_Meeting_of_the_Foreign_Ministers_of_the_Russian_Federation_the_Republic_of_India_and_the_Peoples_Republic_of_China

several sectors including agriculture.¹⁰⁸⁷ They also acknowledged the success of youth exchanges that brought together students from both countries to develop technological innovations to address key issues, such as rural health and well-being.

On 11 December 2021, Prime Minister Modi inaugurated the Saryu National Project in Balrampur, Uttar Pradesh.¹⁰⁸⁸ The project aims to interlink five rivers to secure water supply to irrigate 140,000 hectares of land over nine districts of Uttar Pradesh.¹⁰⁸⁹

On 21 December 2021, Minister Tomar released a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for the use of drones in pesticide and nutrient application.¹⁰⁹⁰ The SOP covers topics such as statutory provisions, flying provisions, drone registration, and safety insurance.

On 22 December 2021, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved a new MSP for copra during the 2022 season, based on recommendations from the Commission for Agricultural Costs and Prices.¹⁰⁹¹ The MSP for milling copra was increased from INR10,335 per quintal in 2021 to INR10,590 per quintal for 2022, and ball copra from INR10,600 per quintal in 2021 to INR11,000 per quintal for 2022. The increase ensures the new MSP is 1.5 times higher than the weighted cost of production.

On 1 January 2022, Prime Minister Modi announced the release of the tenth installment of financial benefits to farmers under the Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi scheme, allowing INR200 billion to be distributed to 100 million beneficiary families.¹⁰⁹² The programme also involved an equity grant of over INR140 million to 351 Farmer Producer Organizations, benefitting 124,000 farmers.

On 22 January 2022, Minister of Rural Development and Panchayati Raj Giriraj Singh announced the publication of the revised Rural Area Development Plan Formulation and Implementation Guidelines.¹⁰⁹³ He stated that the guidelines will “serve as the basis for rural transformation and enable effective land use planning in rural areas,” in addition to facilitating better utilization of geospatial information.

On 1 February 2022, India released its Union Budget 2022-23, which included an emphasis on rural development.¹⁰⁹⁴ The budget included direct benefit transfer payments for farmers, digital and sustainable improvements to farming, as well as other economic measures to support the production of oilseeds, millet and other agri-food products.

On 22 March 2022, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs approved a Minimum Support Price (MSP) for raw jute for the 2022-2023 season, based on recommendations from the Commission on Agricultural Costs

¹⁰⁸⁷ India- Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 21 January 2022. https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34606/India_Russia_Joint_Statement_following_the_visit_of_the_President_of_the_Russian_Federation

¹⁰⁸⁸ PM inaugurates the Saryu Nahar National Project in Balrampur, UP, Prime Minister’s Office (New Delhi) 11 December 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1780456>

¹⁰⁸⁹ Transformation of Aspirational Districts Programme, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting (New Delhi) 5 January 2022. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://static.pib.gov.in/WriteReadData/specificdocs/documents/2022/jan/doc2022153401.pdf>

¹⁰⁹⁰ Union Agriculture Minister Releases Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for use of Drone in Pesticide Application for Crop Protection and for spraying Soil and Crop Nutrients, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 21 December 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1783937>

¹⁰⁹¹ Cabinet approves Minimum Support Price (MSP) for Copra for 2022 season, Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (New Delhi) 22 December 2021. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1784257>

¹⁰⁹² PM releases 10th instalment of PM-KISAN, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 1 January 2022. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1786818>

¹⁰⁹³ Union Minister Shri Giriraj Singh releases revised Rural Area Development Plan Formulation and Implementation (RADPFI) Guidelines, Press Information Bureau: Government of India (New Delhi) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1791267>

¹⁰⁹⁴ Budget 2022: Rural Development, Invest India: National Investment Promotion and Facilitation Agency (New Delhi) 2 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.investindia.gov.in/team-india-blogs/budget-2022-rural-development>

and Prices.¹⁰⁹⁵ The MSP was raised by INR250 to INR4750 per quintal. The increase ensures the new MSP is 1.5 times higher than the weighted cost of production.

On 25 March 2022, the Department of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare, the Ministry of Food Processing Industries, and the National Horticulture Board announced subsidies of 35 to 50 per cent for cold storage units.¹⁰⁹⁶ The program will operate under the Mission for Integrated Development of Horticulture and aims to reduce post-harvest produce loss.

On 29 March 2022, the government approved the extension of the Scheme on Promotion of Agricultural Mechanization for In-Situ Management of Crop Residue in the States of Punjab, Haryana, Uttar Pradesh and the National Capital Territory of Delhi to 30 September 2022.¹⁰⁹⁷ The scheme provides financial assistance to farmers for crop residue management machinery.

India has taken action to improve food security and fight malnutrition through the promotion of nutritional education in rural areas. It has also taken measures to provide financial assistance to farmers and support the introduction of digital technologies in the farming sector to improve crop yields. India has further recognized the need to strengthen intra-BRICS collaboration on key issues including agriculture and participated in policy dialogue with its BRICS counterparts.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Amandeep Saini

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to reiterate enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

On 10 September 2021, the BRICS Partnership on New Industrial Revolution Innovation Center held its inaugural ceremony in Xiamen.¹⁰⁹⁸ At the ceremony, 28 projects were signed, with a collective investment value of over CNY 13 billion. Among the guests included International Affairs Advisor of the Mato Grosso state in Brazil Ariana Guedes de Olivera, who led a delegation of ten agricultural corporations to the ceremony. The BRICS Exhibition featured projects for enterprises in the biotechnology, nanotechnology, new materials, green economy and smart manufacturing sectors.

On 21 September 2021, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs released an article detailing Minister Tang Renjian's participation in the G20 Agriculture Ministers' Meeting, which occurred from 17-18 September 2021.¹⁰⁹⁹ Minister Tang Renjian's remarks proposed the use of digital technology to strengthen food production and improve the likelihoods through enhancing food security. Vice Minister of Agriculture and Rural Affairs Ma Youxiang proposed support mechanisms for developing countries to acquire improved capabilities for food production and disaster reduction, further calling for stronger networks of collaboration between governments, market-based private sector groups, non-governmental organizations, and both agriculture and food industries.

¹⁰⁹⁵ Cabinet approves Minimum Support Price of Raw Jute for 2022-23 season, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 22 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseFramePage.aspx?PRID=1808122>

¹⁰⁹⁶ Setting up of Cold Storages under Mission for Integrated Development of Horticulture (MIDH), Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 25 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1809692>

¹⁰⁹⁷ Measures to Promote Crop Diversification, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (New Delhi) 29 March 2022. Access Date: 1 April 2022. <https://pib.gov.in/PressReleasePage.aspx?PRID=1810902>

¹⁰⁹⁸ BRICS enterprises see opportunities amid new industrial revolution, The State Council Information Office of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 10 September 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. http://english.scio.gov.cn/international/exchanges/2021-09/10/content_77744774.htm

¹⁰⁹⁹ G20 Agriculture Ministers' Meeting Convenes, The State Council Information Office of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 21 September 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022. http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202109/t20210923_300719.html

On 28 October 2021, Vice Minister Ma convened the 8th meeting of the China-Russia Agricultural Cooperation Subcommittee of the Committee for Regular Meetings Between the Chinese and Russian Heads of Government, alongside Russian Deputy Minister of Agriculture Sergey Levin.¹¹⁰⁰ The meeting concluded with bilateral agreements to further proliferate partnerships in agriculture. Vice Minister Ma, who co-chaired the meeting with Deputy Minister Levin, expressed the desire to heighten China's collaboration with Russia in areas such as agro-trade, agricultural investment, and the prevention and control of animal and plant diseases.

On 26 November 2021, the Foreign Ministers of China, India, and Russia met to discuss trilateral cooperation on key issues of concern, including food security.¹¹⁰¹ The ministers welcomed the outcomes of the 13th BRICS summit and agreed to work towards strengthening their strategic partnership. The ministers also reaffirmed their commitment to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and climate action via the Kyoto Protocol and Paris Agreement.

On 6 December 2021, the National Administration for Rural Vitalization announced that China had publicized a five-year action plan to expedite the improvement of the nation's rural living conditions, marking 2025 as the deadline.¹¹⁰² The ministry identified infrastructural improvements as a core area of improvement, citing the aim to improve sanitary facilities in rural regions such as sewage treatment capacities. Head of Soil Ecology at the Ministry of Ecology and Environment Su Kejing revealed that the ministry aimed to prioritize densely populated rural regions with densely allocated water sources, improving their sewage infrastructure and abilities to treat black and odorous water sources. An official of the Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development Qin Haixiang pledged that China will continue to preserve the three elements of traditional villages, natural landscapes, and countryside culture. Official Qin identified the tourism and cultural industries as pockets of potential future growth.

On 8 December 2021, Vice Minister of Agricultural and Rural Affairs Deng Xiaogang announced China's plan to further agricultural modernization and rural vitalization during the ongoing and fourteenth Five-Year Plan period, from 2021 to 2025.¹¹⁰³ He expressed the aim of relying on regions with better conditions to lead in the achievement of agricultural and rural innovation, further stating the goal of demonstrating visible progress by 2035.

On 23 December 2021, the Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences (CAAS) revealed the Report on Development of the Rural Living Environment in China.¹¹⁰⁴ The report, compiling information since the beginning of 2021, evaluated the institutional actions taken to improve China's rural living conditions. At the event of the report's release, researchers from the Rural Development Institute of CAAS and representatives from the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs deliberated the findings of the study.

On 20 January 2022, an official of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs Xie Jianmin affirmed that China will take stronger measures to make its agri-food systems more environmentally efficient and beneficial to rural

¹¹⁰⁰ Eighth Meeting of China-Russia Agricultural Cooperation Subcommittee Convened, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 1 November 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022.

http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202111/t20211101_300741.html

¹¹⁰¹ Joint Communique of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 11 December 2021.

https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/Joint_Communique_of_the_18th_Meeting_of_the_Foreign_Ministers_of_the_Russian_Federation_the_Republic_of_India_and_the_Peoples_Republic_of_China

¹¹⁰² Action plan to improve rural living conditions, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202112/t20211207_300759.html

¹¹⁰³ China unveils 5-year plan to advance agricultural, rural modernization, The State Council of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 8 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022.

https://english.www.gov.cn/news/pressbriefings/202112/08/content_WS61b15183c6d09c94e48a1f99.html

¹¹⁰⁴ Report on Development of the Rural Living Environment in China Released, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 24 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022.

http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202112/t20211229_300771.html

communities by promoting food security, reduction of carbon emissions, and poverty alleviation.¹¹⁰⁵ His remarks were delivered at the launch of the Rural Development Report 2021 hosted by the International Fund for Agricultural Development and the China Center for Agricultural Policy of Peking University.

On 4 February 2022, China announced that it will allow Russian imports of wheat and barley, which was previously restricted on the basis of phytosanitary concerns.¹¹⁰⁶

On 4 February 2022, President Xi Jinping and President Putin of Russia met in Beijing and took part in the opening ceremony of the XXIV Olympic Winter Games.¹¹⁰⁷ They published a Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, which referenced food security as an area of cooperation to accelerate the implementation of the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

On 22 February 2022, China revealed its “No. 1 central document,” outlining its policy objectives for on rural revitalization in 2022.¹¹⁰⁸ The document pledged to improve the production capacity of key agricultural products such as soybean, oil plants, vegetables and pork, and committed to ensuring that the full-year grain output remains above the 650 billion kg threshold. The document also highlighted intentions to continue the implementation of the five-year plan for improving the rural environment, targeting improvements in rural infrastructure as key focus areas, and further identifying highways, water and energy facilities, and housing as priorities.

On 15 April 2022, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs, the National Rural Revitalization Administration, and the Bank of China announced plans for collaboration on strengthening conditions for investment in the country's rural regions.¹¹⁰⁹ The notice outlined food production, rural development and countryside governance as central items of cooperation and targeted the improvement of financial services as the channel for development. The agreement pledged to establish a long-term mechanism of collaboration for the three parties, which would prioritize the modernization and vitalization of agricultural zones in rural regions.

China has encouraged intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation through convening multilateral meetings with other BRICS members and public commitments to strengthen lines of collaboration in agri-food production and environmentally sustainable agricultural practices. China has also announced multi-year policies aimed at improving the living environment in its rural regions.

Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Chan-Min Rob

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to reiterate enhancing intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security and promotion of comprehensive development of rural areas.

¹¹⁰⁵ China strives to make food system greener, more sustainable: official, CCTV (Beijing) 20 January 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://english.cctv.com/2022/01/21/ART116YI0fGV5bEAYP40Zi1R220121.shtml>

¹¹⁰⁶ China lifts restrictions on imports of Russian wheat, barley, Reuters (Moscow) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/article/russia-china-grains-idAFL1N2UF10Y>

¹¹⁰⁷ Joint Statement of the Russian Federation and the People's Republic of China on the International Relations Entering a New Era and the Global Sustainable Development, President of Russia (Beijing) 4 February 2022. Access Date: 8 February 2022. en.kremlin.ru/supplement/5770

¹¹⁰⁸ China outlines key tasks to fully advance rural vitalization in 2022, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 23 February 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202202/t20220223_300803.html

¹¹⁰⁹ Joint effort looks to boost rural investment, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 20 April 2022. Access Date: 13 May 2022. http://english.moa.gov.cn/news_522/202204/t20220420_300841.html

On 1 October 2021, the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development announced that its Deputy Minister Mcebisi Skwatsha will hold three meetings with three distinct groups of small-scale rural farmers to discuss the challenges they encounter in their respective experiences.¹¹¹⁰ Deputy Minister Skwatsha also pledged to meet with labourers of farms in the town of Uniondale following the first two visits to the townships of Kurland and KwaNokuthula.

On 30 November 2021, Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development Thoko Didiza announced the launch of the second phase of the Presidential Employment Stimulus for the nation's subsistence producers.¹¹¹¹ Encompassing rural farmers, the stimulus will seek to support self-employed subsistence producers struggling with low funds and unemployment.

On 9 December 2021, the government hosted the exit ceremony of the National Rural Youth Service Corps program in the province of Limpopo.¹¹¹² The program, which aims to alleviate poverty and equip youth in rural regions with economic and trade skills for business and job creation celebrated its successful implementation.

South Africa has promoted the development of its rural regions through the National Rural Youth Service Corps program and the Presidential Employment Stimulus for subsistence producers. However, South Africa is yet to demonstrate engagement in intra-BRICS agricultural cooperation for food security.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Chan-Min Rob

¹¹¹⁰ Deputy Minister Skwatsha to Engage with Kwanokuthula Small-Scale Farmers and Uniondale Farmworkers, Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development (Pretoria) 1 October 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022. <https://www.dalrrd.gov.za/docs/media/Media%20Invite%20Deputy%20Minister%20Skwatsha%20to%20engage%20Southern%20Cape%20Communities-Edited.pdf>

¹¹¹¹ Minister Thoko Didiza announces second phase of implementation of Presidential Employment Stimulus Initiative for subsistence producers, South African Government (Pretoria) 30 November 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-thoko-didiza-announces-second-phase-implementation-presidential-employment>

¹¹¹² Limpopo Economic Development on youth development and skills through National Rural Youth Service Corps (NARYSEC), South African Government (Pretoria) 9 December 2021. Access Date: 11 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/limpopo-economic-development-youth-development-and-skills-through-national-rural-youth>

20. Science and Education: Better Education and TVET

“We commit to strengthening our cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training), through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.”¹¹¹³

XIII BRICS Summit: New Delhi Declaration

Assessment

Country	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Brazil			+1
Russia			+1
India			+1
China			+1
South Africa			+1
Average	+1.00 (100%)		

Background

In 2013, BRICS Ministers of Education met for the first time in Paris, on the sidelines of the 37th session of the UNESCO General Conference. This meeting was welcomed by the BRICS leaders at the 2014 Fortaleza Summit, the BRICS leaders, where they first took significant action on education. The BRICS leaders stated: “We recognize the strategic importance of education for sustainable development and inclusive economic growth. We reaffirm our commitment to accelerating progress in attaining the Education for All goals and education-related Millennium Development Goals by 2015 and stress that the development agenda beyond 2015 should build on these goals to ensure equitable, inclusive and quality education and lifelong learning for all. We are willing to strengthen intra-BRICS cooperation in the area and welcome the meeting of Ministers of Education held in Paris, in November 2013. We intend to continue cooperation with relevant international organizations. We encourage the initiative to establish the BRICS Network University.”¹¹¹³

At the 2015 Ufa Summit, the BRICS leaders continued with their focus on education, recognizing the need for equally accessible, high-quality and lifelong education for well. As well, they specifically acknowledged the “the primary importance of higher education and research and call for exchanging of experiences in recognition of university diplomas and degrees.”¹¹¹⁴

In 2016, the BRICS Education Ministers met for the fourth time, concluding with the New Delhi Declaration on Education. The declaration focused on Sustainable Development Goal 4 on education and reaffirmed “the need for universal equal access to quality education, including secondary and higher education, technical and vocational education and training, and lifelong learning opportunities for all.”¹¹¹⁵ The BRICS leaders welcomed the declaration and reaffirmed the need for universal access to high-quality education at the 2016 Goa Summit.¹¹¹⁶

¹¹¹³ The 6th BRICS Summit: Fortaleza Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 15 July 2014. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/140715-leaders.html>

¹¹¹⁴ VII BRICS Summit: 2015 Ufa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 9 July 2015. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/150709-ufa-declaration_en.html

¹¹¹⁵ New Delhi Declaration on Education, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 30 September 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/160930-education.pdf>

¹¹¹⁶ 8th BRICS Summit: Goa Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 16 October 2016. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/161016-go.html>

At the 2017 Xiamen Summit, the BRICS leaders underlined the importance of education to promote sustainable economic and social development and to strengthen BRICS partnership. Furthermore, they agreed to “share experiences and practices in realizing education-related sustainable development goals.”¹¹¹⁷

In 2018, the BRICS Ministers of Education met, but the 2018 Johannesburg Summit did not focus on education.¹¹¹⁸ At the 2019 Brasilia Summit, education was not mentioned at all.¹¹¹⁹

At the 2020 Moscow Summit, the BRICS leaders revived their focus on education by committing to “enhancing cooperation particularly in the field of TVET [technical and vocational education and training] and higher education, through best practices exchanges of knowledge and expertise, including in digital technologies for distant and blended learning, which have become necessary tools for the provision of high quality, steadily accessible education.”¹¹²⁰

Commitment Features

The BRICS commitment is “We commit to strengthening our cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training), through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.” There are five components that BRICS members must exchange best practices, knowledge and expertise on: early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education and TVET.

“Commit” refers “to do or perform, to pledge or bind (a person or an organization) to a certain course or policy.”¹¹²¹ “Strengthening” refers “to make or become stronger.”¹¹²² “Cooperation” refers to “the action or process of working together to the same end.”

“Childhood development” refers to “the sequence of physical, language, thought and emotional changes that occur in a child from birth to the beginning of adulthood.”¹¹²³ It includes: “cognition – the ability to learn and problem solve; social interaction and emotional regulation – interacting with others and mastering self-control; speech and language – understanding and using language, reading and communicating; physical skills – fine motor (finger) skills and gross motor (whole body) skills; sensory awareness – the registration of sensory information for use.”

“Primary education” refers to “the first stage traditionally found in formal education, beginning at about age 5 to 7 and ending at about age 11 to 13.” It focuses on reading and writing skills, arithmetic skills, and basic social studies and science.¹¹²⁴ “Secondary education” refers to “the second stage traditionally found in formal education, beginning about age 11 to 13 and ending usually at age 15 to 18.”¹¹²⁵ “Higher education” refers to “any of various types of education given in postsecondary institutions of learning and usually affording, at the

¹¹¹⁷ BRICS Leaders Xiamen Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 4 September 2017. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/170904-xiamen.html>

¹¹¹⁸ BRICS in Africa: Collaboration for Inclusive Growth and Shared Prosperity in the 4th Industrial Revolution, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 26 July 2018. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/180726-johannesburg.html>

¹¹¹⁹ Brasília Declaration, BRICS Information Centre (Toronto) 14 November 2019. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/191114-brasilia.html>

¹¹²⁰ XII BRICS Summit Moscow Declaration, BRICS Information Center (Toronto) 17 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <http://www.brics.utoronto.ca/docs/201117-moscow-declaration.html>

¹¹²¹ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹¹²² Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 12 November 2020. Access Date: 11 November 2021. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2020.pdf

¹¹²³ What is Child Development? Child Development (Adelaide) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://childdevelopment.com.au/areas-of-concern/what-is-child-development/>

¹¹²⁴ Elementary Education, Britannica (Chicago) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/elementary-education>

¹¹²⁵ Secondary Education, Britannica (Chicago) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/secondary-education>

end of a course of study, a named degree, diploma, or certificate of higher studies. Higher-educational institutions include not only universities and colleges but also various professional schools that provide preparation in such fields as law, theology, medicine, business, music, and art. Higher education also includes teacher-training schools, junior colleges, and institutes of technology.”¹¹²⁶ “Technical and vocational education and training” refers to “education, training and skills development relating to a wide range of occupational fields, production, services and livelihoods.”¹¹²⁷

“Exchange of best practices, knowledge and expertise” refers to “the act of giving something to someone and them giving you something else.”¹¹²⁸ In this case, it would be “a working method or set of working methods that is officially accepted as being the best to use in a particular business or industry, usually described formally and in detail,”¹¹²⁹ “understanding of or information about a subject that you get by experience or study,”¹¹³⁰ and “a high level of knowledge or skill.”¹¹³¹

For full compliance, a BRICS member has to take action on four or five of the following components: early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education or TVET. If a BRICS member takes strong action on three of the components and partial on one or two of them, it would still be considered full compliance. If a BRICS member takes strong action on only two components and partial on the rest, it would be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member takes partial action on two to five of the components, it would still be considered partial compliance. If a BRICS member takes action, strong or partial, on only one component, it would be considered noncompliance.

As this commitment requires actions that include best practices, knowledge and expertise, the depth component encompasses both strength of an action and how many of these aspects it includes. This is because best practices, knowledge and expertise can relate to each other and also be one and the same. Therefore, strong actions could include concrete actions such as hosting workshops or meetings, sharing specific information (comprising of best practices, knowledge, and/or expertise), publishing studies and/or reports, supporting student exchanges or sending experts for training sessions in other countries. Partial actions would be attending meetings without explicitly sharing information, verbal reaffirmation of the commitment or announcing intentions to partake in exchange information. Furthermore, as this commitment specifies cooperation, national actions that relate to the components of this commitment do not contribute to compliance unless they are intended to be part of a larger purpose for exchanging with other countries. Only multilateral actions count towards compliance.

¹¹²⁶ Higher Education, Britannica (Chicago) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/higher-education>

¹¹²⁷ Technical and vocational education and training (TVET), UNESCO (Paris) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://unevoc.unesco.org/home/TVETipedia+Glossary/filt=all/id=474>

¹¹²⁸ Exchange, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/exchange>

¹¹²⁹ Best Practices, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/best-practice?q=best+practices>

¹¹³⁰ Knowledge, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/knowledge>

¹¹³¹ Expertise, Cambridge Dictionary (Cambridge) n.d. Access Date: 11 November 2021. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/expertise>

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The BRICS member only strengthens cooperation in ONE of the fields of early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education, or technical and vocational education and training (TVET) through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.
0	The BRICS member somewhat strengthens cooperation in TWO or THREE of the fields of early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education OR TVET through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.
+1	The BRICS members strengthens cooperation in FOUR or ALL FIVE of the fields of early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education AND TVET through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

Compliance Director and Lead Analyst: Sonja Dobson

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation in the fields of early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education, and technical and vocational education and training (TVET) through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

On 15 October 2021, President Jair Bolsonaro signed a bill reallocating BRL600 million that had initially been put aside for Brazil's Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation to other government departments, reducing the federal science budget by 90 per cent.¹¹³² This reduction in funding will reduce the number of scholarships for students and fellowships for postgraduate students.¹¹³³

On 3 December 2021, Brazil, along with other Community of Latin American and Caribbean States (CELAC) Member States, agreed to adopt the China-CELAC Joint Action Plan for Cooperation in Key Areas (2022-2024) through friendly consultations.¹¹³⁴ As it pertains to the field of education, the Joint Action Plan aims to promote cooperation between higher education institutions by developing various forms of exchanges and cooperation between professors, students and academics. It will also promote exchanges of TVET knowledge and expertise in the field of educational informatics and in the field of aerospace through satellite data sharing, satellite applications and construction of ground infrastructure and personnel training. Additionally, the Plan aims to strengthen exchanges and increase synergies between scientific and technological authorities through the innovation, academic, and scientific sectors.

During the week of 17 December 2021, the Ministry of Economy's External Financing Committee authorized the contracting of USD250 million loan from the World Bank for post-pandemic education resumption project "Educa mais Forte Norte e Nordeste."¹¹³⁵ The program aims to strengthen access to early childhood education and provide updated educational management systems among other plans.

On 28 April 2022, the BRICS Technical and Vocational Education and Training Cooperation Alliance (BRICS-TCA) was officially inaugurated.¹¹³⁶ The National Council of the Federal Network of Vocational, Scientific and Technological Education Institutions of Brazil was among the organizations to initiate the alliance. The BRICS-

¹¹³² Scientists reel as Brazilian government backtracks on research funds, Nature (London) 22 October 21. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-021-02886-9>

¹¹³³ Brazilian Science in Danger, Inside Higher Ed (Washington D.C.) 11 November 2021. Access Date: 23 November 2021. <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2021/11/11/brazil-cuts-federal-science-spending-90-percent>

¹¹³⁴ China – CELAC Joint Action Plan for Cooperation in Key Areas (2022-2024), Embassy of the People's Republic of China in the Cooperative Republic of Guyana, (Georgetown) 13 December 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. http://gy.china-embassy.org/eng/xwfw/202112/t20211213_10469237.htm

¹¹³⁵ Brazilian government grants US\$250 million for post-pandemic education resumption, The Rio Times (Rio de Janeiro) 17 December 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. <https://www.riotimesonline.com/brazil-news/rio-politics/brazilian-government-grants-us250-million-for-post-pandemic-education-resumption/>

¹¹³⁶ BRICS Countries Pen Cooperation Alliance on Education, China News Service (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Access Date: 28 April 2022. <http://www.ecns.cn/news/2022-04-28/detail-ihaxwerf5649784.shtml>

TCA aims to be a multilateral platform for exchanging information and practices to foster cooperation between BRICS TVET stakeholders in efforts to promote BRICS' socioeconomic development.

Brazil has committed and taken actions to increase the means to which knowledge, practices and expertise in education in TVET, higher education, and early childhood education can be exchanged. Furthermore, with the inauguration of the BRICS-TCA, Brazil has strengthened cooperation in education.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of +10.

Analyst: Fianait Liu

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to strengthening cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as technical and vocational education and training (TVET), through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

On 16 November 2021, the 22nd meeting of the Russian Chinese Commission for Humanitarian Cooperation was co-hosted by Deputy Prime Minister Tatyana Golikova and Vice Premier of China Sun Chunlan.¹¹³⁷ Deputy Prime Minister Golikova asserted that a cooperation agreement would be signed between the Orlyonok Russian Children's Centre and the Chinese Education Ministry's Centre for International Language Exchange to reinforce the cooperation in improving child development.

On 25 November 2021, Prime Minister Mikhail Mishustin attended the videoconference with the Heads of Government Council of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation.¹¹³⁸ He expressed Russia's willingness to share their "achievements" in using AI-based solution and database management platforms to improve remote education services.

On 26 November 2021, Deputy Prime Minister Dmitry Chernyshenko signed an agreement with Vice Premier of China Sun during the closing ceremony of the Russian-Chinese Year of Scientific, Technical, and Innovative Cooperation.¹¹³⁹ The agreement initiated the cooperation and student exchange program of universities between both countries. Deputy Prime Minister Chernyshenk also announced that Kuzbass, a Russian "world-class research-and-education centres," would open a new office in China the next year to gain more opportunities to cooperate with Chinese educational entities.

On 24 December 2021, President Vladimir Putin announced that the program of mega grants for scientists will continue during a joint session of the State Council and the Council for Science and Education.¹¹⁴⁰ He claimed that this would enable scientists in Russia to form research groups and connect with foreign specialists.

On 28 April 2022, the BRICS Technical and Vocational Education and Training Cooperation Alliance (BRICS-TCA) was officially inaugurated.¹¹⁴¹ The BRICS-TCA aims to be a multilateral platform for exchanging information and practices to foster cooperation between BRICS TVET stakeholders in efforts to promote BRICS' socioeconomic development.

¹¹³⁷ Tatyana Golikova Chaired the 22nd Meeting of the Russian-Chinese Commission for Humanitarian Cooperation, the Russian Government (Moscow) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43812/#>

¹¹³⁸ Meeting of the SCO Heads of Government Council, the Russian Government (Moscow) 25 November 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43901/>

¹¹³⁹ Deputy Prime Ministers of Russia and China Hold a Closing Ceremony for the Russia-China Years of Scientific, Technical and Innovative Cooperation, the Russian Government (Moscow) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. <http://government.ru/en/news/43916/>

¹¹⁴⁰ Russia to Continue Program of Mega Grants for Scientists, Putin Says, Russian News Agency (Moscow) 24 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. <https://tass.com/politics/1380613>

¹¹⁴¹ BRICS Countries Pen Cooperation Alliance on Education, China News Service (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Access Date: 28 April 2022. <http://www.ecns.cn/news/2022-04-28/detail-ihaxwerf5649784.shtml>

Russia has taken strong action to strengthen cooperation in educational fields, particularly with the establishment of the BRICS-TCA..

Thus, Russia receives the score of +1.

Analyst: Wesley Cheung

India: +1

India has partially complied with its commitment to strengthen cooperation in the fields of early childhood development, primary education, secondary education, higher education, and technical and vocational education and training (TVET) through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

On 6 December 2021, Prime Minister Narendra Modi met with President Vladimir Putin of the Russian Federation for the 21st India-Russia Annual Summit. India's Ministry of External Affairs published a joint statement following the visit.¹¹⁴² India and Russia reaffirmed their efforts to promote linkages between universities and educational institutions. Both countries also committed to organizing exchange programs for diplomats for training.

On 26 November 2021, the Foreign Ministers of India, Russia and China met digitally to discuss a multitude of subjects.¹¹⁴³ The Ministers welcomed the UN-mandated Open Ended Working Group to facilitate telecommunications exchanges. Additionally, the Ministers reaffirmed their commitment to facilitate capacity building and the transfer of technology to developing countries.

On 11 January 2022, Minister of State for Education Rajkumar Ranjan Singh addressed the E-Symposium on "Building Innovation Ecosystem in Educational Institutes," organized by the Ministry of Education. Singh urged the higher education institutions of India to create an environment that supports high-quality research and technology transfer.¹¹⁴⁴ Panelists from around the world joined together to promote entrepreneurship and start-ups.¹¹⁴⁵

On 15 January 2022, Prime Minister Modi extended the invitation to the Pariksha Pe Charcha 2022, the Prime Minister's interaction programme with school and college students, to students and teachers from around the nation and the globe to discuss exams and emerging trends in education.¹¹⁴⁶

¹¹⁴² India- Russia Joint Statement following the visit of the President of the Russian Federation, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 6 December 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34606/India_Russia_Joint_Statement_following_the_visit_of_the_President_of_the_Russian_Federation

¹¹⁴³ Joint Communique of the 18th Meeting of the Foreign Ministers of the Russian Federation, the Republic of India and the People's Republic of China, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 26 November 2021. Access Date: 26 December 2021. https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/34540/Joint_Communique_of_the_18th_Meeting_of_the_Foreign_Ministers_of_the_Russian_Federation_the_Republic_of_India_and_the_Peoples_Republic_of_China

¹¹⁴⁴ Higher Education Institutions Will Serve As Enablers In India Innovation: MoS Education Ministry, NDTV (New Delhi) 11 January 2022. Access Date: 14 January 2022. <https://www.ndtv.com/education/higher-educational-institutions-will-serve-as-enablers-in-indian-innovation-mos-education-ministry>

¹¹⁴⁵ Rajkumar Ranjan Singh To Inaugurate A 2 Days Long E- Symposium On "Building Innovation Ecosystem In Educational Institutes" Tomorrow, India Education Diary (N/A) 10 January 2022. Access Date: 10 January 2022. <https://indiaeducationdiary.in/rajkumar-ranjan-singh-to-inaugurate-a-2-days-long-e-symposium-on-building-innovation-ecosystem-in-educational-institutes-tomorrow/>

¹¹⁴⁶ Opportunity to discover emerging trends in world of education: PM, The Tribune (Chandigarh) 15 January 2022. Access Date: 15 January 2022. <https://www.tribuneindia.com/news/schools/opportunity-to-discover-emerging-trends-in-world-of-education-pm-361546>

On 16 January 2022, India attended the Sustainable Development Goals Summit 2022 in collaboration with the United Nations Information Centres.¹¹⁴⁷ Panellists from around the world deliberated with Indian secondary school students about the importance of gender equality and women empowerment.

On 31 March 2022, the Ministry of External Affairs announced a sharp decline in the number of students who departed India for higher education in 2022 from previous years.¹¹⁴⁸ The decline is brought about by temporary visa restrictions for Indian students. The Indian government has not acted to promote abroad learning for higher education students.

On 18 April 2022, the Institutes of Eminence, a recognition scheme set up by India's Department of Higher Education and Ministry of Education, announced the funding of Banaras Hindu University scholarships for international students to boost the enrolment of international students.¹¹⁴⁹

On 22 April 2022, the foreign secretary of India reiterated India's commitment to the promotion of democracy and democratic values to grow India as an education hub for a growing global constituency.¹¹⁵⁰

On 28 April 2022, the BRICS Technical and Vocational Education and Training Cooperation Alliance (BRICS-TCA) was officially inaugurated.¹¹⁵¹ The BRICS-TCA aims to be a multilateral platform for exchanging information and practices to foster cooperation between BRICS TVET stakeholders in efforts to promote BRICS' socioeconomic development.

India strongly strengthened cooperation in the field of education, particularly through the establishment of the BRICS-TCA.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Fianait Liu

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to strengthening cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as technical and vocational education and training (TVET), through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

On 22 October 2021, Education Minister Huai Jinping attended the 2021 China International Education Symposium to deliver a speech.¹¹⁵² As he provided proposals about the international cooperation, he stated that countries should cooperate and "promote the sharing of educational reform and development

¹¹⁴⁷ Chandigarh: Sustainable Development Goals Summit concludes, Hindustan Times (New Delhi) 16 January 2022. Access Date: 16 January 2022. <https://www.hindustantimes.com/cities/chandigarh-news/chandigarh-sustainable-development-goals-summit-concludes-101642363711573.html>

¹¹⁴⁸ Question NO.3261 Indian Students Opting for Foreign Education, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 31 March 2022. Date Accessed: 4 April 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/rajya-sabha.htm?dtl/35106/question+no3261+indian+students+opting+for+foreign+education>

¹¹⁴⁹ Institute Offer Scholarships to Attract International Students, The Times of India (Mumbai) 18 April 2022. Date Accessed: 18 April 2022. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/home/education/news/institutes-offer-scholarships-to-attract-international-students/articleshow/90914304.cms>

¹¹⁵⁰ Address by Foreign Secretary at the Times Network India Economic Conclave 2022, Ministry of External Affairs: Government of India (New Delhi) 22 April 2022. Date Accessed: 24 April 2022. <https://www.mea.gov.in/Speeches-Statements.htm?dtl/35232/address+by+foreign+secretary+at+the+times+network+india+economic+conclave+2022>

¹¹⁵¹ BRICS Countries Pen Cooperation Alliance on Education, China News Service (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Access Date: 28 April 2022. <http://www.ecns.cn/news/2022-04-28/detail-ihaxwerf5649784.shtml>

¹¹⁵² Minister of Education Huai Jinping Attended the Plenary Meeting of the 2021 China International Education Symposium and Put Forward Three Proposals," China Education News Network (Beijing) 24 October 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. http://www.jyb.cn/rmtzcg/xwy/wzxw/202110/t20211024_630383.html

achievements among people of all countries” to overcome problems and enhance fairness of education at a global level.

On 16 November 2021, the 22nd meeting of the Russian-Chinese Commission for Humanitarian Cooperation was hosted virtually by Vice Premier Sun Chunlan and the Russian Deputy Prime Minister Golikova. Vice Premier Sun acknowledged the success in the past cooperation such as “cooperative education, joint training of talents, cultural exchanges, and youth exchanges between the two sides.”¹¹⁵³ He stated that new impetus would be implemented to further consolidate the cooperation.

On 7 December 2021, Minister Huai attended the 2021 International Forum on AI and Education. In Minister Huai’s speech, he emphasized the significance of implementing AI technologies in education and called for nations to cooperate to build a “open, inclusive and resilient education systems” together.¹¹⁵⁴

On 14 December 2021, Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Wang Wenbin mentioned that China’s assistance of providing research aids for African young scientists and training programs for technicians and government officials from forty-seven African countries, including South Africa, have harnessed huge success in term of improving these countries’ technological progress.¹¹⁵⁵ He stated that China would remain opened to continue aiding the young talents from Africa.

On 28 April 2022, the BRICS Technical and Vocational Education and Training Cooperation Alliance (BRICS-TCA) was officially inaugurated.¹¹⁵⁶ The BRICS-TCA aims to be a multilateral platform for exchanging information and practices to foster cooperation between BRICS TVET stakeholders in efforts to promote BRICS’ socioeconomic development.

China has taken strong action to strengthen cooperation in primary, secondary and higher education and TVET. Particularly, through the establishment of the BRICS_TCA.

Thus, China receives the score of +1.

Analyst: Wesley Cheung

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to strengthening cooperation in the field of early childhood development, primary, secondary and higher education as well as technical and vocational education and training, through exchanges of best practices, knowledge and expertise.

On 22 September 2021, the National School of Government announced that it will be hosting the second iteration of the Executive Education Programme in conjunction with the University College London.¹¹⁵⁷ As part of the programme, participants received instruction from senior political office bearers in economic governance. This initiative demonstrates the government’s commitment to strengthen cooperation in the higher education sector.

¹¹⁵³ The 22nd Meeting of the China-Russia Humanities Cooperation Committee Was Held, Sun Chunlan and Golikova Jointly Attended, the Ministry of Education of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 16 November 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xwfb/s6052/moe_838/202111/t20211116_580323.html

¹¹⁵⁴ 2021 International Forum on AI and Education, the Ministry of Education of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 12 December 2021. Access Date: 13 December 2021. http://en.moe.gov.cn/news/press_releases/202112/t20211213_587020.html

¹¹⁵⁵ Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Wang Wenbin’s Regular Press Conference, Embassy of the People’s Republic of China in the United States of America (Washington), 14 December 2021. Access Date: 5 January 2022. http://www.china-embassy.org/eng/lcbt/wjbfyrbt/202112/t20211214_10469658.htm

¹¹⁵⁶ BRICS Countries Pen Cooperation Alliance on Education, China News Service (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Access Date: 28 April 2022. <http://www.ecns.cn/news/2022-04-28/detail-ihaxwerf5649784.shtml>

¹¹⁵⁷ School of Government hosts second edition of Executive Education Programme, National School of Government (Pretoria) 22 September 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/national-school-government-hosts-second-edition-executive-education-programme-aimed>

On 8 October 2021, Minister of Basic Education Angie Motshekga made a statement welcoming the newly appointed members of the National Commission for the United Nations Education, Science and Culture Organization (UNESCO). During the press release, Minister Motshekga reiterated that the commission as well as the country's "membership to UNESCO [allows South Africa] to contribute to the international community."¹¹⁵⁸ This statement reaffirms the government's commitment to cooperating with international partners in basic education, which includes primary and secondary schools.

On 28 April 2022, the BRICS Technical and Vocational Education and Training Cooperation Alliance (BRICS-TCA) was officially inaugurated.¹¹⁵⁹ The BRICS-TCA aims to be a multilateral platform for exchanging information and practices to foster cooperation between BRICS TVET stakeholders in efforts to promote BRICS' socioeconomic development.

South Africa has partnered with international institutions to exchange knowledge and expertise in higher education. In addition, South Africa has reaffirmed its commitment to working with other countries in multilateral government frameworks in the primary and secondary education sectors.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Yana Sadeghi

¹¹⁵⁸ Minister Angie Motshekga on basic education developments, Department of Basic Education (Pretoria) 8 October 2021. Access Date: 13 January 2022. <https://www.gov.za/speeches/minister-angie-motshekga-basic-education-developments-8-oct-2021-0000>

¹¹⁵⁹ BRICS Countries Pen Cooperation Alliance on Education, China News Service (Beijing) 28 April 2022. Access Date: 28 April 2022. <http://www.ecns.cn/news/2022-04-28/detail-ihaxwerf5649784.shtml>